

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF  
EDUCATION - DIVISION OF  
PORTFOLIO PLANNING**

**Success Academy--Bronx 3 Expansion  
and Co-location in X145 (Temporary  
siting for 3 years)**

**April 16, 2015**

1 [START RECORDING]

2 MS. LETICIA RODRIGUEZ ROSARIO: Everyone is  
3 entitled to their opinion. We do not attack.  
4 We let people speak. Even if we disagree, we  
5 let people speak. We will not tolerate  
6 disrespect. So if you hear me, at any point in  
7 the evening, say respect, that means that we  
8 need to bring our voices down and we need to  
9 listen. Adults in the room, this is our  
10 opportunity to teach our children what democracy  
11 looks like, feels like, and sounds like. So it  
12 is key that you model for our students what we  
13 expect. Students, this is your opportunity to  
14 participate in this democratic organization and  
15 feeling today. So we really need to also  
16 understand that in our country we listen, and we  
17 agree to disagree, and we respect. So again, I  
18 want to remind everyone that we stay--the aisles  
19 must remain clear, for fire purposes. We must  
20 remain respectful, so that we hear everyone's  
21 voice because in this country, everyone's voice  
22 is to be heard and that when someone is  
23 speaking, we allow them to speak, even when we  
24 disagree. So on that note, we're going to get  
25 started. Good evening. Thank you, again. This

1 is a joint public hearing for the Department of  
2 Education Community Education Council 9 and the  
3 school leadership teams of Junior High School  
4 145, Urban Science Academy, the New Millennium  
5 Business Academy. And I am the Community School  
6 District 9 superintendent, Leticia Rodriguez-  
7 Rosario. We have asked the District 9 community  
8 education council and school leadership teams of  
9 Junior High School 145, Urban Science Academy,  
10 and the New Millennium Business Academy, as well  
11 as the ALC of Middle School 145, to participate  
12 in this joint public hearing. I am joined  
13 tonight by Lauren Wilkins, from Junior High  
14 School 145; Ms. James from the ALC; Mr. Kelly  
15 from the Urban Science Academy; Mr. Bastion from  
16 the New Millennium Business Academy; as well as  
17 Ms. O'Feeny [phonetic] from the CEC 9. And also  
18 I have Ms. Maha Titah [phonetic] from SUNY.  
19 This hearing--I'm sorry, guys. I'm going to  
20 have to read a script, so I do need you to  
21 listen. This hearing is being recorded and  
22 everyone needs to know that. The purpose of  
23 this hearing is to provide comments about the  
24 proposal. Before I describe the proposal, I  
25 want to make sure you are all aware of the

1 opportunity to provide your input. All of  
2 those who wish to speak must sign up in the  
3 speaker signup area, located just outside the  
4 auditorium. The signup list will close in 15  
5 minutes. Speakers will be given the floor in  
6 the order that they have signed up. All  
7 comments are limited to two minutes. There may  
8 be elected officials who arrive at different  
9 times throughout the evening. If they wish to  
10 speak, we will do our best to accommodate them  
11 at the first opportune moment. Those who are  
12 here at the start of the public comments segment  
13 will be asked to speak first. All comments will  
14 be mentioned in the analysis of public comment,  
15 to be published and provided to the Panel for  
16 Educational Policy, the evening before the panel  
17 votes. The vote is scheduled for April 29,  
18 2015. In addition, we welcome any comments and  
19 feedback you may have, at any time before the  
20 panel votes on this proposal. The email address  
21 and phone number where comments may be made are--  
22 everyone ready--D09 proposals. So I'll say  
23 that again, D09proposals@schools.nyc.gov. And  
24 the phone number is as follows. Again, the  
25 phone number is as follows. (212)374-5159, and

1 I will say that again, (212)374-5159. I am now  
2 going to read the proposal summary. This  
3 proposal concerns the temporary siting of a  
4 portion of Success Academy Bronx 3 or SA Bronx  
5 3. SA Bronx 3 is an existing public charter  
6 school that permanently serves students in  
7 kindergarten through second grade in building X-  
8 146, located at 968 Caldwell Avenue, Bronx, New  
9 York, 10456 in Community School District 8. The  
10 New York City Department of Education, or DOE,  
11 is proposing to temporarily site grades three  
12 through five of Success Academy Bronx 3 in the  
13 X-145 building, which has sufficient space for  
14 these grades, and it is located just 0.6 miles  
15 from the X-146 building. If this proposal is  
16 approved, Success Academy Bronx 3 will offer  
17 grades kindergarten through two in the X-146  
18 building and grades three through five in the X-  
19 145 building. If this proposal is approved,  
20 Success Academy Bronx 3 will be temporarily co-  
21 located in Building X-145, located at 1000  
22 Teller Avenue, Bronx, New York, 10456 in  
23 District 9 for three years, beginning in the  
24 2015-2016 school year. If approved, before the  
25 end of the temporary three-year co-location, the

1 DOE will reevaluate the proposal, to determine  
2 the long-term sitting location for grades three  
3 through five of Success Academy Bronx 3, which  
4 includes the possibility of remaining in the X-  
5 145 building. If this proposal is approved,  
6 Success Academy Bronx 3 will be co-located in X-  
7 145 with Junior High School 145, Urban Science  
8 Academy and New Millennium Business Academy,  
9 which are each existing district middle schools  
10 that serve students in grades six through eight.  
11 Building X-145 also houses an alternative  
12 learning center, ALC Middle School 145. A co-  
13 location means that two or more school  
14 organizations are located in the same building  
15 and they share common spaces, like auditoriums,  
16 gymnasiums, libraries and cafeterias. If this  
17 proposal is approved, in the 2015-2016 school  
18 year, Success Academy Bronx 3 will serve  
19 approximately 100 to 120 third grade students.  
20 In X-145, Junior High School 145 will serve  
21 approximately 325 to 355 students. Urban  
22 Science Academy will serve approximately 295 to  
23 325 students. New Millennium Business Academy  
24 will serve approximately 180 to 210 students,  
25 and the ALC Middle School 145 will serve

1 approximately 10 to 80 students. This yields a  
2 projected 2015-2016 utilization rates of 52% to  
3 63%, and equals a total building enrollment of  
4 910 to 1090 students, if approved. Success  
5 Academy Bronx 3 will add one grade per year,  
6 until it serves third through fifth grade in  
7 Building X-145 in 2017 through 2018. At this  
8 point, the total building enrollment is  
9 projected to be approximately 1,070 students to  
10 1,280 students, which yields a projected  
11 utilization rate of approximately 62% to 74%.  
12 This demonstrates that there is sufficient space  
13 for the co-location. As mentioned, if approved,  
14 prior to the end of the proposal, in 2017 to  
15 2018, the DOE will reevaluate the proposal and  
16 the long-term seating for grades three through  
17 five of Success Academy Bronx 3. Any resulting  
18 significant changes to school utilization will  
19 be described in a future proposal and will be  
20 subject to separate approval by the Panel for  
21 Educational Policy, in accordance with the  
22 Chancellor's Regulation A190. If this proposal  
23 is approved, Success Academy Bronx 3 will  
24 continue to accept students through a charter  
25 lottery application, with preference to siblings

1 of current or accepted students, and to  
2 applicants who reside within District 8. If  
3 seats are available in first and second grade,  
4 Success Academy Bronx 3 will provide a  
5 preference to District 8 residents for those  
6 seats. Success Academy Bronx 3 will provide a  
7 preference to District 9 residents, if seats are  
8 available in third or fourth grade, to attend  
9 school in the X-145 building, once the school  
10 begins serving those grades. Thank you for your  
11 patience. I have two more paragraphs. Again,  
12 thank you. You are being a wonderful audience.  
13 Thank you. The proposal is not expected to  
14 impact admissions, current or future student  
15 enrollment, instructional programming. All of  
16 the extracurricular programs or community  
17 partnerships permanently offered at Junior High  
18 School 145, Urban Science Academy, or the New  
19 Millennium Business Academy. But the way  
20 extracurricular programs are configured within  
21 the building may be subject to change.  
22 Additionally, this proposal is not expected to  
23 impact current or future student enrollment, or  
24 instructional programming at the ALC Middle  
25 School 145. Junior High School 145, Urban

1 Science Academy, and New Millennium Business  
2 Academy are each part of the school renewal  
3 program which will result in the schools  
4 becoming community schools. This proposal will  
5 not impact the schools' participation in the  
6 school renewal program. Junior High School 145,  
7 Urban Science Academy, and New Millennium  
8 Business Academy will each adopt a community  
9 school model, beginning in the 2015-2016 school  
10 year. While the DOE does not expect this  
11 proposal to impact any tailored - - programs,  
12 extending instruction time for other additional  
13 resources, the schools may receive, as a result  
14 of the school renewal program and the schools'  
15 designation as community schools. The DOE will  
16 reevaluate the space allocations outlined in the  
17 building utilization plan for this proposal  
18 after each school's particular community school  
19 model is developed. At this time, again, I want  
20 to thank you for being a wonderful audience.  
21 Thank you. At this time I will pause for the  
22 SUNY statement. Please pass the mike.

23 MS. MAHA TITAH: Good evening. My name is  
24 Maha Titah, and I am director of charter school  
25 information at the SUNY Charter Schools

1 Institute. I am here tonight to hold a public  
2 hearing on behalf of the board of trustees and  
3 the State University of New York, or SUNY. The  
4 Education Law requires SUNY to hold a public  
5 hearing any time one of the schools it  
6 authorizes might open in an existing public  
7 school building. I am here tonight to listen to  
8 your comments about the proposal to temporarily  
9 locate grades three through five of Success  
10 Academy Charter School Bronx 3 in part of  
11 Building X-145 which is - - New York City DOE,  
12 beginning in the fall of 2015. SUNY is holding  
13 its hearing now, at the same time is holding its  
14 joint public hearing, so that we don't have to  
15 ask parents and community members to attend two  
16 different hearings on the same subject. I will  
17 be taking notes on your comments during  
18 tonight's hearing. In addition, you may give me  
19 any written comments you may have with you. You  
20 can also email your comments to  
21 charters@SUNY.edu. You can also mail comments  
22 to 41 State Street, Suite 700, Albany, New York,  
23 12207. Extra copies of our notices are posted  
24 at the back of the auditorium, with all of this  
25 contact information. SUNY will accept comments

1 through May 7th, which is five business days  
2 after the meeting of the Panel for Education  
3 Policy, where this co-location will be  
4 considered. Thank you in advance for your  
5 comments this evening.

6 MS. ROSARIO: All right. Again, we're going  
7 to start the comments. What was the word I said  
8 we need to remember?

9 AUDIENCE: Respect.

10 MS. ROSARIO: Oh my goodness, you're on it.  
11 I'm excited. Thank you guys, that is awesome.  
12 Adults, I want to hear you. I've heard the  
13 kids. I want to hear the adults. What was the  
14 word, everyone?

15 AUDIENCE: Respect.

16 MS. ROSARIO: Thank you so much. So if you  
17 hear me say that word, it means that we may be  
18 losing it a little bit and we need to bring it  
19 back. Okay? You've been excellent and  
20 wonderful, and I know that this will go well.  
21 Okay? So thank you. At this time, a reminder  
22 that we must have the doorways clear, so please,  
23 if there is an empty seat, please take it. And  
24 we must keep the entrances and the aisles clear.  
25 All right. At this time, I will be calling Ms.

1 O'Feeny from the CEC to speak.

2 MS. JOSEPHINE O'FEENY: Good evening  
3 everyone. My name is Josephine O'Feeny. I sit  
4 on the CEC for District 9, as the Bronx borough  
5 president appointee. I'm also the parent of an  
6 eighth grader at Mont Hall Science and  
7 Technology Academy, an international  
8 baccalaureate school. While I note there is  
9 nothing we can do to stop Success Academy  
10 Charter School from co-locating with the schools  
11 in--the district schools in this building, I  
12 just want to voice our position. By the way,  
13 this is not an us versus them argument. This is  
14 just stating the facts. There is a  
15 misconception out there that all public schools  
16 are failing and all charter schools are good.  
17 That is not the case. The truth is that the  
18 quality of charter schools varies. New York  
19 charter school networks are genuinely higher  
20 performing, but national research has shown that  
21 37% of charters have lower outcomes than  
22 district schools. 17% perform higher, and 46%  
23 perform about the same. So we do have a lot of  
24 - - in district public schools. Also, charter  
25 schools and district public schools are not on a

1 level playing field. Charter schools have an  
2 unfair advantage. Why is it that charter  
3 schools don't have as many English language  
4 learners and students--can you hold your  
5 applause until--I want to make sure this comes  
6 out. All right? Why is it that charter schools  
7 don't have as many English language learners and  
8 students with special needs? Why is it that  
9 more students end up leaving charter schools  
10 after enrollment? Guess where they go. Where  
11 do they end up? That's right, in our district  
12 public schools. Yes, a lot of parents apply to  
13 charter schools, but how many of these students  
14 that are accepted stay put until they graduate?  
15 The solution is not create new schools or  
16 squeeze charter schools into already crowded  
17 district public schools. The solution is to fix  
18 the schools we have, to guarantee all our kids  
19 the right to a quality education. We absolutely  
20 need all hands on deck. Instead of - - charter  
21 schools, we should work together to improve all  
22 of our schools. We would like to see charter  
23 school operators and district school leaders  
24 with a track record of success come together and  
25 exchange best practices. We call on charters

1 that are co-located with low-performing  
2 schools, to share resources and improve the  
3 quality of leadership of the charter school, of  
4 the building. Ultimately we all want the same  
5 thing for our children, an education that  
6 prepares them for a rigorous college education,  
7 a competitive global economy, and a lifelong--  
8 lifetime love of learning. So let's roll up our  
9 sleeves and get to work. We don't have any time  
10 and energy to waste on political battles, when  
11 our children's futures are at stake. Thank you.

12 MS. ROSARIO: Thank you, Ms. O'Feeny. At  
13 this time, I do want to recognize Councilwoman  
14 Vanessa Gibson, who is sitting. She will be  
15 speaking later on, but she is in the audience  
16 and I do want to recognize the Councilwoman and  
17 also Karen Haggesson [phonetic], our District 9  
18 UFT representative. Thank you both for being  
19 here. At this time, we will have  
20 representatives of the school leadership teams,  
21 from the prospective schools to speak. The  
22 first person that we'll ask to come to the mike  
23 is Muriel Simon. I'm sorry. If I call your  
24 name, just correct me. Ms. Simon, please.

25 MS. MURIEL SIMON: Good afternoon. My name

1 is Muriel Simon. I'm also a parent of a sixth  
2 grader and an SOT member. My perspective of  
3 charter schools is not against them, but you're  
4 not for our children because you come into this  
5 building, pushing out what we already  
6 established. You're not coming into this  
7 building wanting to take our children. You want  
8 to push them out. We're here to fight for our  
9 rights, just like you are here to fight for  
10 yours. Our children matter, just as yours do,  
11 so respect our rights and our children. Thank  
12 you.

13 MS. ROSARIO: The next speaker--we have a  
14 lot of speakers that we need to get through, so  
15 let's please, again, respect, and we need to  
16 listen. Beatrice Richardson. Ms. Richardson?

17 MS. RICHARDSON: Thank you. Give me one  
18 second. My mother, Beatrice Richardson is  
19 coming up as well and my daughter, Beatrice  
20 Kelly. So I'm going to start with peace and  
21 blessings to every single person in the  
22 building. We are not against the charter  
23 schools. Everyone deserves to learn, including  
24 our children. We love our children at 145, in  
25 the 145 building and we do want what they need

1 because they haven't been able to get the  
2 tools that they need for their education. So  
3 therefore when you deal with home, you have to  
4 deal with home first, and then deal with  
5 outside. So our children at home, we need  
6 certain tools, before we give you the space that  
7 we still haven't been able to--I'm sorry. I'm a  
8 little shaky and nervous, excited. But we still  
9 haven't given our children what they really  
10 need. So therefore we respect what you're  
11 saying, but we really need this part--okay. I'm  
12 sorry. We are promised--it's okay. I'm nervous  
13 and I'm not afraid. We are promised more  
14 programs, more staff and more services. This is  
15 a part of being a renewal school. We are being  
16 dis-serviced by taking away our space which  
17 would be our children's way toward their  
18 lifelong learning, etcetera. We do understand  
19 what you want for your children, but we want the  
20 same thing for our children. Due to the fact  
21 that we're dealing with a middle school group of  
22 children, our children are going through puberty  
23 in different cycles, I mean, social, emotional  
24 transitions. They need the space to learn, and  
25 they need the space to grow. And they deserve

1 to learn and grow, just like any one of us.  
2 145 is a great school. I saw some signs about  
3 great schools. Peace and blessing to that, but  
4 145 is most definitely a great school. We have  
5 wonderful teachers. We have a wonderful  
6 administration. We have wonderful parents, and  
7 we deserve just as much as everyone else.  
8 Middle schools were made so that young  
9 adolescents can learn and understand the impact  
10 of puberty on their intellectual, and social,  
11 and emotional lives. The danger here is that  
12 students will be administrative relocated,  
13 without having their unique developmental needs  
14 addressed. Blessings and peace.

15 MS. ROSARIO: Next speaker is Ms. Barrow  
16 [phonetic].

17 MS. BARROW: Good evening, everyone.  
18 Welcome to our home. A few things. Not only am  
19 I a teacher here, I'm the union rep for 325.  
20 But I am also community member. I grew up in  
21 this neighborhood. I decided to teach in this  
22 neighborhood, and I've decided to move all my  
23 brown children up in this neighborhood. Now I'm  
24 going to say something, and I'm not going to  
25 take it back. And I'm just going to say, yeah I

1 said it. This is not anything else but  
2 economic segregation, racism. And we're all  
3 brown, but guess what? The people in charge of  
4 this are not. The people in charge of this are  
5 - - educated. I mean, I want to have the money  
6 that a charter school has, but economically we  
7 don't. I want to have and give my children the  
8 opportunity that probably test [phonetic] public  
9 schools get them. But you know what? We're not  
10 about test - -. We're not about--we're not a  
11 test score. They're children. We educate them.  
12 We don't brag about our test scores. We brag  
13 about the things that we do for our children.  
14 We teach them how to work in the community. We  
15 teach them what community is all about. We  
16 don't exile our children because they're special  
17 needs - -. And guess what. It's okay. We can  
18 keep them. We want them. You want to know why?  
19 Because they're ours. They belong to us and  
20 that's okay. But you, from District 9, are you  
21 from this community? Are your children from  
22 this community because these three schools right  
23 here are community schools? This is an  
24 initiative that the city wants us to bring up.  
25 So are you part of our community? We will

1 welcome you, if you are part of our community.  
2 Are you? That's my question. I don't have a  
3 problem with charter schools. They're great.  
4 You guys have great test scores, but that's all  
5 I hear, test scores. Build your community.  
6 That's what we're about. That's what we want.  
7 The only thing we have is space. We don't have  
8 computers in the classrooms. Children don't get  
9 textbooks. We don't have smart boards in every  
10 classroom. We don't have new furniture. The  
11 only thing that we have in this neighborhood, in  
12 this community that I've seen since I was six  
13 years old and now I'm teaching in the community  
14 is space. And now that's being taken away by  
15 people above, who have money to push around  
16 other people - -. So yes, it is a parent  
17 choice. Yes, it is a parent choice and I agree  
18 with you. But guess what. Just as you parents  
19 have a choice, we have a choice. It's all about  
20 respect, right, Ms. Gonzalez? It's all about  
21 respect, and we want us and we want you to  
22 recognize and respect us, respect our space.  
23 You know, my momma told me one thing very  
24 important. She said never kick somebody out of  
25 your house. Never kick an enemy out of your

1 house. But you know what? We don't need to  
2 open the door. So I don't want to kick you out,  
3 but we don't want to open that door. And you  
4 know what? Blessings to you. Blessings to us.  
5 May we one day come together and look at all of  
6 our children, not just charter school or  
7 district kids, but children all in all. And  
8 that's what we're here for, for our children.  
9 And I'm talking like this because these are my  
10 children, and your kids might be my kids one  
11 day, too. Hopefully they make it in the charter  
12 school and they don't get kicked out because of  
13 special needs, or - - or whatever it is, so much  
14 as that you guys - - we get them. But we'll  
15 take them. Thank you very much, and have a good  
16 night.

17 MS. ROSARIO: Next speaker, Ms. Haskins,  
18 Dina Haskins [phonetic].

19 MS. DINA HASKINS: Hello, everybody. Well -  
20 - too young to go to junior high school - - it's  
21 a big space, like my daughter. We come from  
22 District 9. And I want to know, can she be able  
23 to come to your school if, you know, because I  
24 know you're - - the other side. You all have  
25 120 over there. You all have - - high school -

1 - for the school because - - to build  
2 something - - for the young kids. And another  
3 thing, your kids are so young. We've got - -  
4 around the corner. We - - fighting for them to  
5 get away because our kids, we've got grown kids  
6 mainly doing stuff out the - -. They call the  
7 police, you know. And - - your kids - -, you  
8 know. And another thing, big kids, they push  
9 the little kids around. They - - seeing things  
10 they shouldn't see. And I don't think that's  
11 right, you know? I know District 8 - -. I know  
12 that area. And - - school for the kids like - -  
13 they are and just for them, you know, or maybe  
14 by fifth grade or something, you know, because  
15 there's a lot of shooting going around. And  
16 plus we got big kids here. They get in trouble  
17 - - your kids is around high school and junior  
18 high school kids. It shouldn't be. It  
19 shouldn't happen like that. I think they should  
20 make a building and build up something just for  
21 your kids because - - it ain't going to happen  
22 like that - - shooting - - not for no fifth  
23 grade - - you know? So that's all I have to  
24 say. And I have nothing against charter  
25 schools, but I think - -. I don't think they

1 need to be in a junior high school. That's  
2 all.

3 MS. ROSARIO: Thank you. Laura Weiss  
4 [phonetic] will be our next speaker.

5 MS. LAURA WEISS: Good evening. My name is  
6 Laura Weiss. I've been a teacher at MS328 for  
7 seven years. Really, what I want to point out  
8 here tonight is that there is more that unites  
9 us than divides us. And that is in the sense  
10 that every child is entitled to a great  
11 education. That's why I entered teaching seven  
12 years ago, because I believe that every child  
13 deserves an opportunity. When I began teaching  
14 here seven years ago, there were three schools  
15 in the building. Two years later, the  
16 suspension site came into our building. My  
17 students lost classrooms. They lost space.  
18 They lost a science lab. They lost a computer  
19 lab and they don't--especially our sixth graders  
20 do not have the same opportunities that they had  
21 when I even started here, just a few years ago.  
22 This proposed co-location will cause my  
23 students, and the students of 325, and the  
24 students of 145 to lose even more space. I  
25 believe this is an injustice, and my question,

1 and it's a rhetorical question, is how does  
2 the Department of Ed that this proposed co-  
3 location plan to provide every child with a  
4 great, quality education? And that's really all  
5 I have to say. I just don't want to see my  
6 students have more taken from them than they  
7 already have. Thank you.

8 MS. ROSARIO: Our next speaker--again, thank  
9 you, audience. You've been wonderful. Thank  
10 you for being respectful. Thank you. Michael  
11 Afaro [phonetic], please come up.

12 MR. MICHAEL AFARO: Hello. I just want to  
13 thank everyone for coming out tonight. So  
14 basically, long story short, this is my eighth  
15 year at the 145 complex. And when I first  
16 started out here, we could have more--a higher  
17 population of students. There were more bodies  
18 in the building. But what we did have were more  
19 services. As we got more room, we were able to  
20 increase our basketball program, - - Thurgood  
21 Marshall on trial, leadership initiative and - -  
22 . So every time we had more space, we were able  
23 to kind of take a step in the right direction  
24 because we - - these community services. And  
25 this year we had - - more than ever. And being

1 a community school, we really had high hopes  
2 of - - more - -. So my major thing is give us a  
3 space, and give us resources, and give us  
4 success. Thank you.

5 MS. ROSARIO: Shamika Munoz, - -.

6 MS. SHAMIKA MUNOZ: Good evening, everyone.  
7 My name is Shamika Munoz. I am the - - teacher  
8 at MS328. The comment I really want to speak  
9 about is the signs that say something about  
10 great schools and let my child learn. And so  
11 we, here, we want our children to learn as well.  
12 And we think your children should learn, too,  
13 just not on the backs of our students. And when  
14 you come in, and you take our space, and you  
15 come from other districts and other places, and  
16 you take the space that is allocated to our  
17 students, you affect our students' ability to  
18 learn as well. So we do think every child  
19 should be able to learn, and your child can  
20 learn, but this is not the place for them. This  
21 is not the place for them, for a number of  
22 reasons. This is not the place for them because  
23 this is a community school for children of this  
24 community, District 9. This is not the place  
25 for them because this is a middle school, where

1 our children range in age, from about 12 to  
2 sometimes 16 because we do have to educate all  
3 students, as they come to us. This is not the  
4 place for your child because I'm not sure if you  
5 know, but there's a men's shelter across the  
6 street. And I don't know really if--we don't  
7 want our children here, so I'm not sure if you  
8 want to bring your five or six year old - - nine  
9 year old here. So the moral of the story is  
10 yes, your child should learn and so should ours.  
11 And your child cannot learn off the backs of our  
12 children. Thank you.

13 MS. ROSARIO: The next speaker--I just want  
14 to remind everyone, if you can, if you can move  
15 in to those empty seats, so the people in the  
16 back may have a seat, so we can keep our aisles  
17 clear and our doors clear. Thank you. Again,  
18 thank you for being a great audience. Our next  
19 speaker is Desi Washington.

20 MR. DESI WASHINGTON: Good afternoon  
21 faculty, parents, and students. My name is Desi  
22 Washington. I'm an alumni from this school.  
23 This proposal that you are proposing is a grave  
24 injustice to not only the community, and the  
25 children, and the parents. Taking away the

1 available space, that's the only thing that  
2 these children have. I am hurt because I came  
3 from this community. I am very emotional. I  
4 want to break down and cry right now. This is  
5 unfair. We're not thinking about the safety of  
6 the children that you want to bring in here.  
7 Again, you speak about the shelter in the back  
8 which is a men's shelter, which contains sex  
9 offenders. Children have to cross that street,  
10 dangerous intersection. Are you going to bus  
11 them here? We have lots of questions that  
12 haven't been answered. This proposal is being  
13 thrust upon us, all right? It's being just  
14 demanded that you come in here to do this. It  
15 is not fair to the staff that work here. It is  
16 not fair to the children, it is not fair to the  
17 parent, and it is not fair to the community that  
18 you take away from the essential space for  
19 recreation and education that these children  
20 need, and this community. Thank you.

21 MS. ROSARIO: Again, at this time, I do want  
22 to remind everyone, we must keep those doors in  
23 the back open and the aisles clear. At this  
24 time, I will now have the next presenter, which  
25 is Ms. Wilkins from Junior High School 145 - -.

1 MS. WILKINS: Good afternoon 145 family,  
2 and that includes New Millennium Business  
3 School, and it includes Urban Science, ALC and  
4 District 9 community members. I would like to  
5 welcome charter school's parents and students  
6 that are here. However, I would like to voice  
7 an opinion and this is my opinion. I came from  
8 elementary school. Elementary school children  
9 are a lot different than junior high school  
10 students. First of all, let me explain one  
11 thing to you. We're talking about an age where  
12 students are going through social emotional  
13 crisis, and sometimes there are students that  
14 are in need of special services. One of the  
15 plans that we have, because we have a great  
16 working relationship, is to have a mental health  
17 clinic, a dental clinic, a health clinic for the  
18 students in the community of District 9 that go  
19 to 145. If the charter school proposal goes  
20 through, that takes space away from having the  
21 opportunity to provide our students with the  
22 mental health, the physical health, and other  
23 issues that they have to deal with. It was  
24 mentioned before that there is a men's shelter  
25 behind us. There is also another shelter not

1 too far from this area. We have a concern  
2 about transportation for students. Your  
3 students are precious. Our students are  
4 precious. All students are precious. There is  
5 a block behind us, off of Webster Avenue that  
6 has 11 intersections. Going across there is not  
7 a good idea for junior high school students. It  
8 is definitely not a good idea for third grade  
9 students to have to cross into this area, across  
10 Webster Avenue. If we're talking about giving  
11 students metro cards, that's also not such a  
12 good idea because there are several junior high  
13 schools in the area and other schools that have  
14 to ride the buses also. Your students would be  
15 on the buses with our students. It will greatly  
16 impact Junior High School 145, 328, and 325,  
17 because each school needs their own autonomy.  
18 Each school has their own identity. If the  
19 space is given to the charter school, we then  
20 have to share floors with each other. That  
21 takes away our individual identity. You want  
22 your identity. We are entitled to have our  
23 identity, too, as individual schools. I would  
24 like to again thank you for coming. I do hope  
25 that if you are here, we will work together.

1       However, I am really looking forward to  
2       continuing this building as a community junior  
3       high school.

4               MS. ROSARIO: At this time, our next speaker  
5       will be Mr. Kelly from the Urban Science  
6       Academy.

7               MR. KELLY: Good evening, everyone. So I do  
8       - - the welcoming tone that you've heard from  
9       this panel and from other people. We all want  
10      the same thing. Everybody in this room wants  
11      the same thing. We want the hopes and dreams of  
12      our children to come true. That we share.  
13      However, in order to achieve that goal,  
14      resources must be allocated. The sole objection  
15      we have is that this proposal reduces the  
16      precious resource of space in facilities for the  
17      children that we already love and serve, and  
18      that is our sole objection. If you should be  
19      here in the fall, we would welcome you with open  
20      arms, and work with you cooperatively. It is  
21      simply a matter of limited resources, so thank  
22      you all very much.

23              MS. ROSARIO: The next speaker will be Mr.  
24      Bastion from the New Millennium Business  
25      Academy.

1           MR. BASTION: Good evening. - - parents,  
2 students, our visitors from Success Academy 3.  
3 Good afternoon, and welcome to our school  
4 community. The sole reason why you are met with  
5 some opposition by members of this community,  
6 it's a matter of fact that this community has  
7 endured many, many challenges over the nine  
8 years that I've been here and also many, many  
9 successes. As you heard some of the teachers  
10 speak about, the beginning years when they  
11 started here, we were able to offer our students  
12 extracurricular activities, a science lab, a  
13 technology lab, and how, when enrollment fell,  
14 or also when we lost space, due to the  
15 suspension site, that we had to pull back on  
16 some of those programs. Part of this audience,  
17 looking over this sea of orange, and blue, and  
18 white, and all the faces, part of this makes me  
19 really, really sad because I understand that the  
20 individuals here from Success Academy did not  
21 flip through a white page book and go, "Hey, we  
22 want this school. We want this space. We  
23 understand your struggle. We understand - -,  
24 but at the same time, we owe it to our parents.  
25 We owe it to our students. We owe it to our

1 staff members to stand firm and say, you know  
2 what? Community schools deserve respect.  
3 Community schools were here first and really  
4 what we have is an - - where private  
5 organizations are trying to infiltrate public  
6 space. That's something that we believe in as  
7 Americans. That's something we believe in as  
8 the common folk, that every child should have an  
9 excellent school in his or her neighborhood.  
10 When we look at the historical trend of the 145  
11 complex, of the schools and the students, please  
12 stop calling us failures. What we are is 26%  
13 English language learners in - -, and we are not  
14 ashamed of that. We are not ashamed of that.  
15 We're not ashamed of that. Please stop calling  
16 us failures because 25% of our student have  
17 IEPs. We're not afraid of that. We're not  
18 ashamed of that. That's who we are. 20% of our  
19 kids are students who live in public housing  
20 shelters. We're not ashamed of that. This is  
21 who we serve. This is who we fight for, so I  
22 beg each and every parent here donning an orange  
23 shirt, from District 8. Understand that when  
24 you hold a sign saying, "My kid has a right to  
25 learn, parent's choice," those arguments have

1 nothing to do with the moment. The moment is  
2 that you're trying to - - on the backs of  
3 community school students. And we understand  
4 that you didn't create it. You didn't construct  
5 it, and so therefore if you are here in the  
6 fall, we ask that you enter our home, you enter  
7 our space with respect. Finally, there is  
8 something a little bit disgraceful about the sea  
9 of orange because it was intimidating. Why do I  
10 say that? Because I have a student who came up  
11 to me from my school and said, "Are these the  
12 folks here to take away our school?" That  
13 should never happen. I heard a student from  
14 Success Academy - - say, "Oh, is this our new  
15 school?" We're doing something fundamentally  
16 wrong, when you pit neighborhoods against one  
17 another, parents against one another, students  
18 against one another, educators against one  
19 another. This is - -.

20 MS. ROSARIO: At this time, respect,  
21 everyone, respect. Thank you. Again, you've  
22 been a wonderful--I am so proud. I stand here,  
23 very, very proud of the way this is going.  
24 Thank you. Students, adults, thank you so much.  
25 At this time, I'm going to call up Stephanie

1 Cown [phonetic] from the Success Academy  
2 network representation. Again, I want to remind  
3 everyone that I will not accept derogatory  
4 comments. I will not tolerate it. We are a  
5 democracy and all voices are heard and  
6 respected. Thank you.

7 MS. STEPHANIE COWN: Good evening everyone.  
8 My name is Stephanie Cown and I support Bronx 3,  
9 from Success Academy's network office. It's  
10 nice to meet all of you, here this evening.  
11 Success Academy Bronx 3 is part of Success  
12 Academy's charter school network. Last year,  
13 our schools ranked in the top 1% in math and top  
14 3% in English language arts, in the state. We  
15 are so proud of what our scholars have been able  
16 to do, across the network and at Bronx 3. But  
17 if this proposal is not approved, our current  
18 second graders will be educationally homeless  
19 next year. That's why our staff, our families,  
20 and our scholars are here today. Our families  
21 have found a school that works for them, and  
22 they should be able to continue their education  
23 with us. More parents in the Bronx need great  
24 schools. This year Success Academy Bronx 3  
25 received more than 3,000 applications for fewer

1 than 100 open seats. More than 500 of these  
2 were for third grade alone. We look forward to  
3 continuing to provide an excellent school for  
4 our current scholars, as well as new students in  
5 the community, and to building a strong  
6 relationship with our new collocated schools,  
7 here at 145. Thank you.

8 MS. ROSARIO: Thank you again. We will now  
9 start with the students. Again, we will now  
10 start with students and again, a reminder, all  
11 voices heard.

12 MS. COLLEEN STEWART: Hi - -. I am the  
13 principal at Success Academy Bronx 3.

14 MS. ROSARIO: Okay. Is your name - -?

15 MS. STEWART: - -.

16 MS. ROSARIO: From south--I'm sorry, from  
17 Success Academy, Bronx 3 principal.

18 MS. STEWART: Thank you. Good evening.  
19 Thank you. First and foremost, I just want to  
20 thank you guys for welcoming us tonight. You  
21 know, I know this is really difficult, but  
22 you've been really gracious in opening your  
23 doors to us tonight, so we really appreciate you  
24 hosting. Thank you so much. I'm Colleen  
25 Stewart. I'm the principal of Success Academy

1 Bronx 3. Thank you guys. Success Academy  
2 Bronx 3 needs space to grow next year, so that  
3 we can continue educating our second graders.  
4 This is more than a school. It's a wonderful  
5 community of parents and educators, committed to  
6 the success of all children. When we have  
7 family reading nights, parents are busting down  
8 the doors. When we have a family potluck, we  
9 are greeted with amazing dishes from all around  
10 the world, celebrating the amazing cultures that  
11 we have in our building. Thank you. The  
12 students at Success Academy Bronx 3 love  
13 learning. When I open the door at 7:15 every  
14 morning, there is a line of scholars waiting to  
15 get into the doors. They run to me to shake my  
16 hand every morning, and they cannot wait to  
17 begin their day. I'm very proud of all my  
18 students, but I'm particularly proud of our  
19 second graders. They came to us brand new last  
20 year, as first graders. Over 50% of them were  
21 not reading. Many of them did not even know  
22 their letter sounds. But I'm proud to say, by  
23 midway through second grade, 100% of them are  
24 reading on grade level. And that's really just  
25 thanks to the amazing - - work of our parents

1 and our teachers at Success Academy Bronx 3.  
2 These students have had an amazing start in  
3 their education, and I want to be sure that they  
4 have the opportunities to continue learning and  
5 continue growing at Bronx 3. It's so important  
6 that they have space for third through fifth  
7 grade, so they can continue to be a part of our  
8 amazing community. Now as a principal who  
9 currently shares space with another school, I  
10 know that co-location is not easy. But with  
11 respect, and courtesy, and collaboration it  
12 works. Success Academy Bronx 3 has a good  
13 relationship with its current collocated school,  
14 PS146. We regularly talk. We collaborate. We  
15 share ideas, best practices, and we work really  
16 hard to be good neighbors. And I know that we  
17 can do the same, here at PS145. Thank you guys.

18 MS. ROSARIO: At this time, we will start  
19 with the students. I want the students to line  
20 up five at a time, so that as soon as one  
21 speaker finishes, the other one--I do want to  
22 remind you that at this time everyone will have--  
23 -oh, sorry--two minutes to speak. We have one  
24 board representative from the school leadership  
25 team of 325. Ms. Lopez, please come up. Mr.

1 Lopez, sorry. Mr. Lopez, please come up.

2 MR. TINO LOPEZ: Thank you. Thank you.

3 Thank you. Good evening, everyone. My name is-

4 -

5 MS. ROSARIO: Respect, everyone. Respect.

6 MR. LOPEZ: Good evening, everyone. My name  
7 is Tino Lopez, and I'm here as a school  
8 leadership team representative and also as a  
9 parent of eight graduate students of Urban  
10 Science Academy. I would like just to summarize  
11 in short words my idea about all of this. And  
12 that is that the worst thing that can happen at  
13 this middle school number 9, is to lose  
14 classroom space. We need our space, in order to  
15 provide better education and to provide better  
16 human beings to the communities and to the  
17 country. Thank you.

18 MS. ROSARIO: I'm going to call up the first  
19 five students, at this time, the first five  
20 students. Do you know who you are? No. Okay.  
21 So it's Messine Masali, - - Jessica, Breanna,  
22 Jonathon, Laura--sorry--and - -. You guys have  
23 numbers. We're going by your numbers. Okay.  
24 So the first, so numbers one, two, three, four,  
25 and five. Thank you. First speaker.

1           MR. MATTHEW KAMAI: Thank you. Good  
2 evening, everyone. My name is Matthew Kamai  
3 [phonetic] and I'm a proud student of MS145.  
4 While I was reading the Washington Post from  
5 April 10th, 2015, one comment really sharpened  
6 my eyes. It says, "Since many schools do not  
7 replace those students, more than 2,500 seats  
8 are left empty, in third grades through--third  
9 through eighth grade alone," according to the  
10 report. Now if you guys have 2,500 seats empty,  
11 why do you need our classes?

12           MS. ROSARIO: Respect, everyone. Respect.

13           MR. KAMAI: It is also said in this report  
14 that it's not only really fair for the seventh  
15 graders or high school student to have to be  
16 educated with a child who is reading at a second  
17 grade or third grade level. We are sixth,  
18 seventh, and eighth grade students, soon to be  
19 high school students. And Ms. Eva Moskowitz  
20 says herself that why should there be third  
21 grade and second grade students reading levels  
22 in a school with kids who are in sixth, seventh,  
23 and eighth? We are sixth, seventh and eighth  
24 graders. We need this space so that we can  
25 learn. I'm not saying that your children can't

1 learn, but we also need to learn, too. That's  
2 all I have to say.

3 MS. ROSARIO: Thank you.

4 MALE VOICE: [Spanish 1:01:28].

5 MS. ROSARIO: Respect, everyone. We need to  
6 hear him. We're not going to get through all  
7 the speakers, if we don't be respectful.

8 MALE VOICE: [Spanish 1:01:44].

9 FEMALE VOICE: [Spanish 1:03:45].

10 MALE VOICE: - - billion dollars that there-  
11 -that they - - all the schools because that's  
12 what the question is.

13 MS. ROSARIO: No, he wasn't on the list.

14 MS. LAURA ALVAREZ: Good evening. My name  
15 is Laura Alvarez and I'm also an eighth grader.  
16 I do not agree with Ms. Moskowitz' idea of  
17 taking a portion of my school to bring a third  
18 grader to my second home. This school only  
19 accepts students who only know English and  
20 maintain a three or four on statewide tests.  
21 Furthermore, this character--this charter  
22 school--sorry--will only go to students from  
23 District 8, and it is obvious that this charter  
24 school is not for the benefit of the children in  
25 our community. It is very unfair because there

1 are many smart kids who do not know English  
2 and won't be able to attend this school. And if  
3 you happened to forget, Ms. Moskowitz, many  
4 Hispanic families come to this country to have a  
5 better life. Your idea will only put many kids  
6 in this community at a disadvantage. Instead of  
7 you using money towards a charter school here,  
8 why not fund a bilingual education? Ms.  
9 Moskowitz, we do not want any kind of deal with  
10 you. And to our Governor Cuomo, please return  
11 to my school, MS 145, a total - - precisely the  
12 amount of \$1,114,000 - -.

13 MS. KADEDRA SOFANA: Good afternoon,  
14 everyone. My name is Kadedra Sofana [phonetic],  
15 and the reason I'm here today is because of  
16 these amazing, incredible teachers. They've  
17 been here through our ups and downs. And I'm  
18 going to perform a poem. The title of my poem  
19 is 145. These three years been very good to  
20 all, for all of us. But generations have been  
21 created. We have so many memories here. Why do  
22 you want to make a ending to that? Families  
23 stay together. When you come in, you can't get  
24 out. This school is my home. My home is my  
25 heart. My heart is my soul. And to all of you,

1 this school is a great school. MS145 is  
2 amazing. For all of you coming here today to  
3 support us - -. Even though I'm in eighth grade  
4 and I'm about to graduate soon, I still care.  
5 My sister might be coming from Mexico, and I  
6 want her to attend this school, meet the amazing  
7 staff, teach her what they taught me. I don't  
8 want nobody else teaching her. Thank you.

9 MS. ROSARIO: At this time, I do want to  
10 make an announcement. If you leave the  
11 building, we will not be allowed to come back  
12 in. So please, please do not think you can exit  
13 and come back in. It is very difficult to keep  
14 the safety together, if we have people entering  
15 and leaving the building. And again I want to  
16 remind you to keep the aisles clear. At this  
17 time, I will call the following six following  
18 students, number 6, 7, 8, 9, 10. Please come  
19 up. You have numbers that were given to you.  
20 Please, 6, 7, 8, 9, and 10.

21 MS. ROSARIO: Start right away.

22 FEMALE VOICE: Good evening. My name is - -  
23 . I'm an eighth grader at MS 145. While I was  
24 sitting, I overheard one parent from Success  
25 Academy, stating that they should have a school

1 in another site. And one of the posters says  
2 parents' choice, so why wasn't her choice  
3 approved?

4 FEMALE VOICE: - - in the New York Times, it  
5 said, "Charter school advocates demanded that  
6 the New York City schools chancellor, Carmen  
7 Ferdinand [phonetic], bring data to support her  
8 accusation that those schools push some students  
9 out before they take the state tests and - -  
10 high score of some children. That's just  
11 segregating. In a speech she said that she was  
12 supportive of charter schools, but that they had  
13 to be more transparent about their practices.  
14 Charter schools, which admit students by lottery  
15 - - high scores. Jeremiah Kitteridge  
16 [phonetic], the executive director of Families  
17 for Excellent Schools, a charter advocacy group,  
18 noted that test scores were protected by federal  
19 privacy regulation. The report also found that  
20 the students who left charter schools had lower  
21 test scores than the students who stayed,  
22 suggesting that - - increase the school's  
23 performance on tests. Why are you making people  
24 feel left out? Charter schools are supported by  
25 taxpayers' dollars but are privately - -.

1 Advocates highlight some - - this high score  
2 as evidence that they deserve more public  
3 resources. The city pays much of the rent for  
4 new charter schools if it denied them free  
5 space. We - - 64% on reading tests and 94% on a  
6 math tests helped Success - - led by Eva - -  
7 Moskowitz. Known for her attention grabbing  
8 rallies and skirmishes with the teachers' union  
9 and Mayor Bill de Blasio, will have 43 schools.  
10 A proposal by Governor Andrew M. Cuomo will  
11 bring her closer to her goal of 100. That will  
12 give Success more schools than Buffalo, the  
13 state's second largest district. If they keep  
14 taking the - - our students, where are all the  
15 special education and ELS going to go? If the  
16 kids have good behavior at Success, they get  
17 candy. And if they ace high scores on - -  
18 tests, they receive - - and basketballs. Why  
19 buy them? The kids shouldn't be bought to work.  
20 They should always do their work, not because of  
21 a reward at the end of it. We want to keep our  
22 environment the same. We like the friendly  
23 community that's here. We don't even have the  
24 same schedules as the other two schools, so we  
25 will be very confused, trying to get from class

1 to class. I have one question. Why is  
2 Success Academy trying to invade in our  
3 community when they got 2,500 empty seats around  
4 the city? Thank you.

5 MS. BRIANNA BAKER: Good evening. My name  
6 is Brianna Baker and I represent 325. As a  
7 school, as a union, we want to stay as strong as  
8 possible. I believe that they are trying to  
9 break the strongest union, which I believe is  
10 the community. If you do put this school into  
11 ours, you're taking our main privilege, which is  
12 space. We need our space. Once you come in,  
13 we'll only have a certain classes at certain  
14 points, which we need. Our students should have  
15 the ability to move. Once you come in, it will  
16 be back in the past, as in students staying in  
17 the same classroom all through--all day and  
18 having teachers move from class to class, like  
19 in elementary school. We are not supposed to be  
20 treated as elementary students. And I also  
21 disagree with one point, as in enrollment. When  
22 students are coming back from the summer into  
23 school, I believe there will be overcrowded  
24 classes at some point, since there will be more  
25 students. And I believe this school is only

1 meant to support 1,700 students in the whole  
2 building, but you're adding over 1,000. We  
3 don't have the space. And it's also about the  
4 things we don't have. We don't have computers  
5 in every classroom. We don't have working smart  
6 boards in every classroom. We don't have a  
7 plentiful amount of textbooks to use. We don't  
8 have updated laboratories. But things we do  
9 have, we have perseverance. We help each other  
10 personally. Our teachers do more than just  
11 prepare us for state tests because that is not  
12 all that matters. The only thing we have is  
13 space. We are human beings. We need space to  
14 grow.

15 MR. ISAIAH BREWTON: My name is Isaiah  
16 Brewton [phonetic]. All I'm going to talk about  
17 is the exercise of our students. And I don't  
18 think that we should play--if this school does  
19 come into this building, our exercise will be  
20 cut in half and our obesity rate will increase.  
21 Our obesity rate is already 30%, so why would we  
22 want to decrease our children's health and just  
23 so they can get a little bit smarter. And maybe  
24 that's cool, and maybe not really that good.  
25 I'm just saying. And if we do cut our - - then

1 we--then our children will have a lot more  
2 diseases. We would--some of our children would  
3 have to get surgeries in the--man--in the--all  
4 right. Just that this school would not be good  
5 for our building because for our children's  
6 future and for - -.

7 MS. ROSARIO: - - so that she can speak. He  
8 can speak.

9 LAVON: My name is Lavon [phonetic], and I  
10 want to talk about how much Success means to me.  
11 I love school. I'm only in third grade, so I  
12 can go to college. So I want to save my--I mean  
13 I want to save our school where I go - - because  
14 I need to learn that. But I want to save our  
15 school today because they would want us to go  
16 through third grade and we do need a third grade  
17 education. That's why - -.

18 MS. ROSARIO: Will speakers 11, 12, 13, 14,  
19 and 15 please come up?

20 FEMALE VOICE: Speaker 27 left, just so that  
21 you know.

22 MS. ROSARIO: Again, speakers 11, Paulston,  
23 Joe, Uses, Luna, and Roosevelt, please come up.  
24 I want to remind everyone you've been wonderful.  
25 I am so proud. Again, a reminder. This is

1 very, very - - for everyone and we want to  
2 give everyone their voice. Thank you.

3 MILEY: Hi, my name is Miley.

4 MS. ROSARIO: Students, shh.

5 MILEY: And I love my school because I learn  
6 there and my teachers make me learn. Thank you.

7 LUNA: Hi. My name is Luna. I love my  
8 school. I would like for my school to grow  
9 bigger and bigger. I also love my education  
10 because at Success Academy, I learned to read.  
11 Thank you.

12 ROOSEVELT: Hi, my name is Roosevelt  
13 [phonetic], and I love Success Academy because I  
14 should be able to go to any school, without  
15 being uncomfortable or bullied. I want to  
16 continue my education, without having to be  
17 worried or be afraid, for free. Thank you for  
18 having Success Academy here. Why can't we all  
19 get along? Thank you.

20 MS. ROSARIO: A reminder that please follow  
21 the number system, again, to please follow the  
22 number system. We are now up to speakers 16,  
23 17, 18, 19, and 20--again, 16, 17, 18, 19, and  
24 20. Please follow the number system. Thank  
25 you. Again, respect. We want to hear all

1 voices. Shh.

2 TAMIKA: Hi, my name is Tamika. I'm here  
3 with Success Academy 3. I would like for  
4 Success Academy 3 to grow bigger and bigger, get  
5 more schools for my little daughter that's - -  
6 inside this school also, soon as she turns four.  
7 I don't have no problem with public school. I  
8 have a child that's in public school right now,  
9 trying to get him inside of Success Academy  
10 also, or any other charter school, if I can.  
11 And also everybody is equal. I wish that  
12 everybody could get along, and that's all I have  
13 to say.

14 MS. ROSARIO: I want to remind everyone--  
15 thank you. I want to remind--I'm calling  
16 students and by number. Students and by number.

17 FEMALE VOICE: The students will have a  
18 highlighted yellow on the bottom of the number,  
19 so it will have like a yellow dot on the number.  
20 We're doing parents, teachers, adults after the  
21 students.

22 MS. ROSARIO: So would students with the  
23 numbers 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, and 20, please come  
24 up, students with the numbers 16, 17, 18, 19,  
25 and 20. You can speak.

1 MALE VOICE: Success Academy is--

2 MS. ROSARIO: Shh. Respect, everyone.

3 MALE VOICE: Success Academy teachers - -.

4 Success Academy teachers - - I want my school -

5 -. Success Academy - - teachers - - school.

6 JASON: Hello. My name is Jason - -. My

7 teacher is - - Success Academy - -. She's the

8 best. I would like for Success Academy to grow

9 bigger and bigger, each and every year. I love

10 Success Academy. Thank you for attention - -.

11 MALE VOICE: My name is - - and I just

12 wanted to say that Success Academy Bronx 3 works

13 really hard and we really need a space for third

14 grade. We need space because how are we going

15 to educate our brains, if we don't have the

16 space to do it in? If we don't have the space

17 to learn, how, when we grow up, how will we be

18 able to teach other kids? And I just wanted to

19 say that Success Academy Bronx 3 works very

20 hard, and I just want to give a shout out to - -

21 .

22 MS. ROSARIO: We want to remind that you

23 have two minutes.

24 JANIAH: Hello. My name is Janiah, and all

25 I wanted to say is that for all those people who

1 think that we shouldn't fight for more space  
2 in our school and that keep believing that  
3 you're wrong. All students - - more space.  
4 Thank you.

5 MS. ROSARIO: Will the students with the  
6 numbers 21, 22, 23, 24, and 25 please come up?  
7 Students with the numbers 21, 22, 23, 24, and  
8 25. All of you have been doing great. I am  
9 very proud of this audience. You have been  
10 doing wonderfully. For young ones, they need  
11 to--we need to really be quiet so that we can  
12 hear them. Please, we need to hear them.

13 TORY: My name is Tory. Our school - -.

14 MS. ROSARIO: Remember, we only have two  
15 minutes. Go ahead. We're listening.

16 EILEEN: Hello. My name is--

17 FEMALE VOICE: Hi, Eileen. Come on, Eileen.  
18 You can do it. Eileen, it's okay, baby.

19 MS. ROSARIO: Let's give a round of applause  
20 to Eileen.

21 FEMALE VOICE: Success Academy gives us a  
22 education but--and we try to keep it up. But  
23 people try to take away our education.

24 MS. ROSARIO: Please let them speak.

25 FEMALE VOICE: Success Academy gives us

1 education but people try to take that, the  
2 education, away from us. But then we won't be  
3 intelligent.

4 FEMALE VOICE: Hello. My name is - -  
5 Jackson and I am six years old. I love my  
6 school and all I want is more - - more vacation.

7 MS. ROSARIO: Okay. Another reminder,  
8 respect. And we need to hear everyone. Thank  
9 you.

10 MALE VOICE: Good evening, everyone. I  
11 mean, we all know what we're here for, so I'm  
12 going to just cut to the chase. Right? Now how  
13 would you feel if somebody took away your home,  
14 or demanded your home, rather? This is our  
15 home. It's not just a school. Like I mean, it  
16 is, but this is our home. This is our  
17 territory. We marked our territory already.  
18 And I mean, we already got two other schools  
19 here. Well, we welcomed them into here, but at  
20 the end of the day this is 145. This is ours.  
21 Now when I was first enrolled to this school, to  
22 see my mother, the disappointment on my mother's  
23 face when she found that there was two other  
24 schools in this building, I'm never going to  
25 forget her face. But she still enrolled me into

1 this school for one reason, and that was  
2 because it was still a 145 in this building.  
3 There was still space. Now if these people come  
4 in here, I mean, you all learning and that's a  
5 great thing, but you all taking away the one  
6 last thing that we have, and that's space. And  
7 that's not fair at all. Now if you all had a  
8 school. No offense. If you all had a school  
9 and we demanded that school, how would you all  
10 feel? I mean, not only that, but there's one  
11 more thing that you all forget. Look at us and  
12 then look at them. I mean, I'm 14 years--I'm 14  
13 and I'm just now learning what love is. I'm  
14 just now learning what all this stuff is in this  
15 one school because the teachers here keep it  
16 real with you. And I'm still growing. But how  
17 am I going to grow with a bunch of third graders  
18 in this building? That's all I got to say. - -  
19 .

20 MS. ROSARIO: Next I would like to call the  
21 next numbers. Again--oh, there's one more?

22 FEMALE VOICE: I have a question. I wasn't  
23 able to sign and I been working on something for  
24 quite a while and I was wondering if I could say  
25 it, yes. Thank you.

1 MS. ROSARIO: Again, respect everyone.

2 DAMIAN: Hello. My name is Damian. I first  
3 started Success Academy at the age of four years  
4 old and now I am in the second grade. I love my  
5 school and I would like to continue my education  
6 in Success Academy. And I would like to have a  
7 space in - - school at the next--for the next  
8 year, if possible.

9 MS. ROSARIO: I would like now to call  
10 numbers 26, 27, 28, 29, and 30.

11 MR. PETE BURGESS: Good evening. My name is  
12 Pete Burgess, eighth grade president for class  
13 452. We have been gathering - - for the - -.  
14 Here's what my fellow classmates felt about this  
15 proposal. It's horrible because of kids mixed  
16 with preteens or above. Maybe she could use  
17 their own money and expand these children's  
18 education with their own school building with  
19 flying colors. Safety is what also crosses my  
20 classmates - -. Children and teenagers mixed  
21 doesn't feel safe. We're in a rebellious world.  
22 Yes, we worry about safety, especially for  
23 younger children with experience. Opinions  
24 matter because they make a difference. Please  
25 rethink this decision. Thank you.

1 MS. ARIANA LOPEZ: Hello parents,  
2 students, family, and alumni. I am Ariana  
3 Lopez. I am the class president of - -. I have  
4 been attending MS145 for seven months and I'm in  
5 the sixth grade. So far, in sixth grade  
6 students have already made strong friendships,  
7 so why break them? We are all here to debate if  
8 Success Academy should arrive to this building  
9 or not. I think they shouldn't because overall  
10 they're too young. How would you like your  
11 eight year old seeing harsh behavior of certain  
12 students which would make a bad influence on  
13 them? The children should be with their own  
14 elementary grades, not sharing it with  
15 adolescents and teens. The building will be too  
16 big for these kids, the lunchroom, the  
17 auditorium, and gym. That should--they should  
18 be in a small environment, like they are in now.  
19 It wouldn't be fair - - New Millennium sharing a  
20 floor of another school. This will make a big  
21 impact on the sixth graders. It wouldn't be  
22 fair for us, even the third graders. So please  
23 don't break this academic--this wonderful  
24 academic family. Thanks for listening.

25 MS. ROSARIO: Will the following numbers,

1 30, 31, 32, 33, and 34. Again, students with  
2 the numbers 30, 31, 32, 33, and 34.

3 MR. SHAKIEL HUSSEIN: Good evening. I'm  
4 Shakiel Hussein [phonetic]. I am a student from  
5 Urban Science Academy, and I'm a seventh grade  
6 student. There are students here that are good  
7 at athletics, music, art. And you're taking gym  
8 away from us, and you're taking art time away  
9 from us, and you're taking music time away from  
10 us. And there are three schools here that are  
11 against you guys from coming here while there  
12 are only one of you guys. And that's all.

13 MS. ROSARIO: You're next.

14 MS. LILLIAN ACTON: Hi, my name is Lillian  
15 Acton [phonetic]. I'm from 328. I have a true  
16 story to tell about me. When I was in my old  
17 school, they didn't teach me how to read. They  
18 didn't teach me nothing. But when I came to  
19 this school, I had the best teacher, Mr. Wyatt  
20 [phonetic]. My - -. This school is fun. Why  
21 you going to take this away from me? It's my  
22 school. I run this school. Don't take anything  
23 from me. Now I'm in the sixth grade. This  
24 school is mines. Bye-bye. Leave.

25 MR. JONATHAN MOYT: Hello, everyone. My

1 name is Jonathan Moyt [phonetic].

2 MS. ROSARIO: Again, respect.

3 MR. MOYT: Both the DOE and the charter  
4 schools said it won't make a large impact.  
5 However, this is false. Having young kids of  
6 kindergarten to third grade is a terrible idea.  
7 Young kids have to be forced in with a school  
8 filled with teenagers. It's just a terrible  
9 idea, in my opinion. Furthermore, I mean - -  
10 our resources that the charter schools are  
11 offering us it is actually taking space away.  
12 The total estimated amount of students are 30.  
13 Pushing 30 students into another room with 30,  
14 at least 30 more students is wrong. And who  
15 knows? Maybe somebody's class - - and might  
16 have to - - because there's too many people  
17 filling one room. We might not even get - -  
18 time for lunch and no physical education because  
19 there won't be that much time, since there's  
20 only eight hours in a school day. I want to  
21 come back and see the same teachers still here  
22 and everything the same, not some little third  
23 graders. And I want you all to learn and  
24 everything but it's just we can't have you guys  
25 here. It's not really a good thing. And - -

1 you guys brought your students here and  
2 supposedly supporting the charter school. But  
3 the thing is, are they really supporting the  
4 charter school? They don't know the real deal.  
5 They don't know that if they get sick, they can  
6 get just kicked out automatically if they don't  
7 get their good grades, and high grades, and who  
8 knows? It's just really automatic. And let me  
9 tell you, you said that you're being homeless.  
10 You're not going to be homeless. You got us.  
11 You got 145, including Urban Science, Business,  
12 and including - -. You're not alone. We all  
13 work as one, but not putting in another school.  
14 Another school is going to fill everybody's  
15 space. We're going to be overcrowded. It's a  
16 fantastic school. It's not everything, the test  
17 scores. It's not. I get it about the test  
18 scores because you got to pass, but stop  
19 mentioning - -. You're bragging. And one last  
20 thing. Once you guys finish elementary school,  
21 where are you going to go? - - elementary  
22 charter school. Where are you guys going to go?  
23 You're all going to go to a simple, ordinary  
24 public school, not a charter school. That's  
25 what you guys have to think about. And just

1 another--

2 MS. ROSARIO: Time is up.

3 MR. MOYT: Yes.

4 MS. ROSARIO: Time is up, Jonathan.

5 MR. MOYT: All right. Thank you.

6 MS. ROSARIO: Before I go through my next  
7 sheet, I want to take this opportunity to say  
8 aren't we all proud of our students? Aren't  
9 they awesome, every single last one of them? I  
10 could not be prouder at this moment. Students  
11 from 145, Success Academy, Bronx Millennium,  
12 Business, all our schools are--all our students  
13 are awesome. So please give them a big round of  
14 applause. They did a wonderful job. I am so  
15 proud of every single student. Thank you. At  
16 this time, we will now call adult speakers.  
17 Adult speakers with the numbers one, two, three,  
18 four, and five. Adult speakers with the numbers  
19 one, two, three, four, and five.

20 LINDA: Hi, my name is Linda - - and I went  
21 to this school 18 years ago. It was the best  
22 school ever. - - I could say I - - with honors.  
23 I work in a law office. I went to military. So  
24 this school is not--this is my home. I was  
25 raised here. This is my community. My son goes

1 to this school now. And the little bit that  
2 you all taking away from him--there's other  
3 places you can build. It's not only here. I  
4 understand you want your kids for education, but  
5 all these kids do, too. So don't think that - -  
6 failing because let me tell you something. I  
7 did not fail at 145. With honors, went to a  
8 good school, and to a good college, and look at  
9 me now. Thank you.

10 MS. WILLIAMS: Good evening to the board.  
11 Good evening to the parents and students. My  
12 name is Ms. Williams. I was a volunteer for  
13 MS325. I have a 16-year-old right now, who's an  
14 honors student in Bronx Leadership Academy, who  
15 left MS325. He was brought into MS325 with an F  
16 grade from his old school, and we tried to get  
17 him into a charter school. And they told us  
18 that he was not up to standards of the charter  
19 school. And we got him here into MS325. I  
20 would like my 16-year-old to stand up right in  
21 front of me. He's making honor roll. He  
22 graduated from MS325 with honors, and he's on  
23 the honor roll in his school. Now I have my  
24 granddaughter. Stand up. She's going to 145  
25 here, and I'm a proud grandparent. We have--I

1 have three generations here, me, my daughter,  
2 and my grandchildren. But our children have  
3 great potential to learn. But how can they  
4 learn when the funds have been taken away from  
5 them for them to excel? My grandson, he was a  
6 drummer here, in 325. They took away the  
7 drumming program and they cut the finances to  
8 the school. We would like to learn like the  
9 charter school do. And I'm not knocking the  
10 charter school because everybody has a potential  
11 to learn. But I'm saying that these schools  
12 have financial--finance given to them, when the  
13 finance have been taken away from our schools  
14 and we are nothing. I saw a plant that grows in  
15 the forest, and what the plant does when it  
16 climbs on the other plants, the other trees, it  
17 stifles them and they cannot grow. When you  
18 climb on our backs, we are going to be stifled  
19 and our own children cannot get the education  
20 that they need. God bless you and have a good  
21 night.

22 MS. ROSARIO: Again, respect everyone.

23 MR. JAMES DONAHUE: Good evening, everybody.  
24 My name is James Donahue. I'm an eighth grade  
25 teacher, an English teacher here at MS145. I've

1       been here for 16 years, and I love my job.  
2       I've had opportunities to work in other places.  
3       I've had opportunities to work in places that  
4       are a little less difficult to work. I wouldn't  
5       leave here. You're going to have to drag me out  
6       of here. I love my coworkers. I love the  
7       principal. I love my assistant principal. Most  
8       of all, I love my students. Now they'll tell  
9       you that what I just said is mad corny, but it's  
10      true. Now I know that you folks from Success  
11      Academy love your jobs, and your coworkers, and  
12      your students. And I'm not here to attack  
13      Success Academy or Ms. Moskowitz. I admire your  
14      passion. You brought a lot of adorable kids  
15      here tonight, but I'd like you to imagine  
16      something. I'd like you to imagine that you get  
17      what you came here for tonight. Although let's  
18      be honest. You don't have to imagine it because  
19      you know as well as I know, as well as the  
20      governor, and the mayor, and the chancellor  
21      know, that you will get what you want. You  
22      will. I know I'm being cynical but I'm not  
23      stupid. And I think I know a done deal when  
24      it's staring me dead in the eyes. But imagine  
25      something else. Imagine a warm April evening,

1 five days from now. And imagine eight  
2 busloads of people wearing green t-shirts pull  
3 up in front of the Success Academy complex, on  
4 Teller Avenue. We'll be out of your hair by  
5 then. What do they want? They want 15 of your  
6 classrooms. Maybe, just like I did tonight, you  
7 overhear one of their parents say to their  
8 child, "These people want to deny you an  
9 education." Would you agree with them? Success  
10 teachers, would you quietly pack up your  
11 classroom and move, as I'm expected to do, or  
12 would you do exactly what we're trying to do  
13 here tonight, not deny anyone an education but  
14 to ensure that our kids will still have a school  
15 to attend in the future. I wish you luck if it  
16 happens to you, and I hope that you'll  
17 understand how hurt we feel as a community,  
18 that's being told, "You're not good enough.  
19 These people are better." Thank you.

20 MS. ROSARIO: Will the next round of  
21 speakers, number 6, 7, 8, 9, and 10 please come  
22 up? Adult speakers 6, 7, 8, 9, and 10, please  
23 come up.

24 MS. GLORIA ALPINS: Hello, everyone. My  
25 name is Gloria Alpíns [phonetic]. I had a child

1 in charter school for the last three years and  
2 I had decided at some point that whatever was  
3 going on in charter school with my son wasn't  
4 working. So what I decided to do was take him  
5 out and put him in a public school. As I was  
6 going to registration, I was told, "Oh - - tell  
7 her. Three schools." I said, "OMG. Here we  
8 go." I spent 11 years at the DOE as an  
9 employee, and at some point I left. But knowing  
10 that, I was afraid that something else was going  
11 to happen. So I had to choose, charter school  
12 or public school. But I knew whatever was not  
13 working at charter school had to end. And I  
14 decided to do that. I put my son, and in the  
15 first marking period he made honor roll that he  
16 couldn't do in charter school, the first marking  
17 period. I don't know what it was or what it--  
18 but I know there was a lot of stuff going on in  
19 the first week that I was there, and that's at  
20 MS328. I met five staff members and the  
21 principal at a table, at a meeting because there  
22 was a plan in place for my child that - - for  
23 three years that I took my kid to charter school  
24 that did--they did not do. Now the seats that  
25 you have there, I repeat everyone with the

1 orange tee shirt - - welcome to the school.  
2 But in that, we are accommodating you tonight.  
3 And so people that are standing that do belong  
4 here are standing up to accommodate you. So in  
5 that, can you imagine what it would look like,  
6 if we all sat down? We would not all have  
7 seats. In the morning when the school buses  
8 come, how many more will arrive? And in fire  
9 drill, what would it look like because if I had  
10 15 steps ahead of me and I got 50 more people  
11 ahead of me, that's 50 more steps that I have to  
12 step back and wait for those people in front of  
13 me to go ahead.

14 FEMALE VOICE: You know they're coming out  
15 first.

16 Gloria: My kids, my kid is here. And so  
17 while he's here, I expect a number of different  
18 things to happen. You can't measure everything  
19 by numbers because, like I told you, my kid was  
20 in charter school for three years and did not  
21 make honor roll once. First and now, until now,  
22 he's still on honor roll. Please look at this.  
23 Please look at what's going on here. You are  
24 not sardines. You are human beings. And  
25 although we all want a good education for our

1 children, all of us want that. We want that  
2 for ourselves of course. And we need space.

3 MS. ROSARIO: Thank you.

4 MALE VOICE: Good evening, everyone. First  
5 of all, I would like to say thank you to  
6 everyone from 135 for holding this here. I know  
7 this is difficult for you guys. I understand  
8 that and I agree with Beatrice. We're all here  
9 for the same thing, for our children. However  
10 my child was on both sides. He started off in a  
11 non-charter school. He did not succeed. He did  
12 not get the education he needed. He came to  
13 Success Academy, not knowing his ABCs, not  
14 knowing how to read. We had tutors go and help  
15 him. We even had tutors over the summertime,  
16 and that still didn't help. And what I saw at  
17 Success Academy was not only what was given to  
18 us but it was the care and the love that the  
19 teachers showed at Success Academy. - - he's  
20 texted me and told me, "Moses, this is what I  
21 need from you." They care. It's not only about  
22 what we have or the space. It's what they bring  
23 to the children. And I understand that this is  
24 hard for everyone. I understand that. However,  
25 it's like I said, we're all here for the same

1 thing and I want the same thing for my child.  
2 I want a great education and I - - in my opinion  
3 Success Academy is that opportunity. Thank you.

4 MS. ROSARIO: Reminder to be respectful.

5 MALE VOICE: Good evening. I know there's a  
6 lot of parents here and we're all tired. We all  
7 have A.M. jobs, P.M. jobs, different schedules,  
8 but we are all here to fight for our children.  
9 And I want to thank 145 for having us, but it  
10 is--I want to just point out one thing. It's  
11 very sad for me as us, as a community and for  
12 the DOE to have us here fighting for--over space  
13 for education equality. It is very sad. It is  
14 very, very sad. And if I was in your shoes, I  
15 would be fighting the same exact way, and I  
16 applaud you for that. Most 100% because we are  
17 all here about our kids. With that being said,  
18 we need more schools. Where are the schools?  
19 Where is the space? We need more space. - - as  
20 the community as a whole because when one shall  
21 fail we all fail as a community. Where one  
22 child fails, we all fail, all of us. Now again,  
23 with that being said, at this point my son has  
24 nowhere to go for the third grade.

25 FEMALE VOICE: That's a lie.

1 MALE VOICE: He has no--there's nowhere  
2 for him to go for the third grade. I didn't  
3 make the rules up.

4 MS. ROSARIO: Okay. Reminder to be  
5 respectful and let everyone speak.

6 MALE VOICE: He doesn't have a home, and it  
7 is unfair that from District 8 opening to  
8 District 9. As I said, if I was in on District  
9 9 I would fight with you for the same thing.  
10 But he doesn't have a home and we need a home.  
11 Success Academy is doing great for my son. He  
12 is reading at a fifth grade level - - second  
13 grader with a third grade level. Last point.  
14 We want success for all of our children. Thank  
15 you.

16 MS. ROSARIO: Before the last people speak,  
17 I will ask that now there are plenty of empty  
18 seats. Would everyone please, at this time, sit  
19 down? We want everyone at this point seated.  
20 Please at this point please move into seats.  
21 There are plenty of empty seats. We would like  
22 everyone at this time seated. Again, I cannot  
23 thank you enough. You are such a responsive  
24 audience and respectful audience. I thank you  
25 again. Everyone, at this time, please be

1 seated. And now the next speaker will speak.

2 FEMALE VOICE: Peace and greetings,  
3 everyone. When I came here this evening, I came  
4 with no notes. I came basically with my  
5 testimony as it pertains to the Success Academy  
6 helping my child to excel. My son's growth was  
7 stagnant. It was being hindered. He was both  
8 at a regular, traditional school, as well as a  
9 charter school which failed him. So as someone  
10 mentioned in - - no, not all charter schools are  
11 the best or all charter schools are good. So as  
12 I sat back, I took notes. You all spoke of  
13 geographic areas. We all come from an area  
14 which we live in and reside, which is the Bronx.  
15 It is a low property area. It is a low income  
16 area in which no, not all schools are failing  
17 schools because I rised above a failing school,  
18 obtained two degrees. I was District 11. I  
19 succeeded with the power of my parents being  
20 determined. However not all kids are - - so  
21 when they don't get it from home, they get it  
22 from places such as Success Academy which is not  
23 only a community but a built-in family and it's  
24 structured on character, humanity, principles,  
25 values, morals. And this - - teaches these

1 children that are actually scholars. Their  
2 classrooms are made at the colleges, preparing  
3 them with a vision, a hope, an inspiration and a  
4 dream to one day walk - -.

5 [END RECORDING]

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

1  
2           The prior proceedings were transcribed from  
3 audio files and have been transcribed to the  
4 best of my ability. I further certify that I am  
5 not connected by blood, marriage or employment  
6 with any of the parties herein nor interested  
7 directly or indirectly in the matter  
8 transcribed.

9  
10           Signature

*Michelle R Killen*

11           Date April 20, 2015  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25