

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF
EDUCATION - DIVISION OF
PORTFOLIO PLANNING**
**Alfred E. Smith Career and Technical
Education High School**
4/16/12

1 [START RECORDING]

2 MR. GREGG BETHEIL: This is a joint - -
3 hearing of the Department of Education - -
4 education council - - school - - to discuss the
5 proposed closure of Alfred E. Smith Career and
6 Technical Education High School - - 576 with
7 Bronx Design and Construction Academy 78542 and
8 Bronx Community High School - - school year.
9 Tonight's proceeding will be recorded - - .
10 Before we begin the hearing, we ask if anyone
11 that wishes to speak during the public comment
12 portion of the meeting, please sign up at the
13 table out in the lobby. At this point, we - -
14 25 extra speakers signed up. - - 15 minutes.
15 Also, if you have a question, there's paper
16 cards available to you in the back. - - portion
17 of the agenda. Please write that question on
18 the card, write it on the back, and submit it to
19 a volunteer at the table. Only people who are
20 signed up to speak will be to participate in
21 public comment. All - - participants will - -
22 be here - - 5:30. - - a representative from - -
23 education council seven is available and will be
24 joining us. I know they haven't - - just wanted
25 to see - - an opportunity to speak at the first

1 opportune moment. We haven't started - - she
2 will need an opportunity to speak and do want to
3 respectful everybody's time - - . Intended for
4 tonight's hearing - - presentation of a proposal
5 with presentations by the - - participants
6 followed by the public comment. Speakers should
7 - - or please sign up on the table in the lobby.
8 Public comment will be no longer than two
9 minutes each. The time - - follow the speakers
10 - - 30 seconds - - when your time has expired.
11 - - members of the audience, if you have
12 question, what you need to do is you need to
13 write that on the cards that are available in
14 the back. Please - - volunteer - - . While the
15 public comment is taking place, staff members
16 will - - ask questions - - to get them ready for
17 the question and answer period. Some questions
18 will be - - the last - - . Even though all of
19 the digital questions will not be addressed in
20 the forum tonight, the answers will be available
21 on the - - website prior to the panel meeting.
22 If at end of the hearing, you still have
23 questions, we encourage you to direct them to us
24 by calling 212-374-5159. Again 212-374-5159 or
25 send it to us via email at

1 d07proposals@schools.nyc.gov. Again, - -
2 d07proposals@schools.nyc.gov. We will make
3 those numbers and email addresses available - -
4 . And now I'd like to introduce you the panel
5 that been assembled for tonight's joint public
6 hearing. - - .

7 MS. KIM DURAN: Kim Duran, Alfred E. Smith -
8 - association president.

9 MR. BETHEIL: - - from the Alfred E. Smith -
10 - association. Thank you for joining us. We're
11 also joined by Thomas Newton from the school
12 leadership team here at Alfred E. Smith. Thanks
13 for joining us, Mr. Newton. Matt Williams, the
14 principal at the Bronx Design and Construction
15 Academy. And Lucinda Mendez is the principal of
16 Bronx - - High School. Also, some members of
17 the audience tonight by - - from Alfred E. Smith
18 as well as the Deputy Chancellor Laura
19 Rodriguez. We're also pleased to have the four
20 - - joining us - - member of family traditional
21 - - president's office and will be - - official
22 representatives to speak - - . On that - -
23 Laura Rodriguez who will formally present the
24 proposal.

25 MS. LAURA RODRIGUEZ: Thank you Gregg. Good

1 evening ladies and gentleman. Thank you for
2 being here this evening. This - - public
3 hearing is convened to discuss the proposed
4 closure and replacement of Alfred E. Smith
5 Career and Technical Education High School.
6 Smith is located at 333 East 151st Street in
7 community school district seven in the Bronx.
8 It currently serves students in grades 5 through
9 12. On March 5th, 2012, the New York City
10 Department of Education published a proposal to
11 close Alfred E. Smith and open a new school
12 07X576. By closing Alfred E. Smith and
13 replacing it with a new school, we are seeking
14 to - - a school environment that will prepare
15 students for success. The new school will build
16 on strongest elements of Alfred E. Smith and
17 will incorporate new elements. Students will
18 have access to a higher quality educational
19 option while they continue to attend school in
20 this very building. In conjunction with this
21 proposal the Department of Education submitted a
22 school - - application to the state education
23 department to implement the turnaround model at
24 the new school. If approved, this would make
25 the new school eligible for up to two million

1 dollars in supplemental federal funding. I
2 want to acknowledge the students and faculties
3 who feel your son or daughter is being well
4 served by Smith. Tonight we will hear about its
5 success stories happening at Smith. There are
6 success stories and we honor those, but we also
7 need to consider the many students who started
8 with your child in the 9th grade and have not
9 experienced the same success. They deserve
10 better. Despite a number of challenges the
11 school has faced, some - - elements of Alfred E.
12 Smith are worth preserving in the new school.
13 For example, while the school's overall quality
14 review school was - - . The review anticipated
15 some very - - such as school programs
16 partnerships which promote the students personal
17 growth and development while including their
18 families. With new supports and restructuring
19 the Department of Education expects that the new
20 school will be able to effective leverage each -
21 - while improving students' outcomes. However,
22 Alfred E. Smith's performance - - overall and
23 feedback from the members of the New York State
24 Board of Regents that the pace of change in New
25 York City's persistently low - - schools is not

1 - - community needs suggest that Alfred E.
2 Smith should be closed and replaced with a new
3 school with new programs and supports.
4 Graduation rates at Alfred E. Smith have been
5 consistently low over the years. In 2010-2011,
6 Alfred E. Smith's four year graduation rate
7 including August graduates was 54 percent, well
8 below the citywide graduation rate of 61.1
9 percent. If - - counted toward graduation as -
10 - pace for most students in the 2011-12 school
11 year, the four-year graduation rate at Alfred E.
12 Smith would drop to just 31 percent putting the
13 school in the bottom six percent of the high
14 schools citywide. First year - - accumulation -
15 - of student success because students - - early
16 in high school often have trouble getting back
17 on track to graduate. In 2010-2011, only 71
18 percent of first year students at Alfred E.
19 Smith earned at least ten credits. This rate of
20 credit accumulation puts Alfred E. Smith in the
21 bottom 25th percent of high schools citywide.
22 Before we hear from other members of the panel
23 and move to public comments, I would like to
24 briefly discuss the impacts of this proposal on
25 current Alfred E. Smith students and faculties -

1 - . First of all, all current faculty with
2 students will have a guaranteed seat in the new
3 school. This includes all - - 9th, 10th, and
4 11th grade students as well as any 12th grade
5 students who did not graduate by the beginning
6 of the 2012-13 school year. All - - 9th graders
7 who have applied to Alfred E. Smith and are
8 matched to - - high school admission process
9 will automatically be enrolled in the new
10 school. Regarding CTE, the Career and Technical
11 Education. The new school will continue to
12 offer the two programs currently available to
13 incoming 9th graders at Alfred E. Smith. The
14 automotive technician program and - - repair
15 program. Some Alfred E. Smith 11th and 12th
16 grade students are currently enrolled in a - -
17 ventilation, air conditioning, - - and pre-
18 engineering programs. If this proposal is
19 approved students enrolled in five programs that
20 are phasing out, will be supported as state - -
21 graduation at the new school. Additionally, the
22 Department of Education does not anticipate that
23 the proposed closure and replacement of Smith
24 will impact the collocation of any of the schools
25 located on the campus. Bronx Design and

1 Construction Academy and Bronx - - High School.
2 Finally, I want to clarify the process the new
3 school will go through to hire the best possible
4 staff if this proposal is approved. One, there
5 is no quota of staff that must be removed as a
6 result of this process. This proposal does not
7 require the turnover of any set percentage of
8 staff. Secondly, pursuant to the city's teacher
9 contracts, if this proposal is approved
10 pedagogical staff who apply to work at the new
11 school will be reviewed by a five-person school-
12 based personnel committee. The committee is
13 made up of the principal, two designees of the
14 chancellor and two designees of the United
15 Federation of Teachers - - . The proposed new
16 leader will develop qualifications for positions
17 in the new school and a personnel committee will
18 consider each candidate who applies. All
19 teachers from the current school are eligible to
20 apply to work at the new school. If sufficient
21 numbers of staff from the closing school apply,
22 at least 50 percent of the new school's
23 pedagogical positions must be selected from
24 among the appropriately licensed, most senior,
25 qualified applicants. Again, there is no set

1 percentage of limits on the number of staff
2 from the closing school who can inquire to work
3 at the new school. And the decisions are made
4 by the personnel committee of the new school.
5 Thank you and we look forward to hearing your
6 comments and your questions.

7 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you. The next
8 presenter - - speaking for the community
9 education council seven. Just want to make sure
10 - - . With that - - next presenter is Mr.
11 Newton from the school leadership team at Smith.

12 MR. NEWTON: I'm a teacher here at Smith. A
13 special education teacher. I'm also the union
14 delegates - - as well. So I've got a vested
15 interest - - .

16 FEMALE VOICE: Can't hear you.

17 MR. NEWTON: - - . I - - my entire teaching
18 life, which is now - - . I was here in 2008
19 when we went through the phase - - risk Smith -
20 - phased out. - - simply not met. And I think
21 we're going to see that promises are not going
22 to be kept here as well. I want to make sure
23 that you understand a little bit about the
24 history of this school that's so important to
25 all of us. As you may well know, this

1 originally was created as a - - vocational
2 school for boys - - public centered. Smith
3 currently provides - - educational opportunities
4 to its students. This includes approximately
5 170 students receiving its special services.
6 That's the group that I deal with. And it's one
7 that I'm very concerned about in this particular
8 proposed change. Alfred E. Smith's CTE high
9 school was named for a famed New City politician
10 noted for his honesty and for his veracity.
11 Teachers at Smith have always - - to follow the
12 - - . As I see it, - - form of education was
13 contained - - named after one of the most
14 infamous and dishonest characters while she who
15 - - lack of honesty. It seemed to me that the
16 real - - . I'm sure Tweed would admire - - for
17 his greed, lying, lack of honesty - - integrity.
18 Smith has long been recognized for its superior
19 - - vocational programs. These include the auto
20 trades, carpentry, electrical installations, - -
21 . Most of those - - as you know no longer
22 exists and had been destroyed to the detriment
23 of this particular community. Smith Frank
24 [phonetic] students have been - - to participate
25 in - - program - - such as the - - the - -

1 Nissan, Toyota, Chrysler, and Acura - - and
2 also - - major New York builders and
3 contractors. Many - - of our students have - -
4 education system - - grants. Many Smith
5 students have gone on to full-time employment as
6 - - of all of them. - - retain our positions.
7 Where are the teachers - - highly - - at the
8 level at Smith - - the past, which should
9 continue for the future. One of the problems -
10 - is the state. As a member of the school
11 leadership team, we were not informed that this
12 - - had been selected. When I raised an
13 objection to it, there was no agreement that - -
14 . I think that's an egregious fault of this
15 particular operation. While the - - letter of
16 the law - - school and community of their
17 intentions, they have said with obviously
18 cynicism and contempt, scheduled required
19 meetings on the day when we get back from spring
20 break. This was - - 2008 when they first
21 announced the closing - - in December - - just
22 prior to our Christmas vacation. So - - going
23 on - - schedule meetings with the least possible
24 - - parents or participants - - to participate.
25 This is I think a direct - - and that's been

1 something that's been going on. One of the -
2 - repeatedly is that in 2008 with the - -
3 document - - the educational - - we were
4 promised, our students were promised that they
5 would have a chance to graduate - - and have - -
6 recommendation from Smith. This is a - - 2012
7 EIS [phonetic] - - was not going to continue.
8 We - - our students - - that they have been here
9 to receive. - - repeatedly to complain that
10 they'd been here all these years and what's it
11 worth. They aren't going get a certification so
12 that they can go out - - get a good job. That
13 is what Smith is all about. We are concerned
14 about our individual students. - - I don't
15 think so. All - - a series of lies,
16 misstatements from - - issue. We want something
17 that - - once - - and it goes - - . - - Smith,
18 we had - - the new principal of the new school.
19 I - - activity as to - - the team - - school.
20 The gentleman who came in said I'm going to be
21 the principal. I - - . Today our resume - -
22 that says - - what you need - - parents. - -
23 accurately leaning - - . - - until it's fixed.
24 Okay guys. We've already made the decision, why
25 are we holding this meeting - - .

1 [applause]

2 MR. NEWTON: - - and old joke that goes back
3 to the time of - - anyone that said - - scandal.
4 Somebody sold - - insurance. That's how things
5 go - - here. We got - - we saw - - we know what
6 they're going to do. This - - themselves.

7 [applause]

8 MR. NEWTON: Yeah. I have one last thing to
9 say and - - mentioned before. - - that there is
10 a provision - - parents never - - .

11 [applause]

12 MR. NEWTON: We want people because they're
13 all - - so that teachers who are already - - to
14 apply for jobs they've had for years. - - a new
15 job - - in the new school. We don't want this
16 to be - - . We don't want this to be - -
17 process that has - - to it. I, for one, respect
18 the document - - certified teacher in New York.
19 I'm a lawyer for god sakes and I know my job. I
20 know how to do it. - - school - - children with
21 special needs. So why this has to be - - to
22 professionals. We're already certified. We
23 shouldn't have to prove it all over again - -
24 situation. So ladies and gentleman, respect
25 those - - loss to the community because we got

1 people who care. We've got teachers who have
2 been dedicated, who are here every day of the
3 week and on the weekends. We have plenty of - -
4 graduation - - we demand based on the--our
5 organization - - on our student populations. We
6 do the best we can. We love our kids. We
7 respect them. - - by dealing - - and if you
8 look at what the chancellor of the - - said.
9 He--she considers this entire situation to be -
10 - and that's all it is. And it's - - politics.
11 Let's - - over this process once and for all.

12 [applause]

13 MR. BETHEIL: All right. Thank you. The
14 next presenter - - .

15 MS. LUCINDA MENDEZ: This will be short and
16 sweet. It wasn't - - . It wasn't two years ago
17 that I was standing out here at the school
18 coming into the building. Is it - - . - - as
19 principal of Bronx Community High School. And -
20 - decisions have been made. But I just wanted
21 to say that - - school - - . It's more of - - .
22 It's more - - . Our school - - need to come - -
23 et cetera. It's a humbling - - has happened to.
24 - - many - - 15, 20, 25 - - years. They go - -
25 . - - our school, our teachers, our students,

1 - - . - - first between - - is that - - and I
 2 - - hoping that - - today. We got - - and take
 3 the name - - to maintain the - - . - - return
 4 to a building and I hope that they return to a
 5 building where they - - . They got - - . So -
 6 - .

7 [applause]

8 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you - - . - - council
 9 seven here. Okay. We've - - if you want to go
 10 down - - . You are reminded that - - limited to
 11 two minutes. Time - - finding time is tough.
 12 Okay. Twenty one speakers total. And the - - .
 13 We're beginning - - principals - - president's
 14 office - - Alfredo Pican - - .

15 MR. ALFREDO PICAN: Good - - . - - to the
 16 Department of Education. Given the - - in the
 17 community with this process for the form of
 18 education - - school. To produce better student
 19 outcomes, - - this opportunity from our
 20 students. To turn around - - student. We have
 21 no evidence that this is a necessary - -
 22 schools. But the Department of Education has -
 23 - sufficiently - - that this process - - . This
 24 process only serves to - - school community - -
 25 . Instead - - schools succeeding. Thank you.

1 [applause]

2 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you, Mr. Pican. - -
3 move on to the speaker - - here. Please help
4 yourselves - - back. If any additional folks
5 would like - - first opportune moment. - -
6 first - - microphone. - - two minutes. After
7 that - - won't cut you off mid-sentence. Our
8 first question - - Alan - - speaker number two,
9 Robert Matthew, speaker number three, Steven - -
10 , speaker number four Elijah - - , and speaker
11 number five Jamal - - . I'd ask you - -
12 microphone and we'll begin - - .

13 MR. NEWTON: We're going to - - gentleman in
14 the blue cap.

15 MR. BETHEIL: - - . Two minutes - - .

16 MR. ALAN VALDIVIEZO: So I'd like to speak
17 out on why I came to Alfred Smith. - - from
18 high school - - had a vocational program that
19 certifies many kids in - - certificate after
20 they graduate and so I saw - - targeting. And I
21 became--I wanted to go to school for that. So I
22 think it's - - four times my application to - -
23 schools. And the more I chose - - that's
24 something that I really like. And so, um, when
25 I came - - opportunities that are given to us.

1 And, um, many - - are - - and also to excel in
2 school and after school. And I believe - - high
3 school. And so something that I really want is
4 a - - certificate because - - us students who,
5 um, will be able to - - opportunities to - -
6 high school. And so, um, I came to this school
7 for those reasons. And, uh, I also, um, would
8 learn for the - - that - - and it also allows us
9 to be able to learn more about - - and be able
10 to, um, get, um, more, um, more opportunities.
11 More opportunities to get into a job - - of - -
12 union and it'll allow us to, um, to be able to
13 keep on learning - - college certainly to send
14 us to college to keep on learning. That's - -
15 just wanted to - - .

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHEIL: Thanks for having fun with the
18 microphones this evening. Alan, it seemed like
19 you had a couple of questions as well. If you
20 want to - - up here we'll make sure--try an
21 adjustment. Our next speaker is Robert Matthew,
22 number two. Mr. Matthew.

23 MR. ROBERT MATTHEW: Hello - - . - - my
24 father always took me - - . As - - high school
25 - - will ever - - . And after serious

1 consideration of what school I thought would
2 be best for - - , the - - was Alfred Smith.
3 When I first came to Alfred Smith, I placed my--
4 I placed - - . So - - my kids and the kids at
5 the - - . Ever since then - - , which - - all
6 of which - - . - - many hours to - - . I have
7 regained my - - and - - . But once again that -
8 - tested. Now - - very positive change of me
9 graduating and seeing - - activity. - - and
10 also - - counselor - - . Together we can - - .
11 So my question is, so my question really is what
12 do you want us to do - - teaching and other - -
13 Alfred E. Smith - - my whole life. What I've -
14 - beyond our control.

15 [applause]

16 MR. BETHEIL: Before we proceed to third
17 speaker - - podium. Juanita Bess and also
18 signed up as number three on a separate list.
19 So after - - you'll have your chance.

20 MR. STEVE MIALBO: I originally had and
21 eight-page statement - - procedures. - - speak
22 - - finally to - - educate and training - - .
23 Just a few comments about business and
24 education. - - 350 - - in the metro area. Area
25 - - employed 30,000 employees. And

1 additionally, 27,000 plus - - are employed a
2 result of indirect - - of dealership operations.
3 After - - downturn, auto sales - - are on the
4 rebound and - - dealerships are hiring
5 employees. Dealerships look for the AYS
6 [phonetic] school Alfred E. Smith for entry
7 level employees. Students from the school are
8 prepared with technical skills, - - skills, and
9 become very - - dealership. Since earning - -
10 certification, over 100 students from this - -
11 school have - - dealership. This is true as - -
12 students and teacher - - at the secondary level
13 or - - dealership. This is one - - from this
14 school made through the board. - - students may
15 come to school. As a - - one of the leading - -
16 publications in New York City, I ask - -
17 administration and staff more time to continue
18 making adjustments to their - - technology
19 programs that are helping the students and
20 business. Thank you for giving me the
21 opportunity to speak about a school that's
22 making a difference in the lives of young people
23 and the future of the - - . Alfred E. Smith - -
24 high school has an outstanding history. Many
25 students owe their success - - learned at this

1 school. This is a testament to effectiveness
2 of the administration and the staff at this
3 school. Thank you very much.

4 MR. BETHEIL: Our next speaker is Juanita
5 Bess. Try not to touch it. It should settle,
6 ma'am.

7 MS. JUANITA BESS: Juanita Bess representing
8 - - .

9 MR. BETHEIL: - - working on it.

10 MS. BESS: Okay. - - turn the volume down.
11 It's very uncomfortable. Okay. First and
12 foremost I'm representing the facts of our
13 school supervisors and administrators - - . - -
14 school is already in the process of creating a -
15 - program. It's not - - than a little maneuver
16 that's not - - . Rather - - began as a flawed -
17 - locations - - CSA [phonetic] and UFB
18 [phonetic] over - - personnel - - systems. The
19 - - turn on a - - is not - - principal and
20 teacher evaluations. - - to close - - schools -
21 - . - - ask what we do about it. - - teachers
22 - - 50 percent of all teachers - - excess.
23 There's nothing educationally sound about - - it
24 is being introduced for cynical reasons, not to
25 help students. It will not contribute to - -

1 principal and teacher evaluation systems.
2 Furthermore, - - in these schools - - other
3 schools, the - - will stay in our schools with -
4 - system, one after another after hours. While
5 we - - most important ones - - fiscal cost too.
6 Remove over 1,800 teachers and - - substitutes
7 at the low salary will cost the city
8 approximately 180 million dollars annually.
9 They say that children - - . We say children -
10 - when?

11 [applause]

12 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you. - - Elijah - - .

13 ELIJAH: I'm not - - . I'm a - - . I
14 didn't - - everything down. And my teacher told
15 me about us not finishing - - . And I figure I
16 have to say something. I just want to say that
17 all these years I've worked so hard - - my
18 father pushing me. I can't let it go now. I
19 just - - myself and cops just looking at me.
20 And - - got better. - - my father finished.
21 And now - - I'll be the one to go to college and
22 succeed and have my family - - . And I'll be
23 the one who - - other families - - other
24 families. They can help each other. - - maybe
25 that's the trick - - . That's the trick that

1 makes - - go to this school. - - like that.
2 I feel that - - so that other children, other
3 kids - - . So I'm saying if you, if you work on
4 something, don't give up. Don't let - - happen
5 to you. - - my father always told me never give
6 up. - - , but I'm not. I don't want to do
7 this. I worked too hard for this. Too many
8 years - - books started studying, studying, and
9 reading. - - my father pushed me. My mom was
10 learning when - - . I don't - - father's head
11 now and my mom's - - all my friends - - head
12 down saying - - he couldn't - - school - - .

13 [applause]

14 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you Mr. - - . Sorry
15 about the microphone problems. Could I--there
16 have been a number of questions already about
17 the future of the CTE programs. We've got a
18 number of questions. So I want to let folks
19 know when we get to the Q & A portion, we are
20 going to address some of them very directly to
21 avoid any confusion that's out there. The
22 concerns that you have. The things we need to
23 address. We want to let you know in addition to
24 the statement that was made before by the
25 chancellor, that we will be addressing some of

1 those questions during the Q & A. With that
2 I'll turn it to speaker number five, Jamal
3 Dudley.

4 MR. JAMAL DUDLEY: - - . I'm Jamal Dudley.
5 I'm a parent from the neighborhood, from the - -
6 . - - graduate from vocational high school.
7 Both of my sons attend Smith. Jamal Dudley,
8 Jr., and - - . We're doing very well - - this -
9 - . It's big - - addressing schools. It's
10 about - - . We're - - this high school and
11 education where the - - just not really being
12 able to have the kids continue with - - and be
13 able to hold onto - - myself forcing them to
14 have to work for bigger businesses and work--and
15 be on long waiting lists for the union in most
16 of these types of positions without having the
17 opportunity to possibly start and run their own
18 businesses - - . With my high school education
19 I was able to get my electrical license two and
20 a half years early. Now I have 15 employees and
21 - - with my CTE. I made - - while taking away
22 something. Why take - - what good - - .

23 [applause]

24 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you Mr. Dudley. The
25 next five speakers are speakers six through ten.

1 Uh, Scott, it looks like Palin--I'm sorry - -
2 .

3 MR. SCOTT PAGAN: Pagan.

4 MR. BETHEIL: Pagan, thank you. Number
5 seven is Devon Lacker, number eight was Warren
6 Baker [phonetic], but I believe they didn't want
7 to speak, they just wanted to make sure they had
8 their chance. Speaker number nine is Fred
9 Pollack and number ten is Sterling Robison. The
10 microphone, Mr. Pagan.

11 MR. PAGAN: My name is Scott Pagan. - -
12 beginning my speech by saying - - students. - -
13 necessary since - - I'm - - also about the
14 promise that was made to them that they - - high
15 school. That this closure or transition will
16 not affect them. This is just not a program
17 that's been taken from them - - . It's an
18 invaluable asset as Mr. Dudley said, it counts
19 as two and a half units for New York City master
20 electrician's license. They seek to - - qualify
21 just to take several student service exams such
22 as - - . The CTE - - apprenticeship programs -
23 - construction - - . If - - do not see CTE - -
24 it's a tremendous disserve and injustice to
25 these students. If you are concerned, this is

1 children in New York City not - - disservice
2 and injustice to these children - - .

3 [applause]

4 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you. Our next speaker
5 is - - .

6 MR. DEVON LACKER: My name is Devon - - and
7 I currently go to Alfred Smith High School. Let
8 the mission at this school provides - - addition
9 to its students. It has come to my attention
10 that all the time and energy that I've put in
11 also other students of this school might be cut
12 short. And - - unfair. Myself and most of the
13 other students at Alfred E. Smith. Information
14 that we take in at this school is important due
15 to the fact that this - - this CTE education is
16 not very easily found. It's actually - -
17 actually obtained - - . It's not ever easy to
18 come by. Also, also the--yes. Also, - - had an
19 opportunity that people--that the students have
20 - - . We not only had the 60 education - - .
21 So let's say - - not doing so good, this
22 actually - - credits. And that program, that -
23 - education - - every last student into - -
24 school. And that's a different way to be taught
25 - - injustice for that - - school. - - this - -

1 community - - not full of great opportunities.
2 So the education that we are provided through
3 this school is very important. Letting - -
4 opportunities see - - out from school. Not only
5 is it a foundation for our - - future, it helps
6 us to build success. And we need this school -
7 - outside the school. This information - -
8 great foundation for all the students - - that
9 want to have - - , that want to succeed in life.

10 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you, Mr. Walker. I just
11 want to confirm speaker number eight - - . You
12 are going to speak? Mr. Baker.

13 MR. BAKER: Hi, my name is - - . - - 26
14 schools closing in New York. In fact, today in
15 the Bronx there's two more of these hearings
16 going on - - everything else. - - with this.
17 Students are being - - with actions and protests
18 in order to be heard, to really fight back
19 against these and doing more participating just
20 in this obviously useless - - and demand our - -
21 that something interested. - - and I don't want
22 to - - academy is coming to New York. We're
23 going to see our system of 400,000 of students.
24 And as profit education in New York. So - - I
25 just wanted to - - and there's something else

1 for you. - - but - - schools here - - and,
2 um, - - students--high school students who - -
3 participating in - - actions - - come into New
4 York - - more than you can do than just talk to
5 the officials who won't listen to you and not do
6 a thing for you. You can - - system. - - so
7 yes.

8 [applause]

9 MR. BETHEIL: Speaker number nine, Mr.
10 Pollack.

11 MR. FRED POLLACK: I hope the Department of
12 Education - - and, uh, they seems like this is a
13 done deal and, uh, - - the situation here and
14 that, uh, that it's already been decided, which
15 - - opportunity - - they had such tremendous - -
16 in the community and, uh, I just hope that, that
17 you keep the auto - - program, you keep the
18 teachers that keep going - - I do have something
19 that - - Alfred E. Smith is an important - -
20 institution in the New York's - - it would be a
21 tragic mistake to close it. Every working - -
22 teachers going on 30 years and - - as well as -
23 - vital role Smith plays in the community.
24 Students will value the experience and the
25 excellent - - program, which is probably the

1 best program in the city if not the nation.
2 Smith has - - mentoring program - - graduates
3 are - - certification - - . - - working
4 relationship with - - build the relationship - -
5 and the trade association - - no more. I do
6 know - - and, uh, thanks to the program - -
7 community. - - our families - - poor - - city.
8 - - for some technicians. They're contractors
9 and professionals - - . We have received the
10 Board of Education should use these resources to
11 turn over the very benefits that - - . Now
12 unfortunately - - from down on Pico - - our
13 employees should reconsider closing - - who can
14 go around and participate in the program and for
15 the society who will - - . Thank you for your
16 consideration.

17 [applause]

18 MR. BETHEIL: Next is speaker number ten,
19 Sterling Robison.

20 MR. STERLING ROBISON: Hello everyone. - -
21 because they know how I feel about it - - . So
22 - - community. It's been set. They're not
23 listening. They're not going to listen. If you
24 - - student. They give you tons of reasons why
25 the school should close. - - . They said many

1 times the data, the - - not heard from any - -
2 is - - education do to close the achievement gap
3 - - .

4 [applause]

5 MR. ROBISON: I have not seen one iota of
6 anything that told me about the number of
7 internships while - - that they are going to
8 recruit - - Bronx. To ensure that - -
9 opportunity when they go - - . They didn't have
10 that - - . You heard speakers from the - -
11 association that - - one of the - - associations
12 that gives away all different dealerships across
13 New York City. They - - just like - - the
14 actual competition. They're out - - students,
15 111 of them have come through these doors. And
16 the activists - - for people - - comes in that
17 actually provides students with opportunity.
18 But we talk about the gap. Maybe - - should
19 just - - for doing - - education chose not to do
20 with, with academic responsibilities - - . - -
21 with your assistance. All because of - -
22 representative indicated because they did not--
23 they don't negotiate - - evaluation and the
24 principal - - . How criminal is that? And the
25 then document says - - half the consideration.

1 This was done on - - office - - . So just
2 because - - after much consideration because you
3 - - times - - and principal - - does not mean
4 that they mean it. It's just not.

5 [applause]

6 MR. ROBISON: It is impossible to believe
7 that all of these - - have been to - - . And
8 trust me there's - - knows, it, Board of
9 Education knows it, many of you know - - Career
10 and Technical Education - - federation of
11 teachers - - . Not only have you known about it
12 - - been in this school many times. - - going
13 to be visited. I think - - . So to - - that we
14 have to make the case to the folks that are
15 trying to shut us down. Especially when you
16 think about the economic development that's
17 happening in the Bronx. But you are not alone.
18 This is something that they are doing - - two
19 other schools right? Geographically located in
20 the same area. - - . They talk about, oh yes,
21 the CTE programs are those the - - taken care
22 of. We got - - association that does not - - .
23 So what does that - - schools - - these folks
24 have--they've got - - and quiet. And - - us
25 apart. - - for opportunity and - - in this

1 school and other - - . They got - - . So - -
2 and we can sing and we can tie ourselves - - .
3 - - two minutes - - .

4 FEMALE VOICE: Keep talking. You're doing
5 fine.

6 MR. ROBISON: I say this because for all of
7 us we - - schools. Because if we don't stand up
8 for the students, who's going to stand up for
9 them? Some of you - - what did you see in the
10 television when you're faced with a - - .

11 [Applause]

12 MR. ROBINSON: - - think about is this
13 because they don't want to talk about - -
14 students. Teachers have the right to - - people
15 are hiring them. - - confidence that the system
16 that we send out children in--our public school
17 system - - a place where they can send their
18 kids so they can ensure that they're going to
19 get a - - education. Before CTE goes - -
20 multiple path of opportunity, whether they are
21 going to continue that way or whether they are
22 going to - - worthless. Unfortunately - - has
23 chosen not to - - that. We don't - -
24 destruction. That it's happening not just - -
25 across the - - . If that's - - would there be

1 so much destruction or - - . So - - I - -
2 because this is a travesty. They - - our
3 community. It's so devastating in the impact to
4 the students in this building is, is going to be
5 - - . Not to say - - school. But - - other
6 factors that they're not telling you. When you
7 shut down a school and change the name and you
8 go back and you look at that school - - in 2012
9 and you come back to a - - you pick out - -
10 school that no longer exists. - - after the
11 school closes, it's history. The same - - that
12 they occupy with - - occupy that building.
13 Think about the noises, the cases - - the hours
14 of testimony. Many of those documents - -
15 middle of the street or - - street. The same
16 thing happens to people - - because if you go
17 back to this school, anything after 2012 you
18 will no longer - - think about all the schools
19 that are closing down. - - come back and you
20 say, ha, I - - maybe we can find somebody who
21 used to be in school and see - - because there's
22 no one there to - - . So having said that for
23 those that are coming down and speaking, - -
24 voice on the record. Let it be known that, you
25 know, we object to these kind of closures. Not

1 just this school, but any school especially
2 with the Department of Education - - support.
3 Okay. Thank you very much.

4 [applause]

5 MR. BETHEIL: Now that Mr. Robison has
6 finished his two minutes. Thank you. We'll
7 move on the speakers 11 through 15. Janella
8 Hines, Ellen Lara, Luz Colon, Carlos Levy, and
9 just one name. It looks like Kirka [phonetic].
10 Ms. Hynes? Okay.

11 MS. JANELLA HYNES: Good evening, my - - and
12 - - speeches - - high school position. When I
13 stand here as - - to speak loudly and clearly -
14 - political decision to close this school.
15 School closure in many cases is devastating to
16 our community, to the students, to the
17 educators, to the community members that it
18 serves - - . It should be in this effort the
19 final step in a series of steps that have been
20 taken by the Department of Education - - a
21 school - - that the students at - - have no
22 access, have no relationships, - - . That's not
23 the place here. That is not the reality here at
24 Alfred E. Smith. Their own documents show the
25 proper - - . Their own document shows that the

1 relationship that exists within the
2 institutions of higher learning where it can be
3 - - where you - - and have substance in our
4 approving - - mostly - - who is in this school
5 community. This is a - - a community school
6 that is working to provide opportunity - -
7 process to the - - this school. And the DOE is
8 willing to shut that out through a political
9 decision. As someone said, this is about
10 collective bargaining - - this is not about - -
11 new opportunities, better education, and real
12 support for these students. And this will be -
13 - so I stand here in solidarity with the - -
14 with the parents who have spoken, with the
15 educators who have spoken, the community members
16 who have spoken to say, we stand against this.
17 This is unacceptable. This political rule
18 should not be sanctioned today. If you are - -
19 taking back all of this information to - - make
20 a decision. This decision has not been made
21 yet. You're not asking me to listen to what has
22 been said today, to taking it back, and to - -
23 schools - - .

24 [applause]

25 MR. BETHEIL: Speaker twelve. Mr. Lara.

1 MR. LARA: Yes. Good evening. How are
2 you? My name is - - Lara - - and I'm here today
3 to let you know that - - students can learn and
4 have the opportunity to go - - high school - -
5 in the Bronx and - - . We all know that you - -
6 and the - - school. - - is one of - - . The
7 big - - opportunity for the - - to get very
8 smaller and - - was a - - to close the school
9 down. This is a - - will disappear and this - -
10 sense. - - opportunity - - sense. - - sense
11 that 100 percent of the students are - - . It
12 is not to say that 100 percent of the teachers -
13 - this woman says - - nobody says we're going to
14 - - our school. No one says we're going to - -
15 . Nobody says - - school. - - opportunity you
16 are destroying family. You are taking away - -
17 disrespecting the teaching profession. Abusing
18 your power and - - and the floor - - . thank
19 you.

20 [applause]

21 MR. BETHEIL: - - Ms. Colon.

22 MS. LUZ COLON: Hi. My name is Luz Colon.
23 - - started here as - - teachers that - - he has
24 gone from a - - to national honor society.

25 [applause]

1 MS. COLON: And - - and that's all because
2 of the teachers in this school and the way that
3 they care. I've never seen anything - - they
4 don't care about the students here. It's - -
5 and it's a travesty to close the school. I've
6 sent a letter to - - and the DOE and to - - and
7 I have not received an answer. So - - and
8 that's - - . Stop - - . Thank you.

9 MR. BETHEIL: Next is Carlos Levy, speaker
10 14.

11 MR. CARLOS LEVY: As speaker number ten
12 said, I'm one of many other students here being
13 served a true dishonesty for the 2012 term. - -
14 other students here didn't come here for a CTE
15 diploma and we are - - future if - - MC88
16 [phonetic] small - - and - - electrical union
17 that do hire from Smith. And - - toward the
18 future. Many - - and they rebuild the homes and
19 schools of our community. And this is a true -
20 - . True. Thank you.

21 LILLIAN: Hi my name is Lily - - and I'm a
22 science teacher at Smith. I - - and this
23 building remains Smith, it remains something.
24 It's not - - . It is a - - . And when you hear
25 the name Smith, you associate what goes on in

1 there. When a building - - was phased out to
2 - - I thought that the Department of Education
3 had slapped Smith High School in the face
4 because the CTE program - - program was one of
5 the best - - and we produced quality, skilled
6 workers. You took that away from Smith. Two
7 years later, you're doing it again. These
8 students who - - someone else - - anticipating
9 the fact that they - - wouldn't graduate with an
10 endorsement - - CTE - - . Closing the school
11 and remaining - - my concern is, yes, things are
12 - - but they - - take advantage of this
13 innovation. Many years ago we should expect - -
14 and this is what - - closing Smith High School.
15 That is the worst - - . So my concern now is,
16 yes, we are - - . That is a fact. We just
17 learned to go through the process - - fine I
18 said that. But the fact is the school - - my -
19 - that I had - - questions. And they had
20 support - - Smith High School endorsement.
21 Smith--not - - school, not - - .

22 [applause]

23 LILLIAN: - - are angry and they don't know
24 what to do. And it's not - - . Thank you.

25 [applause]

1 MR. BETHEIL: Our final five speakers are
2 speaker 16, Lucinda Mendez, who spoke earlier
3 for the panel, speaker 17 is Stanley Cunningham,
4 speaker 18, Juanita Bess who I believe spoke
5 earlier, thank you. Speaker 19 is Max - - .
6 Thank you. And speaker 20 angel Franco and
7 speaker 21, Paulette Sylvester. Mr. Cunningham.

8 MR. STANLEY CUNNINGHAM: My name is Stanley
9 Cunningham and I'm - - . I work as a - -
10 technical institute - - school. I'd like to - -
11 a number of students each year who are - -
12 Alfred E. Smith school - - post-secondary
13 education and I can tell you certainly that - -
14 some of the best students that come to - -
15 Alfred E. Smith. So - - preparation for - - the
16 Smith students - - . - - almost every aspect of
17 - - involves some form of technology and almost
18 every job - - interaction - - some other - -
19 high tech device. - - is considered or - - and
20 how you need to - - will not feel that - - town
21 - - city or state - - . Another - - science,
22 technology - - high schools that had classes,
23 that taught - - technology - - technology - -
24 and the success - - ability to move goods and
25 services - - including getting ourselves some

1 work - - we - - transportation - - Alfred E.
2 Smith is a CTE school and each year - - a number
3 of the students - - choice for secondary
4 education. These students - - the very ones who
5 we depend upon to continue making America the
6 country that it is. The - - any - - expectation
7 - - our country great - - and the desire to have
8 - - all of these things. We want - - is to
9 allow Alfred E. Smith to have more - - to
10 achieve the excellence that we know - - if - - .

11 [applause]

12 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you. Next is Mr.
13 Rivera.

14 MR. MAX RIVERA: My name is - - Rivera. I'm
15 a - - and also a long time resident of this
16 community and I'm here - - the thought of this -
17 - this is already a - - so I don't know how
18 you're - - when they could really have - - I
19 know - - people don't have to - - people have a
20 choice - - participate with this kind of hearing
21 when we know this is already a done deal. This
22 is - - Mayor Bloomberg to privatize all
23 education. You - - all the - - by using the
24 city and teacher union - - we'll - - and I'm
25 going to - - the students are better, the - -

1 are better, the people in this community - -
2 this is who - - who are they - - for - -

3 [applause]

4 MR. RIVERA: And - - .

5 [applause]

6 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you. Nest is Angel
7 Franco.

8 MR. ANGEL FRANCO: Yes, yes. I'm also a
9 member of the south Bronx community - - . I
10 want to ask you what - - on the students who are
11 - - . They are going get - - . How many - -
12 when you have - - . This isn't--this is what,
13 the second time that we've - - charter schools
14 and - - years. They took - - corrupt - -
15 political views. That charter school - -
16 actually - - agriculture and - - and
17 construction industry. Why - - ? I mean, I
18 actually - - . I mean that's - - that the
19 person - - south Bronx - - education is not - -
20 is not - - but all the same I - - personal gain
21 - - and I understand why you would do this, why
22 you make the deals. But when we - - this is not
23 - - this - - the children's future. After - -
24 to a private - - from all the people. This is
25 not - - . With that said, you know, you have

1 heard - - Alfred E. Smith and you will
2 continue to hear about Alfred E. Smith because
3 this is not, this is not - - . You decision is
4 adopted so it does not matter. - - you'll - -
5 you'll reduce it. - - . But we knew - - .
6 This discourages us. This just shows us that
7 this is not enough. - - what - - represent our
8 kids to be - - . With that said, - - true
9 success rate. They say Alfred E. Smith had--
10 let's see--52, - - 53 percent graduation rate.
11 So if - - kid - - for example, if 100 kids apply
12 to Alfred E. Smith, 100 kids came to Alfred E.
13 Smith. If I'm - - maybe 60 percent. Maybe 60
14 of those kids will make it. From that 60
15 percent - - third student - - 30 percent of
16 those kids left the school after the first year.
17 So - - destination - - after the 4 year
18 graduation - - 53 kids. We can - - graduation
19 rate after - - more kids. So I want to ask you,
20 how do you - - 16 - - ? And subsequently - -
21 keep on trying - - this - - future is. - - why
22 don't you just - - . One thing - - are
23 eliminating - - . You're only asking. So my
24 last question for you, do you think - - these
25 individuals who - - top - - within our schools -

1 - are you going to - - have you done your job?
2 I hope - - because - - injustice to this
3 community. The community will - - .

4 [applause]

5 MR. NEWTON: I just want to clarify a couple
6 of things in terms of - - someone just - - to us
7 as direct questions. First of all, there is no
8 proposal to put in charge of school in this
9 building. I agree there was a proposal two
10 years ago. And after a hearing in this
11 auditorium that was filled to the rafters, that
12 proposal was withdrawn and a charter school was
13 not - - . So I want to make sure that nobody
14 leaves the building believing that there's a
15 charter school involved in this proposal. There
16 is not. Mr. Franco also asked the question
17 about whether or not students in this school or
18 those in the - - school are guaranteed a place
19 in this school. And that's - - original reading
20 of the proposal. All current students are
21 guaranteed to be placed in the new school if
22 it's approved when it opens. And any student
23 that has applied and has been accepted into the
24 ninth grade next year will be offered a spot in
25 the new school will be - - . So anybody that is

1 worried about enrollment, those are two things
2 I just wanted to correct the record. The third
3 question about whether or not I can sleep at
4 night. I'm not sure that is appropriate to
5 answer here. But I can say that we do listen to
6 these hearings. That the hearing that happened
7 in this auditorium two years ago is a fine
8 example of that where additional information was
9 introduced. The department did - - did change
10 the proposal - - .

11 MALE VOICE: :- -two years.

12 MR. NEWTON: Very, very clear. I don't want
13 any parents leaving tonight believing that their
14 students do not have a place in the new school
15 or that there's a charter school being
16 introduced to the building. Neither of those
17 questions are part of the current proposal. We
18 have one remaining speaker. It's speaker number
19 21, Paulette Sylvester.

20 MS. PAULETTE SYLVESTER: Good evening. I'm
21 the parents of the child - - Alfred Smith High
22 School. And I should - - single parents who are
23 - - their time with all - - I did not choose for
24 my child to be born - - it's my - - to be born
25 with mental capacity that requires him to have a

1 - - . That's not my choice. I have this
2 child. He's one. Therefore, it's my
3 responsibility to take care of him and see that
4 he can function productively in society because,
5 you know what, - - and if he's not - - than the
6 whole society will suffer - - . And that's why
7 I'm here to ask to - - parents and said, - -
8 supposed to go to high school - - at eight years
9 old, he told me mommy I don't want to work - - I
10 don't want to have my own business. At eight
11 years old, he has shown a natural desire or a
12 nature proficiency for - - . And when I - -
13 today to - - student. And specifically not for
14 a high school that - - program. And if that
15 kind of school was Smith--Alfred E. Smith High
16 School, I have found over the years that these
17 teachers are hardworking. They are - - and they
18 go to the extra mile to make sure that these
19 children succeed. That's my personal - - .
20 Okay. Now I - - now who has - - as I said
21 before - - parents would like to see their child
22 succeed. Yes, I would love to see - - . But I
23 have to face reality - - because of - - but I
24 also - - and I see that he can really - - high
25 school - - .

1 [applause]

2 MS. SYLVESTER: - - and because of not being
3 able to do - - but he can be a productive,
4 productive, and I repeat productive member of
5 society. And as I said before if my child - -
6 suffers all of them suffers because, you know
7 what, - - more - - productive because - - caring
8 on feeling - - who are out there - - . - -
9 personally and - - my children wherever I go I
10 will fight for my children - - .

11 [applause]

12 MS. SYLVESTER: - - . - - time. You know
13 it is hard to say, but most of these schools
14 that are being closed in particular Smith High
15 School has a large number of children who are -
16 - what is going to happen to those children who
17 cannot - - to go on to - - university. Does
18 anybody - - ? Does anyone have children who are
19 - - in a public school? - - does anyone from -
20 - Department of Education. Does anybody right
21 here - - or - - positions? Do - - that is my
22 question. Who - - child and - - positions and -
23 - ? Do you - - question. Thank you.

24 MR. BETHEIL: Thank you Ms. Sylvester.

25 MALE VOICE: You people should be ashamed of

1 yourselves.

2 MR. BETHEIL: With that I'm concluding the
3 public comment. And we'll now begin the
4 question and answer period. We've had - - of
5 individual questions that have been submitted
6 and we'll try and address most of them here
7 tonight. And those of the representative. Any
8 question that is not answered here tonight, will
9 be answered on the department's website prior to
10 the - - educational policy meeting. If you have
11 additional questions at the conclusion of
12 tonight's proceedings, we ask that you direct
13 them to us via the phone number and email that I
14 mentioned before. Let me repeat it again. By
15 calling 212-374-5159, 212-374-5159, or by
16 sending comments with concerns through email to
17 d07proposals@schools.nyc.gov. Again that's
18 d07proposals@schools.nyc.gov. As I said before,
19 a number of the most concerning questions this
20 evening addressed the status of the programs
21 here at the school relative to their continued
22 work moving forward and the opportunities for
23 students in those programs would have as well as
24 the status of their technical endorsements.
25 There were three questions that were asked of us

1 and I'll reads them and then I'll turn it over
2 to Amanda Kahn to respond. The first is what
3 provision is there for the automotive school?
4 The second question is will students at the
5 building trades programs here have the
6 opportunity to earn a CTE endorsed diploma when
7 they graduate in June 2013. The third question
8 is what - - happen to automotive - - .

9 AMANDA: Good evening everyone. - - those
10 questions were received on - - cards and we also
11 heard - - so we're glad to have the opportunity
12 to clear this up. Regarding the new trades, the
13 programs which are currently approved and are
14 currently - - give CTE endorsed diplomas and
15 those are the carpentry - - program, - -
16 program, current - - programs tonight. If this
17 proposal moves forward, those programs would be
18 part of the new school in their same process of
19 phasing out and so students who are currently in
20 11th and 12th grade and are in those programs
21 and are planning to get CTE endorsed diplomas,
22 should still be able to get those diplomas.

23 [Crosstalk]

24 AMANDA: - - as the existing school. So if
25 the students stay on track and stay in school

1 and continue - - .

2 MR. NEWTON: Where is it stated? The EIS
3 does not say that. Where does it state that
4 they will get this? We want chapter and verse.

5 AMANDA: Exactly - - let's go through the
6 EIS together.

7 MR. NEWTON: No, I'm--again this - - .

8 [Crosstalk]

9 AMANDA: - - continue - - . So the
10 questions asked about the - - program. So the
11 first piece is what about - - school and the
12 proposal for the school that would open in the
13 coming year would be an - - school. So again
14 the question about - - trades. Currently those
15 two programs are in development, which means
16 that they exist for students and are in the
17 process of getting approval, which will once
18 that approval is granted, allow programs to get
19 endorsements under - - . Currently this - - but
20 we have the - - on the tenth, which is a step in
21 the process. And the school that would be
22 coming in would continue the process. So that
23 the new school would be able to move in that
24 direction and hopefully as soon as possible be
25 able to endorse - - .

1 MR. NEWTON: That's not an answer.

2 [Crosstalk]

3 MR. NEWTON: That's totally obfuscating.

4 [Crosstalk]

5 MR. BETHEIL: Folks, let me be very clear.
6 - - if this proposal is rejected. As is the
7 case right now, students in the automotive
8 programs cannot - - get endorsed diploma - -
9 currently. If there was no proposal, those
10 students could not get endorsed diplomas because
11 in the automotive programs those two programs
12 are not currently approved by the state
13 Department of Education. Those programs are in
14 the process of developing towards approval as
15 has been the case in the construction trades
16 programs and when state approval is received,
17 students that are still in progress can earn
18 that technical endorsement. That is a separate
19 process from the main - - you heard before,
20 which is an outside endorsement different from
21 the state's ability to grant a diploma. And
22 that is true across any CTE school in the city
23 that they have not earned a CTE approval by the
24 state and they are unable to bring their
25 approval.

1 MR. NEWTON: - - new procedure. New
2 school - - new procedure has to be initiated.
3 So how can you say that? - - .

4 MR. BETHEIL: Mr. Newton. Mr. Newton. This
5 is a process that's been going since the
6 original, um, phase down of the construction
7 trades program. There's ongoing conversations
8 with the state, that assuming that the - -
9 material are the same and are following the
10 curriculum, the state tells us that there should
11 not be any problem transitioning them over. I
12 don't want to suggest that it's a sure thing or
13 people were - - it needs to be gone through and
14 that's why this program - - developed and
15 continue to be developed as fully as they need
16 to be to earn that state endorsement. When
17 we're talking about the automotive programs,
18 that state endorsement does not exist - - .

19 MALE VOICE: - - .

20 MR. BETHEIL: With that - - comments this
21 evening. We appreciate the - - contributions to
22 the - - . The information will be shared with
23 the panel on educational policy, which will have
24 its hearing on April 26th, 2012, at 6:00 p.m. -
25 - 83 Plazen Avenue in Brooklyn to vote on this

1 proposal. Again, please use the phone number
2 212-374-5159 or send email to
3 d07proposals@schools.nyc.gov if you have any
4 other questions or concerns. Thank you for
5 coming. This joint public hearing is officially
6 adjourned.

7 [END RECORDING]

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio files and have been transcribed to the best of my ability.

Signature 

Date 4/18/12