

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF
EDUCATION - DIVISION OF
PORTFOLIO PLANNING**

P.S. 230 Dr. Roland N. Patterson

**2/25/13
5:30 P.M.**

1 [START RECORDING]

2 MR. GARY BETNEIC: It's approximately 6:15.
3 If you have a question that you would like to be
4 addressed during the question and answer portion
5 of the agenda, please write that portion on the
6 index cards that are provided outside on the
7 table and submit them to the volunteer at the
8 table. Only people who have signed up to speak
9 will be able to participate in the public
10 comments. All town participants were asked to
11 be here no later than 5:30 p.m. Three members
12 have arrived from - - . Now that we've started,
13 if anyone else arrives, he or she will have time
14 to speak at the first opportune moment. We want
15 to be respectful of everybody's time - - .
16 There may be elected officials who arrive at
17 different points throughout the evening. If
18 they wish to speak, we'll do our best to
19 accommodate them at the first opportune moment.
20 Those who are here at the start of the public
21 comment period will be asked to speak first. As
22 we'll see in the full agenda as described, we're
23 in a room. The four members mentioned on the
24 public hearing will include the presentation of
25 the proposal and presentations of the five

1 hearing participants filed by the - - time.
2 Speakers should have already signed up at the
3 signup table in the lobby. Public comments will
4 be no longer than two minutes each. The time
5 will be strictly followed. The speakers will be
6 informed when their designated time has ended.
7 There will be a question and answer period.
8 Members of the audience, if you have a question,
9 please write your question on the index cards
10 that were supplied at the signup table we
11 provided this evening. While public comments
12 are taking place, staff members will organize
13 questions into categories and get them ready for
14 the question and answer period. Some questions
15 will be asked directly from the index card.
16 Others will be asked under headings in order to
17 avoid repetitiveness. Even though all
18 individual questions will not be addressed in
19 the forum tonight, answers to questions will be
20 posted on the Department of Education website,
21 prior to the town hall educational policy
22 meeting. Independent of - - and you still have
23 questions, we urge you to direct them to us by
24 calling the phone number on the bottom of the
25 fact sheet or send them to us via e-mail to the

1 e-mail address provided on the fact sheets.
2 That e-mail address is
3 do9proposals@schools.nyc.gov. Again, that's
4 do9prospals@schools.nyc.gov or by calling us at
5 (212) 374-5159, (212) 374-5159. I would now
6 like to introduce the panel, which has been
7 assembled for tonight's joint public hearing.
8 At the end, we have representing the Community
9 Educational Council, our president Marilyn Asad
10 [phonetic]. We're also joined by Superintendent
11 Doris Estatida [phonetic], and Principal of I.S.
12 229, Ezra Matthias [phonetic]. Thank you for
13 joining us this evening. On this side, we have
14 from the school leadership team, Karen Resa-Gild
15 [phonetic]. We're also joined by Wendall
16 Deloatch [phonetic], who's the SLT co-
17 chairperson, Theona Williams [phonetic], the SLT
18 chairperson, Yvette Jenkins, the United
19 Federation of Teachers, also a member of the
20 School Initiative Team, Marina Penn [phonetic],
21 Principal of P.S. 230X, and Shael Suransky, our
22 - - chancellor. I just want to - - if there are
23 any elected officials that have yet arrived. If
24 they do arrive, we'll be sure to introduce them.
25 With that, I'll now turn the podium over to

1 Chancellor Shael Suransky who will present the
2 proposal.

3 CHANCELLOR SHAEL POLAKOW-SURANSKY: Good
4 evening, everyone. Thank you for coming out
5 tonight. I really appreciate you taking the
6 time to come and listen and to speak and share
7 your views. The hearing we're going to be
8 discussing tonight is a proposal to phase out
9 P.S. 230. This is always a very difficult
10 decision and not a decision that we take
11 lightly. And so, it's very important to have
12 these discussions and hear from parents,
13 students, teachers, and other members of the
14 community. When we consider this decision, we
15 look a lot of different things. We ask the
16 question about what's working at the school and
17 what's not working at the school. We ask how
18 are all of the students doing, not just this
19 year, but in prior years. And we ask the
20 question what could change. What could improve
21 the quality of learning for students in this
22 community? All of us count on our schools to
23 provide a high-quality education for every
24 single child. And when a school is struggling,
25 we have to take action to ensure that the

1 current students don't fall further behind and
2 that future generations of students have an
3 opportunity to succeed. I want to begin by
4 acknowledging that I believe that there are
5 students and families who feel that this school
6 is working for them, and that there are really
7 good things that are happening here: strong
8 teachers, strong kids, strong families. And I
9 want to recommend that as we listen to the
10 conversation tonight that it's important to
11 honor those stories and for that to influence
12 our decisions. But I also want to hear an
13 honest conversation about what can be improved
14 and what's not working. Because there are many
15 students who have not succeeded at our school
16 and their voices are important as well. As you
17 know, P.S. 230 is located here in a building
18 that's shared with X229 and it serves grades K
19 through five. On January 22nd, the Department of
20 Education published the proposal to phase out
21 and replace P.S. 230. And on February 5th, that
22 proposal was then amended with new information
23 from the state around school improvement grants
24 that will be available next year. The proposals
25 discuss the track record of how the students

1 have performed in this school. And what we've
2 seen in the data is as follows. Last school
3 year, the grade on the school's progress report
4 was an F in each of the categories. And in
5 prior years, the school has a C grade in the two
6 years beforehand. The majority of students at
7 this area of performance was below grade level
8 in English and in math. To be specific, 16% of
9 students passed their English exam last year and
10 23% of students passed the math exam. Because
11 of this, P.S. 230 has also been identified by
12 New York State as a priority school, which means
13 that it's in the bottom 5% of schools in the
14 state in terms of student performance. So there
15 are concerns, not just from the city, but also
16 from the state about what can be done in this
17 school to improve the learning experience for
18 the young people. Given these concerns, the
19 department believes that a more serious
20 intervention is needed and that's why we're
21 proposing a new school option to replace this -
22 - and that school would involve a new staff.
23 Some of the teachers and administrators may
24 continue from the existing school and some will
25 be new to you. We have a separate impact

1 statement about the new school that's been
2 published and if that school is approved, it
3 would also offer a new kindergarten program, as
4 well as a new bilingual education program.

5 Before we move to the public comment section of
6 the meeting, I would briefly like to discuss the
7 impact of this proposal for students who are
8 currently attending P.S. 230. If the proposed
9 data for 230 is approved, next year, the school
10 would not take in new kindergartners, first
11 graders, and second graders. The new school
12 would take in those classes, and then, each
13 year, the school would phase out one grade from
14 there. The current second, third, and fourth
15 grade students at P.S. 230 who meet promotional
16 standards would continue to attend 230 for the
17 duration of elementary school. Current
18 kindergarten and first grade students at 230
19 would be enrolled in the new elementary school.
20 Fifth grade students who would have the
21 opportunity to graduate at the end of this year,
22 they have probably already applied for middle
23 school as part of the District 9 middle school
24 process. Students can also apply to finish
25 school elsewhere. As part of our public school

1 choice process, prior students at P.S. 230
2 would have the opportunity to match with another
3 elementary school for the next school year of
4 2013-2014. I know that there'll be a lot of
5 questions and comments that will be raised, and
6 so at the end of the meeting, I'll come back and
7 try to speak to what we've shared and also
8 answer the questions that come up here in the
9 meeting. Thank you. I'm going to pass it back
10 to Gary, so he can continue the presentation.

11 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you, Shael. Our next
12 presenter is Ms. Espada who's - - .

13 MS. ESPADA: Good evening, everyone. I want
14 to thank everyone for coming today. The
15 community education council is in the - - of
16 phasing out our district schools. We believe
17 that if they don't - - the proper services for
18 our children, our leadership would not be a - -
19 issue. The progress report grade states for
20 P.S. 230 2009-2010 is a C, 2010-2011 is also a
21 C. Any my question is what has the DOE helped
22 P.S. 230 - - ? [Applause] As the CC president,
23 for the past two years, I have taken a lot of
24 student - - and a lot of phasing out of district
25 - - schools. And what I have then seen from the

1 numbers is that a lot of the schools division
2 might add a lot of population of bussed students
3 or students with IDs. My question again is
4 where has the DOE helped? [Applause] As a parent
5 myself of three student of P.S. district 9, I am
6 totally disgusted with the department, that they
7 are phasing out our public schools and utilizing
8 the space for charter schools. Well, the
9 problem is that our children is to have a one or
10 a two. They're taking a three and four because
11 they don't want their students to phase out
12 [applause].

13 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you. The next presenter
14 will be from the school leadership team. I
15 believe there's a presentation that's been
16 prepared, so Paul - - Ms. Blaines [phonetic] and
17 Mr. Deloatch.

18 [Applause]

19 [Background noise]

20 MS. YVETTE JENKINS: Good evening everybody.
21 My name is Yvette Jenkins. Is this thing on?

22 MALE VOICE: Yes.

23 MS. JENKINS: So I represent the - - school
24 issue - - and we're asking the DOE to stop the
25 phasing out of P.S. 230, and we have taken some

1 time to look over this impact statement. And
2 the impact statement quotes some - - some
3 misrepresentations, so I just want to highlight
4 in this yellow copy of this impact statement. I
5 want you to take a look at page four. Page
6 four, if there's an overview of past strategic
7 improvement efforts that the DOE has done to
8 P.S. 230. What we are saying, really, is none
9 of this helped: providing coaching to teachers,
10 training staff, coaching. If you didn't have
11 any, I'm not - - . You chose to - - at the
12 sign-in sheets. [Applause] What will really
13 help? We don't need a minute. We don't need to
14 take the name off the building and put another
15 name up. [Applause] I want to take your
16 attention to pages four through six on the
17 impact statement. This information was
18 highlighted where it says summary of feedback.
19 We're going through the feedback. I was at the
20 SFT session, and I was at a parent session, and
21 I was at the teacher session. And some very
22 important information that came out of all these
23 sessions somehow did not make in the summary of
24 feedback, so we want to bring it to your
25 attention. [Applause] The following things at

1 the school that we need to face, our biggest,
2 biggest, biggest problem is the open design. I
3 know there - - architecturally. I'm not asking
4 them to - - with classrooms. So who partitions
5 it? Does he learn? Does he learn in the - - ?
6 Does he learn in this school district that - - ?
7 Help us. [Applause] Who are afraid to come to
8 this school and the time passes, so let us hear
9 from - - . The next thing we want to talk about
10 is the school sits on top of the metro now. You
11 have to change that now. It's something that we
12 have to work original that can make it easier
13 for us where - - like I said, some new
14 partition, smaller classes. Another thing that
15 they did not mention is we're placed next to the
16 major - - highway, increasing not only our
17 pollution and staff, all of us who show up here
18 to work more than - - consecutive school years.
19 We know that this is a labor of love. There's
20 no - - . [Applause] And not only does the - -
21 [applause] and that none of the teachers from
22 8:00 to 3:00, are they teaching? Well, the
23 entire staff is - - not reporting to - - center.
24 Did they write a check? And this is a
25 [applause]. So key issues that we face: Less -

1 - from them. Do you need a - - in there? Of
2 course. We cannot - - of that. So I think I
3 want to call attention to - - by saying this.
4 Yes, - - . That would be all of us. Well, the
5 part of the impact statement that says that
6 these are programs that we offered you at P.S.
7 230. Then, I think that all - - . We have not
8 had - - year, have we?

9 FEMALE VOICE: No.

10 [Background noise]

11 MS. JENKINS: We don't have programs that
12 are funded. We must be the only school in the
13 entire - - that don't have any ICT classes. We
14 don't have any. [Applause] So we've got - - .
15 So the impact statement created also to show
16 some great reason - - children P.S. 230 every
17 single day, every day. We have a young woman in
18 - - group. We have Spanish students also. Why
19 are there no services? We have parent workshops
20 for ESL. We have ESL students with - - at the
21 school. We have the morning - - . We have - -
22 attendance. [Applause] We have smart phone
23 technology in the classroom with a nice
24 [applause]. We have [background noise]. We
25 have [background noise]. We have student

1 functions. We have a - - research program
2 [background noise]. We have this. [Loud
3 cheering] Let's go to quickly, ESL programs
4 created by Ms. Valencia [phonetic] - - the ESL
5 teacher. So far, we have spoken with a couple
6 of the parents. They're - - interviewing
7 skills, resume building, conversational English.
8 [Applause] We have the attendance and opening in
9 a - - . We have more of the family [background
10 noise], which is designed for more attendance.
11 They come to school right now, - - right now,
12 one day are surprised. We are in the morning
13 cup of Joe [phonetic], which is an activity.
14 Parents come in. They sit and talk during - -
15 [applause]. Right there. We have an - -
16 program, so these items are in the classroom,
17 and we assume in the committee [applause]. We
18 have the yellow - - program in school, Ms. - -
19 Martinez [phonetic] and Ms. Abigail [phonetic].
20 And this program is designed to help young women
21 in the school community, the - - of leadership
22 and advance their social skills and - - assist.
23 Everybody sees that they're going--all the - -
24 also around here, they sail. They dance. They
25 do arts. They do crafts. They do - - dancing.

1 We have - - Christmas. They go out and - -
2 [applause]. We have the [background noise].
3 These are - - for the young boys: young,
4 minority boys, single-family households, - - .
5 And then we have the - - at the club [applause].
6 They are great. And they go 90 miles, it's a
7 great thing. It develops overall health and
8 fitness. And what would be - - competitive
9 school go to - - ? It's a great program, yeah?
10 And then we have the student council, which is
11 led by Mr. Hunt [phonetic] and Mr. Martinez
12 [phonetic] and we know importance of policy when
13 it comes to the school [applause]. We have
14 smart phone technology in the classroom. Then,
15 we recently - - new - - , not for one of just
16 aligned with the core curriculum. And then, I
17 want to talk about the - - discussion of data.
18 We lost - - years. We haven't been - - from the
19 city. [Loud cheering] And what's going on in the
20 state? Other than saying [background noise] you
21 know why these subgroups do so well? Because
22 there are in classrooms that are enclosed and
23 books. [Applause] Lastly, if the - - is saying
24 we should have so much meaning, so much class,
25 so much professionalism, you've got people

1 coming in the - - and that is why this school
2 is supposed to - - [applause]. And what - -
3 school program? Another school program that we
4 have ensured that they have agreed to spend some
5 time is the hot meal, hot lunch - - no people
6 from the community. And many years ago, they
7 had - - . They never - - this program during
8 the day, but I'm sure our CEO will take it up at
9 some point. - -

10 [Cheering]

11 MR. WENDEL DELOATCH: I'm not only here as a
12 member of the school leadership team, but I'm
13 also here as an educator in the - - school for
14 over 16 years. [Applause] I am here to share
15 some information with you all and I hope that
16 the DOE is taking notes because the DOE is
17 research-based, and this - - is research-based.
18 I am here to discuss with you or to make you
19 aware of two critical components that every
20 successful student must be - - upon. This is
21 foundational. This is infrastructure, which is
22 teacher retention and principal turnover. So
23 let's go through the research and let you know
24 how teacher retention or teacher turnover
25 affects your children. Well, in the research

1 study conducted by the University of Michigan,
2 the University of Virginia, and Stanford
3 University, the study cited what effect does
4 teacher turnover have on student achievement?
5 This study used, as a focal group, 850 New York
6 City fourth and fifth grade student observations
7 over an eight-year period. The study found
8 evidence of - - a study of teacher turnover on
9 student achievement. Results suggested that
10 teacher turnover has a significant and negative
11 impact on student achievement in both male and -
12 - . These are the tests that showed children
13 were testing and maybe whether they are
14 successful or not. Moreover, teacher turnover
15 is particularly harmful to the achievement of
16 students and students with low-performance
17 students and large Black populations. Teacher
18 retention is a major problem at P.S. 230. You
19 can see the chart with the statistics. And next
20 I want to address the critical issues of
21 principal turnover. A research study was done
22 by Princeton University, October 2009, titled
23 *Principal Turnover, Student Achievement, and*
24 *Teacher Retention*. This study concluded that
25 there is a significant negative impact on

1 student achievement. We are all aware of the
2 critical nature of the job of principals to the
3 school. P.S. 230, over the last ten years has
4 had a total of nine principals or six principals
5 acting in the capacity of principal. If you do
6 the average, it comes out to 1.2-year tenure per
7 principal. This is not acceptable [applause].
8 I know many of the principals that were in those
9 acting capacities. I have seen some - -
10 [applause]. The Department of Education knows
11 principal is the CEO of the school and for them
12 to overlook that average--I'm not the first to
13 have computed that average. They have many
14 people downtown with many more computers, and
15 they know, and for them to ignore [applause].
16 They said it's not only an insult to the
17 student--it's not only a - - , but now they
18 insulted the teachers, but it's an - - as you
19 should tell their - - [loud cheering]. And do
20 you know that we [background noise] thousand
21 wrecked - - buildings in our community for
22 children's success. We show success through our
23 children [applause].

24 [Pause]

25 MS. JENKINS: So then the question arises

1 why our school? I was looking in the
2 document, in the impact statement, there are a
3 lot of - - in attendance, but the rest district
4 is 93% redline percentage of the 3% difference.
5 So does that mean related to our - - ? I don't
6 think so. So I have - - the impact on all the
7 years - - . The question here I see why do you
8 phase us out? Why not option one? Why not give
9 us option one, which involves development of all
10 the great things that we said. Of all the
11 things that are doing, I think this was the
12 inclination of the staff and the parents. That
13 option one would have been a better solution to
14 phase out this - - , like I said here.

15 [Applause] So I want to take your attention to
16 page three of the impact statement that says we
17 are looking for the school lacks the capacity to
18 improve quickly. We're looking for quick fix or
19 are we looking for a long-term solution to the
20 problems of P.S. 230? [Applause] So these are
21 some things that we think that would help us, as
22 opposed to phasing us out. Let's look at option
23 one. What will help us? More enclosed
24 classrooms and smaller class sizes. Finally, to
25 support teachers and - - , [applause] more

1 healing put and intense professional
2 development and instructional studies for the
3 struggling students [applause], and many years
4 ago, this proposal - - school to get - - . Our
5 community has several mental health - -
6 [applause]. Thinking about our goal, what do we
7 - - ? Leadership - - , a team to identify
8 grants to give us more bilingual services, and
9 an - - program to improve our attendance
10 [background noise]. That's a - - thing to us
11 [cheering].

12 [Applause]

13 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you for your
14 presentation. I just want to make sure there
15 aren't any other comments from any of the other
16 panelists at this time. I'd like to acknowledge
17 that we're joined this evening by - - Beasley
18 [phonetic] here at - - ? Ms. Beasley. Thank
19 you. Now, with that, we can now conclude the
20 formal presentations. And I'd ask the following
21 people to line up to the microphone for the
22 public comment. You're reminded that the public
23 comment must be limited to two minutes per
24 speaker. The time will be kept and you will get
25 a signal when you have 30 seconds remaining, and

1 when your time is up. We have a time beeper
2 right next to the microphone. I would ask that
3 the following five people line up and go over
4 the instructions. Speaker one, Lexxis Irizarry;
5 speaker two, Yolanda Payne; speaker three, Dora
6 Miller; speaker four, Carrol Harrison; and
7 speaker five, Ebie Johnson.

8 [Applause]

9 MR. BETNEIC: As a reminder, please keep
10 your comments under two minutes. The DOE staff
11 member is keeping time. He'll raise a sign to
12 alert you when you have 30 seconds left and when
13 your time is up. We want to make sure that
14 everyone's voice is heard this evening and we
15 have a - - for the speakers. So please try and
16 finish your thought as your time expires, so
17 that we can make sure that everybody's voices
18 are heard. With that, I'm going to call Ms.
19 Irizarry.

20 MS. LEXXIS IRIZARRY: I just want to say I'm
21 at P.S. 230 and the teachers here taught me
22 well. And I've had a great year to go to - - .
23 And it was a very great experience. And I don't
24 think that closing the school down is not the
25 solution. They need teachers who build our

1 community, - - work, and keep the good
2 teachers and including the school - - . And we
3 need to work because they try to work with the
4 schools - - .

5 [Applause]

6 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you.

7 MS. YOLANDA PAYNE: Good afternoon. You
8 know, one of the things that I have a problem
9 with is the major showed - - problem is
10 literacy. They didn't include teacher's
11 program. He recently chose a program - - . It
12 turned into a very successful program. The
13 mayor has chosen a model of networks. So in
14 other words, we had designed a - - of workshops
15 on the weekend, after school, even though, like
16 you can image, - - of education that - - and
17 this was the - - for everyone in there. Now, in
18 the network is what capacity do they do have to
19 support the school's teaching program and all
20 the school and the network? So the mayor chose
21 - - . We didn't choose it. We didn't like it
22 because we knew our children had the ability to
23 - - back in court. So now, we have a social
24 member who is speaking for our children and who
25 can - - for the schools and before you start to

1 take control of the children's programs that
2 people who don't work with the population don't
3 understand the student's needs, so that's - - .

4 [Applause]

5 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you. Miss Miller?

6 MS. DORA MILLER: Okay. I'd like to say
7 good evening. I'm a - - . I'm on the senior
8 committee school - - [laughter]. At this time,
9 we gather to face a difficult decision. And
10 today with this - - school, we've been drawing
11 strength, tenacity, and perseverance to educate
12 students whose families face great adversity:
13 economic, socially, politically, and racially.
14 Today, we as a school - - with a firm and great
15 effort hold a dedication to stay in our school
16 on a daily basis. The - - that is in our
17 school, we have an allegiance to the idea that
18 we have the power in our hands [applause]. We
19 know that our hands will be - - . Our hands
20 will be worked extremely hard. At this time,
21 our - - are divided without the necessary
22 educational supports. Our hands were being - -
23 long before this day. Today, we begin a
24 different journey that involves political and
25 economic decisions that are beyond our control.

1 This is a reality of our time. Our school
2 neighborhood is undergoing economic and
3 political changes. We have learned that the
4 personal education is that all children can
5 learn. And the challenge is to find a way for
6 them to accomplish this. Together, we have
7 discovered that with only adequate resources
8 imparted in certain school as turnaround
9 schools, results in a different principle being
10 taught. This is here in New York to Washington,
11 D.C., and of course, the states. It is easier
12 to let him assume a failure than to provide - -
13 resources [applause]. We can't allow them to do
14 to our schools in the classroom without
15 providing highly detailed intervention - - .
16 Let me go over and sign something else or I'll -
17 - . Let me go to the - - [laughter]. Okay.
18 Any of you ever seen a - - ever say there's a
19 grievance about closing of schools that possibly
20 violates Title 6 of the Civil Right Act, which
21 prohibits race-based discrimination in
22 federally-funded programs. Many groups are
23 filing lawsuits. Think about that. [Applause]
24 [Background noise] We want our - - schools to
25 educate knowing how the inner city works. I'm

1 not too - - . We've been taking a step out on
2 faith, even when we cannot see the - - .

3 [Cheering]

4 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you.

5 MS. CARROL HARRISON: Good afternoon,
6 everyone. I'm Carrol Harrison with - - . I
7 represent all of the teachers, the parents, and
8 those kinds of folks in the district. But
9 tonight, I'm not here about that. I'm about
10 these children sitting in the audience, all
11 these children that come to school ready to
12 learn. Learn in classrooms where there are no
13 walls, children that come to school with special
14 needs and attention deficits and sitting in a
15 room with no walls, listening to what's going on
16 in the classroom. That's being set up to fail
17 [applause], but the students of P.S. 230, give
18 us some walls and give us some support, so we
19 can teach our children to be better people
20 [applause].

21 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you. Ebie Johnson?

22 MS. EBIE JOHNSON: Good evening, everyone.
23 My name is Ebie Johnson. I started at P.S. 230
24 in 1986. I became a professional in 2007. I
25 became a second grade teacher [applause]. I'm

1 also - - and plus president of the students,
2 so I'm definitely here too - - and their
3 children. I noticed that in this fact sheet,
4 you said that you have leadership support,
5 instructor support, operational support, and
6 student support. The only support I do not see
7 in this statement is community support. I
8 challenge the DOE to come in to this community
9 with strong initiatives to bring the community
10 in with academic help [applause] because a lot
11 of our parents can not afford [background noise]
12 to math or - - to limited programs. But I want
13 the DOE to come to the community to provide the
14 necessary - - and mathematic initiatives, so
15 that our parents are able to help our children
16 at home because I feel they've - - [applause].
17 Bringing up a student here, it's going to be the
18 same problem because the main problem is not
19 being addressed.

20 [Applause]

21 MR. BETNEIC: All right. I'd like to call
22 speakers six through ten, so speaker number six
23 is Wilma Eman [phonetic]; speaker number seven,
24 it says Uzoma; speaker eight is Gihia Gonzales;
25 speaker nine is Josephine Manow; and speaker ten

1 is Jovani Johnson [phonetic]. So speaker six
2 is - - ?

3 MS. UZOMA CHIMA: Good evening. My name is
4 Uzoma Chima and I've been in this school for the
5 past 13 years. I just have a - - . From what I
6 saw on the impact statement, it said that the
7 new school is going to bringing a high
8 percentage. Why can't P.S. 230 - - ? Do they
9 realize that it is important for truancy - - at
10 pre-K level, why can't we help them? [Applause]
11 You know there was something that I realized
12 what I am seeing. I realized that from the top,
13 DOE, they want to run the school system like
14 operate - - . But there is something I want you
15 to know. When my supervisor either calling or
16 tells me what to do and I do it, and it falls
17 through, it is not my social responsibility.
18 But in anything else, he said if you ask me
19 something to do and I do it, and it falls, it is
20 my fault. How is it going to help? [Cheering] I
21 also want to let you know that the human mind is
22 the most difficult instrument to work on. It is
23 not easy to teach a child how to think. It is
24 not. That is why we have to look for different
25 IQ levels. One more thing that I have to say, I

1 have a little girl in my class that just lost
2 her grandmother. We didn't - - . Up to this
3 point, then, I have not seen any grief
4 counseling to - - . [Background noise] Do you
5 think that an hour or two hours before that girl
6 stopped crying that she was listening to me?
7 She was going through something. She was going
8 through the - - and she was not trying, like
9 [background noise]. If this has happened in a
10 different neighborhood, they would have grief
11 counselors from the city, from the state, from
12 the mayor [Loud cheering]. We must have a
13 simple plan that is - - similar is one thing.
14 I've got a couple of different accents that
15 challenges the classroom. Do what? How do you
16 expect I go to - - in class? And we expect them
17 to perform just like--I will do - - that will
18 have you translate available today. Let's think
19 about this. Thank you.

20 [Cheering]

21 MR. BETNEIC: Gihia Gonzales?

22 MS. GIHIA GONZALES: Hi, I'm a student in
23 [background noise] and I am here today. And
24 even in the past year, I have been taught well
25 by teachers that really teach well and they

1 haven't - - with us. We had to focus. They
2 push you to learn. And I'm happy about it.
3 today, where I'm standing right now, I'm happy
4 about it. Ms. Penn, I've put a lot of work and
5 effort into this school and I'll be, with the
6 teachers that's also being punished, just
7 because of the students' survey. I want to go
8 to the - - , but now, I feel that some of the
9 students is there for school. [Applause] Now,
10 they have brought into the - - . They have open
11 in schools. They need the concentration and
12 they don't have enough time to learn. You have
13 to push them a little bit, but they want to
14 learn [applause]. The - - of the schools that
15 they have - - .

16 [Cheering]

17 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker seven is Josephine
18 Manow.

19 MS. JOSEPHINE MANOW: Hi. My name is
20 Josephine Manow. I graduated from here in 1998.
21 It seems like a long time ago for a lot of the
22 teachers who were there - - who are still here
23 today and some of them placed - - in the school.
24 I know that [background noise] is on the verge
25 of becoming a - - , I decided to share my story.

1 Like most kids who attended P.S. 230, - - for
2 the community, I lived just three blocks away in
3 the towers - - ten and - - to be exact. My
4 parents were new immigrants to this country from
5 - - , so English was not the first language
6 spoke in my house. They were tough and worked
7 long hours in order to provide for my three
8 siblings and I. My family at home wasn't only
9 the family I had. I had a family here at this
10 school. This place became a place where I could
11 excel in my academics and still be a - - . I'm
12 not sure if there is any other school I've
13 attended that - - with academic excellence like
14 P.S. 230. My teachers, like Ms. Tanner
15 [phonetic] and Mrs. Ten [phonetic] and Miss
16 Mitchell [phonetic] became my second parents and
17 my classmates became my brothers and sisters.
18 This place has built the work ethics that I have
19 today, which are perseverance and determination.
20 It is the things that I learned here in that
21 home that got me to Preston [phonetic] High
22 School, one of the best college prep high
23 schools for a girl in the Bronx. And it's the
24 things that I learned here that helped me obtain
25 my Masters of Arts from the University of

1 Connecticut. [Applause] It's also those things
2 that currently have me employed as a marketing
3 coordinator for a fortune 500 company. I'm not
4 sure if I really would be the person I am today
5 if it wasn't for this school. If you phase out
6 this school, there are not going to be any more
7 stories like mine and people aren't going to be
8 able to have a place to call home.

9 [Applause]

10 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker ten, Yvonda Johnson,
11 Ms. Johnson?

12 MS. YVONDA JOHNSON: Right here. Never
13 mind. Because of that incident, a question
14 though, I want to ask something.

15 MR. BETNEIC: If you write a question on the
16 card table, we'll be taking questions later. I
17 just want to make sure--speaker number seven,
18 just listed as - - ? Okay. We'll move on to
19 speakers 11 through 15, speaker 11--I'm sorry--
20 it looks like Sharia Hancock; speaker 12 is
21 Devon Genwerth; speaker 13 is James Moore;
22 speaker 14, Dreama Brown; and speaker 15 is
23 Karen Alford. We'll start with Sharia Hancock.

24 MS. SHARIA HANCOCK: Hello everyone. My
25 name is Sharia Hancock. I - - into the school

1 and now - - . My grandson was just admitted
2 to one of the - - programs in - - . If it
3 wasn't for the staff and the school here, they
4 have contacted me, people that have been part of
5 the - - in the school. I trust all of the
6 teachers here, the principal - - . My grandson
7 is - - . I'm here just a minute today for
8 anyone. We don't know where he going to sing
9 when it comes to a new school. We don't need
10 the teachers to be going to the other school. I
11 remember when Miss Payne walked in here as a
12 teacher and she's the principal now. Everyone
13 needs to work with the other to be a better - -
14 and be sure that - - . And I'm just asking for
15 you please, give some hope, thank you.

16 [Applause]

17 MR. BETNEIC: I'm sorry.

18 [Background noise]

19 MR. DEVON LUTHER GENWERTH: My name is Devon
20 Luther Genwerth and I'm a teacher of technology
21 - - and I taught at this school at the beginning
22 of '07-'08 year and I've - - year class. Since
23 I got here, I have lost - - in the school that
24 is saddened. I have always - - . And
25 obviously, this last were based on the students

1 that failed. Now, we place this on the--I
2 know this is the past - - tell us that the
3 principal got recent support from the - -
4 support and so on. And really it came from the
5 position matters of - - . Now, I won't support
6 'cause they're wrong because I like the - -
7 here, but when he cannot support this - - . If
8 he works, then that person takes the places.
9 And if you think that person should also be
10 principal, it is not that way in that - - today.
11 I - - on us--those of you who begin at the
12 present time to overlook a feeling just a little
13 bit of - - . Our - - that at some point in the
14 not too recent past, a certain neighborhood or
15 district, not only recently, had issues with
16 school performance among - - . But I'm going to
17 speak to the cause of school performance. It
18 wasn't the - - city that started the problem
19 because the city put - - program. They went to
20 the federal government and - - that provided a -
21 - solution. They did not close the schools.
22 And if they closed one school, their main idea--
23 and this was the teachers and students--main
24 idea was not to close schools. Their main idea
25 was to fix what the problem was, and they did

1 it--not a single - - . I think that Mr. - -
2 should remain because he don't see - - problems
3 with student performance and they don't want to
4 do all the learning there, should look at the
5 reason on some levels. That's it.

6 [Applause]

7 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you. Next is speaker
8 13, Jim Moore?

9 MR. JAMES MOORE: Good evening. My name is
10 James Moore. I'm the founder of - - Manhood for
11 the - - community program [applause] for - - .
12 Those programs - - for the weekly and the
13 program is actually working. And so, I'm here
14 to support the P.S. 230. The only time that I
15 witnessed this period was after - - and the
16 community has the opportunity to learn and learn
17 to - - . Now, you all saw the performance
18 summary or the final reports. You all believe
19 that the staff here is not committed to high-
20 quality education. However, nothing could be
21 farther from the truth. This - - and the staff
22 here are spending countless hours tutoring and
23 sharing life lessons with students to ensure
24 they have the development - - . The DOE that is
25 presented does not reflect the passion that

1 teachers display while teaching or [applause]
2 who have chose to - - . That growing - - in
3 school for P.S. 230 does not need a new name or
4 a new principal. [Applause] At the end of the
5 day, changing the school name or changing
6 principals will not change the makeup of the
7 community or the students they serve. [Applause]
8 What P.S. 230 needs is some real assistance from
9 DOE. P.S. 230 needs real classrooms, not open
10 spaces. P.S. 230 needs more funding to support
11 - - models, smaller classrooms, and a - - . It
12 is my understanding that the principal last - -
13 eight years ago, but still hasn't received the -
14 - DOE. We at P.S. 230, we have - - special
15 education, ELSA, support is - - and then support
16 from - - not from the - - . Thank you very
17 much.

18 [Applause]

19 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you.

20 MS. DREAMA BROWN: Good evening. My name is
21 Dreama Brown and I started to serve as a
22 principal of P.S. 230 for 2003 to 2007.

23 [Applause] I'm here to say - - or P.S. 230, when
24 I came here in 2003, the achievement of the
25 students here at the school was even lower than

1 it is now at the level that they're planning
2 to close this school. This school--in my
3 current role, I serve as the vice president of
4 school aged services for the Children's Aid
5 Society. We work in 16 different regional
6 schools, in Washington Heights, North - - , and
7 the Bronx, Staten Island, and in Harlem. And in
8 those schools, we do what we should be doing
9 here at P.S. 230, which is instead of phasing in
10 a new school and using that space to build new
11 construction for another school, dividing those
12 recourses, we should be building an - - school,
13 a school-based health plan, so that when
14 children come to school sick who don't have
15 insurance, they can get them to it. [Applause]
16 They can see a dentist. This whole thing is
17 extremely isolated. I have visited dozens of
18 schools in my work since I left here in 2007.
19 I've visited dozens of schools and this school
20 is unique. I've been in schools in Brooklyn,
21 other parts of the Bronx, New Orleans, the Bay
22 area, and even in Chicago. This community is
23 isolated. They needs are high. The children
24 come to school [background noise] and - - adults
25 always have the skills to address. But I can

1 tell you between 2003 and 2007, this school
2 was on the service. This school was removed
3 from the service because of the work of the
4 teachers, the children, the parents [applause]
5 that we know what it takes to improve. What
6 they need is the resources to remove [background
7 noise] not move away, not move for a - - trying
8 to fix some student achievement. Those long-
9 term issues that Ms. - - and others have talked
10 about, they are here. They are real. Let's not
11 pretend that - - . Let's support the schools
12 that are in the south that have not - - , but
13 we've asked them to. They did not assist the
14 new principal. They've asked what Ms. Kinneys
15 [phonetic]--they've done what Ms. Kinneys asked
16 them to do. And it's now our turn to support
17 them and not be [applause].

18 MR. BETNEIC: All right. The next speaker
19 will be Ms. Alford.

20 MS. KAREN ALFORD: Good evening all. I'm
21 Karen Alford. I'm the - - vice president of - -
22 schools. When the - - of chancellor began, he
23 asked what could change. And I think tonight,
24 they are presented with a picture of what could
25 change. Did you know that if the DOE decided to

1 support instead of abandon this school, things
2 could change? We know is the DOE decided to
3 listen to the roadmap that the SOT put forward,
4 things could change. We know that if the - -
5 the Department of Education decided to make sure
6 that that beautiful Robin Hood library was open
7 to being utilized, things could change. They
8 [background noise], so it's really ridiculous.
9 So that teachers could adquatley teach. People
10 don't understand, you cannot teach if there are
11 not walls. You need to be able to hear
12 yourself. The children need to be able to have
13 time to think and process. You can't do that
14 with all of the noise around you, but it can
15 change. If the DOE decided to make sure that
16 more of the community could be invested in this
17 school. I don't want to see - - citizens
18 roaming around the neighborhood, so the
19 teachers' cars aren't broken in. It's hard to
20 maintain teachers. So [background noise] they
21 need - - . The DOE has a responsibility to
22 children. And right now, I do not see where
23 they're taking care of this responsibility. And
24 I - - this one thing and someone new is
25 certainly not supporting the efforts of this

1 school. You don't know how to say [applause].
2 You don't have a thing more thought out than
3 this plan. So hopefully, someone will listen to
4 the passion and the - - of intellect that have -
5 - for us tonight.

6 [Applause]

7 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you. [Background noise]
8 from speakers 16 through 20. That's - -
9 Johnson, speaker 16; speaker 17, Mary Weaks
10 [phonetic]; speaker 18, - - Jordan; speaker 19,
11 Henrietta Alvarez [phonetic]; and speaker Jerome
12 Brown [phonetic]. And while we're waiting for
13 them, Miss Gil, member of the SLT, wanted an
14 opportunity.

15 MS. THERESA GIL: Good evening. My name is
16 Theresa Gil. I'm a parent of a fourth grader
17 who attends P.S. 230. I'm also a member of the
18 parent association and SLT. I am here to speak
19 about some concerns - - . This community faces
20 struggles that a lot of communities don't, from
21 high crime rates to constant evictions. Parent
22 involvement and support is - - here. As a
23 member of the parent association, we try every
24 attempt to get parents out of that - - , fliers,
25 making phone calls, to even sending out surveys

1 to see what, you know, time is going to work
2 for parents. These parents here are - - .
3 These are the parents who [applause]. You know,
4 a lot of these teachers--lots of them have
5 personal relationships with. You can get all
6 these teachers and, you know, really who are
7 going to come. The one consistent thing kids
8 have--a lot of these kids have--are probably
9 school-related, the - - . [Applause] You know,
10 you have a parent coordinator who goes above and
11 beyond his job. [Loud cheering] And you have Mr.
12 Deloatch, who does everything from [cheering]
13 like the class - - use English as a second
14 language, then you go without an English class
15 and has - - . How can we think to get rid of--
16 you know, he's bringing out the best in them
17 because anything to improve that. But to hear
18 well, this teacher does that and have a personal
19 relationship with this kid is not an issue.
20 Thank you.

21 [Applause]

22 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you, Miss Gil.

23 MS. JORDON: Good evening everyone. My name
24 is Miss Jordan. I'm also on the SLT team.
25 Also, my son is in the first grade and he has a

1 lot of - - . My thing is, before you decide
2 to close our P.S. really we should look at the
3 DOE. We should look at the superintendent, but
4 we all do need to help this school get back. My
5 son [cheering] has not had OT for a whole year
6 and half, and I had to fight. Mr. - - fought
7 for me. The assistant principal fought for me
8 to get his - - just received last month. My
9 thing is, he has issues. It can be addressed.
10 It does actually help. So before Mr. Newburg
11 [phonetic], the superintendent, they - - to come
12 here and see how the school is running
13 [background noise] closes. [Applause] Also, to -
14 - what everyone is saying, there aren't any
15 doors in the school, so the youngsters that are
16 in first grade to actually be focused. So
17 before you come in--it takes a village to raise
18 these kids and help the kids, so I'd like to see
19 the village in [background noise]. I see my
20 child at - - school. What - - the DOE and
21 superintendent?

22 [Loud cheering]

23 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you.

24 MOUSAFI: My name is Mousafa. My class is -
25 - . I don't feel like my school should be

1 closed because our teachers are really good.

2 [Crying] and I feel lucky, and I don't like it.

3 And we are [crying] school be closed. Nobody, I
4 don't like it.

5 [Applause]

6 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker Thompson?

7 MR. KEN THOMPSON: Of course, I will follow
8 that [laughter]. Good evening. I'm Ken
9 Thompson, Associate Director of - - New York.
10 It stands for the residency - - 230 marshaled
11 out before. In 2004, we were invited to the
12 onsite supplemental education services provider
13 to the component of No Child Left Behind.
14 Within one year, - - threw in over one million
15 dollars in - - for P.S. 230, including a grant
16 for the [applause] program and the - - Children
17 and Family Services, a second grant from New
18 York City Department of Education for the 21st
19 century through the - - program, and a third
20 from the New York City Department of Youth and
21 Community Development - - . We are always - -
22 and are confident from the teachers from buying
23 the - - for the P.S. 230 roof - - and eventually
24 renewed, and subsequently, this school's being
25 approved in 2007. At close of the 2007 school

1 year, Ms. Brown [phonetic] resigned and Ms.
2 Penn assumed principal. In Ms. Penn's first
3 year as principal, P.S. 230 was not included in
4 the supplement educational services program. As
5 previously mentioned, the school is no longer
6 one of the schools in the - - . Fortunately,
7 private endowments and - - applied to a SPICE
8 [phonetic] program and a - - development
9 program. In '08-'09, the year immediately
10 following the year when 230 was apprised for
11 supplemental educational purposes, the school's
12 assurance of state list of schools that need to
13 improve. As such, as the - - term, along with
14 the aforementioned events, that school program--
15 the - - program--the SPICE program and - - to
16 have a licensed social worker at the school
17 three days per week. '08-'09, sort of, actually
18 raised the burdens of CEO support services, and
19 not coincidentally, then the school received a -
20 - pay and found themselves in the future - -
21 [applause]. In '09-'10, unfortunately, it's a
22 crime to need more than ten persons - - P.S.
23 230, a loss of \$205,000 - - . Moreover, - - was
24 cut by \$50,000 and stand - - providing them with
25 social worker intervention, as in the previous

1 year. In '09-'10, the school grade dropped to
2 a C. The proposed - - at P.S. 230 is - - in
3 that. So what I don't understand is who in the
4 - - have requested a few grades or the pre-K for
5 several years to know that. However, the school
6 must have a few years - - . More interesting,
7 as members of No Child education on the
8 individual - - , when the president said at the
9 Union speech to the proposed - - . The proposed
10 [applause]. This proposal [background noise]
11 reached at the quality of the system, in saying
12 if we come at nutrition, they're teachable. And
13 there's very little of the actual - -
14 distinction of the desire to - - those left out
15 on the frontline day in and day out with the
16 most minimal resources that categorically run
17 with the - - of P.S. 230, thank you.

18 [Applause]

19 MR. BETNEIC: The next speaker is - - ?

20 MR. THEODORE JORDAN: Good evening. My name
21 is Theodore Jordan.

22 MR. BETNEIC: I'm sorry, hold on a second.

23 Speaker 17, Mary Lees [phonetic]? All right.

24 Start - - .

25 MR. JORDAN: My name is Theodore Jordan.

1 I'm here to represent my - - who is a student
2 at 2P9 in the Bronx. She clearly - - . Right
3 now, she's back, doing good. She's in high
4 school, - - . [Applause] She's now at a student
5 at Northeastern University in - - majoring in
6 criminal justice. She's on the dean's list.
7 She has an honor roll student. She's - - at - -
8 University. Today, she called and said dad, she
9 says I heard that they're closing the 230 and -
10 - . And she says you go and represent me. I
11 always think she - - achieve this thing. I've
12 had it made when - - she had. She stuck with
13 it. [Cheering] Also, I sat down with - - here
14 when the school - - was here and was
15 participating with the - - who was here. I sat
16 on the different boards, so maybe I've had the
17 greatest spot. I say band-aids--a quick fix is
18 not what's necessary. If you have an old shoe,
19 and if the shoe fits, you keep wearing that shoe
20 and you do the best to keep on using it, right?
21 So don't close it down.

22 [Applause]

23 MR. BETNEIC: - - ?

24 MS. MARIE ALVAREZ: My name is Marie

25 Alvarez. I have been living in this community

1 for the last 17 years. I'm not an educator,
2 but I have visited many schools here in New
3 York. I am - - here and I also am a mother.
4 This school needs help. It has 24 classrooms
5 and only five of them are enclosed. If you do
6 the math, not even need the - - out of this - -
7 , which is 95% of the classes. [Applause] So
8 really what I was going to say is already said,
9 okay? But I'm going to close with this quickly.
10 What guarantee are you giving that a new school
11 will do better than the school now? [Applause]
12 if you will give me the same classrooms, I
13 believe - - because they have peace, really
14 noticeable in other classrooms. The children
15 cannot listen to the teachers, but they're
16 listening to what everybody is saying but the
17 teachers. Do you think my son and the children
18 from here will learn that way? Would you put
19 your children in a classroom like that? No.
20 [Applause] We don't want to phase out. What we
21 want is classrooms with doors and walls and
22 soundproof. The noise from outside will not
23 allow the children to learn. Give us the
24 bilingual school that is united to the other
25 schools. Because 75% - - who are bilingual. Do

1 you know in pre-K, they are promoting because
2 we were so - - the pre-K here. There's a large
3 [background noise] from here to both sides
4 because there's no pre-K in this site. Don't
5 give - - . Fix my son's school. [Applause]

6 MR. BETNEIC: Okay.

7 DR. BULA: How are you doing? I'm not into
8 really taking facts that--

9 [Background noise]

10 MR. BETNEIC: We'll wait a second, doctor.

11 DR. BULA: Hi, I've been to the [background
12 noise] communities and I've seen over the - - .
13 At least at that time, I was probably - - when
14 my kids were going to this school. And I feel
15 like at 2:30, they have don't have - - 'cause
16 the other school that - - and they had enclosed
17 walls. They had doors and they had ceilings.
18 When I come here, I focus on math class. I say
19 those - - in the front of the class and this is
20 my class. You know, chalkboards and no doors.
21 They got them closed - - , but they've got a C
22 grade. I think a C is good with no doors and
23 they got no walls coming in [applause]. They
24 went to put a - - in the school. That got money
25 for that, but they don't have money - - to help.

1 It's not - - math, it's 75 to 80% of the kids
2 that go to this school are from - - park tower.
3 But only 50% of parents had the time. It's
4 better for them to close the school, I suggest.
5 You all should work within the - - park tower to
6 find a way to leave the documentation out for
7 the kids to have fill in, instead of coming to
8 school to mess it up for the kids that are
9 passing. You all want to put in - - and key
10 financing - - , but I don't see nothing here
11 about - - the doors. My son could earn that
12 money. [Applause] That's all I have to say.

13 [Applause]

14 MR. BETNEIC: I call speakers 21 through 25,
15 - - , 22 is Shamika Gaines; 23 is Whitney
16 Franklin; 24 is Teasha Wilson; and 25--I'm
17 sorry--it looks like - - . Speaker 21? Speaker
18 21 is not - - ? Okay. Speaker 22, ready to
19 speak?

20 MS. TEASHA WILSON: Hi, my name is Teasha
21 Wilson. My son is - - . He goes here now. He
22 didn't pass his first - - . And it was hurting
23 him to know that his school was closing after -
24 - , and basically, have his feelings involved.
25 And it's, like, nerve-wracking to know that you

1 all had things - - , things at the school that
2 are, basically, failing and leaving it to a
3 whole bunch of people that don't know - - , and
4 the district has to start over from scratch
5 anyway. And I mean, my son, he loves his
6 teachers that he has had. And I have never seen
7 nothing wrong with the educational training that
8 they had here at the site of this meeting. As I
9 saw the facts, they acted towards the - - and
10 nothing has, basically, changed, except for you
11 all want to get rid of the teachers that,
12 basically, help with the kids and put some new
13 ones in that don't have any experience at all.
14 I'm will to do anything.

15 [Applause]

16 MR. BETNEIC: The next speaker is Whitney
17 Franklin.

18 MS. WHITNEY FRANKLIN: Good evening. I just
19 want to start by saying I deal with complete
20 [background noise] effects on the school.
21 Listening to you close to two hours, I know the
22 possible outcome [background noise]. It makes
23 the closings for living for - - school, as well
24 as all of our concerns, all of our worries,
25 everything that's been discussed, we've told our

1 leaders. And I just can't help but feel like
2 is this a - - point that anyone off site should
3 be here? [Background noise] because you should,
4 but even if you do not [background noise] who
5 study with them, who - - them are telling you
6 this is not an option. [Applause] lead to my
7 daughter's experience because of - - counseling.
8 It was the one despite the memo show, my
9 daughter has been - - from the moment she got
10 there. She says she's improved in reading.
11 She's improved in math. She has a personal
12 relationship with the majority of teachers that
13 she sees on a regular basis and they all support
14 her. She's been - - on the month. Like, you
15 guys can't put a price on that. You can't put a
16 decision on that. That means something and it
17 means a lot. It means - - kid. [Applause] And
18 one of the things I want to talk to you about
19 that was brought up at the last meeting about
20 the rezoning and the [background noise]
21 providing access to certain - - . It's not
22 actually clear because you can't - - like that.
23 This little school was across the street. 90%
24 of the students that attend the school live in
25 the - - across the street and down the block in

1 - - little houses. They said the attendance
2 rate and that says something. Like, maybe you
3 guys should consider rezoning the school. Maybe
4 you'll have a better result because there have
5 to be other options, other than just closing it
6 down. That [background noise], but what I
7 really wanted to say is [background noise]. I
8 just wanted to bring it to the - - that all of
9 you is to literally close the school right now.
10 And I am - - to charter schools because not when
11 my daughter was here, but the reasons that I
12 have - - in charter schools is the [background
13 noise]. I mean, most of us are not - -
14 [applause]. But even though we need a team of
15 teachers ready to--because if we don't, so what
16 is your advice? And we need to enforce a child
17 [background noise].

18 [Applause]

19 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker 24, Letisha Conavarni
20 [phonetic], speaker 24? We'll move on to
21 speaker 25, Mr. Wilson?

22 MR. TEASHA WILSON: Good evening. I know
23 the last time that we came here, I shared some
24 very minor thoughts in terms of how to solve the
25 problem here. I came to this country 21 years

1 ago. I was eight years of - - before I got
2 here. My strength was changing schools that are
3 failing to schools that are passing. And if you
4 go through the records, I have that behind me.
5 It takes at least three years to really put new
6 programs in place and change anything. Think
7 about this. Is it easier to close a school?
8 It's so easy. Just close the doors. What are
9 the psychological and emotional impact that will
10 have on the students at that point? It's
11 [applause]. Just - - that everywhere I go
12 around the school, I get so many hugs a day.
13 Every person for the hugs are usually the kids.
14 A lot of you all people say oh, a lot of them
15 are learning. It is very important to
16 understand. Where are you going? Closing is
17 easy. It's like a - - . I remember one thing
18 more. I'm not really the - - type. Look at
19 what happens out there. You are trying to take
20 away their mothers and fathers of the children.
21 You can't do that. [Applause] It's very
22 important because then they'll - - because the
23 local school is a safer place than you - - .
24 Oh, Mr. Wilson is not here? Oh, Mrs. Bitten's
25 [phonetic] not here? Oh, Ms. Rain [phonetic] is

1 not here? Who am I going to talk to? You saw
2 my - - . This is what one of the kids did,
3 right when they see me, running - - . I can't
4 get 'em off me. They say not to touch the kids.
5 I don't touch them. They touch - - .

6 [Background noise] [Loud cheering]

7 MR. BETNEIC: And now speakers 26 through 30
8 to the microphone, so it looks like Racarryah
9 Murrell [phonetic] is speaker number 26; speaker
10 27 Lanisha Humbert; speaker 28 Jennifer Zenavo
11 [phonetic]; speaker 29 Denorah Bobet [phonetic];
12 and speaker 30, Fredrick Law [phonetic].
13 Speaker number 26?

14 MS. RACARRYAH MURRELL: I just want to say
15 to the staff and the principal and the social
16 [background noise], I am a parent of a student
17 that goes here. And I want to say something
18 that is real - - our school system has not
19 considered anywhere. [Applause] there are a lot
20 of schools - - at the site and to - - , it was
21 not easy. Then, you have - - this school and
22 the one time that I don't have to worry. I know
23 my child is safe and she's learning. And she -
24 - . As far as the - - small classes and doors
25 over the classroom or over the - - , the school

1 needs help, at least funding. And I would
2 think that attention to the children should only
3 be accommodated by the attention or the - - . I
4 think they should be accommodated by their - -
5 and their surroundings. I don't know about you,
6 but when I was at - - pay attention - - to all
7 of these rooms, okay? That wasn't - - . They
8 competed with thousands of kids and they'll stay
9 focused. And that's all because of the - -
10 cameras. It shows the kids' priorities.
11 [Applause] and what our child goes through. It
12 starts and ends in the home and when you have
13 someone caring. [Applause] And when I tell a
14 story - - . These kids have - - . How am I
15 dealing with the teachers? Not believe the
16 teachers. We need help. Help from the DOE,
17 help from the parents who need to stick together
18 because this is our - - , our children. Thank
19 you.

20 [Applause]

21 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker 27.

22 MS. LANISHA HUMBERT: My name is Lanisha
23 Humbert and I'm going to talk about the - -
24 results. My daughter has had the pleasure of
25 being with some of our teachers who are very

1 passionate, enthusiastic, and wear many hats.
2 I feel the brain is very complicated and you
3 have to be very creative to tap into a child's
4 brain and get them to understand the process
5 that we're going through. I will be - - . and
6 if you have no problem with the small
7 classrooms, maybe how we learn and what teachers
8 represent the children and the - - retention
9 skill from them to processing information as we
10 thought it will help, and just more funding, and
11 maybe talking to the teachers. Ask the teachers
12 what they need and bring in those [applause],
13 and then speaking to the teachers and the
14 principals in the schools to impart that wisdom
15 that will help to elevate the education. They
16 need help.

17 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you.

18 [Applause]

19 MR. BETNEIC: Next speaker?

20 MS. JENNIFER ZENAVO: I just want to say it
21 upsets me that this is my child's school. And
22 my daughter has learned to read. My daughter is
23 becoming bilingual. My daughter can count. And
24 it upsets me that - - DOE wanted just to walk.
25 And what kind of message is that sending to our

1 kids and their dreams? [Applause] Our
2 daughter and she started something. You know,
3 when I was in high school, and I thought about -
4 - , if I wouldn't have took it again, I wouldn't
5 have finished high school. I wouldn't have went
6 to Berkley College. So why aren't we thinking
7 of all our children? These are our children.
8 Would you give up on yours? No. [Applause] But
9 are you phasing out?

10 MALE VOICE: Yes.

11 [Background noise]

12 [Applause]

13 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker 29?

14 MS. DENORAH BOBET: Good evening. My name
15 is Denorah Bobet. I was born and raised in this
16 community - - and strong. [Background noise] in
17 1997, eight years long. My daughter and my son
18 are in this school when he was kindergarten and
19 he's going on to the - - . I will tell you the
20 support that comes from the staff and the
21 faculty at this school you're not going to see
22 anywhere else. The population is not going to
23 change. Therefore, the statistics - - . Until
24 you have the fact, we also--what? 73% or 77% of
25 the primary has to move to - - and the other 84%

1 of the primary - - tonight? The 16 and 23% of
2 the students that are passing, their parents are
3 right here. Why don't you talk to the other
4 parents? They are not here [applause]. Why - -
5 the other parents that are not supporting their
6 children and educating them? This was mentioned
7 before many a time. Education, for example, - -
8 . We've got to go to the students and see what
9 they think and what could be done differently to
10 make people more successful. Not to be on the
11 side 'cause that's not going to help anybody
12 through the type - - . Thank you.

13 [Applause]

14 MR. BETNEIC: Thank you.

15 [Background noise]

16 MR. FREDRICK LAW: I'll just mention as a
17 teacher here, [background noise] is the student
18 because I'm going to say something that's going
19 to make, probably, not a very well - - . And
20 that is when I was asked from the students to
21 explain why the school was closing, I had to
22 scatter my focus in this question and it was
23 very hard for me to - - . And I told them that
24 it was very much like what happened when the
25 settlers would come in the Old West and had to,

1 kind of, displace the Native Americans who
2 already lived there. And now my students have
3 their discussion and their debate about why that
4 happens, and they always maintain that they - -
5 with the Native Americans 'cause they give the
6 land and in New York, what's going on in the
7 schools are appropriately - - and the situations
8 that we're debating, okay. But people have more
9 money, more resources, the space to let them use
10 their resources to form the area into something
11 that they want. That is exactly what's
12 happening in [applause]. And - - is not just
13 because of the statements out here. The
14 programs that we might send to the pre-K support
15 systems, they will have them, but they won't
16 have 'em for us. And if that's the case, and
17 the programs should not happen for us for
18 whatever reason, you are not getting full - - .
19 And the answer is no longer talking. It's
20 revolution. So please consider that when you're
21 continuing it those different kinds of schools
22 that have the same kind of pattern that we
23 always see in the schools that you're closing.
24 [Applause] If you did this, it's not even
25 talking to him. There's going to be a riot and

1 there's going to be reactions in the streets
2 because you're not considering the people who,
3 basically, make up the - - .

4 [Applause]

5 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker?

6 GEORGE FROM CSE: Good evening everyone. I
7 represent the principal at C79 and I'm going to
8 read a statement. It's really not a statement -
9 - reading, and then I have a few comments that I
10 want to say. Once again, the DOE has scheduled
11 more than two dozen to close. The latest 26
12 schools destined for the - - in a particular
13 pattern. Several of the principals who were
14 told they would have time to turn the schools
15 around, several have effective - - to the - - ,
16 several have sufficient policy reviews. One
17 actually has a principal who exceeded
18 expectation and - - was improved - - . The DOE
19 seems to take aim at schools as if they're
20 playing a game of Russian roulette. The DOE
21 worse - - is often their same children and
22 families. It usually takes aim at the students
23 who have already setbacks and humiliations in
24 previous school closings. Many of them have
25 turned away from the city - - schools and the

1 reasons are poor academic performance or
2 recovering from families with - - . Then the
3 young students are warehoused in another low-
4 performance school that are - - closed too.
5 This is failing strategy for turning schools
6 around. This is the statement prepared for the
7 CSA. And we really should have things like this
8 at the school several times and the school can
9 remain peaceful, a very - - . I am a retired
10 principal from district 19. In October of - - I
11 received a letter from the state and I was told
12 that my school was going to close. I had the
13 instruction, but this is really from my
14 experience - - in the past was that I had time.
15 It took me three and a half years to bring - - .
16 There is no - - . For me, it's a nightmare for
17 my school, but I have the support of my staff,
18 the DOE, and the students - - job. I feel that
19 if you give them the time, the school will be
20 successful. My school was.

21 [Applause]

22 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker 31 Lana Dominick and
23 32 Joe Leake [phonetic]?

24 [Laughter]

25 MS. LANA DOMINICK: Hello. My first

1 question to you all is, like, I'm going to
2 close down this school, right? What do you want
3 to do if you close down this school when a lot
4 of people--the parents--they have to look for
5 schools, but their kids need schools. They're
6 missing days in schools. Not trying to help
7 with any of what needs to be fixed now with the
8 school, like we're talking about all this - - .
9 That's just wrong. My - - here, so they get
10 support. I mean, she has the support from a lot
11 of teachers here. She's got her friends here.
12 She's got friends here. This is like her
13 family, you know what I'm saying? We have my
14 God kids that go to this school. The things
15 that my god kids do to actually have someone
16 that can communicate with them and they can
17 actually, like, understand what their role is -
18 - . They can have that communication and that
19 support. The support, you know, some of the
20 kids don't have that at home. So when they have
21 this school and you take it away from them, do
22 you think that that's going to make them a
23 better person? It's going to [background noise]
24 anything different? No, it's actually going to
25 be worse - - and what there was already--do you

1 understand what I'm saying? I think the - -
2 is going to bring them down even further. The
3 fact is - - school said that you've got to call
4 before you do anything. And right now, you're
5 trying to have them walk. And now that they're
6 set up, you should just keep it as right and
7 that's it, but you shouldn't be like that at
8 all. [Applause] She needs a long time,
9 especially with - - . You know, and I can tell-
10 -I have the other - - numbers, and I go to their
11 school and I look, and you won't find a good
12 school that's actually communicating with the
13 children and the parents and telling them
14 everything, what's actually being done or
15 actually given the parents the opportunity to
16 come see the kid's school--the classroom--and to
17 see what the kids are learning. Just give it
18 time. I'm sorry. I've lost all of my time, but
19 this is our - - . You know what I'm saying? We
20 had this discussion, like, I think it was last
21 month. You all came to the school and you all
22 talked. Honestly, my opinion is that all of
23 this that's being said right now, but coming in
24 this ear and coming out this ear.

25 [Applause]

1 MR. BETNEIC: Speaker 32, last call. This
2 is probably - - accurate comments, so if you
3 have - - originally.

4 [Background noise]

5 MS. ESPADA: I had to say this before all
6 those people came back in today. As a parent
7 and as a CC [phonetic] president, I want to
8 challenge the DOE and the mayor to bring in
9 teachers or professors from Princeton, Yale, or
10 - - to see how the students there would do.

11 [Applause] But to - - somebody the same poor - -
12 right now that our children are receiving and
13 are being taught. And then, and only then, you
14 can believe our teachers are not doing a good
15 job. Instead of believing the DOE, the - - for
16 failure and electing to support the schools that
17 are struggling and are in need of support. On
18 behalf of all of the - - parents, we all--the
19 parents of - - come together as one. To make a
20 difference for our children, we have to set them
21 up for success and not failure. Thank you.

22 [Applause]

23 MR. BETNEIC: That's exhausted our speaker
24 list. Now, there'll be a question and answer
25 period. And remember, there are some individual

1 questions and others that were bucketed into
2 categories. Any question that is not answered
3 here tonight will be answered on the Department
4 of Education website. If you have additional
5 questions at the conclusion of tonight's
6 proceedings, we ask you to direct them to us on
7 the phone or by e-mail. Those numbers are on
8 the fact sheet, but again, it's
9 do9proposals@schools.nyc.gov,
10 do9proposals@schools.nyc.gov or (212) 374-5159.
11 Now, I'll turn it back to the chancellor for
12 your questions.

13 CHANCELLOR POLAKOW-SURANSKY: Thank you. So
14 there were several questions that were submitted
15 and I'm going to answer each of them in a
16 moment, but before I do answer the questions, I
17 just want to thank you again for coming tonight
18 and for talking with such passion for the school
19 - - right here. I'll tell you a little bit of
20 what I've learned. I've heard you list some
21 real challenges here. The design of the
22 classrooms, the challenges around retaining the
23 teachers, the challenges around the high - -
24 from the teachers, making sure that parents
25 understand the curriculum, needing more

1 services, like counseling and health services,
2 wanting more resources that can directly support
3 the needs of special ed. students. And I also
4 heard a lot of good things, that teachers and
5 parents and alumni talk about here in this
6 school. Children here feel nurtured and well.
7 There's consistency. There are good teachers
8 and a good principal, a parent coordinator, that
9 there's some progress for students who are
10 learning English, the special ed. students.
11 People feel good about some of the new
12 curriculum that they started to try where our
13 leadership - - programs for young men - - .
14 There are morning cup of Joe programs, so
15 parents and teachers can interact. There are
16 after school programs for ESL students. There
17 are special attendance programs and new
18 technology, like a smart - - and workshops for
19 parents. And I want to be clear that the
20 purpose for this hearing is to take all of that
21 information and consider it before the
22 chancellor makes a final recommendation to the
23 panel for educational policy. And I've heard
24 clearly that the members of the community that
25 were here tonight feel very passionately and

1 strongly that this is not the right proposal
2 for this school. I also want to acknowledge
3 that there are some open questions that people
4 have, and so, let me just talk briefly about
5 some of the questions that came up. One of the
6 questions is, is this school going to become a
7 charter school - - is passed? It will not
8 become a charter school. The proposal that is
9 on the table is for a new district public school
10 that will come. Another question that is asked
11 is what will happen to students who are here
12 now? Are they going to have to find another
13 school? Those students who are here now who are
14 in kindergarten through first grade will join
15 the new school [background noise] approved, and
16 students in the second, third, and fourth grade
17 will continue as part of P.S. 230 until they
18 graduate, unless their parents decide that they
19 would like them to go another school. And that
20 option does exist as well. Another question
21 asked is what's going to happen next with the
22 new school that's coming in? And how do you
23 know that it's going to be better or it's going
24 to be able to solve some of the challenges that
25 have been - - for students? And I can't promise

1 you that the proposal that we make is
2 definitely going to work. I can tell you that
3 over the past ten years, there have been 600 new
4 schools created across New York City. And the
5 vast majority of those schools have done much,
6 much better than the schools that they replaced.
7 And the challenges that, I think, we face is
8 that there can be different opinions, both of
9 which are valid about what is the right solution
10 for the school, so many here tonight proposed
11 the solution of trying to bring new resources
12 into this building and more support. And with
13 that, we would help solve the problem. And the
14 proposal that we made is to try and give a new
15 culture and a new team to attempt to make this
16 different. And I want to be clear about
17 something because I think if you haven't been
18 involved in the projects around the city to
19 create new schools, you might not know this.
20 But many of the teachers are part of the school
21 community will choose to become part of the new
22 school of P.S. 230. There is part of the
23 teachers' contract that guarantees that 50% of
24 the qualified teachers in the school can become
25 part of the - - school, if they apply to it, at

1 least. And so, there will be--if this
2 proposal is approved--that option available for
3 many of the staff here. And there will also be
4 an opportunity for new folks to come in. I want
5 to share one data point that I noticed when I
6 was sending it out to the school. Every year,
7 we ask teachers on a survey, is this a school
8 you would recommend to parents. And four out of
9 ten teachers in this school said no, and that's
10 in the bottom 7% of all schools in the city. So
11 that means that there are real concerns even
12 amongst the teaching staff about whether this is
13 working for kids. And I think that the proposal
14 that we're making is not to develop the kids in
15 the - - . The proposal is to try and find a
16 different solution and bring light into some of
17 the experiences for children who aren't
18 succeeding. We know that many kids are, but
19 when 84% of the students are not able to pass
20 their exams, that's a problem and we need to
21 face that squarely and we need to find a
22 solution. And I think that we will think deeply
23 on what you've shared tonight, but I also want
24 you to listen and think carefully about what the
25 best solution might be. Because whichever way

1 this decision goes, we're going to need the
2 educators, the alumni, the parents who spoke
3 here tonight to part of the continuing to move
4 the learning and the academics in this building.
5 The building's not going anywhere. There are
6 real challenges in this building. And as many
7 people said, the needs in this community are
8 strong. We are committed, as many of you spoke
9 tonight, to trying to build something that meets
10 every child's needs, not just 15%. And that's
11 the challenge ahead of us and it's not an easy
12 one to solve. So again, thank you for being
13 here, for being so thoughtful in what you
14 shared, and the next steps in this process will
15 be the chancellor will consider this feedback
16 and then make the final recommendations to the
17 panel for educational policies, which will vote
18 in March on whether or not to phase out the
19 school and whether or not to create a - -
20 school. Thank you.

21 MR. BETNEIC: So before we wrap up, I just
22 want to make sure you have some information
23 about the details that have been mentioned. As
24 he said and you've heard basically to be honest
25 as you can and we do appreciate the feedback and

1 the comments - - . The information will be
2 shared with the panel on educational policy, and
3 we will have this meeting on March 11th, 2013 at
4 - - technical high school, 2943 - - Brooklyn at
5 6:00 p.m. We're voting on this proposal. The
6 public comments at the end of this - - submitted
7 via e-mail or by phone or - - , so basically,
8 the feedback to your phone or by calling (212)
9 374-5159 or by e-mail
10 do9proposals@schools.nyc.gov. This information
11 is also included at the bottom of the fact
12 sheets. Thank you all for coming to the joint
13 public hearing for the - - .

14 [Background noise]

15 [END RECORDING]

16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio files and have been transcribed to the best of my ability.

Signature *Lisa Jampas*

Date February 27, 2013