



Amended Public Comment Analysis

Date: February 9, 2012

Topic: The Proposed Phase-out of International Arts Business School (17K544) in Building K470 Beginning in 2012-2013

Date of Panel Vote: February 9, 2012

Summary of Proposal

The New York City Department of Education (“DOE”) is proposing to phase out International Arts Business School (17K544, “International Arts Business”), an existing high school in the George Wingate Educational Complex, or building K470 (“K470”), located at 600 Kingston Avenue, Brooklyn NY 11203, within the geographical confines of Community School District 17. It currently serves students in grades nine through twelve, and admits students through the Citywide High School Admissions Process. International Arts Business also offers a Career and Technical Education (“CTE”) pathway. The DOE is proposing to phase out International Arts Business based on its poor performance and the DOE’s assessment that the school lacks the capacity to turn around quickly to better support student needs. If this proposal is approved, International Arts Business will no longer admit new ninth grade students after the conclusion of the 2011-2012 school year. The school will continue to phase out one grade level at a time, until it completes its phase-out and closes after the 2014-2015 school year. Current students will be supported as they progress towards graduation while remaining enrolled at International Arts Business. In cases where students do not complete graduation requirements by June 2015, the DOE will help students and families identify alternative programs or schools that meet students’ needs so that they may continue their education after International Arts Business completes phasing out.

International Arts Business is co-located with the School for Human Rights (17K531, “Human Rights”), an existing secondary school that serves students in grades six through twelve, the School for Democracy and Leadership (17K533, “Democracy and Leadership”), an existing secondary school that serves students in grades six through twelve, and the High School for Public Service: Heroes of Tomorrow (17K546, “HS for Public Service”), an existing high school that serves students in grades nine through twelve.

In addition, K470 houses two sites of a multi-side District 75 inclusion program (75K036): P036K@H544K, which serves students in grades nine through twelve in International Arts Business’ general education classes, and P036@Wingate, which serves students in Human Rights’ general education classes.

In another Educational Impact Statement (“EIS”), the DOE is proposing to open a new high school, 17K745, in K470 in September 2012. The proposal can be found at: <http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/leadership/PEP/publicnotice/2011-2012/Feb2012Proposals>.

This school will continue growing to full-scale as International Arts Business phases out. The new school will open with ninth grade, adding one grade annually and reaching full scale in the 2015-2016 school year with a grade span of nine through twelve.

The details of this proposal have been released in an EIS which can be accessed here: <http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/leadership/PEP/publicnotice/2011-2012/Feb2012Proposals>.

This analysis of public comment has been amended to clarify the supports offered to schools.

Copies of the EIS are also available in the main offices of International Arts Business, Human Rights, Democracy and Leadership, the HS for Public Service, P036@Wingate, and P036KH455K.

Summary of Comments Received at the Joint Public Hearing

A joint public hearing regarding this proposal was held at K470 on February 3, 2012. At that hearing, interested parties had an opportunity to provide input on the proposal. Representatives from School Leadership Team (“SLT”) at every school organization in K470 were invited to participate. Approximately 138 members of the public attended the hearing and 28 people spoke. Present at the meeting were: the Chancellor’s Designee, Brooklyn High School Superintendent Karen Watts; District 17 Community Education Council (“CEC”) representatives Cassandra Townsley and Natasha Welsh; Citywide Council on High Schools (“CCHS”) representative Monique Lindsay; Principal of International Arts Business, Sheila Hanley; International Arts Business SLT representatives Pita Gay Nelson, Jessica Schrank, Gary James, and Allison Smith; Principal of Democracy and Leadership, James Olearchik; Democracy and Leadership SLT representative Tyler Brewster; and Principal of HS for Public Service, Ben Shuldiner. Representatives of P036K@H544K’s SLT were invited to attend the hearing, and their attendance had been confirmed, but they ultimately chose not to attend. Representatives of Human Rights’ SLT were invited to attend the hearing, but they chose not to attend. New York City Council Member Mathieu Eugene also attended the hearing.

The following comments and remarks were made at the joint public hearing:

1. Council Member Eugene opposed the proposal and stated that International Arts Business should be supported. He also stated that phasing out International Arts Business will not positively affect students.
2. International Arts Business SLT representatives opposed the proposal and contended:
 - a. The school should not be closed because students receive academic and social enrichment, among other positive benefits, from their experiences at the school;
 - b. While International Arts Business’ graduation rate was below the Citywide average, it is still higher than the graduation rates of other schools in International Arts Business’ peer index, so International Arts Business should not be closed.

- c. There is not sufficient data to support the proposal to phase out International Arts Business.
 - d. Standardized assessments are not sufficiently differentiated, so International Arts Business' special education students' academic performance is not accurately measured.
 - e. Current students would not receive individualized attention during the proposed phase-out.
 - f. International Arts Business' staff has not been given a chance to succeed.
 - g. Why does the DOE not recognize International Arts Business' performance from beyond three years ago?
3. The Principal of International Arts Business opposed the proposal and contended:
- a. In 2010-2011, International Arts Business had a higher four-year graduation rate than 41% of its peer schools and a higher six-year graduation rate than 61% of its peer schools.
 - b. International Arts Business should not be phased out because it is not a Persistently Lowest Achieving school, unlike two schools in its peer group.
 - c. The school is a nurturing and motivating environment.
 - d. The schools that were proposed for phase-out in 2008 but were not phased out have not been successful in the years since they were proposed for phase-out.
 - e. International Arts Business should not be phased out because the majority of its students are on track to graduation. Currently, 72% of students who are due to graduate in 2012 are expected to graduate, while 65% of students who are due to graduate in 2013 are expected to graduate, and 78% of students who are due to graduate in 2014 are expected to graduate. Amongst students who are expected to graduate in 2015, 71% of have 5 credits or more.
 - f. International Arts Business has the highest four-year graduation rate of the high schools that the DOE has proposed to phase out this year.
 - g. Of the students who graduated in 2010, 64% of students received a Regents or an Advanced Regents diploma. Of students who graduated in 2011, 69% of students received a Regents diploma.
 - h. Of the students who are expected to graduate in 2013, 75.6% passed the English Language Arts Regents exam.
4. The Principal of HS for Public Service opposed the proposal and contended:
- a. International Arts Business is a nurturing and positive environment for students.
 - b. Schools that are co-located on a campus should be evaluated differently than schools that are not.
 - c. There are concerns about shared spaces in the building during the period when there will be five schools in the building.
 - d. The DOE should consider a different intervention because phasing out International Arts Business would impact the other schools in the building.
5. Multiple commenters opposed the proposal and stated that instead of phasing out International Arts Business, the administration should be replaced.
6. A commenter stated that International Arts Business' poor academic performance is due to its student population and that the school has a higher percentage of special education students than District 17 and more special education students than its co-located schools.

7. Multiple commenters stated that International Arts Business needs more resources to improve.
8. A commenter stated that International Arts Business has not had a science teacher since September.
9. A commenter contended that a school that is graduating 75% of its students should not be considered a failing school.
10. A commenter asked how the phase-out would affect a community based organization, buildOn, which organizes students to provide community services over the weekend.
11. A commenter stated that it is unfair that Community Roots Charter School, which received an “F” grade on its 2009-2010 Progress Report, be allowed to expand when International Arts Business, which received an “F” grade on its 2010-2011 Progress Report, is proposed to be phased out.
12. Multiple commenters stated that International Arts Business should not be phased out because it did not receive a Quality Review in 2010-2011 and because the school is improving, as demonstrated by the percentage (19%) of International Arts Business’ current eleventh grade students who are on track for graduation.
13. Multiple commenters stated that International Arts Business is a nurturing academic environment for students and families.
14. Multiple commenters asked where students would go if International Arts Business is phased out.
15. Multiple commenters stated that International Arts Business has improved by implementing teacher effectiveness practices, special education initiatives, creative student programming, and more professional development.
16. A commenter stated that the DOE should recognize how the proposed phase-out would impact International Arts Business’ staff.
17. A commenter contended that schools that have been targeted for phase-out generally have disproportionate numbers of poor and minority students.

The following questions were asked as part of the question and answer section of the Joint Public Hearing on February 3, 2012.

18. A commenter asked how current eleventh grade students would be affected if the proposal is approved.
19. How does International Arts Business compare to other schools in its peer group?

Summary of Issues Raised in Written and/or Oral Comments Submitted to the DOE

20. Brooklyn Borough President, Marty Markowitz submitted a letter to the Chancellor of the DOE before the EIS describing this proposal was published in which he requested a detailed list of the supports that were provided to International Arts Business in an effort to save the school. He claimed that the supports provided in the EISs are too generic to distinguish from one another.
21. The DOE received a written comment from a group of International Arts Business teachers who wrote in opposition of the proposed phase out.
 - a. The school has identified areas that needed improvement and then made strives to address each and every one. The decision to phase out International Arts Business

was made prematurely, as the school had just implemented all of the proposed improvements in September, only two months before decision was made to propose the phase out.

- b. The school's graduation rate improved to 61%, up from 58%, and within 4 points of the City average.
- c. Passing test scores in the Global Regents examination increased from barely passing to more scores greater than 75%.
- d. Based on improvements listed above, school should be given the chance to prove its success and not be phased out prematurely.

Class Size Matters ("CSM"), submitted written comments objecting to all of the proposed phase-outs and truncations proposed by the DOE. In opposing the DOE's proposal to phase-out and eventually close these schools, the CSM comments cited the following reasons: (1) none of the Educational Impact Statements for the proposals include discussion of how the proposed phase-outs or, where applicable, the co-locations would affect class size; (2) the Citywide Instructional Footprint does not include class size standards; (3) the Educational Impact Statements use utilization figures from the DOE's Enrollment Capacity Utilization Report ("Blue Book"), which does not take into account the need to reduce class sizes in schools Citywide; (4) the community members, faculty, and families of schools that have been proposed for phase-out have opposed the proposed phase-outs and truncations; (5) the schools that have been proposed for phase-out and/or truncation have high concentrations of "at-risk" students, as defined as English Language Learner students, students with disabilities, and economically disadvantaged students.

Analysis of Issues Raised, Significant Alternatives Proposed and Changes Made to the Proposal

- Comment 1 contended that phasing out International Arts Business would not positively impact students. Comments 2(a), 3(c), 4(a), and 13 state that International Arts Business is a positive, nurturing environment for students.

The DOE recognizes that that members of the community may oppose this proposal. However, the DOE believes that closing a struggling school and opening a new school with new leaders and staff is a successful strategy to provide all students with an excellent education. In a June 2010 MDRC, an independent research group, issued a report on New York City's new small schools strategy. MDRC concluded: "it is possible, in a relatively short span of time, to replace a large number of underperforming public high schools in a poor urban community and, in the process, achieve significant gains in students' academic achievement and attainment. And those gains are seen among a large and diverse group of students — including students who entered the ninth grade far below grade level and male students of color, for whom such gains have been stubbornly elusive." (MDRC, "Transforming the High School Experience," June 2010.)

The DOE counts on each of its schools to provide a high-quality education to its students—and it hold all schools of them all to the same high standard. If a school is not getting the job done for students – whether it was opened recently or not – the DOE is compelled to take serious action to ensure its students do not fall even further behind.

- Comments 2(b), 3(a,b,e-h), 4(d), 5, 9, 12, 15, 19, and 21(b-d) relate to contentions that International Arts Business should not be phased out.

Comments 2(b) and 3(a) erroneously claim that International Arts Business's graduation rate was higher than the graduation rates of other schools in its peer index group. International Arts Business's four-year graduation rate group was in the bottom 28% of schools Citywide, 27% of schools in Brooklyn, and 34% of its peer group. Its six-year graduation rate was in the bottom 46% of schools Citywide, the bottom 42% of schools in Brooklyn, and in the 50 percentile among its peer group schools. Comment 3(g) contends that a significant percentage of International Arts Business students who graduate receive Regents diplomas. While 64% of 2010 graduates received a Regents or an Advanced Regents diploma, only 57% of International Arts Business students who were expected to graduate in 2010 actually graduated, and only 34% of International Arts Business students who were expected to graduate in 2010 received a Regents diploma. Of the students who were expected to graduate in 2011, only 61% of International Arts Business students graduated, and only 42% of International Arts Business students received a Regents diploma. This is notable as Regents diplomas alone will count towards graduation starting next year.

Comment 3(e) claims that the majority of International Arts Business's students are on track to graduation, but only 66% of first year students at International Arts Business 10 credits or more in their first year; this puts International Arts Business in the bottom 23% of International Arts Business' peer group, the bottom 15% of schools Citywide, and the bottom 9% of schools in Brooklyn. First year credit accumulation is a key predictor of student success because students who fall behind early on in high school often have trouble getting back on track to graduate. Only 54% of third year students at International Arts Business earned 10 or more credits, which put International Arts Business in the bottom 10% of schools Citywide, the bottom 9% of schools in Brooklyn, and in the bottom 3% of its peer group.

Comment 9 claims that International Arts Business graduated 75% of its students. In 2010-2011, International Arts Business had a 76% six-year graduation rate. However, in 2010-2011, International Arts Business only had a 61% four-year graduation rate. In response to comment 21(b), the DOE acknowledges that International Arts Business' graduation rate in 2009-2010 was 57%, but even in 2009-2010, its graduation rate put International Arts Business in the bottom 18% of schools Citywide and in its peer group and in the bottom 16% of schools in Brooklyn. The DOE also acknowledges that the New York State Education Department did not rank International Arts Business as a Persistently Lowest Achieving school in 2009-2010 or in 2010-2011. Comment 3(f) contends that International Arts Business should not be phased out because it had the highest four-year graduation rate of the schools that the DOE has proposed for phase-out this year. However, as discussed in more detail below, there is not a sole criterion by which the DOE determines whether a school should be phased out. While International Arts Business may have seen improvements in the number of students who have passed the Global Studies Regents exam, in 2010-2011, International Arts Business was in the

bottom 20% of schools in Brooklyn and 14% of high schools Citywide in the weighted Global Studies Regents pass rate, as outlined in the Progress Report. Finally, while Comment 3(h) contends that 75.6% of students who are expected to graduate in 2013 may have passed the English Language Arts Regents exam in January 2012, International Arts was in the bottom 10% of schools in Brooklyn and 8% of schools Citywide in the weighted English Language Arts Regents pass rate.

It should be noted that International Arts Business' graduation rates and ranking did not comprise all of the components in the DOE's comprehensive review of International Arts Business. That review was conducted with the goal of determining what intensive supports and interventions would best benefit the International Arts Business community. After the review, the DOE concluded that only the most serious intervention, the gradual phase-out and eventual closure of International Arts Business, will best serve the school's students and community. Phasing out and closing International Arts Business will allow for new school options to develop in K470 that are intended to provide better options for families. Indefinitely trying to turn around a school that has struggled for years is not viable, and the DOE has had success with replacing the City's lowest-performing schools with new schools.

- Comments 2(c) and 21(a) contend that there is not sufficient data to support the proposal to phase out International Arts Business. Comment 12 contends that the proposal is not justified because International Arts Business did not receive a Quality Review in 2010-2011. Comment 2(g) asked why the DOE did not taken into account International Arts Business' performance from beyond three years ago.

Schools are identified for possible grade reconfiguration or phase-out for the following three reasons: (1) they received poor grades on their annual Progress Report; (2) they received a poor rating on their annual Quality Review; or (3) they have been identified by the New York State Education Department as Persistently Low Achieving. Specifically, under the DOE's accountability framework, all schools that receive a D or F, or a third consecutive grade of C or lower on their annual Progress Report and all schools that received a rating of Underdeveloped on their most recent Quality Review are evaluated for intensive support or intervention, including the possibility of grade reconfiguration and phase-out. Not all schools receive a Quality Review every year.

To identify the appropriate action that will best serve the student community, the DOE reviews school data, including data from beyond three years ago, consults with superintendents and other experienced educators who have worked closely with the school, and gathers community feedback. In the case of International Arts Business, after conducting this review, the DOE determined that International Arts Business has failed to develop the proper infrastructure to meet the needs of its students and families. Thus, the DOE proposed to phase out International Arts Business.

During Quality Reviews, experienced educators visit a school over several days, observe classrooms and talk with students, staff and families. Schools are rated on a four-point scale, with "Underdeveloped" as the lowest possible rating and "Well Developed" as the

highest. Not all schools receive a Quality Review each year. Rather, schools are selected for a Quality Review based on criteria established by the Office of Accountability. For more information about the 2011-2012 Quality Review selection criteria, please visit the DOE's Web site at: <http://schools.nyc.gov/Accountability/tools/review>.

- Comment 2(d), 4(b), and 6 contend that factors such as International Arts Business' student demographics and its co-location in K470 should be taken into account when evaluating International Arts Business' academic performance.

The overall Progress Report grade is designed to reflect each school's contribution to student achievement, no matter where each child begins his or her journey to career and college readiness. The methods are designed to be demographically neutral so that the final score for each school has as little correlation as possible with incoming student characteristics such as poverty, ethnicity, disabilities, and English learner status. To achieve this, the Progress Report emphasizes year-to-year progress, compares schools mostly to peers matched based on incoming student characteristics, and awards additional credit based on exemplary progress with high-need student groups. Each school's performance is compared to the performance of schools in its peer group, which is comprised of New York City public schools with a student population most like the school's population, according to the peer index. The peer index is used to sort schools on the basis of students' academic and demographic background, and the formula to calculate a school's peer index includes the percentage of students eligible for free lunch, the percentage of students with disabilities, the percentage of Black/Hispanic students, and the percentage of English Language Learner ("ELL") students at the school. For high schools, each school has up to 40 peer schools, up to 20 schools with peer index immediately above it and up to 20 with peer index immediately below it. Thus, International Arts Business is grouped in its peer group with other New York City public schools with similar student academic and demographic background. Some of the schools in its peer group, such as the Academy for Conservation and the Environment (18K637), the High School for Youth and Community Development at Erasmus (17K537), and the Academy of Innovative Technology (19K618), are also co-located with other schools in their respective buildings.

- Comment 2(e) contends that current students would not receive individualized support during the phase-out. If the phase out proposal is approved, International Arts Business will receive support in the areas of budget, staffing, programming, community engagement, guidance and enrollment including, but not limited to:
 - Helping the school provide students with options that support their advancement, and fully prepare students for their next transition point.
 - Working with school staff to foster a positive culture.
 - Supporting school leadership in efficiently and strategically allocating resources to ensure a consistent and coherent school environment focused on student outcomes.

- Comment 3(d) contends that the schools that were proposed for phase-out in 2008 that were not phased out have not performed well academically. Those schools' respective Progress Reports, where available, can be accessed on the DOE's Web site.
- Comment 4(c) relates to the proposed co-location of 17K745 in K470 and its possible impacts on the shared spaces in K470.

The DOE recognizes that K470 has a cafeteria, an auditorium, a library, and a gymnasium that are currently shared among the co-located schools. As in other situations where schools are co-located, and as is the current practice in K470, the schools will need to share large common and specialty rooms in the building, such as the cafeteria, the gymnasium, and the library. Specific decisions regarding the allocation of the shared spaces will be made by the Building Council, consisting of principals from all co-located schools, in conjunction with the DOE's Office of Space Planning.

- Comments 7 and 20 relate to supports that have been provided to International Arts Business to help the school's efforts to improve performance.

The DOE notes that all schools receive support and assistance from their respective superintendents and Children First Networks. The Children First Network is a team that delivers operational and instructional support directly to multiple schools. Struggling schools receive supports as part of system-wide efforts to strengthen all schools; and they also receive individualized supports to address their particular challenges. The DOE strives to provide struggling schools with leadership, operational, instructional, and student supports that can help turn a struggling school around. Schools take advantage of those supports they believe will best improve student performance.

As stated in the EIS, the DOE offered numerous specific supports to International Arts Business to help its efforts to improve performance. They included:

Leadership Support:

- o Extensive leadership training and mentoring for the principal around whole school improvement, professional development and teacher effectiveness.
- o Leadership coaching and training on implementing plans in support of Citywide instructional initiatives.
- o Training and support of school leadership in systems and strategies for increasing parent involvement and deepening relationships with families at the school.

Instructional Support:

- o Support and training for teachers in improvement strategies for addressing the various needs and learning styles of ELL students and Special Education students.
- o Facilitating training for teachers in various literacy strategies and strengthening lesson planning to incorporate a literacy focus across disciplines.
- o Professional development opportunities for teachers on best practices for instructional improvements in mathematics and strategies for raising student interest levels and outcomes in math.

- o Professional development opportunities for all staff on various measures, systems and protocols to evaluate, manage, and support student work.

Operational Support:

- o Advice on budgeting, human resources, teacher recruitment, and building management.
- o Supporting school staff on developing strategies and practices for improving student achievement.
- o On-site training for assistant principals and guidance counselors around effective use of student data systems to track student progress.

Student Support:

- o Professional development opportunities for school leadership and teachers around strategies for fostering a positive school culture, student engagement and positive student behavior.
- o Supporting comprehensive school wide arts enrichment aimed at improving student outcomes and exposure to the arts.
- o Supporting struggling students with the Global Kids enrichment program, which offers academic, social, and emotional supports through mentoring and exposure to various programs in the city.
- o On-site training and support to classroom teachers on effective strategies for implementing integrated classrooms to support students with special needs in the general education settings.

CTE-Specific Support:

- o Advice and support to the leadership during the process to gain approval for CTE programs.
- o Providing opportunities and training for administrators and CTE coordinators to develop their capacity with Carl D. Perkins Vocational and Technical Education Act funding and CTE data management to further the CTE mission and vision at the school

- Comment 8 states that International Arts Business has lacked a science teacher since September.

International Arts Business’s budget records indicate there are four science teachers assigned to International Arts Business at the start of the 2011-2012 school year, just as there were in the 2010-2011 school year. One teacher was removed from International Arts Business’ staff budget on December 15, 2011, and a budget vacancy was created on January 24, 2012 to replace the teacher. It should be noted that principals have discretion over their budget and make choices about how to prioritize their resources.

- Comment 10 asked how the proposed phase-out would affect buildOn, a club that International Arts Business currently offers.

It is difficult to predict precisely how changes to the above offerings might be implemented, as decisions would rest with school administrators and would be made based on student interests and available resources.

- Comment 11 contends that it is unfair that Community Roots Charter School (84K536, “Community Roots”) was approved to expand even though it received an overall F grade on its 2009-2010 Progress Report while International Arts Business has been proposed for phase-out because it received an overall F grade on its 2010-2011 Progress Report.

While DOE acknowledges that Community Roots received an overall F grade on its first Progress Report in 2009-2010, the school improved and received an overall C grade on its 2010-2011 Progress Report. Additionally:

- In 2010-2011, 67% of Community Roots’ students were on grade level in English Language Arts (“ELA”), up from 59% in 2009-2010. The 2010-2011 ELA proficiency scores place Community Roots in the top 18% of schools citywide and in the top 19% of schools district-wide.
- In 2010-2011, 71% of students were on grade level in Math, which places Community Roots in the top 33% of schools citywide.
- In 2010-2011, 100% of parent respondents on the Learning Environment Survey reported that they are “satisfied” or “very satisfied” with the school.
- Community Roots is a highly demanded school in the community, as demonstrated by the fact that the school has a significant waitlist and low student attrition. In 2011-2012, 410 students applied for 50 open seats in kindergarten. Currently, 700 students remain on the waitlist.
- The student attrition rate for Community Roots was 2.67% in 2010-2011. In that year, only 8 out of 300 students enrolled at Community Roots left the school.

As stated in the EIS, graduation rates at International Arts Business have been consistently low—60% or less—for over the past three years. Last year, International Arts Business’ four-year graduation rate (including August graduates) was 61%, whereas the Citywide average four-year graduation rate was 65%, placing International Arts Business in the bottom 28% of high schools Citywide. If Regents Diplomas alone counted towards graduation, as will be the case next year, the four-year graduation rate at International Arts Business would drop to 42%, well below the Citywide average of 60%, placing International Arts Business in the bottom 20% of all high schools Citywide. This low rate will become increasingly problematic in the future because beginning in the 2012-2013 school year, the only way to graduate will be to earn a Regents diploma.

Furthermore, International Arts Business has struggled with student progress over the years. International Arts Business received an F on the Student Progress sub-section of the Progress report in 2010-2011, a D in 2009-2010, and an F in 2008-2009. Demand for International Arts Business has remained low. The school offers three programs to which students may apply through the Citywide High School Admissions Process: Business, Performing Arts, and Visual Art and Design. Last year each program received between 4.4 and 6.0 applications per available seat compared to the Citywide average of 8.5 applications per seat. Finally, safety issues have been a concern at International Arts

Business in recent years. On the 2010-2011 New York City School Survey, 38% of students reported feeling unsafe in the hallways, bathrooms, and locker rooms—this places International Arts Business in the bottom 3% of high schools Citywide. That same year, 19% of parents expressed concerns about their children’s safety. In addition, 42% of teachers reported that discipline and order were not maintained at the school.

- Comment 14 asked where students would go if International Arts Business is phased out.

As set forth in the EIS, the following are the options for International Arts Business students:

Current International Arts Business Students

Under this proposal, all current International Arts Business students will have the opportunity to graduate from International Arts Business, assuming that they continue to earn credits on schedule.

Current Ninth Grade Students at International Arts Business

In New York City, the high school admissions process is a citywide choice process. The Citywide High School Admissions Process permits an applicant to list up to 12 high school programs in order of preference on his or her application. High school admissions applications were due December 2, 2011. Students who are in ninth grade for the first time can participate in the Citywide High School Admissions Process and can apply to attend a different high school for tenth grade. Current ninth grade students at International Arts Business who are interested in attending a different school for tenth grade may have already taken part in this process by submitting an application on or before December 2, 2011. If this proposal is approved in February 2012, there would be another opportunity for current ninth grade students at International Arts Business, and students at other schools who have applied to International Arts Business, to submit a new list of 12 schools in Round Two of the Citywide High School Admissions Process. Those interested in applying to attend a different school as a tenth grade student in September 2012 should meet with a guidance counselor.

In March, students will be able to participate in Round Two of the Citywide High School Admissions process. Students would submit a Round Two application and would be able to rank schools that have available seats for tenth grade. Students may receive a match as part of Round Two in April. If a student submitted an application as part of Round One of the Citywide High School Admissions process, a match received in Round Two will nullify the Round One match.

Alternatively, current ninth grade students could complete high school at International Arts Business, provided they earn credits on schedule. As the school becomes smaller, students who do not earn credits on schedule would receive more individualized attention to ensure they receive the support they need to succeed. Students would also be encouraged to meet with their guidance counselor to review progress toward graduation and consider applying to a transfer school.

Current Tenth, Eleventh, and Twelfth Grade Students at International Arts Business School

Current tenth, eleventh, and twelfth grade students who are on track to graduate will complete high school at International Arts Business, provided they continue to earn credits on schedule. As the school becomes smaller, students will receive more individualized attention through graduation to ensure they are receiving the support they need to succeed.

Current tenth, eleventh, and twelfth grade students who are not on track to graduate should meet with their guidance counselor to discuss their options. Depending on their age, academic profile, and credit accumulation, some students may be better served in one of the DOE's Transfer High Schools or Young Adult Borough Centers, which have strong track records for helping over-age, under-credited students get back on track toward graduation. In general, however, it is expected that most current International Arts Business students will remain enrolled at the school as they work toward graduation. The DOE will arrange a new placement for students who have not accumulated sufficient credits and those who have not passed the minimum number of Regents exams to graduate by June 2015.

Enrollment Impact for Future High School Students

In a separate proposal, the DOE proposed to open a new high school, 17K745, in K470 in September 2012. It will grow to full-scale as International Arts Business phases out. The new school will open with ninth grade, adding one grade annually and reaching full scale in the 2015-2016 school year with a grade span of nine through twelve. If the proposals to phase out International Arts Business and to co-locate 17K745 in K470 are approved, Democracy and Leadership, Human Rights, HS for Public Service, and 14K745 will admit students through the Citywide High School Admissions Process. Students who listed a program at International Arts Business would have the opportunity to submit a new admission application during the second round of the Citywide High School Admissions Process in February 2012. Schools with available seats as well as new high schools designated to open throughout the city for the 2012-2013 school year will also be available for these students to consider as part of the second round of the Citywide High School Admissions Process. If a student already received a match in the first round of the Citywide High School Admissions Process, submitting an application in the second round will nullify the first round match if the student receives a second round match.

If this proposal is approved, and a student does not submit a second round application in February, International Arts Business' high school program would be removed from the student's existing ranking. In this scenario, any schools ranked lower than the program offered at International Arts Business on the application would move up on the application. This may or may not impact the eventual match, as the student might have been matched to a school ranked higher than International Arts Business on the application. However, if the student would have been matched to International Arts

Business, he or she would instead be matched to the next-highest program listed on the application for which an opening is available.

- Comment 15 stated that International Arts Business has improved by implementing teacher effectiveness practices, special education initiatives, creative student programming, and more professional development.

While the DOE has acknowledged the efforts that have been made by the International Arts Business's staff, we believe that even with these efforts the school has not produced adequate outcomes for the students.

- Comment 16 states that the DOE should recognize how the proposed phase-out would impact International Arts Business's staff.

As stated in the EIS, all teachers and administrative and non-pedagogical staff at International Arts Business will be excessed over the course of the phase-out. This process will take place gradually as student enrollment declines with each successive graduating class. With fewer students, the school's staffing needs will naturally be reduced. All excessing will be conducted in accordance with existing labor contracts. For example, the current United Federation of Teachers contract would require excessing to take place in reverse seniority order within each given teaching license area. Barring system-wide layoffs, excessed teachers would be eligible to apply for other City positions, and any teacher who did not find a permanent position would be placed in the Absent Teacher Reserve pool, meaning that they would continue to earn their salary while serving in the capacity of a substitute teacher in other City schools. Should there be a vacancy in the school in a teacher's license area within one year of the teacher being excessed, the teacher would have a right of return to the school, consistent with applicable contractual provisions regarding teachers' seniority.

- Comment 17 contends that schools that have been targeted for phase-out generally have disproportionate numbers of poor and minority students.

When the student demographics of the high schools that the DOE has phased out is compared to the small schools that have been opened in their place, it becomes apparent that they are very similar in terms of the percentages of black and Latino students, ELL students, and students with disabilities. The high schools that the DOE has phased out had 93% black or Latino students, 16% ELL students, and 13% students with disabilities, the new replacement schools have 93% black or Latino students, 17% ELL students, and 14% students with disabilities.

Specifically regarding International Arts Business, in 2010-2011, 69% of International Arts Business' students qualified for free or reduced lunch, and 97% of its students were black or Hispanic. Across Brooklyn, the average percentage of students who qualified for free or reduced lunch was 68% and the average percentage of black or Hispanic students was 87%. Thus, it is inaccurate to state that International Arts Business has a

disproportionate percentage of students who qualified for free or reduced lunch or were black or Hispanic.

- Comment 18 asked how current eleventh grade students would be affected if the proposed phase-out of International Arts Business is approved.

As stated in the EIS, current tenth, eleventh, and twelfth grade students who are on track to graduate will complete high school at International Arts Business, provided they continue to earn credits on schedule. As the school becomes smaller, students will receive more individualized attention through graduation to ensure they are receiving the support they need to succeed. Current tenth, eleventh, and twelfth grade students who are not on track to graduate should meet with their guidance counselor to discuss their options. Depending on their age, academic profile, and credit accumulation, some students may be better served in one of the DOE's Transfer High Schools or Young Adult Borough Centers, which have strong track records for helping over-age, under-credited students get back on track toward graduation. In general, however, it is expected that most current International Arts Business students will remain enrolled at the school as they work toward graduation. The DOE will arrange a new placement for students who have not accumulated sufficient credits and those who have not passed the minimum number of Regents exams to graduate by June 2015.

Class size is primarily determined by how principals choose to program students at their school within their budget. Thus, no particular proposal, in and of itself, necessarily impacts class size. The Citywide Instructional Footprint relies upon the current programming at a school (number of sections) to determine the baseline footprint allocation. Decisions to co-locate schools are not based solely on the utilization figures in the Blue Book. The DOE also considers the total number of classrooms in the building and the number of sections currently programmed at all schools in the building or projected to be programmed to determine the availability of excess space and the baseline footprint for each school.

The DOE acknowledges that there some members of the schools' communities that are opposed to the proposal, and/or prioritize smaller class sizes. However, given the schools' longstanding performance struggles, we believe that phasing out certain schools and/or creating new educational options by co-locating new schools will best serve the families in these communities.

With respect to CSM's comments regarding the particular types of students who attend phase-out schools, it should be noted that schools progress report grades are based in part on a comparison of the school with peer schools serving similar populations of students. Poor performance report grades thus indicate that a school is not serving its students well, both objectively and by comparison to other schools serving similar students. Moreover, the new schools proposed to open are anticipated to serve student populations similar to the phasing out school.

Changes Made to the Proposal

No changes have been made to this proposal.