

Public Comment Analysis

Date: February 24, 2015

Topic: The Proposed Temporary Partial Re-siting and Co-location of P.S. 46 Edgar Allan Poe (10X046) with Thomas C. Giordano M.S. 45 (10X045) in Building X045 for Four Years Beginning in the 2015-2016 School Year

Date of Panel Vote: February 25, 2015

Summary of Proposal

On January 8, 2015, the New York City Department of Education (“DOE”) issued an Educational Impact Statement (“EIS”) describing a proposal to temporarily re-site one grade level of P.S. 46 Edgar Allan Poe (10X046, “P.S. 46”) from building X046 (“X046”), located at 279 East 196th Street, Bronx, New York 10458 in Community School District 10 (“District 10”) to building X045 (“X045”), located at 2502 Lorillard Place, Bronx, New York, 10458, in District 10, where one grade level of P.S. 46 would be co-located with existing district middle school Thomas C. Giordano M.S. 45 (10X045, “M.S. 45”) for a four-year period beginning in the 2015-2016 school year. A “re-siting” means that students will attend classes in a different building than in previous years, and a “co-location” means that two or more school organizations are located in the same building and may share common spaces, such as auditoriums, gymnasiums, libraries, and cafeterias. A project to build an addition to the X046 building is scheduled to begin in the 2015-2016 school year, which will require P.S. 46 to temporarily re-site some of its students. If this proposal is approved, P.S. 46’s fifth-grade students will be co-located for four years with M.S. 45 in building X045 while the addition project is completed. The addition to X046 will add elementary school seats for District 10, which is in need of additional capacity.

P.S. 46 is an existing zoned elementary school that serves students in kindergarten through fifth grades in building X046. Additionally, P.S. 46 serves students in mini-building X846, located at the same address as main building X046, and nearby annex X831, located at 290 East 196th Street, Bronx, New York 10458, across the street from building X046. The utilization rate across all three buildings for the current school year is approximately 125%, indicating the need for additional capacity for P.S. 46, which is why construction of an addition to X046 is planned. Construction of the addition to X046 involves demolishing mini-building X846, which will require P.S. 46 students to vacate the mini-building. Building X046 and annex X831 do not have sufficient space to absorb the students currently served in mini-building X846; if a portion of P.S. 46 is not re-sited next year and P.S. 46 attempts to serve all of its students in the main building and annex, the approximate combined utilization rate of X046 and X831 is projected to be 134%-141% in 2015-2016. Therefore, a temporary partial re-siting is needed in order to accommodate all P.S. 46 students while the addition is under construction. The addition is anticipated to have a capacity of approximately 650 seats, which will substantially increase the capacity of the X046 building. The construction of the addition is anticipated to be completed prior to the start of the 2019-2020 school year, at which time the P.S. 46 students being served at X045 will return to X046 and annex X831, which will be collectively referred to as X046 throughout the remainder of this public comment analysis unless otherwise noted.

Building X045, where the DOE is proposing to re-site one grade level of P.S. 46, houses M.S. 45, an existing zoned district middle school that serves grades six through eight, and community-based organization (“CBO”) Beacon. Building X045 is approximately 0.8 miles away from building X046. According to the 2013-2014 Enrollment, Capacity, Utilization Report (the “Blue Book”), building X045 has the capacity to serve 1,262 students. In 2014-2015, the X045 building serves 716 students, yielding an estimated utilization rate of 57%, meaning the building is under-utilized and has space to accommodate additional students. If this proposal is approved, during the first year of its implementation in 2015-2016, there will be a total of 900-940 students served collectively by P.S. 46 and M.S. 45 in building X045. This yields a projected target utilization rate of 71%-74%. During the fourth and final year of this proposal, in 2018-2019, P.S. 46 and M.S. 45 will serve a total of 875-915 students in building X045. This yields a projected target utilization rate of 69%-73%. Therefore, the DOE believes that the X045 building can accommodate M.S. 45 students and the re-sited P.S. 46 students over the course of this proposal.



**Department of
Education**

Carmen Fariña, Chancellor

The details of this proposal have been released in an EIS, which can be accessed here:

<http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/leadership/PEP/publicnotice/2014-2015/February2015SchoolProposals>.

Copies of the EIS are also available in the main offices of P.S. 46 and M.S. 45.

Summary of Comments Received

DOE senior leadership led a walkthrough of building X045 and a School Leadership Team (“SLT”) meeting on December 18, 2014 with P.S. 46 Principal Jennifer Alexander Ade and M.S. 45 Principal Annamaria Giordano. Also in attendance at that meeting were representatives from P.S. 46’s and M.S. 45’s SLTs, CEC 8 President Marvin Shelton, and a representative from the Office of District Planning.

Two joint public hearings regarding this proposal were held at the X045 and X046 buildings on February 9, 2015 and February 11, 2015, respectively. At these hearings, interested parties had an opportunity to provide input on the proposal. Approximately 11 members of the public attended the hearing at X045 on February 9, 2015 and three people spoke. Approximately 40 people attended the hearing at X046 on February 11, 2015, at which time seven people spoke. Present at the X045 meeting were Chancellor’s Designee Maria Quail; CEC 10 President Marvin Shelton; P.S. 46 SLT representative Principal Jennifer Alexander Ade; M.S. 45 SLT representatives Principal Annamaria Giordano and Robyn Cutler; and Vicki Javier and Gregory Whitten from the DOE. Present at the X046 meeting were Chancellor’s Designee Maria Quail; CEC 10 President Marvin Shelton; P.S. 46 SLT representative Principal Jennifer Alexander Ade; and Vicki Javier and Bridget Mercier from the DOE.

The following comments and remarks were made at the joint public hearing at X045 on February 9, 2015:

1. Marvin Shelton, president of CEC 10, commented as follows:
 - a. He is in support of the proposal.
2. M.S. 45 Principal Giordano commented as follows:
 - a. She is in support of the proposal.
 - b. She has general concerns around safety regarding this new co-location.
 - c. She wants to understand how classroom equipment will be moved to facilitate the co-location.
3. P.S. 46 Principal Ade commented as follows:
 - a. She is in support of the temporary co-location proposal.
 - b. P.S. 46 is planning on having a technology teacher at X045, if this proposal is approved. That teacher will also be able to provide Special Education Teacher Support Services (“SETSS”).

The following comments and remarks were made at the joint public hearing at X046 on February 11, 2015:

4. CEC 10 President Marvin Shelton stated that:
 - a. The proposal should have a provision indicating the transportation services that will be provided to P.S. 46 students who will have to travel to M.S. 45.
5. P.S. 46 Principal Ade commented that:
 - a. There will be a full-time guidance counselor at M.S. 45 to ease the transition for P.S. 46 students.
6. A P.S. 46 teacher stated that:
 - a. She is in support of the proposal and is dedicated to continue her work with students from P.S. 46 regardless of location.
7. A commenter inquired if there will be transportation provided for impacted P.S. 46 students and, if not, can P.S. 46 parents choose the building where their children will attend school.
8. A commenter asked:
 - a. Will P.S. 46 students be picked up from their homes or from school?
 - b. Will P.S. 46’s articulating fifth-grade students be automatically enrolled at M.S. 46?
9. A commenter asked who will be impacted and when will the proposal take effect.
10. A P.S. 46 teacher commented that:
 - a. He will be teaching technology and providing SETSS at M.S. 45.
 - b. He will offer the same instruction to P.S. 46 students regardless of location.

- c. He is in support of the proposal since it will give P.S. 46 students an opportunity to experience being around middle school students.

Summary of Issues Raised in Written and/or Oral Comments Submitted to the DOE

11. The DOE received a written comment from a member of the public stating that:
 - a. She wants to know how the DOE will arrange transportation services for impacted P.S. 46 students.
 - b. She wants to know the safety plan that will be put in place.
 - c. She would like more details on who will be responsible for the P.S. 46 fifth-grade students.
 - d. She wants to know why the DOE is expanding P.S. 46's enrollment since there isn't sufficient capacity at X046.
 - e. She would like more details on the cost of the proposal.
 - f. P.S. 46 was not provided with translated documents regarding the proposal.
12. The DOE received an oral comment from a member of the public stating that:
 - a. She is in favor of a transportation plan that involves P.S. 46 students being picked up from X046 and dropped off at X045.

Analysis of Issues Raised, Significant Alternatives Proposed

Comments 1(a), 2(a), 3(a), 6(a), and 10(c) are in favor of the proposal and do not require a response.

Comments 3(b), 5(a), 10(a,b), and 11(c) concern P.S. 46's administrative and general personnel positions at X045, with several commenters stating that P.S. 46 students will be offered the same instruction and supports (e.g., technology and guidance counseling) regardless of location. One commenter asked about who will be responsible for fifth-grade students.

Some teachers and administrative staff who had previously been located at the X046 campus will now be located at building X045. Additionally, P.S. 46 staff may escort students between building X045 and building X046 if necessary. In response to comment 11c, the necessary P.S. 46 fifth grade teachers will report to building X045 beginning in 2015-2016 rather than X046 for regular teaching duties. In the event that P.S. 46 students being served at X045 require special services, the necessary service providers may need to travel to X046 to cover the student mandate. Additional staff may work in both buildings, and the P.S. 46 leadership and staff will work to program appropriately, as they have indicated in comments 3(b), 5(a), and 10(a,b).

Comments 4(a), 7, 8(a), 11(a), 12(a) concern the transportation services for impacted students.

Transportation for P.S. 46 and M.S. 45 will be provided according to Chancellor's Regulation A-801. More details on the DOE transportation policy can be found at: <http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/rdonlyres/21A1B11A-886B-4F74-9546-E875EE82A14C/40303/A801.pdf>. This proposal is not expected to impact the transportation services for M.S. 45. For P.S. 46, the temporary re-siting and co-location may result in different P.S. 46 students being eligible for busing than in past years, in accordance with with Chancellor's Regulation A-801. The Office of Pupil Transportation will determine all necessary bus routes once the proposal is approved. With regard to comment 7, the exact grade level and number of P.S. 46 students to be re-sited to X045 is at the discretion of P.S. 46 leadership, and parents will not be able to choose which students are sited where.

Comments 2(c), 9, 11(d), and 11(e) inquire about the rationale behind the co-location and practical details about how the proposal will be implemented (e.g., concerning classroom equipment and costs).

The DOE is proposing to temporarily re-site one grade level of P.S. 46 from its current building, X046, to building X045, where P.S. 46's grade level would be co-located with existing district middle school M.S. 45 for a four-year period beginning in the 2015-2016 school year. A project to build an addition to the X046 building is scheduled to begin in the 2015-2016 school year, which will require P.S. 46 to temporarily re-site some of its students. This addition is anticipated to have a capacity of approximately 650 seats, which will add additional elementary seats for District 10, which is in need of additional capacity. If this proposal is approved, P.S. 46's fifth-grade students will be



**Department of
Education**

Carmen Fariña, Chancellor

co-located for four years with M.S. 45 in building X045 while the addition project is completed. Specifically, the construction of the addition is anticipated to be completed prior to the start of the 2019-2020 school year, at which time the P.S. 46 students being served at X045 will return to X046 and annex X831. In response to comment 11(d), the proposal does not project an enrollment increase for P.S. 46. According to the 2014-2015 Audited Register, P.S. 46 serves approximately 1,252 students in the 2014-2015 school year. According to the EIS, P.S. 46 is projected to serve approximately 1,080-1,140 students in the 2019-2020 school year. In response to comment 2(c), if the proposal is approved, the Office of Space Planning will work with the P.S. 46 and M.S. 45 school leaders to re-locate classroom equipment, if needed, to facilitate the re-siting and co-location.

The estimated cost to temporarily relocate a portion of P.S. 46 to X045 is approximately \$45,000.00. (Estimate is based on average per-pupil re-siting cost estimates provided by the Office of Space Planning). This cost will include moving some existing materials and furniture from the current site to X045.

This proposal is not expected to otherwise impact the operating budget or costs of instruction at P.S. 46 or M.S. 45. Most funding in schools' budgets is allocated on a per pupil basis, based on current Fair Student Funding ("FSF") per capita allocation levels. Schools receive additional funds for students with disabilities, English Language Learners, and those with other supplemental academic needs.

Please refer to the FSF Guide and FY15 School Allocation Memorandum for additional information on cost of instruction and how the changes to FSF funding and other school allocations will be impacted as a result of register changes at P.S. 46 and M.S. 45. Staffing changes are at the discretion of the school within the limits of contractual and mandated obligations.

The FSF Guide can be accessed at:

http://schools.nyc.gov/offices/d_chanc_oper/budget/dbor/allocationmemo/fy14_15/FY15_PDF/sam01_1b.pdf.

The FY15 School Allocation Memorandum is available at:

http://schools.nyc.gov/offices/d_chanc_oper/budget/dbor/allocationmemo/fy14_15/FY15_PDF/sam33.pdf.

Should this proposal create a need for additional administrative space or function, the cost of voice and data lines will be fully covered by the DOE. This allocation is subject to approval by the Office of Space Planning.

Comments 2(b) and 11(b) concern the proposal's impact on campus safety and governance.

Due to space limitations across the city, it is not unusual for elementary schools and middle schools to be co-located in a building together. Pursuant to Chancellor's Regulation A-414, every school or campus is mandated to form a School Safety Committee ("the Committee"). This committee is responsible for developing a comprehensive School Safety Plan that defines the normal operations of the site and what procedures are in place in the event of an emergency, including a fire safety plan, which entails fire drill and evacuation procedures. School leaders from P.S. 46 and M.S. 45 will form a School Safety Committee at X045. The School Safety Plan is updated annually by the Committee to meet the changing security needs, changes in organization and building conditions and any other factors; these updates can also be made at any other time it is necessary to address security concerns. The Committee will also address safety matters on an ongoing basis and make appropriate recommendations to the principals when it identifies the need for additional security measures.

In addition, as stated in the EIS, the DOE makes available the following supports to schools relating to safety and security:

- Providing "Best Practices Standards for Creating and Sustaining a Safe and Supportive School," as a resource guide;
- Reviewing and monitoring school occurrence data and crime data (in conjunction with the Criminal Justice Coordinator and the New York City Police Department);
- Providing technical assistance via the Borough Safety Directors when incidents occur;
- Providing professional development and support to Children's First Network ("CFN") Safety Liaisons;
- Providing professional development and kits for Building Response Teams; and



**Department of
Education**

Carmen Fariña, Chancellor

- Monitoring and certifying School Safety Plans annually.

The DOE is committed to working with P.S. 46 and M.S. 45 to ensure a safe school atmosphere for all students.

Comment 8(b) concerns the proposal's impact on the middle school admissions process for P.S. 46 and M.S. 45.

This proposal is not expected to impact the admissions or enrollment of P.S. 46 and M.S. 45.

P.S. 46 will continue to give priority to students who live in its zone, as it has in the past, and in accordance with Chancellor's Regulation A-101. Articulating P.S. 46 fifth-grade students will not be automatically enrolled at M.S. 45. M.S. 45 currently admits students through the middle school admissions process using a screened admissions method, which admits applicants based on a set of criteria described in the Middle School Directory and gives priority to student residents of Districts 9 and 10. M.S. 45 also admits students via a zoned admissions method. M.S. 45's zoned program is open to students who reside in the zoned area. In other words, students who are zoned to M.S. 45 for middle school receive priority into this program. P.S. 46 fifth-graders will retain the opportunity to choose among many middle schools for sixth grade and will participate in the Middle School Admissions Process.

Comment 11(f) concerns the provision of translated notices to P.S. 46.

Notices in English and Spanish were provided to the school leadership of P.S. 46 and the principal of P.S. 46 has confirmed that they were backpacked home with students. Notices were also made available in the main offices of P.S. 46 and M.S. 45.

Changes Made to the Proposal

No changes have been made to this proposal.