

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF
EDUCATION - DIVISION OF
PORTFOLIO PLANNING
Success Academy 2 & 3 5th Grade @
M185/208 - 3/15/12**

1 [START 285_720.MP3]

2 MS. CHRISTINE ANNECHINO: My name is
3 Christine Annechino and I am the president of
4 the Community Education Council. Just so
5 everybody knows, the Community Education Council
6 is what, is the school board. We are the
7 volunteer parents that are looking out for each
8 and every one of the public school children in
9 our district from 59th Street to 122nd Street,
10 and might I say we are very proud of all of you.
11 We want to give you a hand. Thank you very
12 much.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ANNECHINO: So here's how it's going to
15 go today: We are going to, we'll hear from
16 everybody on the dais, on the table. They will
17 introduce themselves, just so you know where
18 they're from. Then the Department of Education
19 will read their statement on what they are
20 proposing to do to this building. After that,
21 there will be two to three minutes from
22 everybody on this dais. They will be able to
23 ask a question, but the questions will not be
24 answered until the end of the meeting.
25 Therefore, we need to keep it very succinct for

1 everyone who's here, because it's most
2 important, because all of us up here, we've been
3 talking a lot about your school. We've been
4 trying to tell everyone here about your school,
5 and so now we think it's important that the
6 Department of Education hears from you guys, and
7 we want to make as much time as possible for you
8 guys to speak for what's going on in these great
9 schools. So, without further ado, I'm going to
10 start down on this side of the table, everyone
11 will introduce themselves starting from...

12 MR. STEVEN EVANGELISTA: Okay. My name is
13 Steven Evangelista. I'm the principal and co-
14 founder of Harlem Link Charter School, and a
15 proud member of the building council for this
16 community here.

17 [applause]

18 FEMALE VOICE 1: We can't hear him. Turn up
19 the mike. Turn it up.

20 [background noise]

21 MS. SHELLY KLAINBERG: Good evening. My
22 name is Shelly Klainberg and I am the principal
23 of P226M, one of our nine locations is located
24 in this - - building, and we have been a proud
25 member of this community for many years.

1 [applause]

2 MS. ANGELA DONADELLE: Good evening
3 everybody. My name is Angela Donadelle
4 [phonetic], and I am a proud parent of a child
5 from - - a member of the school - - my child's
6 been going to the school since he was five years
7 old, and I - -. Can you hear me?

8 MALE VOICE 1: Turn the mike up, we can't
9 hear you.

10 MS. DONADELLE: You can't hear me?

11 MALE VOICE 1: No.

12 MS. DONADELLE: Is that better?

13 MALE VOICE 1: No.

14 MS. DONADELLE: I'm a very proud parent of a
15 child at PS226, I am a member of the school
16 leadership team and a proud member of this
17 community. I live five blocks away.

18 [applause]

19 MR. NOAH GOTBAUM: Good evening, everybody.
20 My name is Noah Gotbaum. I'm a member of the
21 Community Education Council. I'm also chairman
22 of the Charter Overcrowding Committee. I'm
23 really happy to be here. I also spend quite a
24 bit of time in helping to develop the magnet
25 grant, which is part of the 185/208 community,

1 and I'm proud of everyone here. Thank you very
2 much.

3 [applause]

4 MS. ESTHER FRIEDMAN: Good evening. My name
5 is Esther Friedman. I am the acting
6 superintendent in District 3.

7 [applause]

8 MS. CAMILLE GOODRIDGE: Good evening, all.
9 My name is Camille Goodridge. I am the vice
10 president number two on the CEC, and I'm also a
11 member of the community.

12 [applause]

13 MS. SYMONE MANNING: Good evening all. My
14 name is Symone Manning. I'm the PTA president
15 and an associate member of - - Magnet School,
16 also a proud parent of a fifth grader.

17 [applause]

18 MS. ANIA ANIS: Good evening. My name is
19 Ania Anis and I'm a fifth grader in Alain L.
20 Locke Magnet School for Environmental
21 Stewardship - - and nothing less.

22 [applause]

23 MR. GULSHAN AKHTAR: Good evening, ladies
24 and gentleman. My name is - - I have been the
25 PS185 student. Thank you.

1 MS. TALESHIA WOODS: Good evening, ladies
2 and gentleman. My name is Taleshia Woods. I'm
3 a proud parent and a former PTA president of
4 PS185, and I have - - in there also.

5 [applause]

6 MR. GREG BETHAL: Is this microphone a
7 little bit better?

8 FEMALE VOICE 1: Yes.

9 MR. BETHAL: My name's Greg Bethal. I'm
10 serving as the facilitator for tonight's
11 hearing, as well as the designee of Chancellor
12 Dennis Walcott. Before we formally begin the
13 hearing, I do want to point out a couple things
14 that I hope are obvious. Number one, this
15 hearing is about receiving public comment, which
16 means on behalf of the Department of Education
17 and the chancellor, my job this evening very
18 simply is to share a brief amount of information
19 with you. It's very much the same information
20 that was available outside in the hallway and
21 has been posted online for the last few weeks.
22 And then my job is to make sure that I'm
23 listening to what's said during the public
24 comment, doing what I can to respond to
25 questions - - that are asked here, and then make

1 sure that I bring that information both back to
2 the chancellor and his cabinet, as well as
3 making sure the rest of the Department of
4 Education team that's here, make sure that
5 comments are prepared for the - - educational
6 policy. I will say this: as is the case with
7 the other DOE staff that are here tonight, many
8 of us volunteered for this assignment. My
9 reason for doing that is that the magnet school
10 grants that are very much a part of both 185 and
11 208 are in my office at the Department of
12 Education. The staff did have - - for those
13 grants, support those grants, and want to make
14 sure that those grants and the services they
15 provide in both schools and across District 3
16 and other districts around the city continue to
17 thrive as they were designed to do, so our
18 reason to coming out tonight was not to rely on
19 second hand information, but to make sure we had
20 the opportunity to talk very directly and
21 candidly about the work that's going on, how we
22 believe it will or won't impact the school's
23 moving forward, and to hear feedback from both
24 the community representatives that are lined up
25 on the dais, as well as those that are here. As

1 a practical matter, there are almost 60 people
2 that are already signed up outside for comment.
3 Those are 60 people that will each get their two
4 minutes to speak, and I'll launch into the
5 formalities in just a second, but at two minutes
6 apiece, that means we have at least two hours of
7 public comment that will begin after I'm done
8 with the statement, and after those on the dais
9 have the opportunity to speak, and it is very
10 important to us in the Department of Education
11 and to me as a facilitator to make sure that
12 everybody who wants to speak this evening has an
13 opportunity to have their say, and to be heard.
14 So I would ask a couple of favors: I noticed
15 when I came in that the students from the - -
16 magnet had a very simple sign that they were
17 putting up, and I believe that meant that
18 everybody would try and be quiet to make sure we
19 could hear whoever was speaking--a little
20 earlier it was Principal Green, and we
21 appreciate the role model. It would be helpful
22 if there are those that you agree with tonight,
23 certainly show you appreciation for what they're
24 saying. If we have extended applause and
25 interruption in-between each speaker, it will

1 only mean that those speakers that are signed
2 up at number 51, 52 through 60, and there's
3 probably more by now, will have to wait that
4 much later. At other hearings that we've done
5 where we've had some success, where folks wanted
6 to show their appreciation, they used a standard
7 sign language sign of just shaking their hands,
8 and when you have this many people in the
9 audience as we do now, it's pretty easy to see
10 when people agreed with what was being said. I
11 would ask this: I know there are a lot of
12 concerns about this proposal, and I was asked to
13 come by the chancellor and our chief academic
14 officer to hear those concerns, make sure we're
15 listening to what they are, to address as many
16 as I can this evening, and then to make sure
17 that I'm carrying that back to the chancellor
18 and his cabinet. Most importantly, I understand
19 that passions can get aroused whenever we have a
20 meeting that has anything to do with the
21 education of our kids, and simply by the turnout
22 tonight from the community and your community
23 representatives, it's clear that we have a lot
24 of people in this community who care about their
25 schools, and care about the education their kids

1 are getting. I would ask, as politely as I
2 know how to ask, for everybody to please
3 remember that we do have young children in the
4 audience tonight, and to the extent that we can
5 be good role models for how to articulate our
6 point of view, even when we may disagree and
7 make sure that everybody is heard. I think the
8 only folks we'll excuse tonight for being a
9 little bit loud are those kids that are getting
10 tired, or if you need to go to the bathroom,
11 please ask somebody to take you to the bathroom.
12 It's perfectly okay. But with that, we'll begin
13 the hearing and I thank you for your attention.

14 [applause]

15 MR. BETHAL: You'll forgive me--there's a
16 few pages of formalities I have to get to. Good
17 evening. There was a question about the
18 cameras, and before we begin, there are a number
19 of folks from the news media that are here
20 tonight--yes, this is a public meeting. If our
21 good friends from the press would be so happy to
22 raise their hands so everybody knows that you're
23 concerned and will cover this fairly. Thank you
24 very much. We're all in this together.

25 MALE VOICE 1: What's the matter with - -

1 the ones who are most prominent?

2 [background noise]

3 MR. BETHAL: All the ones that...

4 FEMALE VOICE 1: - -

5 MR. BETHAL: I heard you before. I asked if
6 those that were here from the press would raise
7 their hands. As it is a public hearing, some of
8 you may have cell phones and other cameras and
9 things like that, and are free to tape here as
10 you would anywhere. If you are using those
11 tapes for any commercial purpose, please
12 remember that there are young children in the
13 room and you have an obligation to get their
14 permission and that of their parents before you
15 use their likeness in any public-facing
16 document. So I appreciate everybody playing by
17 the rules. With that...

18 [background noise]

19 MALE VOICE 1: You should like, you should
20 like - - who that is.

21 MR. BETHAL: My job is to introduce the
22 folks that are up on the stage. Anybody in the
23 audience that would like to introduce themselves
24 to each other, are more than welcome to do that.
25 - - Appreciate your perspective. Let me begin

1 the hearing so that we can make sure we get
2 some kids home at the end of the hearing, as I
3 do believe everybody still has school tomorrow.
4 Good evening. This is a joint public hearing of
5 the Department of Education, Community Education
6 Council 3, school leadership teams for the
7 proposed colocation of the fifth grades of
8 Harlem Success Academy Charter 2 and 3 in
9 building M185/208 during the 2012-2013 school
10 year. As I said earlier, my name is Greg
11 Bethal. I'm the Executive Director of the
12 Office of School Programs and Partnerships at
13 the New York City Department of Education. As
14 we said before, anybody that requires Spanish
15 language interpretation, please make yourselves
16 available to the folks at the piano, here.
17 We'll give them one more opportunity to make
18 sure everybody understands what we're doing this
19 evening.

20 [foreign language 12:10]

21 MR. BETHAL: We have asked District 3
22 Community Education Council and the school
23 leadership teams of PS185, PS208, P226M, and
24 Harlem Link to participate in this joint public
25 hearing, and I thank everybody for being here

1 and for being here on time. Representatives
2 from Harlem Success Academy 2 and 3 are also
3 present, and we're joined by a number of members
4 of the school leadership team that have already
5 introduced themselves. This hearing is being
6 recorded. That allows us to transcribe it and
7 make sure that all the activities are provided
8 to members of the Panel on Education Policy.
9 The purpose of this hearing is for you to
10 provide comments about the proposal, and before
11 I describe the proposal I want to make sure that
12 you are all aware of the opportunity for you to
13 provide your input. All of those who wish to
14 speak tonight must sign up in the speaker sign
15 up area just outside the door. The signup list
16 will close at 6:45, about twenty minutes from
17 now. Speakers will be given the floor in the
18 order that they have signed up. All comments
19 are limited to two minutes, and we will have a
20 time keeper who will let you know when there's
21 30 seconds left and when your time is up. If
22 you have a question that you want addressed
23 during the question and answer portion of the
24 agenda, which will take place following the
25 public comment, please write that question on

1 the index cards provided outside and submit
2 them to a volunteer at the table. We will
3 respond as the CEC president suggested from the
4 dais during the question and answer period
5 following public comment. There are a few
6 public officials, elected officials, some who
7 have already arrived, those that may arrive at
8 different times throughout the evening. If they
9 wish to speak, we will do our best to
10 accommodate them at the first opportune time.
11 Those who are here at the start of the public
12 comment will be given the opportunity to speak
13 first. All comments mentioned in the analysis
14 of public comment to be published and provided
15 to the Panel on Education Policy the evening
16 before the panel votes. The vote is scheduled
17 for Wednesday, March 21st, 2012, at the High
18 School for Fashion Industries at 225 West 24th
19 Street here in Manhattan. In addition, we
20 welcome any comments or feedback that you may
21 have at any time before the panel votes on both
22 proposals. The email address and phone number
23 where the comments may be made are available on
24 the materials that were distributed outside.
25 The email address is

1 d03proposals@schools.nyc.gov and the phone
2 number to call is (212) 374-3466. I'm almost
3 there. What I'd like to share with you now is a
4 summary of the proposal. The full proposal is
5 available both online and at the tables outside.
6 For those of you that weren't sure why you came
7 tonight, it's because the New York City
8 Department of Education is proposing to
9 collocate the fifth grade of Harlem Success
10 Charter School 2 and the fifth grade of Harlem
11 Success Academy Charter School 3 in tandem
12 buildings M185 and M208 located respectively at
13 20 West 112th Street, New York, New York, 10026,
14 and 21 West 111th Street, New York, New York,
15 10026, in Community School District 3 for the
16 2012-2013 school year. Tandem belongs are two
17 separate buildings with two separate entrances
18 which are joined by a central core containing a
19 shared gymnasium, auditorium, and cafeterias.
20 Thank you very much.

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: Thank you.

22 MR. BETHAL: HSA2 and HSA3 would be
23 collocated in M185-208 with four existing
24 schools, PS185 Early Childhood Discovery and
25 Design Magnet School, PS208 Alain L. Locke

1 Magnet School for Environmental Stewardship,
2 Harlem Link Charter School and P226M at P208M,
3 one site of a multi-site district 75 school
4 located in M208. A colocation means that two or
5 more school organizations are in the same
6 building and may share common spaces like
7 auditoriums, gymnasiums and cafeterias. If this
8 proposal was approved, during the 2012-2013
9 school year HSA2 and HSA3 would serve fifth
10 grade students jointly in M185/208 as a unified
11 cohort of about 140 to 155 students total.
12 PS185 is a zoned early childhood school in the
13 M185 building serving 237 students in
14 kindergarten through second grade and
15 offering... Hold on, let me finish the sentence--
16 --and offering a full-day pre-kindergarten
17 program. They do a good job at preparing me--if
18 I get it wrong, let me know. PS208 is a zoned
19 elementary school in M208 building serving 200
20 students and third through fifth grade.
21 Although they are two distinct schools, PS185
22 and PS208 serve the same zone and students
23 generally articulate from the second grade in
24 PS185 to the third grade in PS208. P226M serves
25 students in grades K-12 and offers a pre-

1 kindergarten program. P226M is a split site
2 across eight locations including M185/208.
3 P226M at P208M currently serves approximately 38
4 students in third through sixth grade. Harlem
5 Link is a public charter school located at
6 M185/208 serving 299 students in kindergarten
7 through fifth grade. Harlem Success Academy 2
8 is an existing public charter school serving
9 students in kindergarten through fourth grade in
10 building M30 located at 144-176 East 128th
11 Street in Community School District 5
12 approximately 1.2 miles from M185/208. Harlem
13 Success Academy 3 is an existing public charter
14 school serving students in kindergarten through
15 fourth grades in building M101 located at 141
16 East 111th Street in Community School District
17 4, approximately a half a mile from M185/208.
18 M185/208 has the combined capacity to serve 983
19 students. Currently the building serves 774
20 students, yielding a building utilization rate
21 of 79%. If this proposal is approved, in 2012-
22 2013 M185/208 is projected to serve
23 approximately 840 to 996 students in total in
24 PS185, PS208, Harlem Link, P226M at P208M, HSA2
25 and HSA3, and yielding an estimated building

1 utilization rate of between 85% and 101%. As
2 discussed in the educational impact statement
3 and the building utilization plan, the building
4 has sufficient space to provide all these
5 schools with at least their baseline room
6 allocations under the citywide instructional
7 footprint. Therefore, the M185/208 building has
8 the capacity to accommodate all existing
9 schools, along with the proposed fifth grades of
10 HSA3 and HSA2. The proposed colocation is not
11 expected to impact current or future
12 instructional programming, enrollment, or
13 admissions at PS185, PS208, Harlem Link, or
14 P226M at P208M. The DOE believes that HSA2's
15 and HSA3's and the Success Academy's records of
16 success support the growth of these two schools.
17 This proposal - - HSA2 and HSA3 fifth grades in
18 M185/208 would allow these schools to continue
19 providing educational opportunities for students
20 and families, and I would simply add that this
21 is only a proposal for this colocation for the
22 upcoming school year. Any additional thinking
23 and we'll address it a little bit later would
24 need additional public hearings and additional
25 planning. And with that, I'll turn it back over

1 to the CEC president if there are those that
2 have comments from the CEC and the others that
3 have joined us. If we have problems with the
4 microphone, if folks are having a hard time
5 hearing, I would ask that we could get
6 everybody's attention again. If you're having
7 problems with the microphone, you're welcome to
8 come down and use this microphone as well.

9 [background noise]

10 FEMALE VOICE 1: Excuse me? The noise - -
11 really needs to stop. Can you - - ? I want to
12 hear you all. I'm sorry - -.

13 MS. ANNECHINO: Thank you. Thank you.

14 FEMALE VOICE 10: - -

15 [background noise]

16 MS. ANNECHINO: Okay, we're ready to start.
17 We are, before we start on the dais we are very
18 pleased and thrilled and excited to have Senator
19 Bill Perkins - -.

20 [applause]

21 SENATOR BILL PERKINS: Good afternoon, good
22 evening. You know, I'm very honored to be here.
23 I've had a long experience with these two
24 schools. Before I begin, though, I want to ask
25 the person in charge to do something on behalf

1 of the vast number of people that are here,
2 not for me.

3 MS. ANNECHINO: Sure.

4 SENATOR PERKINS: 99% of the people do not
5 feel comfortable with a camera in their face.
6 Most--I don't mind. You don't mind. You need
7 to move him out of the way. So he can take his
8 pictures back there--he doesn't have to be on
9 top of people like he is now. - - Move away--
10 just move away. Let's move away. - - Have a
11 problem seeing me or hearing me? But I'm
12 worried about the other parents, the other
13 adults here who are not as comfortable with a
14 camera in their face, that's number one, so
15 please respect these people - -.

16 [applause]

17 SENATOR PERKINS: Now, you know, I live
18 right down the block over - - Fifth Avenue at -
19 - Plaza, I was the first tenant to move into the
20 building, and I've been involved with these
21 schools ever since then, and I want to--you
22 know, we're going to take a moment to remember
23 Corrine Petty [phonetic] and Norma Jenoe
24 [phonetic] who are the principals of these two
25 schools, and I wanted to remember them and the

1 way that I had the privilege of working with
2 them, which was in many, many ways, but one of
3 the ways in which I had that privilege--you see,
4 they can't even control their cameraman. You
5 understand? They've got to negotiate with the
6 cameraman. It's my time to speak, right?

7 [background noise]

8 SENATOR PERKINS: - -

9 [background noise]

10 SENATOR PERKINS: Let me just - - I'm not
11 going to be long - - we want to - - able to
12 express yourself to the CEC, but there's one
13 thing I just, in memory of those two dynamic
14 principals that put this school on the map, I
15 want to just do something I used to do every
16 time when I would come for the graduation, and I
17 would try to get the young people involved in
18 the recognizing their school, and one of the
19 things we would do going to graduation is we
20 would chant: "This is our school." Repeat after
21 me: "This is our school."

22 MALE VOICE 1: This is our school.

23 SENATOR PERKINS: Stand up: "This is our
24 school."

25 MALE VOICE 1: This is our school, this is

1 our school.

2 SENATOR PERKINS: This is our school.

3 MALE VOICE 1: This is our school, this is
4 our school.

5 SENATOR PERKINS: This is our school.

6 MALE VOICE 1: This is our school, this is
7 our school, this is our school, this is our
8 school, this is our school, this is our school,
9 this is our school, this is our school, this is
10 our school, this is our school, this is our
11 school.

12 [applause]

13 SENATOR PERKINS: 185... 208... Is 208 in
14 the house?

15 [applause]

16 SENATOR PERKINS: Is 185 in the house?

17 [applause]

18 SENATOR PERKINS: Is this your school?

19 [applause]

20 SENATOR PERKINS: Are you going to fight to
21 keep your school?

22 [applause]

23 SENATOR PERKINS: All right.

24 [background noise]

25 SENATOR PERKINS: Now, let me just finish.

1 Let me finish. Yeah. Now, - - in
2 conclusion... In conclusion, I want to be clear
3 about my point of view. There are four schools
4 in this building presently, and they're due to
5 get a magnet grant. And one of the things I've
6 learned as a councilmember and now as a state
7 senator and even as a tenant leader in this
8 neighborhood is that I've had the privilege of
9 not only representing this block but many
10 schools throughout this area, and never, never
11 do I see what takes place in the Harlem part of
12 my district and other parts of the district.
13 Never. I don't care if it's the Upper West
14 Side; I don't care--nowhere. It's only in these
15 communities. And the colocation policy that we
16 see taking place only takes place in communities
17 of color. Let's be real about this. It only
18 takes place in communities of color. The only -
19 - communities of color. It doesn't matter if
20 the school is successful or failing--it's the
21 only place that it takes place, and it's the
22 only place where the real estate, not the
23 education, the real estate is what people really
24 want. Don't think this is about education.
25 This is not ABC. It's about M-O-N-E-Y, M-O-N-E-

1 Y.

2 [applause]

3 SENATOR PERKINS: Now I know, I know that
4 folks don't want to hear that, but that's the
5 truth, and the evidence was borne out, listen to
6 me now, in the last few days. I'm glad you know
7 how to tell time. I'm glad you know how to tell
8 time. Okay, - - I love you, but I want to
9 mention, the next step in the charter - - listen
10 to me--okay, Mr., listen to me. In conclusion,
11 the next step of the charter movement was
12 revealed to us this past week in Albany, and
13 guess what the next step is? Guess what the
14 next step is? Private for-profit charter
15 schools. Private for-profit charter schools.
16 Repeat after me: "Private for-profit charter
17 schools." That is a fact. I wish I was making
18 it up. But that is the proposal that they want
19 us to pass so what you see now is the wolf in
20 sheep's clothing. The wolf in sheep's clothing.

21 [applause]

22 SENATOR PERKINS: So I want to, I want to
23 thank you for the opportunity to return for your
24 graduation to the next level of the struggle for
25 your education. - -

1 [applause]

2 SENATOR PERKINS: The next level of struggle
3 for your education is for you to fight to keep
4 your school. Fight to keep your school. Thank
5 you very much. I appreciate the CEC for the
6 opportunity.

7 [applause]

8 MS. ANNECHINO: Thank you. - -

9 MR. BETHAL: Excuse me--just give me one
10 second. I'd just like to clarify everybody, for
11 everybody, two things to make sure that we're
12 all on the same page. I understand that Senator
13 Perkins has to be in Albany shortly, and so I
14 appreciate the courtesy of allowing him to speak
15 early. Other elected officials as they arrive
16 will be given the opportunity to speak at the
17 beginning of the public speaks after those in
18 the dais have spoken. Additionally, I
19 appreciate the concern about the gentleman with
20 the camera. So that we don't create any
21 problems, it was the Department of Education
22 that asked folks to stay up here so that they
23 would not be in anybody's way. The good senator
24 asked that we asked him to move, the gentleman
25 was more than cooperative, and asked that we

1 find a new place in the room that would not
2 block anybody's view. Thank you very much.
3 Christine, I turn it back to you. - -

4 MS. ANNECHINO: - -

5 [background noise]

6 MS. MAUREEN MURPHY: Good evening, everyone.
7 The charter school we are discussing today - -.

8 FEMALE VOICE 1: We can't hear you. We
9 can't hear you.

10 [background noise]

11 MS. MURPHY: Is that better?

12 FEMALE VOICE 1: Yes.

13 MS. MURPHY: Thank you. The charter schools
14 we are discussing today, Harlem Success Academy
15 charter schools 2 and 3 are authorized by the
16 SUNY Board of Trustees. The education law
17 requires that SUNY hold a public hearing to
18 discuss the proposed location of a charter
19 school when one of the schools it authorized is
20 proposed to move into an existing public school
21 building. The purpose of this hearing is to
22 receive comments related to the proposed
23 location of the charter school. SUNY is
24 conducting its hearing now, at the same time as
25 the DOE, as we rely on the DOE to help us notify

1 parents and guardians and to arrange the
2 hearing location. However, SUNY has to make its
3 own determination regarding the school using the
4 space. SUNY will not make its final
5 determination until after the decision of the
6 TEP. Harlem Success Charter Schools 2 and 3 are
7 existing charter schools serving grades K
8 through 4 and would serve 140 to 155 fifth
9 graders at this location. I'll be taking notes
10 on all oral comments made tonight. In addition,
11 anyone who would like may give me written
12 comments this evening, or you can mail them to
13 SUNY Charter Schools Institute at 41 State
14 Street, Albany, New York, 12207, or by fax at
15 (518) 427-6510, or by email to
16 charters@suny.edu. Written testimony or
17 statements must be received no later than noon
18 on March 26th, 2012. Thank you.

19 FEMALE VOICE 1: Who are you? You haven't
20 identified yourself.

21 MS. MURPHY: My name is Maureen Murphy.

22 MS. ANNECHINO: Okay, here we go. We're
23 going to start down at this side of the table.
24 Please.

25 MS. WOODS: Okay, good evening again. My

1 name is Taleshia Woods. I'm a former student
2 as well from PS185, so you know how touchy this
3 could be for me. As I looked when Mr. Bill
4 Perkins was talking, you know, the frustration
5 between charter schools and public schools is
6 really a misconception. I don't have anything
7 against charter schools. Any school that's
8 going to promote kids to be successful for the
9 future is a great thing. Now what I'm proposing
10 right now is for us to continue to fight the
11 good fight. They have all of us fighting
12 against each other--really, it's not about that.
13 You understand? I see the anger and frustration
14 in everybody's faces. It's that, you know...

15 [applause]

16 MS. WOODS: My son is on his picture with -
17 - now. It's okay. I'm not ashamed to cry in
18 front of you all. If you look around at your
19 communities and see that they built million
20 dollar houses, apartments, next to the
21 development--you understand, it's so confusing
22 out here and we are being brainwashed. Charter
23 schools do what you've got to do, but the people
24 in charge of it have their own funds. Build
25 your own school. If a school is working...

1 [applause]

2 MS. WOODS: Our family school 185 is very
3 close-knit. We speak to the teachers on a daily
4 basis if we want to. We have that. Why are you
5 trying to keep crowding and crowding and taking
6 from the kids? He said to me, "I'm sad because
7 we won't have dance anymore. I'm sad because
8 they're taking away our art." To put it more for
9 your money reason, it really is about the
10 dinero. It's not about them trying to house
11 spaces. They did a thing for the public schools
12 which is sad, I don't know all the research, but
13 they sabotaged it - - you guys need to wake up
14 and know that. They did not give us the right
15 curriculum in the first place, you understand?
16 And then to blame it on the teachers, to blame
17 it on the teachers, they're absolutely out their
18 mind. I say stand up for your community or you
19 will fall for everything these people have to
20 give to you. - -

21 [applause]

22 [foreign language 36:25]

23 MR. AKHTAR: Thank you.

24 [applause]

25 MS. ANIS: Good evening, everyone. My name

1 is Ania Anis. I'm a fifth grader from Alain
2 L. Locke Magnet School for Environment
3 Stewardship, where we strive for greatness and
4 nothing less. I feel that there is no need for
5 two more schools in this building. We don't
6 have enough space. Many of us love how we live.
7 We like when we come in the morning and meet
8 each other every day at the door. It's very
9 fun, but when there's more people and none of us
10 are going to have the cute smile on our face
11 anymore--from cute to bad - -. Thank you.

12 [applause]

13 MS. MANNING: Good evening, everyone. - -
14 Magnet School for Environment Stewardship oppose
15 this proposed colocation on the grounds that it
16 would be detrimental to our growth as a magnet.
17 We are all here to see that all our children
18 receive an education that is both equitable and
19 democratic. To quote article 56 of the New York
20 State Charter School Act of 1998, these are the
21 objectives of a charter school, and you'll
22 notice they're very much like our school: To
23 improve student learning and achievement, to
24 increase learning opportunities of all students
25 with special emphasis on expanded learning

1 experiences for students who are at risk of
2 academic failure, to use, to encourage the use
3 of different innovative teaching methods, to
4 create new professional opportunities for
5 teachers, to provide parents and students with
6 expanded choices on the types of educational
7 opportunities within the public school system.
8 We are not here to fight or argue with fellow
9 parents. We just want our time and our space to
10 be able to grow. It is about choice--it's about
11 traditional public, charter, and magnet. They
12 should all be - - not just one entity or one
13 group. If your choice as a parent is a charter
14 school and your prayers have been answered by a
15 charter school, so be it. There's a parent out
16 there in the back who has a child just like me,
17 looking for that environment for their child.
18 If you've found that in a charter school, so be
19 it--I respect that. We respect that. We just
20 want our time. Thank you.

21 [applause]

22 MS. GOODRIDGE: Good evening again. DOE
23 speaks of choice. Where is choice by allowing
24 an out-of-district school to invade two schools
25 that have the opportunity to promote equity,

1 diversity and academic excellence for all
2 students, for all students? I am not against
3 charter schools, or we're not against charter
4 schools, but I personally am against the DOE
5 with how they planned without getting up from
6 behind a desk to come into these schools to see
7 how these schools are utilized, how the teachers
8 are interacting with the students, but they sit
9 behind the desk and say what we should do. We
10 are not here, not only for Harlem Link, PS208,
11 185, 226, but we are also here for one family
12 under the sun, the Magnet School for Technology
13 and Communications, Early Childhood Discovery
14 and Design Magnet School, the Museum Magnet
15 School, Alain L. Locke Magnet School for
16 Environment Stewardship, the Sing Institute of
17 Manhattan [phonetic], the Young Diplomats
18 Academy, and West Prep Academy--and for those
19 who do not know, those are the other schools
20 that if the colocation happens, it's a
21 possibility that they will lose that grant that
22 we have the magnet grant, which is \$11 billion.
23 The magnet grant was put here to be able to
24 create diversity, 'cause we all know in minority
25 communities there's not too much diversity, and

1 these were put here for diversity. It's not a
2 problem for you to come here, but there's so
3 many schools that's coming, building up,
4 expanding, and the schools that are here are
5 being squeezed, squeezed, pushed out,
6 disappearing, what happened to every child
7 deserves equal quality education on an equal
8 playing field? Because it's not fair for us to
9 be against each other or the most important
10 thing is for our kids to be against each other,
11 so the DOE really needs to look at how to plan
12 much better. Thank you.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ANNECHINO: We have props.

15 MS. LAURIE FRYE: Good evening. Good
16 evening, my name is Laurie Frye. I'm a CEC 3
17 member. I brought the lemons tonight because I
18 think it's a good image. I want to speak a
19 little bit about numbers, and I want to mention
20 the capacity number that is in the EIS. We are
21 being told--I have to get used to this a bit,
22 the microphone--we are being told that there are
23 983 possible seats or enrollment capacity for
24 this building. I remember my math lesson.
25 Someone in there was a lesson about real numbers

1 and imaginary numbers. I would like to submit
2 as my public comment that 983 is an imaginary
3 number.

4 [applause]

5 MS. FRYE: I'm glad to know it's not just
6 me, but I have here--and I feel like hitting
7 somebody over the head with it--but this is the
8 enrollment capacity utilization organizational
9 report Manhattan 2010-2011 school year direct
10 which is, in the EIS stated as being the
11 document from which this number came from.
12 Maybe somebody didn't use a ruler when they were
13 doing those little tiny numbers on the
14 enrollment section for all the schools in
15 district three, but the number--okay, well, I'll
16 get to my notes... That's okay, it's in my
17 notes--here, the enrollment number that I come
18 up with on the targeted capacity when you
19 combine the two schools listed in this document
20 is... Is 642--which means, actually, you are
21 already a little bit squeezed now, which you
22 probably feel, and the historical method was 857
23 which means you would have a little bit of
24 wiggle room, but not near the 184 that the DOE
25 is saying that you would have. But the more

1 interesting things I found in this document I
2 thought were things like each school is entitled
3 up to 8--I'm quoting now--up to 8 rooms equal to
4 or greater than 500 square feet for room
5 functions including general office, principal's
6 office, guidance, nurse, storage, coach's
7 office. Do you guys have a coach's office?

8 FEMALE VOICE 1: No.

9 MS. FRYE: A pre-kindergarten family room?

10 FEMALE VOICE 1: No.

11 MS. FRYE: A duplicating room?

12 FEMALE VOICE 1: No.

13 MS. FRYE: Okay, so now this is where I
14 think maybe the mayor needs the math lesson. So
15 you get, those are the eight rooms--now if you
16 jump down and you have the targeted, let's go
17 for targeted, okay? It's supposed to have 20
18 kids in your third grade class, and up to 28 in
19 your fourth and fifth, so I did a little math
20 and I came up with about 10 classrooms for the
21 two--I'm looking at PS208, since that's where
22 most of the proposal is to take the space. You
23 know, maybe at the least 8 classrooms, but let's
24 go with the 10. Then I found the cluster rooms
25 are allotted 2--that's also in this document,

1 and then I enjoyed this--subtract a full-sized
2 classroom for use as a parents' room and a
3 teachers' room, your community room, which I
4 think you guys do have a nice one, but then,
5 let's see... Okay, then you also--you get, let's
6 see, federal and state funds are allocated to
7 schools for pupil remediation, you get a room
8 for that so that's another room. What did I
9 forget?

10 FEMALE VOICE 1: Relax yourself.

11 MS. FRYE: Sorry, I'm almost there--okay, I
12 think that's it. Okay, so between your eight
13 rooms for school offices, functions, your ten
14 classrooms, your two cluster rooms, and by the
15 way, this is for this year's enrollment, this
16 isn't for your growing school, one meeting room,
17 one federal and state-funded, federal and state-
18 funded room allocated from those funds, I've
19 come up with 22 rooms for PS208. The EIS says
20 you have 19 rooms, so I would also like to
21 submit to the public record that you're about
22 three rooms short.

23 [applause]

24 MS. ANNECHINO: Just a quick demonstration--
25 there are 150 kids that are supposed to be in

1 this school in September, so I want to show
2 you something. Everybody from this center
3 section, and this section, stand up for a
4 minute. Stand up. Stand up, please. Stand up.
5 Everybody, stand up in the back, right? Okay.
6 All of you people, all you 150 people, squish
7 over there.

8 [background noise]

9 MS. ANNECHINO: Okay.

10 [applause]

11 MR. GOTBAUM: Good evening. My name is Noah
12 Gotbaum and I am honored to be here as a member
13 of the CEC representing the parents of District
14 3, all parents of District 3, which extends from
15 122nd Street down to 59th Street. I want to
16 direct part of this to the students here, from
17 185/208, but to our colleagues from the State
18 University of New York who have authorized the
19 charter, and to the Department of Education.
20 First off, to the students, unfortunately,
21 you're not getting a lesson in democracy, here.
22 Unfortunately, this decision has already been
23 made. Unfortunately, this is something like the
24 show trials that we learn about that happened in
25 the Soviet Union where you get a lot of people

1 sitting up, pretending to listen, pretending
2 to take into consideration what you're saying
3 and what your parents are saying and what the
4 community is saying and what our elected
5 officials are saying, but then doing what they
6 think should be done.

7 [applause]

8 MR. GOTBAUM: What's also going on here is
9 we're right in the middle--this is the fault
10 line of education in this country. We're right
11 here, the fault line, the divide. What do I
12 mean? Two years ago, our district received an
13 \$11 million magnet grant to upgrade to end
14 minority isolation in our district and to
15 upgrade and made attractive the programs in some
16 of our struggling schools--eight, to be precise.
17 In those schools where people were not as
18 excited to go, we and this magnet grant and all
19 of you and your principals--Principal Murphy,
20 Principal Green--undertook to give you folks the
21 opportunity and to provide choice, increase
22 choices for 3000 kids in District 3. That's
23 what the magnet grant is about--it says it right
24 here, to end minority isolation, increase choice
25 for the parents of District 3, 3000 seats. As

1 part of that grant, you have to hit some
2 target numbers. You have to implement your
3 programs. Well, for PS208, you have to hit a
4 number of 272 kids for next October.

5 FEMALE VOICE 1: Where are they going to
6 send them? Where? They don't have the space.

7 MR. GOTBAUM: That's what we have to ask the
8 Department of Education.

9 FEMALE VOICE 1: Where?

10 MR. GOTBAUM: Because Mr. Bethal and Ms.
11 Murphy, the number on the educational impact
12 statement projected by the Department of
13 Education for October 2012 for PS208, 180 to 210
14 kids. What does that mean? That means we're
15 not hitting the magnet grant targets.

16 FEMALE VOICE 1: - -

17 MR. GOTBAUM: What does that mean?

18 FEMALE VOICE 1: - -

19 MR. GOTBAUM: That means they are
20 undermining choice for 3000 parents. They're
21 not supporting it. They're undermining it.
22 What is happening? What is happening here? The
23 Department of Education is spending money,
24 bringing people in to waste, undermine, and
25 destroy choice and hurt our schools in

1 assistance, and Ms. Murphy, if you participate
2 in that, and if you participate in the DOE, you
3 hurt our kids. This isn't about choice. You
4 can't tell me that's about choice when you're
5 undermining and destroying a grant that the
6 federal government gave to us. So I have a
7 question, which you will answer later, I guess--
8 how is putting a sixth school in here, a five
9 and six schools, helping the schools to achieve
10 the magnet grant status? We'd like to have an
11 answer to it. I want to say one other thing:
12 We're talking about space. Did everybody know
13 what's going on here?

14 FEMALE VOICE 1: Yes.

15 MR. GOTBAUM: Let's just make sure everybody
16 knows, including the folks from Success Charter,
17 okay, because we're not begrudging them. But
18 the DOE's plan, so that everybody is clear, is
19 to take--we already have four schools in here--
20 to take a fifth grade class from Harlem Success
21 2 which is in District 5, and a fifth grade
22 class from Harlem Success 3 which is in District
23 4, and put them in this school which is District
24 3. Now, they're removing fifth graders out. If
25 I'm a Harlem Success parent, I'm not going to

1 like that very much--why are they taking my
2 fifth grader out and putting them independently?
3 But leave it that be. They're moving 150 fifth
4 graders into this from other schools and other
5 districts and we ask, why?

6 FEMALE VOICE 1: Why?

7 MR. GOTBAUM: Why--and here's another
8 question I have: By our calculations, we've
9 seen, we read the DOE's information, and it says
10 there are 12 schools in District 4 and District
11 5 that have enough space to house those Success
12 Charter kids--12 buildings in the district, and
13 yet, for some reason, they're taking kids, fifth
14 graders, both schools, sending them into this
15 building which already has four kids, and as
16 we've already seen, putting a magnet grant for
17 eight schools, 3000 kids, \$11 million at risk.
18 So my question is...

19 [applause]

20 MR. GOTBAUM: Why are you doing this?

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: Why? Why?

22 MR. GOTBAUM: Why are you not locating them
23 in their own districts where they are right now?
24 I'm just going to tell everybody what the answer
25 is we already got from the Department of

1 Education, and Ms. Murphy, I hope you listen
2 to this because we can't figure it out. The
3 answer from the Department of Education was...
4 This is the plan. Repeat after me: This is the
5 plan.

6 FEMALE VOICE 1: This is the plan.

7 MR. GOTBAUM: What happened to democracy?
8 What happened to community input? What happened
9 to sanity? What happened to planning? I want
10 to end with some discussion about these terrific
11 schools, which Success Charter says are failing-
12 -and that's another issue, because when Success
13 Charter comes and we have five Success Charter
14 schools already colocated, it's not about
15 coexistence. Are you hearing me, Ms. Murphy?
16 It is not about coexistence. It is about
17 competition. In every school we have, we're
18 competing. That's what they want. What is
19 competition mean? You have winners and you have
20 losers. There's no two ways about it. And so
21 what happened at 149, and what happens at 241,
22 and what's happening at Brandeis, and what's
23 going to happen at Wadley? It's the same thing
24 everywhere. It is not cooperation--it is a
25 takeover. It is competition. You cannot have

1 it both ways.

2 [applause]

3 MR. GOTBAUM: And if you're telling me that
4 these schools, our magnet grant schools are
5 failing, while Success is achieving, let me give
6 you a little data if I might, going to end on.

7 [applause]

8 MR. GOTBAUM: The English language learner
9 population at PS208 is 15.3%, all of whom take
10 standardized tests. Do you know what the
11 English language learner population among the
12 eight Success Charter Schools are who have taken
13 the test? 4000 children. Do you know the
14 answer, Ms. Murphy, how many, what percentage?
15 15 kids. In other words, PS208, which has 200
16 kids, has twice the number of ELL learners as
17 the entire Success Charter system. I think
18 these schools are succeeding and they are
19 failing at educating our kids. I would also
20 say, do you know how many collaborative team
21 teaching classes do we have at PS208 and 185?
22 We have six for 400 kids. Do you know how many
23 CTT classes they have at 4000 kids, eight school
24 Success Charter? Three. We have 50 times the
25 number of CTTs. Let me get to the most

1 difficult to educate... Self-contained
2 classes, of which my child is one. Of those
3 4000 kids, eight schools, Success Charter has
4 one self-contained class. Do you realize, with
5 four kids in it--four kids? Do you realize that
6 in this building alone, alone, they have 10
7 times the number of self-contained kids as
8 across the entire success charter?

9 [applause]

10 MR. GOTBAUM: That to me is a failure. That
11 is failure. And this is success, here. Because
12 we are educating all kids and providing
13 opportunities and choice for all kids. Please,
14 sir. - - Support choice and support our kids,
15 all of them.

16 [applause]

17 MS. ANNECHINO: Thank you. I'd like to
18 recognize we're very proud to have Councilmember
19 Gail Brewer.

20 MR. BETHAL: Excuse me one second--Miss
21 Brewer, I certainly appreciate you here. We
22 have you on the list of speakers. I'd like to
23 get through the remainder of the dais, as we
24 said earlier, we have a whole bunch of folks
25 that are here. Many are signed up to speak. We

1 need to finish with the dais. I would ask
2 everybody to respect the time of those in the
3 audience so that we can give everybody there--

4 FEMALE VOICE 1: - - We could be here all
5 night. We'll be here all night.

6 [background noise]

7 MR. BETHAL: I am not cutting off anybody's
8 time. The councilwoman has agreed to allow
9 everybody to finish, and she will have her time.

10 MS. DONADELLE: Good evening. Can I have
11 everybody's attention please? All right, I'm
12 here and I'm representing as a parent and school
13 leadership team member for PS226M. One out of
14 every 150 children is diagnosed with autism or
15 some type of developmental delay. PS226
16 represents that population, a population that is
17 being kicked around and pushed out even more so
18 than the other population. I am proud of what
19 the teachers here at 226, at PS226 at PS208 have
20 been able to do with the already limited amount
21 of space that they have to utilize. My son went
22 here eight years ago. He was in this school
23 eight years ago, and it was during that time
24 that my son transitioned and turned around.
25 Today, my child is going to graduate from high

1 school, okay?

2 [applause]

3 MS. DONADELLE: And with everything - - the
4 problem, I wasn't coming here to speak and
5 here's the thing that's been bothering me and
6 it's been bothering me for a really long time.
7 Are we really attempting to improve our public
8 school system, or are we slowly allowing public
9 education to disband as we know it? I think
10 that's what the private schools are doing. I'm
11 not blaming you, but everything that they do can
12 be done in the public school system, if they
13 allow us to do so, if they allow the funds and
14 the money to come in to be utilized by the
15 teachers that already know what they're doing
16 and how to do it, and that was all I really
17 wanted to say today.

18 [applause]

19 [background noise]

20 MR. EVANGELISTA: Good evening, everyone.
21 My name is Steven Evangelista. I'm the
22 principal and cofounder of Harlem Link Charter
23 School, and I want to tell you a little bit
24 about our school before I make a few comments.
25 We are a member of this building council and we

1 work very well together with PS185, PS208 and
2 P226. I'm really proud of our building council.
3 I'm proud of our collaboration, and my main
4 point here tonight is that we will not be pitted
5 against those schools for any reason. And I
6 want to address my comments to the DOE and to
7 say that I think everyone here would agree, the
8 Success, Harlem Link, district schools here--
9 that we have a problem with trust. And if you
10 don't have trust, you're not getting anywhere in
11 education, and we've learned that in our school.
12 We value trust. We're very open with our
13 colleagues here in the building and we work well
14 together because we value trust and openness,
15 and I think people would disagree about why
16 there's a lack of trust, but I'll tell you my
17 perspective, and our school's perspective. I
18 can't make an opinion about whether Harlem
19 Success should be here next year, because I
20 don't have enough information. And the CEC
21 folks, they've taken the time, they can look,
22 but I'm busy running my school and I can't look
23 in through this blue book and look--I can't have
24 those papers flying like you did so well, but I
25 would like to know, what are the choices the DOE

1 has for this placement? Top three--why would
2 you choose to place the schools here not there?
3 Why would you not choose to place the schools in
4 the other districts that Mr. Gotbaum mentioned?
5 And most importantly, why wouldn't you come to
6 our building council to raise this issue?

7 FEMALE VOICE 1: Yes.

8 [applause]

9 MR. EVANGELISTA: It's hard for me to stand
10 shoulder to shoulder and lock arms with Ms.
11 Murphy and Ms. Green and Ms. Klainberg and
12 educate all the children in the building, which
13 is what we believe is our shared responsibility,
14 if we don't have the information because she
15 heard something from your office and she heard
16 something else from your office and I heard
17 something, and it's almost like we're being
18 orchestrated, pit against each other, instead of
19 sitting at the table together, the students - -
20 policy proposal on the table to say "Here's the
21 issue. What do you think?" And I'll tell you,
22 I know in many schools in this colocation
23 there's fighting and there's that anger and they
24 won't get along they won't work together.
25 That's not true here, and if the DOE is going to

1 have low expectations for building council,
2 then these colocations will not work. The
3 building council idea is a great idea. It's
4 about everyone works together, everyone is
5 clear, everyone compromises, and everyone gets
6 what they need. We can't do that if we're not
7 being approached together, if we're not
8 encouraged and supported in working together,
9 and I know that because of our approach, Harlem
10 Link is about collaboration. We're going to
11 work well with our colleagues no matter who they
12 are, whatever happens, but I know there's fear
13 in the community about a school that they don't
14 know as well, but they hear bad things about in
15 the press coming in and knocking down walls and
16 being unfair. So I think the point that I want
17 to make is about fairness, and I want a
18 commitment from the DOE that whatever happens, -
19 - support for the building council and an
20 equitable distribution of resources in the
21 building.

22 [applause]

23 MR. EVANGELISTA: And I brought with me
24 exhibit A--okay, exhibit F or G or H now--this
25 is a list of all of the rooms that have we in

1 the building that are not instructional
2 spaces, and I'm not going to read it because it
3 will be an hour to go through it, but each room
4 has many people crammed into it. No one at our
5 school has a private space. Social work
6 counseling happens with three other people in
7 the same room. We put up these flimsy dividers
8 so that we could have some semblance of privacy.
9 I don't have a private office a principal. We
10 do have a coach's office--we shoehorned it into
11 next to the AIS room and the meeting space. We
12 use a closet on either side of the building to
13 make photocopies and have a refrigerator for our
14 teachers. My point is we don't have
15 transparency about how space is being used, not
16 just in the building but across the whole
17 district and in other districts. And if we have
18 to sacrifice one or more of these rooms and move
19 people around, will you pay for putting up these
20 new dividers that cram more people into these
21 rooms so that you can make it work next year?
22 That's my question.

23 [applause]

24 MR. EVANGELISTA: Thank you to everyone for
25 coming out, and for young scholars, I appreciate

1 your activism and I'm really inspired by you
2 to come and be a part of this night because I
3 know it's a long night for you, so I'm going to
4 make my final points. We need to rebuild trust
5 in the community. People do not trust the
6 school system right now. We need to be at the
7 table together collaborating on these solutions,
8 and we're not going to be pitted against each
9 other in this building. Thank you.

10 [applause]

11 MS. ANNECHINO: Okay, I'm the last one
12 before public comment. I've got a couple of
13 things. My colleagues up here have been reading
14 a lot of statistics, and those statistics are
15 real. They're not fake, they're not made up--
16 they're real. So I'm here to kind of sum a
17 little bit of this stuff up. I have a 10-year
18 old daughter who I love, and when I tell her
19 things sometimes she looks at me, she tilts her
20 head, and she goes "Really? Really?" So then I
21 thought to myself, that's a lot of what all of
22 these papers look like. For instance, as Mr.
23 Gotbaum had said, we have a school from District
24 2, a school from District 3, moving into a
25 school from District--I'm sorry, a school from

1 District 4, a school from District 5 moving
2 into a school District 3, into a building that
3 has more schools. Duh, duh, duh, tabulate--you
4 know what my daughter would say? "Really?
5 Really?" In this school, right, in this school,
6 there's now going to be six schools. You know
7 what my daughter would say? "Really? Really?"
8 And here's the best part: In District 4 and 5,
9 which I love and I'm meeting more and more
10 people from there, there are, there is, there
11 could possibly be seats there. Maybe not in a
12 public school, my friends--in real, in other
13 buildings. What would my daughter would say?
14 "Really? Really?" We are so amazed that Eva
15 Bloomberg--I mean, Mike Moskowitz--whatever it
16 is, was so amazed the day to come in, look at
17 this school, and decide to collocate, and the
18 only reason why we think they're thinking of
19 that is because their definition of collocate
20 means move in. It doesn't mean cooperate,
21 doesn't mean work together--it means move in.
22 We have real life experience from schools in our
23 district that have suffered because of Eva
24 Bloomberg, Mike Moskowitz. I want the families
25 here to know that you have almost every single

1 school in District 3 at this meeting. I see
2 them out here. They're going to come up and
3 talk, but they are all in support in all of you.
4 In closing and in conclusion, 'cause I could go
5 on, this all reminds me of a childhood story,
6 and the story is--and I think we're all familiar
7 with it--it's called Horton Hears a Who, and
8 guess what? We are in Whoville, and we are
9 shouting out to find the Horton to listen to us,
10 to recognize us, that this is wrong and it's not
11 good for any of the children, whether they're
12 from that HSA group or from the public school
13 group. It's not good for anybody. Thank you
14 all for being here, and I'd like to start the
15 public comment.

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHAL: So we've now concluded the
18 formal presentations and we'll now open the
19 floor for public comments. Speakers will be
20 given the floor in the order that they've signed
21 up. All comments are limited to two minutes.
22 There is one point, 'cause I know some of the
23 kids are leaving as we move into the public
24 comment, and there is one clarification that I
25 want to provide, and we will address the

1 questions that have been posed later. Nowhere
2 in the educational impact statement, any of the
3 proposals from the Department, or any other
4 place, is anyone in any way suggesting that any
5 of the schools on this campus are currently
6 failing. The questions of space utilization,
7 the role of the magnet grants, all of those are
8 legitimate questions and we will address them in
9 turn when we get there. As soon as the public
10 comment is complete, we're obligated to begin to
11 answer those questions. What I don't want
12 anybody to leave here believing is that any of
13 this--we have other hearings that are more
14 challenging, closings and phase-out and that
15 nature. That is not the case here. With
16 that...

17 [background noise]

18 MR. BETHAL: Excuse me. Let me be very
19 clear... It was suggested during the comments
20 that the Department of Education believed that
21 schools on this campus are failing. I am saying
22 without any equivocation we do not believe that.
23 The educational impact statement suggests that
24 we believe the programs need to continue to
25 thrive and be supported, and there is no

1 suggestion, despite the proposal for
2 colocation, that has anything at all to do with
3 the performance of the current schools. It's
4 not part of our consideration in this case.
5 That's what I'm saying. With that, I'd like to
6 call on the handful of elected officials that
7 have joined us, and we'll begin with Council
8 Member Gale Brewer, and Gale, thank you for your
9 patience.

10 [applause]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER GAIL BREWER: Thank you very
12 much. I'm Gale Brewer. I represent from 54th
13 Street to 96th Street, but I am too familiar
14 with colocation, and I am dead against
15 colocation of this Success Charter School in
16 this building, particularly because of the
17 magnet grant. And let me be specific: I had a
18 lot to do with writing that \$11 million grant.
19 I happen to know a lot about technology. I know
20 how technology should go into the schools, and I
21 work with DOE representatives to put technology
22 into that \$11 million, and I'll be darn sure
23 that we are not going to jeopardize that magnet
24 grant. I...

25 [applause]

1 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: - - Of all the
2 magnet schools--it was so fantastic. Every
3 single magnet school is doing science,
4 technology, and the art like you can't imagine.
5 They are debating issues. They are growing so
6 fast, because they have the kind of funding that
7 every school in New York City should have. I go
8 to museums, they talk about this magnet grant.
9 I go to technology seminars around the city,
10 they talk about your magnet grant. It is
11 exactly what should be going on in schools. We
12 cannot jeopardize that grant, and that grant
13 mandates that schools grow as a result of that
14 grant.

15 [applause]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER BREWER: I know it's in there
17 'cause I helped to write it, and let me tell
18 you, nothing is going to stop that grant from
19 succeeding for all of the schools, so I am with
20 you to make sure that Success does not come into
21 the school. You've got to grow. You need more
22 money and more funding. The magnet grand should
23 be just the beginning. I am not against charter
24 schools. I am against colocation that this
25 center, this school today, tomorrow, and

1 forever. Thank you very much.

2 [applause]

3 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Councilwoman. Next
4 is Nicholas Smith who is representing
5 Assemblymember Linda Rosenthal. Mr. Smith?

6 MR. NICHOLAS SMITH: Good evening,
7 everybody. I'm Nick Smith and I am the Director
8 of Legislation and Communications for Linda
9 Rosenthal who's in the state assembly. She's on
10 her way back from Albany so she cannot make it
11 this evening, but she asked me to come down and
12 read a statement on her behalf, so bear with me
13 for just a couple of minutes. Good evening, my
14 name is Assemblymember Linda B. Rosenthal, and I
15 represent the Upper West Side and parts of - -
16 Hell's Kitchen neighborhoods in Manhattan.
17 Throughout my career in the assembly, I've been
18 a strong advocate for providing the state's
19 children with the best education possible. Here
20 in school District 3, our children benefit from
21 access to some of the best public schools in the
22 city. Tonight, I would like to provide a brief
23 comment on the proposed charter revisions by the
24 Upper West Success Academy Charter School, UWS,
25 in my district, and also Harlem Success Academy

1 Charter School, Harlem Success. The UWS is
2 collocated in the Brandeis Educational Facility
3 at 145 West 84th in my district. Originally
4 given a charter in 2010, UWS laid out a specific
5 enrollment plan that would give preference to
6 out-of-district English language learners, ELLs.
7 As students - - attend failing schools before
8 all non-at-risk in-district children. Despite
9 strenuous community opposition, UWS was granted
10 its original charter based on this enrollment
11 priority which did nothing to address the
12 critical shortage of elementary school seats in
13 District 3. After only several months of
14 operation, UWS began plans to change its
15 priority to give absolute priority to District 3
16 students regardless of at-risk designation. At
17 that time, I wrote the SUNY charter school
18 institute to voice my concerns regarding UWS's
19 plans to change its enrollment priority. In its
20 initial application to SUNY, UWS claimed that
21 the granting of this charter was necessary
22 because it would serve high-need under-served
23 populations here in District 3. Above the
24 concerns of community members, local elected
25 officials, UWS was granted the charter. Now,

1 after a little more than one year of
2 operation, the proposal vision suggests that UWS
3 was either ill-informed regarding the
4 demographics at the time it applied, or, worse,
5 disingenuous. I cannot help but to question
6 this move after such a short period of time, and
7 it would seem to many that this change
8 represents a quote "bait and switch" tactic on
9 the part of UWS whereby it sets one set of
10 reasons to justify its existence and another to
11 continue siphoning students from District 3
12 public schools. Under these suspicious
13 circumstances, I urge the DOE to reject UWS's
14 application to revise its charter.

15 FEMALE VOICE 1: Yes.

16 MR. SMITH: In addition to UWS, Harlem
17 Success Academy Charter School has also applied
18 to revise its charter. Harlem Success is
19 originally collocated on the campus that houses
20 four schools, PS185, Early Childhood Discovery
21 and Design Magnet School, PS208, Alain L. Locke
22 Magnet School for Environmental Stewardship, and
23 Harlem Link Charter School. Harlem Success has
24 applied to revise its policy by offering
25 priority to in-district ELLs followed by out-of-

1 district ELLs, all in-district applicants, and
2 finally all out-of-district applicants. While
3 middle school 185 and 208 campus fall outside of
4 my assembly district, the proposed revision to
5 Harlem Success's admission policy is troubling
6 because it would jeopardize federal magnet
7 funding at eight District 3 schools. PS185 and
8 middle school 208 are two of eight District 3
9 recipients of a federal magnet grant totaling
10 \$11 million, which was mentioned just a minute
11 ago. Among the primary purposes for this
12 funding is to ensure systemic reform of the
13 public education system to create opportunities
14 for all students, with an increased focus on
15 developing educational opportunities for
16 minority students. One of the conditions for
17 funding is that each of the eight schools reach
18 and maintain an enrollment quota. If Harlem
19 Success is permitted to change its policy,
20 enrollment from the magnet schools will likely
21 be diverted, forcing each of the eight District
22 3 schools to forfeit their federal grant
23 funding. Finally, in addition to enrollment
24 quota, each magnet school is also required to
25 adopt and maintain a magnet - - curriculum.

1 Implementing these things requires the use of
2 specialty rooms that cannot be compromised by
3 conversions for additional uses. Given the
4 precarious nature of federal magnet grant
5 funding, and the threat posed to that funding by
6 the charter revisions proposed by Harlem
7 Success, I urge the DOE, again, to reject these
8 changes summarily. The federal magnet funding
9 is too important a revenue stream to jeopardize
10 and any decision to allow Harlem Success to
11 expand would come at the expense of that
12 funding. Given that, I cannot support its
13 proposed revisions, and I urge the DOE to reject
14 them as well. Here on the Upper West Side, and
15 indeed, across our state, parents and their
16 children deserve and have choice regarding the
17 best methods by which you educate your children.
18 These choices should lead to educational
19 excellences; however, I am concerned that the
20 acceptance of each of the aforementioned
21 revisions will weaken District 3 schools and
22 students, and therefore, I urge the DOE to
23 reject them. Thank you.

24 [applause]

25 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. We have two more

1 elected officials, and I'll call the
2 microphone, but I would ask--a number of folks
3 are having a hard time hearing. We have two
4 more to go before we move to the public comment
5 and I would ask everybody to please try and be
6 respectful so we can hear them. Next is - -
7 representing councilmember Inez Dickens.

8 [background noise]

9 MS. SAFIYA RAHEEM: Hello, good evening,
10 everyone. My name is Safiya Raheem and I am the
11 community liaison to Councilmember Inez E.
12 Dickens. I'll be reading a statement on her
13 behalf. Unfortunately, she was not able to join
14 us today as she is still recovering from a
15 surgery she had. Good evening. Thank you for
16 coming out this evening. Unfortunately, I could
17 not be here with you tonight, but I have stood
18 firm in fighting for what I believe to be the
19 very best educational environments and services
20 for our children. So many of you have stood the
21 course. However, it is apparent that our fight
22 is not over. Let me make clear that I am not
23 against charter schools. My issue is with the
24 gross overcrowding and blatant inequity caused
25 by certainly colocations, specifically Success

1 Academies. During my time in the City
2 Council, I have seen our traditional public
3 schools stripped of their resources and students
4 forced into staircases to receive basic
5 educational services. I take exception to the
6 fact that these inequities are concentrated in
7 my district and in other communities of color.
8 Today I am expressing my strong opposition to
9 the Department of Education's proposed
10 colocation of the fifth grade of Harlem Success
11 Academy Charter 2, and the fifth grade of Harlem
12 Success Academy Charter School 3 in this
13 building. As stated, this proposal has the
14 potential to jeopardize the PS185/208 from
15 participating in a generous \$11 million federal
16 magnet grant. According to the educational
17 impact statement, the DOE has capped enrollment
18 for PS185 and 208 at 214 and 210 students,
19 respectively, in order to accommodate the
20 additional two schools. This cap disregards the
21 fact that under the conditions of their grant,
22 both schools have enrollment quotas that require
23 them to add at least another full class to next
24 year's roster. This proposal is a disgraceful
25 attempt to undermine the success and growth of

1 these schools, and if approved, will threaten
2 their ability to continue receiving the federal
3 funding. Not only does this proposed colocation
4 raise serious concerns regarding the economic
5 vitality of the existing schools, there is an
6 overcrowding issue that must be addressed.

7 Whether your child attends one of the traditional
8 public schools or a charter school, we all can
9 agree that overcrowding doesn't work for anyone.

10 When the DOE calculates the school's footprint,
11 they are performing a mathematic calculation.

12 They have no sense of how students move through
13 a building, how a teacher sets up his or her
14 classroom to create learning centers, what a
15 gymnasium looks like 200 students trying to play
16 organized sports, what a cafeteria looks like
17 when children don't have the elbow room to eat
18 comfortably. Our children are not numbers on a
19 spreadsheet. I close tonight with my - - I
20 believe in our public school system. I feel
21 that we can fix and rebuild the basic
22 infrastructure of our public schools without
23 subjecting our children to separate and unequal
24 learning environments. Above all, I believe in
25 will continue to fight for quality free public

1 school education for every child.

2 [applause]

3 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. And our last
4 representatives are Jennifer Prince and Steven
5 Watkins from Community Board 10.

6 [applause]

7 MR. STEVEN WATKINS: Good evening. My name
8 is Steven Watkins, and this is Jennifer Prince.
9 Can you not hear me? I'm sorry.

10 [background noise]

11 MR. WATKINS: Good evening. Is that better?
12 Okay, look, first and foremost I want to say how
13 impressed I am by the young precocious souls and
14 minds that are in here tonight quietly showing
15 such a wonderful lesson for all of us adults for
16 what it means to take time, to put yourselves in
17 a position to be mature learners, to demonstrate
18 a kind of leadership and understanding for what
19 it is we as adults need to come together, to
20 listen to each other better so that we become
21 better leaders and shepherds for their future,
22 so I want to give a round of applause to all the
23 children that are in this gym tonight as we work
24 hard to try to ensure their future, okay? We
25 have a statement we'd like to read on behalf of

1 community board 10 from the education
2 committee. Jennifer, do you want to? Okay.
3 Community Board 10 is opposed to the collocation
4 of Harlem Success Academy 2 and 3 with PS185 and
5 PS208, Harlem Link Charter School and PS226.
6 Our board members have walked the halls of these
7 buildings, met with teachers, administrators,
8 and witnessed the collaborative instruction
9 occurring in these buildings. PS208 and PS185
10 already hold four schools with space used at its
11 limit. The addition of yet another school in
12 the building will have a harmful impact on the
13 programming viabilities. The student and
14 teacher work options, time management of shared
15 spaces, the lunchroom, libraries, gym, are
16 already barely managed by the existing four
17 schools collocated together. The addition of a
18 fifth school would mean combining recess with
19 students ages 3 to 11 with an already limited
20 number of staff and supervision, loss of rooms
21 for the arts, teacher resource rooms and
22 especially rooms for special education services
23 and small group instruction. In sum, it would
24 be antithetical for the DOE to suggest to
25 further collocate restructuring yet another

1 school entity. It would displace and
2 jeopardize the positive educational setting of
3 hundreds of our elementary-aged children and
4 their families and their hopes. We need to
5 affirm the value of our students and our
6 educators. We need to listen. We need to
7 listen to Principal Green. We need to listen to
8 Principal Murphy.

9 [applause]

10 MR. WATKINS: And they have not been
11 listened to. They have not been asked. They
12 have diminishing resources as it is. They are
13 not looking for an expansion based on the magnet
14 grant as it exists. We need to affirm this
15 value--quality education. Leaders with respect
16 to DOE are not acting in the way of a noble
17 experiment with respect to this democracy. It's
18 ignoble. It's shameful.

19 FEMALE VOICE 1: Shameful. It is shameful.
20 Say it again.

21 MR. WATKINS: We're going to do our very
22 utmost to protect them, these leaders in our
23 community on a daily basis to protect them from
24 this untenable threat and the potentially
25 harmful and irreversible results. We're here to

1 work together. We're not here to pit each
2 other against one another.

3 FEMALE VOICE 1: No, we're not.

4 MR. WATKINS: Thank you.

5 [applause]

6 MS. ANNECHINO: - - I have a housekeeping
7 announcement. Greg, over here.

8 MR. BETHAL: All we're waiting on is the
9 public comment. The longer you'd like to keep
10 them, I'll leave that up to you.

11 MS. ANNECHINO: Okay, housekeeping. First
12 of all, there is, after this hearing, there's
13 going to be a piece of paper outside where you
14 can do more. We need more of your help in
15 supporting this whole proposal and there's lots
16 of things to do. The second thing is I believe
17 Eva Moskowitz is in the house - -. If he would
18 like to talk, he's more than welcome to have a
19 couple of minutes.

20 [background noise]

21 MR. BETHAL: With that... I want to... We
22 have 66 people who have come out tonight to
23 speak. I want to thank you for your patience as
24 we've navigated these formalities. I'm going to
25 call folks up five at a time. I would ask you

1 to line up at the microphone on this side--not
2 sure where it's going. We'll leave it right
3 there. The first speaker, and I'm sorry if I
4 have trouble with the names--folks, if I could
5 please have your attention.

6 FEMALE VOICE 1: Quiet.

7 MR. BETHAL: Speaker number one, Michelle
8 looks like Lipkin [phonetic], speaker two Brandy
9 Serabia [phonetic], speaker three Shaunte Davis
10 [phonetic], speaker four Stanley looks like
11 Germain [phonetic], thank you, and speaker five,
12 Diane Jackson [phonetic]. If you could line up
13 on the right side, we'll go through them one by
14 one. There is a timekeeper who will warn you
15 when you have 30 seconds left and when your time
16 has elapsed, we will ask you to respect the time
17 so we can get through all the speakers. With
18 that, Michelle, the floor is yours.

19 MS. MICHELLE LIPKIN: Hi. My name is
20 Michelle Lipkin. I'm co-president of the
21 District 3 Presidents' Council. The District 3
22 Presidents' Council supports the 32 parent
23 associations in our district, and as Christine
24 said, this is a district-wide fight. It isn't a
25 fight just happening in this room right now. If

1 you look around the room, you'll see friends
2 from PS87, from PS84, from PS166, from Wadley,
3 from PS199, from PS76, and that's just some of
4 the schools that are supporting you here
5 tonight. We find ourselves here again to battle
6 against charter schools taking over our school
7 space and I find it hard to believe that we're
8 here again, and that we have to stand up and
9 fight for what should be a given--the chance for
10 our District 3 public schools to thrive and a
11 chance for the students in District 3 to
12 succeed. I am here tonight to express District
13 3 Presidents' Council's deep opposition to the
14 proposal to bring Harlem Success Academy 2 and 3
15 to this building. This facility already houses
16 four schools. Adding another puts unnecessary
17 pressure on spaces these schools use to serve
18 their students. Both 185 and 208, as we know,
19 are magnet schools, receiving federal funding
20 and these schools are expected to grow, not be
21 squeezed. The DOE should be doing everything in
22 their power to see our magnet schools succeed.
23 This colocation will bring out of district
24 students to district three, adding to our
25 overcrowding. District 3 is more overcrowded

1 than District 4 and District 5, which are the
2 districts that these charter schools currently
3 reside in. Adding students who will then have
4 priority to attend District 3 middle schools
5 adds to our already existing crisis of middle
6 school seats. The proposal to bring Harlem
7 Success Academy to this building is absolutely
8 unacceptable. It would be destructive to the
9 schools and to every student who attends. The
10 proposal to bring Harlem Success Academy 2 and 3
11 to this district is absolutely unacceptable. We
12 cannot give up any more space to charter
13 schools. This is our district. These are our
14 schools, and we must do everything we can to
15 give them the chance to achieve and to excel.

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Speaker number two,
18 Brandy Serabia?

19 MS. BRANDY SERABIA: Hi, I'm a former
20 student of... I'm a former student at PS185 and
21 PS208. This school is a regular school. I
22 don't see why you have to put more schools into
23 a school that has a lot of learning, and while
24 you're pushing them in, you're squeezing them
25 and you're not giving them the opportunity to

1 learn new things and to learn better. I was
2 here, like, two years ago, I don't remember--
3 this school was like, fascinating. Like, I fell
4 in love with it. The first time I came here I
5 was like, oh my god, I'm going to be scared, I
6 don't know what I'm going to do. And then I
7 found out that they gave me more opportunities
8 to learn, like they gave me, they helped me
9 learn English better. I'm--science, like,
10 that's the main topic that I like, going higher
11 on. I'm still wondering, why would you put
12 Success Academy or whatever their name is in the
13 school that doesn't deserve any more people in
14 the school? I'm not being mean or anything, but
15 like, like I will understand that they need more
16 space or the fifth graders don't get in their
17 school, but them in their district. Put them in
18 a school that needs students. Don't put them in
19 a school that's not their district that is not,
20 that doesn't belong here, because this school
21 learns more better than these schools which only
22 want money, they want more people here, and they
23 want to be successful, well, these schools to be
24 successful.

25 [applause]

1 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. The next speaker
2 is Shaunte Davis. Miss Davis?

3 MS. SHAUNTE DAVIS TOWNSEND: Good evening,
4 everybody. My name is Shaunte Davis Townsend
5 [phonetic]. I'm a former HSA1 parent. My
6 children are in PS208 for a reason--Harlem
7 Success, all they're about was the numbers and
8 the money. They don't care about the school,
9 they don't care about the parents at all. When
10 my kids was in that school, they begged me not
11 to go to school. They come here, they enjoy
12 themselves, I love Miss Green, I love Miss
13 Cologne, the school and parent coordinator, I
14 love everybody here, and - -.

15 [applause]

16 MS. DAVIS TOWNSEND: - - Harlem Success
17 coming here, they came to other schools and I
18 was one of the parents - - rallying for Harlem
19 Success and I was dumb and I didn't know what
20 was going on - -.

21 [applause]

22 MS. DAVIS TOWNSEND: - - Even my kids - -
23 should be in another school, but I'll be back
24 here to make sure - - don't come here. We don't
25 want them - - .

1 [applause]

2 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Mr. Germain?

3 MR. STANLEY GERMAIN: Good evening. Good
4 evening. My name is Stanley Germain. I've been
5 a resident of Harlem since 1959. I went to
6 Brandeis High School and graduated there. You
7 speak about there are no Hispanics or Latins in
8 Harlem Success Academy, you need to come to
9 Harlem Success Academy, too, okay? - - Okay,
10 now - - .

11 [applause]

12 [background noise]

13 MR. GERMAIN: - - One, two, three, four,
14 five, or ten. We are all from Harlem. - - We
15 always want the same fight together. We always
16 been here getting equality and education for our
17 children. So why are we not allowed to have a
18 fifth grade somewhere where our children can
19 succeed? I don't understand it. I don't
20 understand. They also, all the elected
21 officials here, all of you, I voted for you, you
22 are my representation. My son is 9 years old.
23 He was told he was a violent student. He was
24 special ed. He was, he couldn't learn. He left
25 a district school and started - - doing all the

1 things that you would want your child to do.
2 He will be a success in this community.
3 Education is the only way for us to get where we
4 need to go. Do not deny it to any student - -
5 graduated from this school. - - We are your
6 family. We are next door to you. We vote with
7 you. We fight with you. We - - the same
8 schools from the same place. What's the
9 difference between them? You need to look at
10 the - - of the students that you are trying to -
11 - .

12 [background noise]

13 [applause]

14 MR. BETHAL: Speaker number five, ladies and
15 gentlemen...

16 MS. DIANE JACKSON: Good evening, everyone.

17 MR. BETHAL: Miss Jackson, hold on one
18 second. Thank you. Ladies and gentlemen...
19 Thank you.

20 [background noise]

21 MR. BETHAL: Mr. Germain--folks.

22 [background noise]

23 FEMALE VOICE 1: Get your own school.
24 That's the whole purpose.

25 MALE VOICE 1: - -

1 MS. JACKSON: Parents, community--hold on
2 one second, I got it. Parents...

3 MR. BETHAL: Ladies and gentlemen, we've got
4 a group of kids that are sitting up here.
5 They're watching every single one of us as
6 adults. Hold on a second--including me. Hey,
7 excuse me.

8 [background noise]

9 MR. BETHAL: I understand--ma'am. Ma'am...
10 Mr. Germain, you had your two minutes.

11 [background noise]

12 MR. BETHAL: Mr. Germain...

13 [background noise]

14 MR. BETHAL: So kids, let me talk to you for
15 a second. I taught for 10 years and I've got
16 two kids your ages, and I think it's remarkable
17 that you come out to a public hearing where your
18 parents really do care about the education each
19 of you are getting, and the school you have to
20 go to tomorrow, and we've heard a number of
21 comments this evening. We have heard a number
22 of comments this evening that talk about each
23 and every one of you deserving a quality
24 education. And I think it is remarkable that as
25 adults we can't behave ourselves in front of our

1 kids.

2 [background noise]

3 MR. BETHAL: So I would thank you folks.
4 We've got a bunch of role models here in the
5 front and I think it's incumbent upon all of us
6 to start to follow their lead.

7 [background noise]

8 MR. BETHAL: A number of folks have
9 suggested that the Department of Education has
10 put us in the position and that is the reason
11 that we are required to come out here tonight,
12 to present the proposal and listen to this
13 feedback, and that's why I'm here this evening.
14 We've heard a number of perspectives, some that
15 will agree and that some will disagree. And the
16 point about this is that we can do that civilly,
17 we can listen to each other and we can disagree;
18 we can do it on the facts--there are still a
19 number of questions that I need to try and
20 respond to; or we can sit here and yell and
21 scream at each other, and in the morning the
22 kids are still going to have to show up at
23 school and wonder what all their parents, all
24 the adults, and all the elected officials are
25 doing to get them the education they deserve.

1 They've stayed up this late. We still have 55
2 speakers to get through. I'm going to stay here
3 as late as we need to hear from them, and the
4 only way we're going to get through it is if
5 everybody grants each and every speaker the
6 opportunity to be heard. If you disagree with
7 them, that's fine. You have the opportunity to
8 offer comment. But if we're going to yell and
9 scream, ask yourself what example we're giving
10 to our kids. Miss Jackson, thank you for your
11 patience. I turn it to you for your two
12 minutes.

13 MS. JACKSON: My name is Miss Jackson. I've
14 been a teacher at PS185 for 24 years. I am
15 also...

16 [applause]

17 MS. JACKSON: I've taught many of the
18 children here, taught many of their parents, and
19 now the grandparents--excuse me, let me do that
20 the opposite way--the grandparents, their
21 children and their children. So I've been in
22 this community for a long time, not only as an
23 educator, but I also live right in this
24 community, or right above the community in
25 Washington Heights, so I'm not an out-of-towner.

1 We have been working for years to bring our
2 kids as far as they can possibly go with what
3 little resources we used to have. Now, we have
4 an opportunity to grow even more because of the
5 grant that we have received. And now that grant
6 is jeopardy. That grant is in jeopardy because
7 if we can't grow, we can't keep the grant. I
8 don't know where it has become policy, policy to
9 help schools not succeed as you prosper other
10 schools on their backs. Now, Harlem Success
11 Academy parents, I want you to listen--if you've
12 been listening tonight, all that passion that
13 you're showing, don't let it be misdirected.
14 Don't let it be misdirected. Have you heard
15 that there are already four schools in these two
16 buildings? Have you heard that there is already
17 overcrowding with the four schools that are
18 already here? Ask yourselves this: Why would
19 you be set, why would you be told that there's a
20 possibility for your children to come to a
21 building that would jeopardize your children's
22 learning instead of going to a place where there
23 is more opportunity for them to learn in your
24 community? Okay, as I said three years ago, Mr.
25 Evangelista, what they're doing to you, what

1 they're doing to us, they will to do you, and
2 it has come right around again.

3 [applause]

4 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. I'll call speakers
5 six through ten to the microphone--that's Cedric
6 McLester [phonetic], Ben Cole Jr., Chantel
7 Jackson [phonetic], Rhonda Ramos, and Yolanda it
8 looks like Johnson [phonetic]. With that,
9 speaker six, Mr. McLester...

10 MR. CEDRIC MCLESTER: Again, my name is
11 Cedric McLester. I would like to applaud Miss
12 Jackson and her efforts and all teachers like
13 her. I'm a Harlem Success grandparent. My
14 granddaughter hopefully will be in this building
15 next year attending fifth grade. I think we all
16 want the same thing for our children--the best
17 possible education. And I heard someone mention
18 earlier about the demise of public education as
19 we know it. We should all applaud the demise of
20 public education as we know it, because it has
21 failed these children. It has failed my
22 granddaughter.

23 [background noise]

24 MR. MCLESTER: We need to tone down the
25 rhetoric, and we need to stop the them against

1 us. There is one entity that seeks to divide
2 us--it's not mayoral control. It's the union
3 stranglehold. We had some politicians get up
4 here earlier, passionately plead their case--I
5 want you to understand. They're wholly owned
6 subsidiaries of the UFT, and they will do their
7 bidding, not in the interest of these children,
8 but in their own interest. Also, I heard, and
9 these are the things that become very divisive--
10 hey, hey, ho, ho, Harlem Success must go. We
11 haven't come here yet, so that, you know, is
12 something else. And also I heard something
13 about the plan--it's DOE's plan. Well, I tell
14 my granddaughter every morning when I bring her
15 to school, she who fails the plan plans to fail.
16 They have failed our children long enough. The
17 UFT - - is the villain in the - - I'm tired of
18 the name Eva Moskowitz being bandied about like
19 she's the wicked witch of the east. I'd rather
20 think of her as the good witch Glinda. She has
21 magically transformed our - - and if you gave
22 her a chance she could transform yours, too.
23 Thank you.

24 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Speaker number
25 seven, Mr. Cole.

1 [background noise]

2 MR. BEN COLE JR.: Good evening, ladies and
3 gentlemen. My name is Ben Cole Jr. I'm from
4 the Bronx. I come here because this is a cause.
5 It's worth fighting for. If you don't fight for
6 it, they're not going to give it to you. As
7 vice president of the Presidents' Council of
8 District 12, I go into 53 schools. I report
9 back to my superintendent, and some of the
10 things that I see is like from a horror movie--
11 schools being built without gymnasiums. That's
12 right, gymnasiums. Three, three modern schools,
13 no gymnasiums. Some, no libraries. I go to all
14 of the CEC meetings, so I know what's going on,
15 and as the gentleman said, - - CEC it's already
16 laid out. It's a plan, and if you don't fight
17 against those people, you get what you get. So
18 as I see it, this great turnout, they're playing
19 chess with you. With you people, as I see
20 gathered here, you're chess masters, they're
21 only going to lose, so fight the good fight.
22 God bless you and good night.

23 MR. BETHAL: Thank you Mr. Cole.

24 [applause]

25 MR. BETHAL: Before I next speaker, I'm

1 going to ask one more time. Whether or not
2 you can hear them in the back, I can see their
3 faces in the front, and I can see and hear how
4 they're reacting to what folks are saying.
5 Every single kid that's here is going to school
6 every day and working hard. They're working
7 with teachers that are doing everything they can
8 to try and serve them and help them grow. Any
9 adult that's standing in this room and telling
10 kids that they're failing should be ashamed of
11 themselves.

12 [applause]

13 MR. BETHAL: You want to direct your energy
14 or enthusiasm or complaints to the Department of
15 Education, I'm an adult, that's what I get paid
16 for. Don't turn it on the kids.

17 MS. CHANTEL JACKSON: Good evening,
18 everyone. Good evening everyone.

19 [background noise]

20 MS. JACKSON: I have lived in this community
21 for 25 years. I went to PS185. I went to
22 PS208. All right, and I lived across the street
23 for 25 years, okay? You guys have to start
24 realizing what is happening. This is not Harlem
25 Success against PS208 and 185 and Harlem Link

1 and PS226. The Department of Education has
2 the ability to put these schools somewhere else
3 where they can fit. It is not about orange
4 versus green versus burgundy, all right? We all
5 live in this community, all of us. I voted for
6 Bill Perkins to be here, okay? So it's not
7 about them versus us. Our fight is the DOE.
8 You better realize it. You better realize it.

9 [applause]

10 MS. JACKSON: Okay? When I say I fight for
11 every kid in here, my daughter goes to Harlem
12 Link. My godson goes to 208. My friends' kids
13 go to Harlem Success. I fight for them, not to
14 fight against each other, so all that bickering
15 direct it to the DOE. Thank you.

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Jackson. Our
18 next speaker is Miss Ramos.

19 [background noise]

20 FEMALE VOICE 2: Good evening. My name is -
21 - and I am a parent of a student in Harlem
22 Success, too.

23 [applause]

24 FEMALE VOICE 2: We came here tonight to
25 seek space for our children, and I am very

1 heartbroken because it seems as though there
2 is green against orange like the young lady
3 said, and it doesn't make sense because we're
4 supposed to teach our kids to help one another,
5 and to love one another. I don't see nobody
6 saying nothing now, but when we're saying
7 something against each other, everybody wants to
8 get up and speak, but now that I'm saying that
9 we're supposed to teach our kids to love one
10 another and help one another, nobody's saying
11 nothing. It doesn't make any sense. It doesn't
12 make any sense, that we're here fighting against
13 each other, because the bottom line is, the
14 bottom line is, Harlem is a community that we
15 all live in. It doesn't matter what district.
16 Harlem is a community that we all live in. We
17 should all be on the same page, and the page
18 that we should be on is to educate our children,
19 not fight against one another. Fighting against
20 one another - - is not going to - - anything,
21 and what we need to realize is that this is not
22 our fight. DOE is the one that's creating this,
23 and the politicians. The politicians get up
24 here and they speak about what we, about not
25 sharing the space, but we vote for all of them.

1 This school and our school, we vote for them--
2 we should not let them divide us. We should
3 stand strong amongst each other.

4 [background noise]

5 [applause]

6 MR. BETHAL: All right. I want to make sure
7 we don't skip anybody. I'm looking for number
8 9, Rhonda Ramos? Miss Ramos, number 9, are you
9 here? If she comes back, we'll give her an
10 opportunity to speak. Speaker number 10,
11 Yolanda Johnson? That was - -. All right, our
12 next five speakers will be speakers 11 through
13 15, that's Beth Salvatore [phonetic], Damon
14 Anderson [phonetic], sorry, it looks like
15 Shekima Young Jackson [phonetic], Jaima Gilliard
16 [phonetic], and number 15, Liz - -. Speaker 11,
17 Beth Salvatore? Thank you, Beth.

18 MS. BETH SALVATORE: Hi, I'm a parent of two
19 kids in District 3 schools, a fourth grader at
20 PS87 and a sixth grader at MS54. I'm on the
21 parents' association of both schools. I'm here
22 to express their opposition to the colocation
23 plan, and then my own statement regarding the
24 colocation.

25 MR. BETHAL: Folks, if we could ask for

1 quiet in the back of the room, please.

2 Everybody does want to hear the comments.

3 MS. SALVATORE: So just as an aside, I'm
4 happy to see SUNY here. I tried to attend their
5 hearing last night to oppose the charter
6 amendments with - - success. It was really
7 inconveniently scheduled as many of you probably
8 found, against parent-teacher conferences, so a
9 lot of us who would have liked to have been
10 there for the hearing were not able to be there
11 and ended up showing up after it had already
12 ended, so I'm expressing my PTA's opposition to
13 those amendments and also to the colocation
14 proposal. So for the last few years I've been
15 going to CEC meetings and CEC 3 has been asking
16 the DOE for its long-term plan for District 3,
17 its enrollment plan, its building plan, and
18 we've never seen it. We've never seen a cogent
19 long-term planning for District 3, so what we've
20 seen is Band-Aids on emergency solutions--move
21 this school to this building, quick, open a new
22 school in the middle of the year, move them
23 here, so this is another example of slapdash
24 planning, right? We've got these two fifth
25 grades that no one thought to plan for. Now

1 they need a space and they're moving them out
2 of their districts into our already overcrowded
3 districts. What's the plan for next year, and
4 the year after that? They're going to move the
5 sixth grade and seventh grade and eighth grade.
6 What is the plan for those kids? Never mind the
7 fact that, as you said, that they can then be
8 150 instant possible applicants to our already
9 stressed middle schools in District 3, right?
10 So this to me is not a plan. I strongly oppose
11 the colocation proposal for the effect it would
12 have on 185 and 208, on the magnet grant,
13 potentially, and on all of District 3's schools,
14 and on our morale. This fight is ridiculous,
15 and the Success supporters who are here
16 deservedly speak proudly of their schools, as we
17 do of ours, but none of them are addressing the
18 issues of the colocation--the space and the
19 impact on District 3. Thank you.

20 [applause]

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: Thank you.

22 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Speaker number 12,
23 Damon Anderson.

24 MR. DAMON ANDERSON: Good evening,
25 everybody. My name is Damon Anderson. A lot of

1 people know me as DJ. I've lived on this
2 neighborhood, on this block at 111th Street for
3 25 years. My kids as well as myself have gone
4 here. I graduated from 185, PS208, my oldest
5 son graduated from PS208. We're here, 208--let
6 me see you.

7 [applause]

8 MR. ANDERSON: Now, here is my issue--when
9 it came to my 5 year old who is now 10 to attend
10 PS208, my child was told he could not attend
11 this school. I live in front of this building.
12 My door, you walk out--it's 11 steps across the
13 street. I could not attend this school so
14 therefore I was forced to find by any means to
15 get my child at the last minute come August
16 15th, two weeks before time school to start, to
17 get my child in a school who did not have a
18 school to attend, who I got a call saying you
19 won the lottery after the three-month waiting
20 list, number 79 on the waiting list, I finally
21 got in, so now I have three children in HSA
22 Academy, one, two, on 118th Street HSA1, and I
23 have another son in HSA3. Why am I coming up
24 here? I don't know about the politics about
25 what's going on, the money, the this and the

1 that. I just know that some 50 some odd years
2 ago, we couldn't even get educated.

3 [applause]

4 MR. ANDERSON: Now we're sitting up here
5 fighting to tell our kids we can't educate them
6 because of space. We've been overcrowded when
7 we was in school, and for all along they got
8 educations, got college degrees, got all this
9 and got all that, you fought through that,
10 didn't you? You fought through getting beat in
11 the head when Martin Luther King was marching
12 for some of you all, but now we can't fight to
13 get our kids educated no matter what? Now, I
14 wish somebody would tell me to sit down. I live
15 on 111th Street, this block. Some of you all
16 know me. My kids, my nephew, my niece are all
17 in here. We're all family. When we walk out
18 this building, we're not HSA parents, we're not
19 208 parents--we're parents. These are our kids.

20 [applause]

21 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Mr. Anderson. Our
22 next speaker is Shekima Young Jackson.

23 MS. SHEKIMA YOUNG JACKSON: Good evening,
24 everybody. How you all doing? This is good.
25 This is so great, to see parents and everybody,

1 teachers and everybody getting along. Now you
2 keep arguing about space. I was once an HSA
3 parent, right? I sat and I rallied with them,
4 for space, for squeezing, overcrowding and
5 everything. I did it all. But did they listen?
6 No. Like I said, the school's been closed,
7 there's people leaving schools. Why don't they
8 open up their own school, have their own school?

9 [applause]

10 MS. YOUNG JACKSON: I've seen schools
11 abandoned, empty, - - hoping to move in but
12 you're talking about overcrowding but you're
13 willing to come to a public school and
14 overcrowd? That's not right. And I'm glad you
15 all - - fight and protesting and showing these
16 kids what it's like to stand up for something,
17 but really? But really? Are you all really
18 going to sit these kids on each other's laps and
19 teach them and give them a good education? It's
20 all about - - all right? Come on. It's all
21 about 208, 185, come on, all - - District 3,
22 District 4, District 5, District 6--whatever.
23 It's not right. It's not right to the children.
24 It's not right for us parents. It's not right
25 at all, but we don't see - - and argue together

1 and fight together, we ain't going to get
2 nowhere. All right? Do you all hear me? Do
3 you all hear me in the back? Do you all hear me
4 in the front?

5 [applause]

6 MS. YOUNG JACKSON: All right. - - But I'm
7 just saying, if it's the DOE we've got to argue
8 with, then the DOE thank you very much, the DOE
9 - -. - - 'Cause she's the one who wants to move
10 these kids on top of the kids - - we was arguing
11 with the teachers and parents for our kids not
12 to be crowded. You understand? The same
13 argument we had in here, she was doing the same
14 thing. You understand?

15 [background noise]

16 FEMALE VOICE 1: - - Us losing the grant.

17 MS. YOUNG JACKSON: Oh, yeah, yeah, oh wait,
18 that's another thing she used to say--she's
19 always arguing about her losing her grant. What
20 about our grant? You don't care about our
21 grant, right? Our grant - -

22 [applause]

23 FEMALE VOICE 1: It don't matter. - -

24 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Jackson. Next
25 is Miss Gilliard.

1 MS. JAIMA GILLIARD: Good evening. My
2 name is Jaima Gilliard. I'm a parent of HSA3.
3 The reason why I'm here is because I think that
4 everyone here is a little money hungry about the
5 \$11 million grant, and if you do the math, if
6 they're saying that they have \$11 million and
7 they want to enroll this money for 3000
8 students, that's never going to come to a public
9 school. You're never going to get the money
10 anyway, so for you to be "Oh, I want the money,
11 we need the money, what about the money?"
12 You're never go got see the money and they won't
13 tell you that your school will close because
14 you're not performing. - - Oh, but we're not
15 going to talk about that tonight because we are
16 underperforming and they may close our school,
17 so yes, we want to come into a school that has
18 the space or will have the space when they close
19 the school because they're not performing.

20 [background noise]

21 MR. BETHAL: Folks, I just want to ask--it's
22 been stated a number of times and I just want to
23 try and clarify something. I really want to try
24 and do this, because I have to go back to work
25 tomorrow and I have to actually continue to

1 worry about the magnet grant.

2 FEMALE VOICE 1: Exactly.

3 MR. BETHAL: And--no question about it. It
4 is not \$11 million. It is \$11.2 million.

5 [applause]

6 MR. BETHAL: It is \$11.2 million that is
7 directed to the programs in these schools.
8 We're not trying to move it anywhere else, we're
9 not trying to give it to anybody else, and we
10 are confident that are we not jeopardizing the
11 grant with this colocation. I will speak very
12 directly and expand on that when we get to the Q
13 and A, but I'll say it clearly here: I'm the one
14 who's got to talk to the US Department of
15 Education and explain what we're doing. I'm the
16 one that will come back here and explain how
17 we're going to continue to support the grant
18 because it is my staff that has been working
19 with these schools to make them the successful
20 programs they are right now. With that, and
21 thank you for your patience, our next speaker is
22 Miss--I'm sorry, I left number 15, Miss Brock
23 [phonetic].

24 MS. BROCK: Yes, thank you. Good evening,
25 my name is Ms. Brock and here I go again. I'm a

1 former member of Community School Board number
2 3. I'm also a member of this community. I also
3 was - - to 185 and 208, and we had to struggle
4 and we fought. I am surprised at some of the
5 people I see in the audience that I normally
6 don't see at the CEC 3 meeting. I'm not naming
7 no names, but they know who they are.
8 Colocation--I really do not like colocation.
9 Colocation means that when they walk in, they're
10 there temporarily, but physically they're going
11 to move you out. I don't like it because these
12 two schools have money, federal money that does
13 not allow them to do certain things, but the
14 things that they have to do, they have to make
15 do when the magnet dollars. Now, for you to - -
16 to bring in someone else who you already got
17 Harlem Link here, you have overcrowded the
18 schools with another school. I have no problem
19 because they are here now, but Miss Moskowitz
20 has made enough money off the backs of our
21 children, whether they're black, white, blue,
22 yellow, or green. This one gets \$500,000 that
23 you have enough money to go and buy you a
24 building.

25 [applause]

1 MS. BROCK: You do not need to come in to
2 a building that's already established. I can
3 give you three. You can go to 125th Street at
4 the old telephone company building. Do that.

5 [applause]

6 MS. BROCK: John Edison building closed
7 down--go there. Building Manhattan, 119th
8 Street between - - and Saint Nicholas--collocate
9 there. This school is my school and I don't
10 care what nobody else says, this is my school.
11 Okay, this is my school, let me give you a - -
12 what we used to do as parents when - - at 185
13 and 208, we tied up West Side Highway and FDR,
14 nobody could go home and nobody could get to
15 work. That's what we did when they were talking
16 about closing down these two schools, and 185 is
17 open, so we have to be proactive. Tell Miss
18 Moskowitz you're making \$500,000 off of my
19 grandchildren, my children, your children--go
20 and use that \$500,000. Thank you. She told me
21 my time is up.

22 [applause]

23 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Brock. Our
24 next five speakers will be speakers 16 through
25 20--Justin Davis [phonetic], number 16, Candida

1 Brown [phonetic] number 17, Louis Nunez
2 [phonetic] number 18, Amanda Santiago [phonetic]
3 number 19, and it looks like - - John number 20.
4 Speaker 16, Justin Davis--folks, I've ask
5 everybody if we can give our attention to this
6 young man.

7 [background noise]

8 MR. JUSTIN DAVIS: Hello, I'm Justin.

9 FEMALE VOICE 1: Hi, Justin.

10 MS. DAVIS: And I think we should have HSA
11 school in this school because one day I think I
12 could be someone you remember in history, but I
13 can't do this if I don't have education, and I
14 also want to know... Why can't I come here?
15 And...

16 [background noise]

17 MR. BETHAL: Come on, folks. He's doing
18 great.

19 [background noise]

20 MR. BETHAL: Are you all kidding me?

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: No, we're not kidding you.

22 MR. BETHAL: We just made a 6-year old kid
23 cry 'cause we couldn't be adults in this room.

24 [background noise]

25 FEMALE VOICE 1: Eva Moskowitz is--

1 MR. BETHAL: Excuse me. We all made a
2 choice as he was speaking. The politics are
3 adult politics. Let's respect our kids. Come
4 on.

5 [background noise]

6 MR. BETHAL: Sir, you want to have a seat,
7 please? When your turn to speak, you can speak.
8 Right now, I'm going to listen to the children.

9 [background noise]

10 MR. BETHAL: Are you having a seat, sir?

11 [background noise]

12 MR. BETHAL: We are the communities we make,
13 and this is going to get embarrassing if folks
14 don't start to respect the kids in this room.

15 [background noise]

16 MR. BETHAL: Miss Brown, your two minutes.

17 MS. CANDIDA BROWN: Hello, ladies and
18 gentlemen. My name is Candida.

19 VICTORIA: And I'm Victoria.

20 MS. BROWN: And we're from HSA2, and we just
21 wanted to say that we're smart, we have brains,
22 we have teachers who went to Harvard, Yale, and
23 Columbia. PSA185 wants their kids to a good
24 education, and so do HSA's. When we moved to
25 PS138, they didn't like us but we showed good

1 examples to them, and they have changed.

2 MR. BETHAL: Thank you.

3 [applause]

4 MR. BETHAL: Still going? My apologies.

5 MS. BROWN: And also, we also want our
6 education just like you all do, so we think that
7 it's fair that you all share this space, so all
8 of this fighting that you're all doing for space
9 is not actually fair. If you all want - -
10 education just like she said, we think that you
11 all should be nice, that it would be nice if you
12 all would share the space.

13 FEMALE VOICE 1: No. No.

14 [background noise]

15 MR. BETHAL: Next is Louis Nunez, speaker
16 18.

17 [background noise]

18 MR. BETHAL: Mr. Nunez, number 18?

19 MR. LOUIS NUNEZ: Okay, listen, listen up,
20 people, listen up, I want to - - listen up, all
21 this bickering, we've got kids here in the back
22 and in the front.

23 FEMALE VOICE 1: You keep saying that - -
24 saying the same thing.

25 MR. NUNEZ: That's ignorance what you're

1 showing me now, 'cause I got my kids here - -
2 okay, I want to say something. I understand you
3 want education like my kids. I live here, too,
4 in the same freaking neighborhood like everybody
5 else. Fight for yours as we're fighting for
6 ours--that's what you need to do. Understand?
7 Don't fight against us. Fight against them
8 that's taking it away from us. It will be a
9 sinking ship if we let this happen. Fight for
10 what you know. Understand, take the blinders
11 off, and fight for your schools and spaces that
12 they've got the money to build and let them
13 build. On that, like I said, the privilege is
14 going to take over, and we're all going to sink.
15 Thank you very much.

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHAL: Speaker number 19 is Amanda
18 Santiago.

19 [background noise]

20 MS. AMANDA SANTIAGO: I was here when the
21 first speaker talked about Harlem is the only
22 place that this is happening. You know why
23 Harlem is the only place that this is happening?
24 Because we're fighting for an education that
25 people are receiving elsewhere. We're fighting

1 to get the space for our children, for our
2 children to grow and to learn. That's all we're
3 asking. We live four blocks away. This is our
4 community. We live in the community. We're
5 raising our children in this community. For
6 everybody who says oh, we're coming from this
7 place and that place--my house is four blocks
8 away. I walked over here. Four blocks. This
9 is the community where my children go to school.
10 Everybody's fighting, oh, you guys, we have to
11 get along for our kids. All I want for my
12 child, to go to Harvard, to go to Yale. This
13 school, Harlem Success is providing the
14 education where I think my child can do so much
15 better than me. I went to school in public
16 school--it failed me. It failed me. I ended up
17 having to stay in the community. I want better
18 for my children. That's all I'm asking--for
19 space for us all to grow and learn, that's all I
20 want. If my child can't do it in a public
21 school, then do it at Harlem Success. They're
22 doing so much better. The public schools kicked
23 my kids out, kicked my kid out. I have to go
24 look for another school to find an education and
25 get to - - Harlem Success. My son is doing so

1 much better than what he had been doing at
2 public school that kicked him out.

3 [applause]

4 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, speaker 20, Mr.
5 John.

6 MR. JOHN: Hi, folks. I live ten blocks
7 down and I live in 119th Street, eight blocks
8 up. I've been in Harlem for 14 years and I have
9 two kids at HSA2, two little girls, grades two
10 and four. I'm here to say that I approve of
11 this colocation. I think it's a good idea. The
12 Department of Ed has identified space. I know
13 you folks are nervous about colocation, I know
14 it makes you scared, I know that you're upset.
15 Don't be upset and don't be scared. It is going
16 to be fine. HSA is a wonderful school. The
17 kids are very smart, they're very well behaved.
18 The teachers are fantastically talented. The
19 administration is outstanding and the parents
20 are wonderful. Sometimes you have to not be
21 afraid of new things, of change. Don't be
22 afraid, here--they're going to be fantastic
23 neighbors and this is going to be fine. Thank
24 you very much.

25 [applause]

1 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Next will be
2 speakers 21 through 25--speaker 21 Jada Wade
3 [phonetic], speaker 22 Annie Hernandez
4 [phonetic], speaker 23 Brandon Williams
5 [phonetic], speaker 24 it looks like Maria
6 Torres [phonetic], and speaker 25 Jim Barley
7 [phonetic]. Speaker 21, Jada Wade? Is Miss
8 Wade here? Hi. Thank you, Miss Wade.

9 [background noise]

10 MR. BETHAL: Folks, if we could have our
11 attention please. You're all set, Miss Wade.

12 MS. JADA WADE: My school is crammed on two
13 floors. We need a fifth grade. We only have
14 two floors and we have kindergarten, first
15 grade, second grade, third grade and fourth
16 grade only on two floors, and we need one more
17 space for fifth grade which I'm going to
18 currently be in next year. How are we going to
19 have space for the fifth grade and we don't even
20 have enough space for the fifth grade, and the
21 fourth grade took up the last space of the two
22 floors that we had? How are we going to have
23 space for the fifth grade to get an education?
24 We need more space. We need more space--that's
25 the point.

1 [applause]

2 [background noise]

3 MS. WADE: If we won't get education, we
4 won't get to college and we won't get to succeed
5 our goals. We need this. We need this space.
6 We need this.

7 [applause]

8 MS. WADE: If we don't have it, we can't
9 succeed our goals. We can't succeed our
10 achievements. We can't. We can't. We need
11 this space, please. We need this space. We
12 need education. You have a lot of space here.

13 [background noise]

14 MS. WADE: Thank you, but we still need this
15 space, even though... Even though it's your
16 school, we still need space. You all have a lot
17 of space. You all have a lot of space. You all
18 need--we need this space. If we don't get this
19 space, how are we going to learn? How are we
20 going to learn? We need space to learn, too.

21 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Wade.

22 [applause]

23 MR. BETHAL: Miss Hernandez, thank you for
24 waiting. Ladies and gentlemen...

25 MS. ANNIE HERNANDEZ: Good evening. My name

1 is Annie Hernandez, I'm one of the planners
2 at 208, and on behalf of PS208 I just wanted to
3 send an apology to the 6-year old. We know that
4 that offended by our immature comments when he
5 was speaking. I just wanted to let everybody
6 know, this is for the students at Harlem Link
7 and Success Academy--you guys are very bright
8 individuals. This has nothing to do with you
9 guys. It's not that we don't want you here.
10 And this is to all their parents--don't we all
11 realize that we are all looking at puppets right
12 now? Didn't you listen to the numbers that the
13 DOE gave to us? Can you picture your child in
14 this building with other 982 students, sharing
15 the same space? I cannot picture my daughter in
16 that situation. I have a little girl who wants
17 to be a dancer and they want to take away her
18 dancing space, her art room, her library, her
19 music room, her lab, all the tools that she's
20 entitled to have, okay, as the citizens of this
21 country. I work every single day and my tax
22 money should be going towards my daughter's
23 education.

24 FEMALE VOICE 1: That's right.

25 MS. HERNANDEZ: Exactly, and you should be

1 fighting, you should be fighting for your
2 child to be able to have their own space.

3 FEMALE VOICE 1: That's right.

4 [applause]

5 MS. HERNANDEZ: - - Students in the same
6 building. Housing kids in the same building--
7 it's not safe. My daughter's entitled to get
8 quality education like I had it. I went to one
9 of the best high schools in the Bronx. Now,
10 it's one of the worst. And I see the reason
11 why. You're making all these children feel like
12 they don't belong in this space, when they are
13 supposed to come here every single day and get
14 the best education possible and you are
15 responsible for that.

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Hernandez.

18 Next speaker is Brandon Williams, number 23.

19 Brandon Williams, number 23, here? Speaker 24,

20 Maria Torres. Okay, if Mr. Williams or Miss

21 Torres comes back, we'll add them back to the

22 list. I'll call speakers 25 through 30, number

23 25, Jim Barley, number 26 looks like Henry Pena

24 [phonetic], number 27 Danielle Jackson

25 [phonetic], number 28 it just looks like Romeria

1 [phonetic], number 29 Lisa Vachi [phonetic],
2 and number 30, Tanelly Musage [phonetic], and
3 sorry for pronouncing that wrong. Speaker
4 number 25, Jim Barley? Speaker number 26 is
5 Henry Pena. Speaker 27, Danielle Jackson?

6 [background noise]

7 MS. DANIELLE JACKSON: I am from - - and I
8 would like to open with a statement with what
9 happens to something that doesn't work--you
10 throw it out. The students here, 26% of the
11 students here are passing the ELA. 30% are
12 passing the math. At Harlem Success Academy 3,
13 76.6% students are passing the ELA, and 87% are
14 passing the math. I'm a parent at Harlem
15 Success Academy 3 and I'm also a parent at
16 Mosaic Prep and my son who is at Mosaic Prep is
17 doing extremely well, so that school should not
18 be touched. Here, my son doesn't go here, but
19 again, your students are failing the ELA tests,
20 the math, and the reading...

21 [background noise]

22 [crosstalk]

23 MR. BETHAL: - - Speaking - - you can't stop
24 her...

25 [background noise]

1 FEMALE VOICE 1: That has nothing to do
2 with this. Just because your child didn't - -.

3 [crosstalk]

4 MR. BETHAL: No, you can't curtail - - .

5 [background noise]

6 MR. BETHAL: You can't--if she wants to say
7 something, - -. You can't curtail... She wants
8 to talk - -.

9 [background noise]

10 [crosstalk]

11 MR. BETHAL: - -

12 MS. JACKSON: - - We're rallying - - instead
13 of us going against each other, we should come
14 together as a community and work and to Miss
15 Ellen DeGeneres up here, get it right - - Eva
16 Moskowitz and not Bloomberg.

17 [background noise]

18 MR. BETHAL: I have the next speaker,
19 speaker number 28.

20 [background noise]

21 MR. BETHAL: Number... - -

22 [background noise]

23 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Mr. Jackson. Your
24 two minutes. Ladies and gentlemen, if Mr.
25 Jackson could have your attention.

1 MR. JACKSON: Goodnight everybody, how
2 you all doing?

3 [background noise]

4 MR. JACKSON: Moment of silence, please?
5 Please, a little silence and respect everybody
6 who talks, please?

7 [background noise]

8 MR. JACKSON: Thank you. Thank you very
9 much. All I'm here to say is education is the
10 key. That is the key. And what you have with
11 overcrowded classrooms, gymnasiums, lunchrooms,
12 there's no education. These teachers at 208 and
13 185, they concentrate on the students. What
14 they exactly need, not just overall. We're not
15 against Harlem Success and that's what you all
16 have got to understand. We want the extra
17 education--that's - - but the whole thing is,
18 it's the overcrowding. If there's too many
19 students nobody's going to learn. It's going to
20 be more frustration. It's going to be more
21 conflict. And it's going to be more problems.
22 It's all about the education. It's not about
23 teachers. It's not about the parents. It's
24 about the children. Look at all the kids. It's
25 not about us. We had our time. Our time went

1 and passed. Now, like I said, there's no - -
2 Harlem Success, but this is our school. This is
3 208, 185, this is our spot. If you all want to
4 take over someone else, go ahead. But my time
5 is up, thank you, and please, like I said, it's
6 all about education. It's all about the kids.

7 [applause]

8 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Mr. Jackson. Next
9 is speaker 28. Speaker 28? - - Is one of them
10 speaker 28?

11 ROMERIA: Good afternoon, everyone. Parents
12 and teachers and committee, District 3, 4, and
13 5. Every child deserves an education. It
14 doesn't matter which school or district it is.
15 We all aim to please and succeed with our
16 children and their education for the future.
17 HSA offers that. We have been doing it since
18 they opened up. The education that is being
19 taught--yes, they have chess, they have soccer,
20 they have drama, they have tap, they have this,
21 they have that, but also they drill--on a child
22 that might be weak in math, science, or reading.
23 They don't just overall every curriculum is the
24 weakness in the child--they bring forth and they
25 take them from that level of being low, low, low

1 to high, high, high. If you read our stats,
2 you'll see--we're not low on ELL testing, we are
3 not low on our math testing. We're not going to
4 be low when it comes to science testing. Hold
5 up a minute, 'cause he asked for respect and I
6 didn't do that to you, don't do it to me, okay?
7 Don't do it to me 'cause I live right here, too.
8 I live here too, and my daughter could have come
9 to this school, too, but it was my choice to do
10 what I did, like it's your choice. I'm only
11 saying like my teacher said it--we want the
12 space. We want some of the space. Share it.
13 Sharing is caring, caring is sharing. Do you
14 know that? Go home and learn some of that.
15 Empathy--listen to the children. Listen to the
16 children. How many children you see walk around
17 and say "I want to go to that school. I want to
18 go to that school with the blue book bags."
19 Please. We're not here to fight you all. We
20 just came to let you know on a peaceful note,
21 we're coming to get some of the space, too. So
22 share it, please. That's all we want to do.

23 MR. BETHAL: Speaker 29, Miss Vachi? - -
24 Not a problem at all, the microphone's all
25 yours.

1 FEMALE VOICE 3: Um, I'm - - I'm in fifth
2 grade. I was - - in third grade. These Harlem
3 Success, they try to act big and tough. They're
4 not. But I went there, they would look over our
5 tests while we were doing it and say "check this
6 again." They even gave us extra time. They
7 cheated. I know we're supposed to have 90
8 minutes. I know we have more that. I was
9 looking at the clock while I was checking over
10 my work, and if you all want to act all tough
11 and gangster, I know. I was in there last year,
12 as a matter of fact, two years ago, so say
13 something now.

14 [applause]

15 MR. BETHAL: Speaker number 30--share the
16 time, go ahead, I'm sorry.

17 MS. LISA VACHI: Hey everyone, my name is
18 Lisa Vachi and I just wanted to say, it's not
19 about this space. You all got to look at the
20 statistics.

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: Right.

22 MS. VACHI: What's going on, if you're not
23 aware, when charter schools take over all public
24 schools, public schools are going to be
25 eradicated. Charter schools are going to step

1 in, and once the public schools are gone,
2 charter schools are going to charge a fee.
3 Nothing is going to be free anymore.

4 FEMALE VOICE 1: Thank you.

5 MS. VACHI: No disrespect to Success
6 Academy--just now there was a little girl in
7 this school, PS208--girl I just started--and she
8 was crying because of what the lady said just
9 now, directing that statement to the kids of
10 this school and how they're failing. She stood
11 right here in my arms and she cried, so if you
12 all want to say anything degrading about the
13 kids of this school, keep those comments to
14 yourself. Don't bring that out here in front of
15 these kids. One last thing and then I'm going
16 to leave--I'm so sorry. The numbers is...
17 Harlem Success Academy wants to come to this
18 school because they found out about that grant.

19 FEMALE VOICE 1: Thank you.

20 MS. VACHI: Once they get in here they get
21 to share on that grant. It's not about the
22 space, it's about our children--each and every
23 child having an opportunity to learn and grow.
24 Thank you.

25 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Vachi. Speaker

1 number 30, Tammy?

2 MS. TAMMY MUSIOWSKY: Hi, I'm Tammy
3 Musiowsky, I'm a teacher here at 208, as well
4 as...

5 [applause]

6 MS. MUSIOWSKY: As well as the UST chapter
7 leader for our building. I just wanted to talk
8 about some of our numbers in terms of our
9 students, and the services that they will not
10 get any more if this colocation happens. Harlem
11 Success, I know, the space that they're trying
12 to move into is our second floor, which divides
13 our main office on the first floor and
14 everybody's going to be shoved up to the third
15 floor, so that means that all of our students
16 who have specialized programs such as speech,
17 OTPT counseling, - - services, ESL, all of those
18 students which comprise our ESL students is
19 about 30, usually 30 to 40 students per year,
20 our population of students getting counseling is
21 about 25% of our population, they would actually
22 have to travel from this site to 185 with the
23 counselor, losing half of their mandated
24 counseling time because of walking back and
25 forth to the counseling center. Also, more than

1 25%, about 30% of our students require speech
2 services, mandated. They would also have to
3 travel to 185 to get their mandated services,
4 which are 30 minutes--by the time the teachers
5 pick them up, pick up the kids for the
6 groupings, walk over there, go to whatever floor
7 they're going to be on there now, and then walk
8 back, they only get 15 minutes of their mandated
9 time. So that's just a couple of examples of
10 how our students are going to lose their
11 mandated services if this colocation happens.

12 [applause]

13 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. I'll call speakers
14 31 to 34 to the microphone, speaker 31 is Carol
15 Lopez [phonetic], speaker 32 is M. Moda
16 [phonetic], speaker 33 is Keith looks like Deere
17 [phonetic], speaker 34 is Essien Rodriguez
18 [phonetic], and then I'll turn the page to the
19 next half of our speakers. Speaker 31, Carol
20 Lopez--is Miss Lopez here? Speaker 32, M. Moda?
21 Folks, we just let them up the aisle.

22 [background noise]

23 MS. M. MODA: Good evening, parents and
24 guardians. Good evening, parents and guardians.
25 We are all stars of HSA3. - - get this right

1 because we are all a network and if this
2 school was in the same situation as us, you
3 would fight to learn. But do you also want to
4 learn? We can't have - - if we can't learn.
5 Think about our education and how it affects our
6 future. We all have dreams we want to achieve.
7 - - We have to work together.

8 [background noise]

9 MR. BETHAL: One more, or are we all set?
10 You've still got time.

11 MS. MODA: Good night, parents and teachers.
12 [applause]

13 MR. BETHAL: Our next speaker should be
14 number 33, is it Keith? Thank you. Do we have
15 the whole family here?

16 MR. KEITH DEERE: Hello, I am Keith Deere
17 Jr., and I'm actually a fifth grade student at
18 Alain L. Locke Magnet School for Environmental
19 Stewardship. I would like to say that why would
20 Harlem Success want a piece of the space that we
21 don't have? We already have four schools in
22 here. Why add another one? And as Miss
23 Musiowsky just explained, they're going to take
24 away the second floor just with their fifth
25 grade, but the second floor is actually for the

1 Alain L. Locke fifth grade. That means
2 they'll be moving one school's fifth grade to
3 have theirs, and we'll also lose art and library
4 and environmental studies just so we can have
5 space for the fifth grade.

6 [applause]

7 MALE VOICE 2: - - Continue, I'm a parent -
8 - my boys I wanted to say I've got two boys, - -
9 come to school but the school has - - you know,
10 just make more of a - - students - - 208 or 185,
11 - - DOE - - I'm at the same place - - so please,
12 - - you know, - - people. Thank you.

13 [applause]

14 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Next will be
15 speaker number 34, Essien Rodriguez. Guys, you
16 have your two minutes.

17 MR. ESSIEN RODRIGUEZ: - - New people I just
18 want to address this girl who harassed our
19 school. Gee, how do you know? How do you know
20 that we cheated?

21 [background noise]

22 MR. RODRIGUEZ: - - We just have to, we have
23 classrooms in this school because we need
24 space...

25 [background noise]

1 MR. RODRIGUEZ: - - Because we need space
2 and we - - ...

3 MR. BETHAL: You're doing fine.

4 FEMALE VOICE 1: Keep going.

5 [background noise]

6 MR. RODRIGUEZ: Because we need education,
7 too. We need - - and we have to go to - - and
8 we actually...

9 [background noise]

10 FEMALE VOICE 3: - - It doesn't matter
11 whether it's here or somewhere else. We need
12 space. What we need to address is the fact that
13 we need more schools in the city.

14 FEMALE VOICE 1: That's true.

15 FEMALE VOICE 3: What we want is to become
16 smarter, to go to college. They actually are
17 learning, and if we didn't have HSA, but a
18 different school, because we are above normal in
19 reading levels and teachers are more focused on
20 helping low level readers, we will be less smart
21 than in HSA. This is - - and we are from HSA.
22 Now, I just wanted to say one thing about the
23 little girl that said that earlier. There are
24 times--extra time is given to children with
25 special needs and ELL students, in all tests, in

1 all cities across the board, public school,
2 charter school, it's a given. They have special
3 needs, they have time and a half, double time,
4 whatever they need. So one of the things that
5 we need to think about when the little girl was
6 speaking was, was that the case for her? And
7 that's all I have - -.

8 FEMALE VOICE 1: They don't even have
9 special ed kids in that school.

10 FEMALE VOICE 3: Yes, they do.

11 FEMALE VOICE 1: What, 1, 2, or 3? - -

12 MR. BETHAL: Okay, our next five speakers
13 are number 35, Melody Siberry [phonetic], number
14 36 Sonya Hampton [phonetic], number 37 Cassandra
15 Colbert [phonetic], I believe number 38 - -
16 Krauss spoke earlier, and number 40 Alex Newman
17 [phonetic]. Speaker number 35, Miss Siberry?

18 MS. MELODY SIBERRY: Good evening. My name
19 is Melody Siberry and my granddaughter, my
20 granddaughter, Arianna Glass, is a student here
21 at PS208. One thing that I would like to say,
22 really, for the Department of Education, and the
23 people from SUNY as well--there has to be a
24 level of accountability, and I hope that you're
25 taking account all of the dynamics that are

1 occurring tonight, because this is maybe 10
2 years ago when fly [phonetic] came to 149, it
3 was the same situation. And you know, granted,
4 these charter schools are producing great ELA
5 scores and great math scores, but in educating
6 children, socialization and those things count
7 as well, and when kids walk the hall and are
8 penalized by speaking to my neighbor--and I
9 think one of the things that we're missing, too,
10 is that these kids live in the same community,
11 and they're not going to leave the dynamic that
12 is "you against me" in school and let's go home
13 and play together, because the children may, but
14 the parents don't. You know, this learning and
15 this environment is more than our 8 o'clock to
16 5:30--I mean, it really plays a great impact
17 into our lives, and even in terms of these
18 charter schools, I would love to know, because
19 I've been reading Mr. - - he's been doing these
20 charter schools for a number of years--how do
21 you plan a school and you have no way of knowing
22 in three years, four years, where these children
23 are going to be? And I have to say even to the
24 parents of Success Academy, that's why I don't
25 even deal with the charter schools because it's

1 very disheartening. I've gone to schools
2 where books are in boxes and there's not enough
3 space. When they're attracting you to come
4 there, ask them these questions--where will we
5 be? Where will our school be in the next
6 season?

7 [applause]

8 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Speaker number 36
9 is Sonya Hampton.

10 MS. SONYA HAMPTON: Good evening, everybody.
11 My name is Mrs. Sonya Hampton. I'm the PTA
12 president, SLT chairman at PS-MS149. I am the
13 first school that Harlem Success collocated
14 with. They've been in my school for 10 years,
15 so there's no such thing as temporary. Now,
16 what happened to my school when they came? My
17 8-11 district 75 children, like that principal
18 said, get off the bus on 18th Street, they walk
19 over to 17th Street, up on the second side.
20 When Harlem Success first came, I had two sets
21 of everything. Now I have one fifth grade, one
22 sixth grade, one seventh grade, one eighth
23 grade. They will not share. They will phase
24 you out. Then they make all decisions without
25 you. I've been on SLT, I've been a - - leader

1 in that school for 10 years. When Harlem
2 Success came I was happy, because I wanted
3 parents in my community to have a choice. I
4 opened the door. I said, "Eva, let's sit down,
5 let's talk." She said "I'm going to get
6 everything I want. Go talk to your
7 politicians." And she did. My special ed
8 children, they don't have no pull out rooms. We
9 pass them - - each other 'cause we have no place
10 to go. My violins, my keyboards, they are in a
11 closet. Music soothes the soul.

12 [applause]

13 MS. HAMPTON: This community, I grew up
14 here. I went to Romney, - - I went to PS76, so
15 far we've been failing--no, we're not. The
16 Board of Ed, the DOE, Eva Moss, they're failing
17 their children. The Harlem Success children are
18 not happy in my school. They are depressed.
19 They make them - - with their nose like this,
20 they make them move out the way when my kids
21 come in--separate, not equal. My son could not
22 use the bathroom on the third floor. They do
23 not share. I called the NAACP. If you think
24 they are here for you, they are going to take
25 over the school, and put our - - and give it to

1 the other people. You better wake up,
2 Bloomberg and Eva Moskowitz are buddies. They
3 do not care for you. - - Harlem Success - - way
4 before you got here.

5 [applause]

6 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Hampton. If
7 music soothes the soul, I'll do anything for a
8 violin right now if anyone's got one. Number
9 37, Cassandra Colbert.

10 MS. CASSANDRA COLBERT: Hello, my name is
11 Cassandra Colbert. I'm a parent of a student
12 from PS208. I'm also the secretary of the PTA -
13 - school leadership team. My son, this is his
14 second year in this school. Since he's been in
15 this school he has not missed one day of school.
16 He is going to be successful through the public
17 school system.

18 [applause]

19 MS. COLBERT: That is because I put in a lot
20 of work for my child as well as this school
21 does, okay? As well as his family, outside
22 people, outside members--that's what we need for
23 our children, for us to come together more and
24 support our children. Now, as far as Harlem
25 Success, you have a choice. You're not giving

1 your parents a choice to have to travel from
2 Yonkers or the Bronx or anywhere else they have
3 to come from to come to this public school. We
4 have no space. My son cannot eat breakfast at
5 10 o'clock in the morning. He cannot eat lunch
6 at 11 o'clock in the morning. He needs his gym
7 time. He needs his library for reading. He
8 needs his rugby team for his academics. You're
9 going to take all of that from my son, my son
10 right here, Marlon Norris, who's in the fourth
11 grade, he is 9 years old and he has one more
12 year, and I'm looking forward to it at this
13 school, at PS208. If you ask my son where he's
14 headed to, he will tell you, to college.

15 [applause]

16 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Colbert. Next
17 is number 40, Alex Newman. Mr. Newman, number
18 40? Okay, I'll call our next five speakers--
19 number 42, Brianna Bell [phonetic], speaker 39,
20 41, and 43 were just crossed off--there's no
21 names there. Hold on one second. Number 42
22 will be Brianna Bell followed by Sonya Jones
23 [phonetic], number 44, Carole Creole [phonetic],
24 number 45. I'll give them two seconds. Miss
25 Bell, Miss Jones, Miss Creole? Then we are on

1 to number 46, Julius it looks like Dejeter-
2 Dejeter [phonetic], my apologies. You're up.

3 [background noise]

4 MR. BETHAL: Folks, if we could get
5 everybody's attention, please.

6 [background noise]

7 MR. JULIUS DEJETER: Good evening, everyone.
8 This is regarding DOE's - - Harlem Success's
9 progress reports and proficiency exams. If the
10 charter schools aren't serving the same type of
11 children, or less of special education, ELL,
12 etcetera, as public schools, the charter
13 school's progress report will be higher than the
14 district schools, as well as having higher
15 percentages on their proficiency exams than
16 public schools serving such students, so that's
17 just something for the DOE to consider. Now,
18 this is information for SUNY and the DOE: Aside
19 from any other issues such as regarding local
20 land use regulations, zoning or leasing or
21 contracting of space issues, if a charter school
22 collocates inside of a public school building
23 with a district public school, the allocation of
24 classroom space has to be equitable to the
25 public school. How is this collocation equitable

1 to these two public schools? The use of the
2 space also has to be comparable use, so you
3 can't have public school children being placed
4 in the basement or scattered all over the
5 building, learning in stairwells, etcetera, and
6 the charter school has contiguous suitable
7 learning space. If the public school classrooms
8 become more crowded than the charter schools as
9 a result of the colocation, the colocation is
10 not equitable or comparable. So this is the
11 charter school law, and we can see you in court
12 if that's the case. And I do want to have a
13 question for the Harlem Link Charter. I wanted
14 to know when was the charter authorized--was it
15 authorized post-May 28th, 2010? And this is a
16 question for SUNY and the DOE: Is the unified
17 fifth grade Harlem Success Academy 2 and Harlem
18 Success Academy 3, a cohort as you put it, is it
19 a consolidation of the two schools acting as one
20 school, or operating as one school? So that's a
21 main question that needs to be answered because
22 that is very relevant to these schools
23 collocating - -.

24 MR. BETHAL: Thank you.

25 [applause]

1 MR. BETHAL: I'll try to get our next
2 five speakers to the microphone. Number 47 is
3 Florence looks like Gabale [phonetic], number 48
4 Taleshia Woods [phonetic], number 49 is Gay
5 looks like Eva [phonetic], number 50 is crossed
6 out--why don't we stop there? Looking for
7 speakers 47, 48, and 49. Going once... Okay.
8 Let's move on to speaker 51, Angela Tater
9 [phonetic]. Miss Tater, are you here? Speaker
10 52, Kip O'Rourke Brown [phonetic]? Speaker 52,
11 Mr. O'Rourke? Thank you.

12 [applause]

13 MR. KIP O'ROURKE BROWN: How you doing? I'm
14 here to represent community based organizations.
15 I work for an organization where we do sports-
16 based development, after school and also we do
17 support schools during the day as well and the
18 main issue for me is not about charter schools,
19 public schools. It's about due process, as the
20 gentleman from Harlem Link said--there was no
21 due process. There was the building council not
22 consulted in the proposing this proposal, and so
23 that needs to be addressed, and there's one gym,
24 as you can see, when this partition goes up,
25 that's the gym that serves all four schools that

1 are currently in the building. Physical
2 activity is an essential component to the young
3 people's development, and putting those - -
4 would severely limit the ability of these
5 schools to use the spaces to promote physical
6 activity and to improve the development of the
7 students, so with that said, please take that
8 into consideration before taking another 150
9 more students into this space. Thank you very
10 much.

11 [applause]

12 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. The next speaker is
13 number 53, Mulan Pew [phonetic]. Speaker 53?
14 Speaker 54, Phillip Royce [phonetic]?

15 MR. PHILLIP ROYAL: Royal.

16 MR. BETHAL: Royal, thank you, my apologies.

17 MR. ROYAL: Okay. Representing HSA3, or all
18 the HSA - - I just made some comments here.
19 Someone made a comment before about competition.
20 Well, competition is good. It should make you
21 better. You say it only happens in colored
22 neighborhoods--well, what do you think the
23 makeup of charter schools are? These kids
24 deserve an education as well. You already - -
25 so why not accommodate these additional students

1 and accommodate to make it work together for
2 the students, for the students? Not sure what
3 the grant you're speaking about, how it affects
4 additional students and current students but
5 from what I understand it really shouldn't. I
6 don't believe that coexisting students
7 jeopardize the quality of education that HSA
8 has, and has - -. We should be all fighting
9 together for the kids. Everybody keeps saying
10 it's "their" school. I thought this school was
11 a public school. That's all I have to say.

12 FEMALE VOICE 1: Thank you. Exactly.

13 [background noise]

14 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Mr. Royal. Number
15 55 looks like Tom Pena [phonetic]? Number 55.
16 I'm sure I got that wrong.

17 MR. TOM PENA: My name is - - speak out for
18 - - success network, and expand fifth grade to
19 this school. We are not after any grant money
20 or anything else; rather, - - speak for our
21 students and our fifth grade. I am a member of
22 the neighborhood. I am a proud supporter of
23 this charter network. We're doing an
24 accelerated job of learning for our students.
25 Most of the parents that came up to speak here

1 tonight are also from the neighborhood, and
2 as we say, it's our schools. We can share it.
3 We need space. Thank you very much. - - I was
4 told I'd be able to submit a question - -.

5 MR. BETHAL: You can give it to Mr. Poll
6 right there, and we'll get to the Q and A.

7 MR. PENA: Thank you very much.

8 [applause]

9 MR. BETHAL: Number 56, Karen Shields
10 [phonetic]? Miss Shields? Number 57, May Lopez
11 [phonetic]? Number 57? I feel like I'm at a
12 deli. Number 58, Kimberly David [phonetic]?

13 FEMALE VOICE 1: - - 208 is still here.
14 Hey...

15 MR. BETHAL: Kimberly David's from 208, so
16 I'm hoping she went home to get some sleep, come
17 back to school tomorrow. 59, Serena Williams?

18 [background noise]

19 MR. BETHAL: Miss Williams? No? You're
20 just walking up front, messing me up. That
21 makes you Sofia Angelori [phonetic]? Angelori.
22 All yours, your two minutes.

23 MS. SOFIA ANGELORI: Hi. I'm Sofia
24 Angelori, also known as Sofia - - and my
25 children actually go to PS163. The reason why

1 I'm here is because both of my children went
2 to PS185. My fifth grader went here, and I'm
3 going to tell you something--this school rocks.
4 Someone talked about how educating...

5 [applause]

6 MS. ANGELORI: They talked about how
7 educated the HSA teachers are, well, they ain't
8 got nothing on these teachers here. Most of the
9 teachers at PS185 have Master's degrees and
10 above, okay? That's number one.

11 [applause]

12 MS. ANGELORI: Okay, when my fifth grader
13 needed help, they, I mean, they turned her
14 around within 11 months from a level 1 to a
15 level 4. I'm not talking about statistics. I'm
16 talking about real life action. That's what
17 they did for her. Okay, so that's number one.
18 Number two, the only reason my other child isn't
19 going here is because the DOE took the GNT
20 [phonetic] program that was in here--they took
21 it out, so they gave me no choice but to put her
22 in a neither school, but if it wasn't for that
23 one thing, she would have still been here. This
24 is a small community. Everybody cares about
25 everybody else, and guess what? I have a choice

1 to put my kids wherever I want, the same way
2 they have a choice of going to Harlem Success, I
3 have a choice to put them in public school. So
4 I'm not impressed by HSA, because I think they
5 kind of play with the numbers, okay, and so
6 that's my opinion, but I don't think a
7 colocation's going to work because every place
8 HSA has went to, the people who were already
9 there experienced a negative impact, so that's
10 just my opinion. I think it's wrong. I think
11 it's going to be a problem. And here's my thing
12 to Miss Eva Moskowitz, which I think rocks--
13 whoever made that up. If you're going to do a
14 charter school, hey, why don't you think about
15 getting your own building? See what I mean?

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Miss Angelori. Next
18 is number 62, Julie Fanno [phonetic].

19 MS. JULIE FANNO: Hi, everybody. I'm Julie
20 Fanno. I'm from PS166 in District 3 and I just
21 want to let you know that District 3 supports
22 your public schools in this building and opposes
23 the colocation with Harlem Success. I also want
24 to say that our community really doesn't
25 appreciate the strong-arming tactics that Harlem

1 Success uses, including the sending out
2 thousands of these promotional brochures. I
3 just got this one today--I get one about once a
4 month, with my son's name on it. I actually
5 don't know how they got my son's name, but I
6 have a feeling that the hundreds of thousands of
7 dollars they spend to put those out could have
8 been used to buy buildings.

9 [applause]

10 MS. FANNO: I just wanted to say that when I
11 heard about the magnet grant and the creation of
12 the environmental school here, I was so
13 thrilled, because you know, the state of the
14 environment being what it is, we need to educate
15 a generation of leaders who are going to help
16 save the earth, and I know Symone Manning here
17 is very dedicated to that. She's a member of
18 our...

19 [applause]

20 MS. FANNO: I'm here to support Symone.
21 She's a member of the District 3 Green Schools
22 Group, which is a group of parent volunteers in
23 District 3 that is creating model green programs
24 that we can replicate across different
25 districts, and Symone is a member of our group,

1 so this school is very connected to the
2 District 3 community, and we all support you and
3 oppose the colocation. Thank you.

4 [applause]

5 MR. BETHAL: Number 61 was Iris Barbosa
6 [phonetic]. She let me know that she had to
7 leave early. Number 63 is Natasha Rodriguez
8 [phonetic]. Miss Rodriguez?

9 [applause]

10 MS. NATASHA RODRIGUEZ: Good afternoon. I
11 just wanted to say that we don't want--it
12 doesn't mean we don't want you here. We just
13 don't have the space. And it's just that we
14 don't have the space. It's not our fault. We
15 just don't have space, and I'm a former student
16 of PS2 and PS185, and the teachers, they just
17 care about their students. They don't want the
18 money. They just love children.

19 [background noise]

20 MS. RODRIGUEZ: And well, that's basically
21 it.

22 [applause]

23 MR. BETHAL: Nicely said. Number 64, looks
24 like Kupenda Smith [phonetic]?

25 FEMALE VOICE 1: Miss who?

1 MR. BETHAL: Number 64, Miss Smith?

2 MALE VOICE 1: No, she left already.

3 MR. BETHAL: She left already. - - All
4 home. Number 65, Brenda Serabia [phonetic]?
5 [applause]

6 MS. BRENDA SERABIA: My name is Brenda
7 Serabia. I'm a former student. I graduated
8 exactly six years ago, and I don't think--I
9 mean, you guys are talking about this
10 overcrowding and how they're going to take over,
11 but you're not thinking about how when they do
12 come over, do you want the children to study in
13 a place where it's overcrowded, where their
14 education doesn't really matter, where there's
15 going to be, like, 30 students in one classroom
16 and they're not going to pay attention? They're
17 not thinking about that. You're thinking about
18 the money and all of this and that. And this is
19 school is amazing, I mean, the teachers, the
20 principals, they, they care about you. Like, I
21 don't really think like, any other school would
22 care about you like any other person, so you
23 know, but you're not thinking about the
24 children, actually. I mean, think about it, you
25 know?

1 [applause]

2 MR. BETHAL: Thank you. Number 66 is Kena
3 Erby [phonetic]. We're in the home stretch,
4 folks.

5 MS. KENA ERBY: Good evening. I respect the
6 District 3. I'm a CEC member of district 13,
7 and I just want to let you know we all are in
8 this together. Even in Brooklyn, we're fighting
9 Eva tooth and nail as well. I have some
10 questions tonight that I'm, you know, a little
11 curious about that I have a notice here of an
12 announcement of a public hearing with no date on
13 it from SUNY. So my concern is, when was the
14 notice requirement the SUNY hearing sent to
15 parents of this school regarding the SUNY part
16 of this hearing, and what is the specific reason
17 for SUNY's hearing and what determination does
18 SUNY have to make tonight actually using this
19 hearing for your purposes? I guess what I am
20 asking is what school, what charter school law
21 and statute actually applies for this hearing?
22 If it's two or three sections of article 56, I
23 need to know. Thank you.

24 [applause]

25 MR. BETHAL: All right. That exhausts the

1 list we had. I just want to be clear about
2 two things: Noah Kaufman [phonetic] from the CEC
3 for the high schools is here, and we had a group
4 of students from 208 that missed the opportunity
5 to sign up but asked if they could speak and
6 promised to end on a high note, so Mr. Kaufman,
7 just know there are kids following you. There
8 are children following you.

9 [background noise]

10 MR. NOAH KAUFMAN: Good evening, council,
11 thank you, superintendent, thank you members of
12 the Board of Education, Department of Education,
13 and other guests, and the parents and the
14 children who are here. My name is Noah Kaufman.
15 I'm very proud to be appointed by the parents of
16 the city-wide council on special education to be
17 their representative on the city-wide council on
18 high schools. I've been a parent volunteer for
19 13 years. I'm a product of New York City public
20 schools, a proud graduate of PS145, District 3,
21 but I'm here as a parent speaking today and I
22 was going to give a little riff on the letter E
23 and how important the letter E is--the second
24 vowel, the fifth letter, it begins the word
25 education, which is why we're here. It begins

1 the word environment, which is so special in
2 the Alain Locke magnet program. It begins the
3 word everybody, which is so important when we're
4 talking about this current round of charter
5 push-ins and so called "colocations." We know
6 that charters, for whatever purpose they are, do
7 not serve everybody, and that's a real shame,
8 but then we can talk about E and we have an
9 educational impact statement, which everyone was
10 given, or was posted online today, and when you
11 try to read that educational impact statement,
12 you have a word which sounds like E but it's I--
13 it's incredulous. And you say, how does this
14 work, where you're talking about quarter-sized
15 classrooms? And if I were the division of
16 school facilities, I would be embarrassed, and
17 you notice on that EIS there's nobody that is
18 taking responsibility for this EIS that seems to
19 suggest you can put two more schools inside an
20 already crowded school. And we have been asking
21 the DOE, and we have been asking--I've been a
22 parent volunteer asking the Department of
23 Education to do actual, actual planning for our
24 school communities to keep the public in public
25 education and we get no answer and we get ideas

1 just like this where it says, oh, put more
2 children into a crowded school and actually it
3 will be better for them. And you say, you know,
4 E takes the word--it's very powerful even not at
5 the beginning, but also at the end, and it takes
6 sham and you put it at the end and it becomes
7 "shame" and I think that's something that the
8 DOE has to consider if they're going to be
9 responsible to our communities and to our
10 children. Thank you so much for your time.

11 [applause]

12 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Mr. Kaufman. We've
13 exhausted the list. Just because the kids are
14 still here, I don't know how but you're up later
15 than I should be, so Gioia [phonetic], Alimatu
16 [phonetic], David, Mamati [phonetic], Evan
17 [phonetic] and Kamea [phonetic] asked if they
18 could make a comment, and I'm trusting that
19 they'll make good use of their time. Thank you,
20 Mr. Kaufman.

21 MS. GIOIA GASKIN: My name is Gioia Gaskin,
22 and I'm a fourth grader at PS208, Alain L. Locke
23 Magnet School for Environment stewardship and
24 this school is a phenomenal school. Like, when
25 I come here every day I feel like I don't have

1 to worry about being bullied by somebody or
2 being judged by somebody and a lot of people in
3 this school want to go to college. They want to
4 go to Harvard. They want to be a lawyer, a
5 doctor, and dentists and dancers and singers--
6 they want to, like, be what they want to be, and
7 I know a lot of people want to be artists and
8 they want to read books and be like, the
9 President of the United States, and our class,
10 what are we going to do about our art class? So
11 you're going to demand for us to write in our
12 books and our classroom because we can't go to
13 art class, so we're going to do it ourselves and
14 learn how to draw by ourselves? And the
15 library--I love the library. We go in there, we
16 get to read books. I want to be a lawyer when I
17 grow up. I don't want to be somebody who stays
18 home all day because they didn't get the
19 education that they needed. I want to be
20 somebody who can go to some place and feel
21 powerful and let people know what's going on
22 around the world, - - what is going on. I want
23 to be somebody who can strive for greatness. -
24 - We strive for greatness and nothing less. We
25 don't care what people say. We want to be who

1 we want to be. We don't care about all these
2 other people in the school that wants to crowd
3 us in the second floor. We got other people
4 here. We bond together from different schools.
5 When you're--at one time you see someone from
6 Harlem Link walking by, you can be like, oh, hi,
7 how you doing? Because people go to the school
8 that you know personally, not that you just say
9 hi to them because they go to the school--it's
10 because you know them. We're like family.
11 Like, we could talk to somebody and pretend that
12 they're our best friend, and when we go home we
13 know that we can go to school the next day, have
14 a great day. You don't have to worry about
15 people saying that we're not striving for
16 greatness and nothing less. And I just want to
17 say Harlem Success, our teachers love us. Our
18 teachers just want to make sure--you all are
19 going to say, you all can go off to another
20 school. Our teachers love us and want us to do
21 the best we can, so I want to say I don't want
22 you all coming to second period. - - Go
23 somewhere else. Go to another school because
24 there are a bunch of people - -.

25 [applause]

1 MR. BETHAL: So we've got a few more to
2 go, but so far, so good. Thank you, Gioia. I
3 have no doubt you will be on your path to
4 college and to be a lawyer and I rue the day
5 when you're standing back in front of us
6 arguing. No question about it. Alimatu?

7 ALIMATU: Hello, my name is Alimatu - -.

8 [background noise]

9 ALIMATU: Alain L. Locke Magnet School for
10 Environmental Stewardship. I'm in the fifth
11 grade. This is my last year in the school and I
12 don't really want to get out this school because
13 I have a good time in this school.

14 MR. BETHAL: You've got to go to college
15 eventually.

16 ALIMATU: And we get to use iPads, and we
17 get to do stuff on the iPads, and that's a
18 special privilege, and some schools don't even
19 have that and we get to do ballroom dancing and
20 special activities.

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: Take your time, sweetie.

22 MR. BETHAL: You're doing fine. - -

23 ALIMATU: And this isn't going to happen to
24 other schools, just this school, and there's not
25 even any space for Harlem Success to come in

1 this school. If we have space, we would have
2 let you in, but we don't have no space. If you
3 had some space, we would have shared it with
4 you. We're not a mean school. We strive for
5 greatness and nothing less, so we're not being
6 mean. We want you in the school, but what if we
7 don't have no space? We don't have no space.
8 You could try another school that has space, but
9 we don't have no space.

10 [applause]

11 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Alimatu. Who's my
12 last student in line?

13 FEMALE VOICE 3: Hi, my name is - - and I
14 feel really sad because - - is that we don't
15 want, we don't want--we actually do want a
16 charter school to come in but we don't have no
17 space. It's not that we don't want to. It's
18 that we can't, because if we keep losing our
19 space then next year we might have no space and
20 some children might have to get out of the
21 school and we don't want that to happen and
22 maybe like, we won't have any space for the
23 fifth graders and I want to graduate next year.

24 MR. BETHAL: You will.

25 [applause]

1 MR. BETHAL: All right, we've got three
2 more to go.

3 EVAN: Hi, my name is Evan - - from PS208,
4 and I just want to say that Harlem Link and
5 other schools that's trying to come in our
6 school and they're saying that they don't have
7 space in our school, but when you come in then
8 what about us? We're not going to have space,
9 and then you're talking about how you're all not
10 going to have space, then we're not going to
11 have space and then all the fifth grades and
12 second graders are going to come on the third
13 floor, and I don't think that's right. You all
14 should find another school. We're not trying to
15 be mean and say you all can't come in, but we
16 don't have space for other kids.

17 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, Evan.

18 [applause]

19 MS. KAMEA DAVIS: My name is Kamea Davis
20 [phonetic] and I'm on - - like we probably, the
21 only school that gets to do all this stuff, like
22 just now we just got a new art teacher. If a
23 teacher hadn't come, we wouldn't have had art.
24 We're probably the first school that had
25 ballroom dancing. Everybody gets to do what

1 they want to do. Everybody has their own
2 subject, and if they come in our school that's
3 like taking half of the stuff. We want to learn
4 when we grow up. We want to be successful, too.

5 [applause]

6 MR. BETHAL: All right, our last two and
7 then we're done.

8 FEMALE VOICE 5: My name is - - I'm from
9 PS208.

10 [background noise]

11 FEMALE VOICE 5: And what I would like to
12 say is why are you trying to put another school
13 in if, if we don't have enough space? Yeah, if
14 we had the space, we would have shared. It's
15 not like we don't want to share. We have no
16 problem with sharing. If we had a problem with
17 sharing, why would there be other schools in
18 here?

19 [applause]

20 MR. BETHAL: Thank you, - -. David?

21 DAVID: Thank you. My name is David - - and
22 I'm from PS208, and there's something about this
23 school that I love. It's these teachers, these
24 people who make sure that we get a good
25 education, and especially the people who make

1 sure we do our homework such as our parents.
2 They all want us to succeed and go everywhere we
3 need to go, just like my cousin. My cousin - -
4 she came to this school I don't know how many
5 years ago but she came, and she succeeded, and
6 that's what I want to do. And then I have a
7 three year old cousin that's in ps185. They're
8 trying to take her, they're trying--this school,
9 Harlem Success Academy, I don't think they
10 belong here. They're like a disease right here
11 - - and plus like I say to that - - and make
12 your decision right and you need to wake up and
13 smell the coffee.

14 [applause]

15 DAVID: And the education we ought to have.

16 [applause]

17 MR. BETHAL: So... I get a little
18 flexibility as facilitator and every once in a
19 while we get it right. Thank you, kids. We've
20 all got a lot to learn from you. My script says
21 that the speaker list is now exhausted. I am
22 equally sure that I am exhausted. I'm sure you
23 are as well. We now begin the question and
24 answer period. We got a handful of questions
25 that were submitted on cards. There were a

1 number of very direct questions that were put
2 to us by the dais, and I will do my best to
3 answer them now. I am certain that that will
4 raise additional questions and folks will be
5 able to follow up following the hearing. So we
6 tried to group some of the individual questions
7 and others into categories that are
8 representative of the questions that are asked.
9 All the questions raised here tonight will be
10 answered in the analysis of public comment. If
11 you have additional questions at the conclusion
12 and the end of tonight's proceedings, we ask
13 that you direct them to us via phone at (212)
14 374-3466 or email at
15 d03proposals@schools.nyc.gov and that's at the
16 bottom of the sheets. So with that...

17 MR. GOTBAUM: So the questions that I had
18 orally asked--

19 MR. BETHAL: I've got your question. I'm
20 going to do my best, folks. All right. So one
21 of the questions I was asked a number of times
22 is how will this proposal impact the magnet
23 grants of PS185 and PS208? As I said before we
24 do not believe this proposal will impact the
25 magnet grant in place at these schools, which

1 aim to increase diversity. Both schools also
2 already have large out-of-zone populations,
3 about 50%, and will continue to enroll out-of-
4 zone students to increase diversity through the
5 magnet application. Further, under this
6 proposal, both schools are expected to enroll
7 one additional class section next year and can
8 therefore grow their enrollments. Currently
9 PS185 has eight general ed ICT sections total,
10 as well as three pre-K sections for a total of
11 11 sections and is projected to enroll 12
12 sections next year. PS208 has eight general
13 education ICT sections and is projected to
14 enroll a total of 9 next year.

15 MR. GOTBAUM: What are the numbers, Greg?

16 MR. BETHAL: Again--

17 MR. GOTBAUM: Of those sections, how many
18 kids?

19 MR. BETHAL: I'll bring up the numbers in
20 just a second. I just need to pull them up from
21 somewhere else. Thank you. To be clear--and
22 let me just pull up another sheet as I've got a
23 whole bunch of stuff here anticipating that we
24 were going to get all of these good questions.
25 The magnet grants that folks have talked so much

1 about--there are six main objectives of all
2 of the federal magnet grants. The first is
3 voluntary desegregation, elimination, reduction
4 or prevention of minority group isolation. The
5 second is providing all students the opportunity
6 to meet challenging standards. The third is
7 innovative methods, largely through the themes
8 promoting diversity and choice. The fourth is
9 academic knowledge and tangible marketable
10 skills, which is consistent with the district's
11 larger goals of college and career readiness for
12 all of our students. The fifth, we heard about
13 the role of teachers in the building--it is
14 capacity building and professional development
15 to support the long-term sustainability of the
16 magnet programs. And the sixth, as a number of
17 folks have spoken to, is the idea of equitable
18 access. A number of people have said very
19 clearly that we are jeopardizing the magnet
20 program. We are not. We have a responsibility
21 to report each year what the projections are for
22 enrollment. They are not quotas. We have a
23 series of projections that Mr. Gotbaum was
24 correct, are included in the original proposal,
25 and those projections were made two years ago in

1 consultation with the school principals, the
2 superintendent, and the office of enrollment.
3 They were just that--projections, not quotas.
4 Each of the first two years of the grant, the
5 magnets on this campus did not meet their
6 projections. And as we do with any grant, we
7 tried to understand why, we got on the phone
8 with our magnet coordinators at the US
9 Department of Education, the grant coordinators
10 in my office that manage the magnet programs
11 across the city advocate for both the integrity
12 of the magnets, adherence to the rules, and
13 open-minded communication with the US Department
14 of Education, which is simultaneously asking us
15 to improve schools in the aggregate and meet the
16 diversity targets of the goals. So it is a
17 concern and something we need to pay attention
18 to--absolutely. If we thought for a second that
19 we would be jeopardizing the magnet grant
20 dollars, again, the \$11.2 million associated
21 with those grants, we would not be doing this,
22 and at the end of the day, I do know who's
23 accountable if it turns out we're wrong, and
24 that's me.

25 MS. ANNECHINO: Greg, just a point of

1 information--we just finished year one of the
2 magnet grant, isn't that correct?

3 MR. BETHAL: I'm sorry. I was saying those
4 projections were made two years ago in the
5 planning that was talked about by Gail Brewer
6 and by others. It was year one that the
7 projections were not met. We communicated with
8 the US Department of Education and the office of
9 civil rights. They understood why--there were a
10 number things around startup, a number of things
11 in the first year of the grant, and with that
12 rationale and the continued commitment to the
13 diversity targets, there were no changes that
14 were made moving forward to the financing or
15 anything else. We have an obligation to
16 communicate regularly and clearly with the US
17 Department of Education, directing my staff
18 following this hearing to make sure that we're
19 in communication with the Department of
20 Education tomorrow to share with them both the
21 concerns that were raised here as well as our
22 commitments to maintain the integrity of the
23 grant, and the opportunity for those grants to
24 continue to thrive.

25 MS. FRYE: Thank you. What was the name of

1 the grant coordinator?

2 MR. BETHAL: What was the name of the--

3 MS. FRYE: What was the name of the grants
4 coordinator at US Department of Ed?

5 MR. BETHAL: There's a number of different
6 grand coordinators. I believe the name is Ty
7 Harris if I'm getting right. I don't know...

8 MS. FRYE: And who do you communicate with
9 about this grant?

10 MR. BETHAL: I communicate with the folks on
11 my staff--Lenny Leiber [phonetic] who has worked
12 with a number of folks in the building to
13 support professional development and the theme
14 development, and they are tasked with managing
15 the grant, advocating both internal to the
16 Department of Education, as well as working with
17 the US Department of Education as we do on a
18 whole wide range of grants to make sure we're
19 both serving the needs of our local schools and
20 meeting the obligations we have. It's not
21 something we take lightly. There was a
22 relocation of a magnet grant last year. We were
23 in active communication with the US Department
24 of Education. They understood what was
25 happening, what the impact would be, and there

1 was no change in the funding level there.
2 With some of the phase outs that we have in
3 other districts this year have magnets that are
4 associated with them, and in those cases we're
5 proactively engaging to make sure that we are
6 not jeopardizing the ability of those magnet
7 supports.

8 MS. FRYE: - - Did they approve the - -?

9 MR. BETHAL: Do they approve this proposal?

10 MS. FRYE: Yes.

11 MR. GOTBAUM: Are they aware of the
12 discrepancy between the 272 target and the 180
13 to 210 kid--

14 MR. BETHAL: They were made aware of it last
15 year when the target was not reached, and in the
16 same timeline that we did last year--

17 MR. GOTBAUM: No, I'm asking--

18 MR. BETHAL: Let me finish my comment. I've
19 heard your question. It's easy to try and pin
20 me down on a narrow thing. It doesn't provide
21 context so people can get what they want. What
22 I'm saying is last year the US Department of
23 Education was notified about not meeting
24 projections and how we were approaching that.
25 This year, as I just said, we will be contact

1 with the Department of Education tomorrow
2 after we've had the public hearing and had the
3 input. It would have been disingenuous of me to
4 call them up and say "Yes, we've done all this
5 already, it's decided, the public is on board
6 with it." That's why we have public hearings.
7 If they have any problems with it, that one
8 form--

9 FEMALE VOICE 1: It's a smokescreen. - -
10 It's a smokescreen.

11 MR. BETHAL: Ma'am, you're entitled to your
12 opinion, and it's my job to come here and tell
13 you what I know and try to be as candid and fair
14 as I know how to be.

15 MR. GOTBAUM: Just for clarity--so you're
16 saying, I mean, the EIS is a legal document.

17 MR. BETHAL: Mm-hmm.

18 MR. GOTBAUM: Okay. Obviously impasse--it's
19 part of a process, a legislative process.

20 MR. BETHAL: It's not part of a legislative
21 process. It's mandated by the legislature based
22 on the changes in mayoral control.

23 MR. GOTBAUM: Mandated--it's in the law that
24 you require an EIS, and what you're saying is
25 that the government, federal government, behind

1 this grant does not know at this point in
2 time--

3 MR. BETHAL: What I'm saying you know is I
4 can't speak for what the US government does and
5 does not know. They track regularly. What I'm
6 telling you is what my office has and has not
7 done at this point, and how we're proceeding. I
8 understand the question you're asking. Is it
9 possible the US government is monitoring, as
10 they do any number of things, the educational
11 impact statements that are posted online? They
12 do at the state Department of Education and a
13 range of other things, and it's our obligation
14 to inform them before a decision is made and we
15 intend to do that, and if there is feedback from
16 them and they have concern--we don't believe
17 there is because there is no intent to impact
18 the grant here based on the way we're
19 progressing. There's room for the grant to
20 continue to grow. This is a one year relocation
21 for this building as it's proposed, and any
22 other considerations moving forward are going to
23 need to go through a similar public process
24 before anything else is considered, and so I am
25 saying right now as a Department of Education

1 official whose office is responsible for the
2 magnet grants, that we have every belief that we
3 are in compliance with the grant, will continue
4 to be in compliance with the grant, will meet
5 our requirements for notification to the US
6 Department of Education and we'll continue to
7 support as we have in the first year and in the
8 planning the execution of the magnet grant that
9 so many of the kids and teachers and parents
10 that spoke eloquently tonight talked about being
11 valuable to the set of choices that they have.

12 MR. GOTBAUM: So, Mr. Bethal--

13 MR. BETHAL: And I don't want to make this a
14 back and forth. A number of people have
15 submitted questions that I want to make sure
16 they're fair and try and get through that. If
17 folks have additional questions, as I said,
18 based on--

19 MALE VOICE 1: - - Question.

20 MR. BETHAL: If it's the same question that
21 I just answer, like I just said--

22 MALE VOICE 1: No, no, no, it's not. It's
23 not equitable colocation. That's the
24 difference.

25 MR. BETHAL: Okay.

1 MALE VOICE 1: How is the colocation
2 equitable?

3 MR. BETHAL: Okay, let me get through the
4 questions that I have here. I'll be happy to
5 continue to answer them. I'm trying to do that--
6 -

7 MALE VOICE 1: - - Wrote it down, though.

8 MR. BETHAL: What's that?

9 MALE VOICE 1: You said you wrote that
10 question down.

11 MR. BETHAL: I said you wrote that question
12 down?

13 MALE VOICE 1: No, you said you wrote it
14 down.

15 MR. BETHAL: I--

16 MALE VOICE 1: I asked you orally--

17 MR. BETHAL: Sir, if you'd like my job
18 there's an application process online for the
19 Department of Education. Right now I'm going to
20 try and--

21 MALE VOICE 1: Can I have it now?

22 MR. BETHAL: The next question--you're
23 welcome to it.

24 MALE VOICE 1: Okay.

25 MR. BETHAL: The next question was is there

1 space for these schools' fifth grades in
2 their current buildings? Neither M30 nor M101
3 where these schools currently house their
4 kindergarten through fourth grades have space
5 for the fifth grades.

6 MALE VOICE 1: Why not?

7 FEMALE VOICE 1: People got \$500,000.

8 MALE VOICE 1: Where's the planning in
9 District 3 we've been asking for all this - -?

10 MR. BETHAL: The other buildings with space
11 in those districts don't have enough excess
12 rooms to serve these combined fifth grades.
13 Serving each fifth grade separately would be
14 inefficient; it would not provide a strong
15 educational experience for the students. One of
16 the questions that was raised by folks here
17 today, I believe it was raised by Mr. Gotbaum
18 earlier, is what about the 12 buildings on the
19 under-utilized list in Districts 4 and 5? And
20 let me address them in turn: In District 4, at
21 M117, Esperanza Preparatory Academy is expanding
22 to a high school. At M45, Leadership Village
23 Academy is a new elementary school in that
24 space.

25 MR. GOTBAUM: I'm sorry, but I need to

1 interrupt you because you're not answering
2 the question.

3 [background noise]

4 MR. GOTBAUM: I'm not trying to catch you,
5 but--

6 MR. BETHAL: If you'd let me--I haven't--

7 MR. GOTBAUM: Do they have the spaces next
8 year? Do they have enough capacity next year?

9 MR. BETHAL: So let me answer the question:
10 The question is, do they have enough capacity
11 next year?

12 MR. GOTBAUM: Yes.

13 MR. BETHAL: No.

14 MR. GOTBAUM: 'Cause according to blue book--
15 --the blue book number's wrong?

16 MR. BETHAL: The blue book number is based
17 on 2010-2011, and what I was going through was
18 the set of plans for those buildings that are
19 occupying the space that you looked at that is
20 now slightly out of date because we are
21 continuing to plan.

22 MR. GOTBAUM: The blue book numbers are not
23 correct?

24 MR. BETHAL: The blue books numbers are not
25 up to date as of this moment, and it's

1 explained, I believe, in the EIS, and let me
2 go to that to make sure that I'm not saying
3 anything that's incorrect. But hold on, your
4 question was about the blue book. If we'd like
5 to cycle question after question after question
6 and not answer them, we can play that game and
7 we can post it online. You asked whether or not
8 the numbers in the blue book were correct--did I
9 hear you wrong?

10 MR. GOTBAUM: And I also asked--sorry, I
11 also asked not what the plans are going forward,
12 but whether or not there is capacity in any
13 building in District 4 or District 5 for next
14 year, because this is a one year temporary
15 colocation that could house 150 kids. Is there
16 a single building in District 4 or District 5 -
17 - I want to know numbers, space. That's all--
18 temporary colocation.

19 MR. BETHAL: That's all you're asking--you
20 have no other questions, we're not going to
21 amend it, we're not going to add anything else
22 to it? I want to figure out which question I'm
23 asking and try to be fair to folks here.

24 MR. GOTBAUM: Blue book and the numbers--

25 MR. BETHAL: Okay, so let me start with the

1 blue book. Let me start with the blue book.

2 MR. GOTBAUM: Thank you.

3 MR. BETHAL: As described in more detail in
4 the blue book itself which is available online
5 at the New York City SDA, a building's target
6 utilization rate is calculated by dividing the
7 aggregate enrollment of all the school
8 organizations in the building by the aggregated
9 target capacities of those organizations. Each
10 school's organization's target capacity is
11 calculated based upon scheduled use of
12 individual rooms as reported by the principals
13 during an annual facility survey. The DOE
14 standards for maximum classroom capacities which
15 are lower than the United Federation of
16 Teachers' contractual class sizes and differ
17 depending on grade level, and the efficiency
18 with which classes are programmed, for example
19 the frequency with which classes are scheduled
20 at any given classroom. To your question
21 directly--

22 MR. GOTBAUM: Please.

23 MR. BETHAL: The most recent year for which
24 target capacity has been calculated for
25 buildings is 2010-2011. The DOE's estimated

1 utilization rates for the 2011-2012 school
2 year and beyond are based on the 2010-2011
3 target capacity, which assumes that the
4 components underlying the target capacity--
5 again, the schedule of classrooms, maximum
6 classroom capacity, etcetera--remain constant.
7 Thus estimated utilization rates for the 2011-
8 2012 school year and beyond provide only an
9 approximation of the building's usage because
10 each of the factors underlying target capacity
11 may be adjusted by the principals from year to
12 year to better accommodate students' needs. For
13 example, as we heard tonight--

14 MR. GOTBAUM: I have a simple question. I
15 understand--you're explaining the blue book,
16 but--

17 MR. BETHAL: You asked me to explain the
18 blue book. So if you understood how the blue
19 book worked, why did you ask me to explain it?
20 I'm not--excuse me, can you take your seat?
21 I'll take your questions. Folks, we're about 40
22 seconds away from meeting our mandatory
23 obligation by posting our responses to the
24 questions online. I'm willing to stay here and
25 try and answer the questions. There's a whole

1 bunch that were submitted. But I'm not going
2 to allow this to get out of control because it
3 doesn't serve anybody that's still here trying
4 to get answers.

5 [background noise]

6 MR. BETHAL: Excuse me?

7 MALE VOICE 1: You're sugarcoating.

8 MR. BETHAL: I'm not trying to sugarcoat
9 anything. I'm trying to answer the question
10 directly.

11 MALE VOICE 1: He asked you one simple
12 question.

13 MR. BETHAL: He asked me six complicated
14 questions.

15 MALE VOICE 1: Sir, hold on. Two questions--
16 --let me get mine, because you were very rude to
17 that gentleman--

18 MR. BETHAL: Sir--

19 MALE VOICE 1: Sir--

20 MR. BETHAL: Sir, let me be clear, it is not
21 a back and forth right now. There was a
22 process. Sir--

23 MALE VOICE 1: He just asked you one simple
24 question.

25 MR. BETHAL: Ladies and gentlemen, I have

1 enjoyed this joint public hearing. And I'm
2 going to give--

3 MS. ANNECHINO: But we're still here.

4 MR. BETHAL: And I'm going to give--excuse
5 me?

6 MS. ANNECHINO: We're still here. - -

7 [crosstalk]

8 MR. BETHAL: Excuse me, Miss Dempsey
9 [phonetic]. It isn't--

10 MALE VOICE 1: Yeah, so you can still
11 conduct it.

12 MR. BETHAL: Excuse me... I want to be very
13 clear. I'm happy to try and answer the
14 questions.

15 FEMALE VOICE 1: No you're not.

16 [background noise]

17 MR. BETHAL: There were a couple of
18 questions that were submitted by kids. I'll
19 move to those, and then we'll see how they--

20 MR. GOTBAUM: Why are you not answering our
21 questions?

22 MR. BETHAL: Because I'm trying to answer
23 the question and nobody's letting me, so I'll
24 come back to them--

25 MS. GOODRIDGE: No, we want the exact

1 answer. We don't want - -.

2 MR. BETHAL: The answer is no, that space is
3 assigned to other uses, and your read of the
4 blue book is out of date based on updates to the
5 utilization. That is the direct answer to your
6 question, Mr. Gotbaum.

7 MR. GOTBAUM: That is not my--I want to ask
8 a specific question. Sorry--no--

9 MR. BETHAL: You asked me whether there was
10 space in District 12 for these schools next
11 year.

12 MR. GOTBAUM: No, I asked you if there are--
13 not based on future planning, but actual seats,
14 okay? Not that it is assigned in the future. I
15 understand that.

16 MR. BETHAL: No, it's assigned now.

17 MR. GOTBAUM: Okay, so you don't have 150
18 seats right now in any of those buildings in
19 District 4 or District 5? Please tell me.
20 That's all we want to know--not that it's going
21 to be tied up in the future, not that you have
22 plans for it. Do you have the seats?

23 FEMALE VOICE 1: Okay, so let me do this,
24 come back...

25 MR. BETHAL: There are no buildings in

1 Districts 4 or 5 that have enough rooms. The
2 12 buildings that you have identified I was
3 trying to go through the list to tell you
4 exactly what the planned use is and you
5 interrupted me and said that's not what you
6 want. Would you like me to go through the list?
7 The answer to your question is no, there is not
8 space, because there are uses for those spaces
9 planned. If that's not an answer you're
10 satisfied with--

11 MR. GOTBAUM: Next year. Are those uses--

12 MALE VOICE 1: For 2012, 2013?

13 MR. BETHAL: For the upcoming school year is
14 what I am talking about.

15 [background noise]

16 MR. GOTBAUM: So you don't have the seats?

17 MR. BETHAL: Not at M117, not at 45, not at
18 50. At M146 there may be space, but because
19 another D4 site of the district 75 school in the
20 building is relocating to District 2, the
21 program may be required to serve additional
22 sections at M146 as of next year. If that were
23 to be the case, there would not be sufficient
24 space for footprint for HSA2 and 3's fifth
25 grades.

1 MALE VOICE 1: What about--

2 MR. BETHAL: I'm not going to make it a back
3 and forth.

4 MALE VOICE 1: Okay. I was just going to
5 ask--

6 MR. BETHAL: I've tried to be respectful
7 this evening, and you are not in a position to
8 ask me. I am trying to follow the process. If
9 you have a question, put it on a card. If you
10 can't abide by the rules that everybody else
11 here is abiding by, I will ask you to leave.

12 MALE VOICE 1: Oh, so you're just going to
13 like single me out now, right?

14 MR. BETHAL: You're the only one talking to
15 me right now, sir.

16 MALE VOICE 1: I'll go outside? Okay.

17 FEMALE VOICE 1: I thought this was a public
18 meeting.

19 MS. ANNECHINO: - -

20 [crosstalk]

21 MR. BETHAL: I am trying to respect the
22 public that's here that is trying to get
23 answers. In district--in 155, the relocation of
24 M337 will utilize the excess space. In District
25 5, at M30, which is the current site of HSA2,

1 incorrect enrollment information in the blue
2 book is what led to that concern. Actual HSA2
3 enrollment was higher than indicated. HSA2 was
4 also only K-3 in 2010-2011, and as such the blue
5 book doesn't account for the fourth grade. At
6 M43 and M172 the Office of Space Planning
7 assesses the space in a given building. Per
8 their assessment, this campus is not an
9 appropriate site. It underwent master planning
10 as designed to accommodate a specific number of
11 organizations. At M46, not enough per
12 footprint, it's geographically far from the
13 current HSA2 and 3 sites. It is difficult to
14 access. M130--I'm trying. You asked me to
15 answer a question. I'm trying to answer it.

16 MR. GOTBAUM: There are buildings--that
17 building right there, it's right there. My
18 question: That building is in District 4 or
19 District 5?

20 MR. BETHAL: 5.

21 MR. GOTBAUM: Okay. Does it have enough
22 seats to fit 150 kids?

23 MR. BETHAL: Not enough space per footprint.

24 MALE VOICE 1: But too far.

25 MR. GOTBAUM: Sorry--you just said too far

1 from the other schools?

2 MR. BETHAL: I'm sorry, I was reading the
3 next question. Hold on--I can admit it when I
4 make a mistake.

5 MR. GOTBAUM: Please.

6 MR. BETHAL: M43, right? The way the
7 process works, they underwent master planning
8 that's conducted by the Office of Space Planning
9 to assess the space in the given building. Per
10 their assessment, this campus is not an
11 appropriate site. It underwent master planning;
12 it's designed to accommodate a specific number
13 of organizations.

14 MR. GOTBAUM: So that one is determined by
15 number of organizations, not by--

16 MR. BETHAL: That is determined by the
17 master planning that happened at the site, part
18 of which is the number of organizations in the
19 building. There are other considerations as
20 well.

21 MR. GOTBAUM: So it could have, it could be
22 by the other, by the standard of the proceeding
23 so all over everywhere else, so it could be, but
24 the planning process in that school--

25 MR. BETHAL: The planning department has

1 made a determination that it's not. That you
2 believe it could be is an opinion you're
3 entitled to, and I would encourage you to
4 consult the master plan. The master plan has
5 determined that it's not.

6 MR. GOTBAUM: All right, keep going. All
7 right, the next one, the one that's too far
8 away.

9 MR. BETHAL: The next one is M46, the one
10 that did not have enough rooms per footprint and
11 was geographically far from the current HSA2 and
12 3 sites so it would be difficult to access, and--
13 -

14 MR. GOTBAUM: Stop. Does not have enough
15 rooms per footprint--what does that mean?

16 MALE VOICE 1: Right.

17 MR. BETHAL: It means that there's a minimum
18 space footprint that the department uses to
19 determine how many classrooms, and there are not
20 enough classrooms to meet the minimum
21 requirements to siphon them.

22 MALE VOICE 1: And it's too far, right?

23 MR. BETHAL: And it's too far, but the
24 question was about the footprint.

25 MR. GOTBAUM: But is it the same--

1 MALE VOICE 1: What about this site--did
2 they assess this site as having--

3 MR. BETHAL: We did. As I said before, the
4 earlier piece, one was assessed to be 1.2 miles
5 away, and one was assessed to be 0.5 miles away.

6 MALE VOICE 1: But I'm talking about in
7 terms of space.

8 MR. BETHAL: Distance and space would be two
9 different things. Not trying to complicate
10 them--I understand that.

11 MR. GOTBAUM: So let me understand--so M46,
12 you're saying--

13 MR. BETHAL: Does not have enough rooms per
14 footprint. And M133, there is also not enough
15 space per footprint, even with the teacher's
16 college community school being re-sited, a new
17 program is being sited there and that's ASC
18 Verizon which will be put into the excess space
19 you may have seen in the blue book. MS200 and
20 M10 which is also tandem, there is space but
21 geographically far from the current HSA2 and 3
22 sites and difficult to access, and M501 which is
23 the Promise--I've only got one more, and then--
24 M501 is Promise Academy 1 temporary siting, and
25 Promise Academy 2 temporary expansion.

1 MR. GOTBAUM: So you just mentioned a
2 building that in those districts that have
3 enough space. Is that correct?

4 MR. BETHAL: But are geographically far from
5 current HSA2 and 3 sites that are difficult to
6 access.

7 MR. GOTBAUM: So to inconvenience HSA2--

8 MALE VOICE 1: Yeah, what's the difference
9 between where they are now?

10 MR. GOTBAUM: Okay, so the answer is there
11 is capacity in some District 4 and District 5
12 schools but they're too far for the HSA kids to
13 go to?

14 MR. BETHAL: In saying that it's
15 geographically far, I think your assessment
16 would be correct.

17 MALE VOICE 1: But where are they located
18 now?

19 MR. BETHAL: I said the determination was
20 made that it would be too far and difficult to
21 access; you're saying that it would make it
22 difficult for the kids to get there. I'm saying
23 I believe we're saying the same thing. We may
24 disagree about the implications of it, but I
25 believe we're assessing that condition in the

1 same way.

2 MR. GOTBAUM: The answer to my question is,
3 if in those districts, there are buildings that
4 have ample capacity, - -

5 MR. BETHAL: There were two that I gave
6 those examples of where the determination was
7 that they were too far, that is correct.

8 MS. MANNING: - - For one year and travel?
9 We have families that come from Brooklyn, the
10 Bronx--they travel. Get a Metro card.

11 [crosstalk]

12 MR. BETHAL: A question that a number of
13 folks asked was why didn't you come out to the
14 building council? The office of space planning
15 portfolio spoke with the building principals
16 before the proposal came out and offered to
17 meet. It did meet with Principals Green and
18 Murphy and got their input. It also spoke with
19 Principal Evangelista and amended based on that.
20 Which is--there--

21 MS. MANNING: That's not the council. Those
22 are members of the council. You're supposed to
23 present to the whole council. What's the point
24 of having a building commission if people are
25 just going to present to the principals?

1 FEMALE VOICE 1: And what about the space
2 sharing?

3 MALE VOICE 1: Yeah, 'cause - -.

4 MR. BETHAL: The offer was made at the time
5 and they were not invited to do that. If you're
6 saying that the meeting was not with the
7 building council, nobody is contesting that.
8 There were a set of circumstances that led to
9 that, but nobody is contesting that.

10 [background noise]

11 MR. BETHAL: Yes, they met with them before
12 the proposal, there were adjustments that were
13 made, and there was not an invitation to meet
14 with the council.

15 MALE VOICE 3: The space sharing committee
16 or the council?

17 MR. BETHAL: Would you pay to put up the
18 dividers was a question that was asked before.
19 The office of space planning will work with the
20 schools to identify which space will change
21 hands and support the schools with any necessary
22 middle men. Additionally, the charter schools
23 spend upwards of \$5000 on facilities upgrades.
24 Each collocated public school, district school
25 should receive necessary matching funds to

1 upgrade their own facilities. So the
2 question was what if they're doing things on the
3 charter side, is there support for the district
4 school to make the same upgrades? I believe the
5 references were made--

6 MALE VOICE 3: No, it's very different. A
7 very different question--how is it equitable--

8 MR. BETHAL: The answer was about equity.
9 If the charter school spends upwards of \$5000 on
10 facilities upgrades, each of the collocated
11 district schools would receive matching funds to
12 upgrade their own facilities.

13 MALE VOICE 3: No, my question was, how is
14 it equitable for the school--

15 MR. BETHAL: Equitable for me would mean one
16 school gets it and the other school gets the
17 same opportunity, and that's what the state - -
18 that we need to do, the same - - that you were
19 referencing a few minutes ago.

20 MALE VOICE 3: How is it equitable that they
21 come here--how is it--

22 MR. BETHAL: That's not the question that
23 was asked on the sheet.

24 MALE VOICE 3: That's the question that I
25 asked. I asked you, how is equitable for the

1 public school...

2 MR. BETHAL: All right, the question that I
3 read, and unless I'm missing it here, doesn't
4 read "how is it equitable for the public
5 schools?"

6 MALE VOICE 3: Yeah.

7 MR. BETHAL: It asks would you pay to put up
8 dividers?

9 MALE VOICE 3: How is this colocation
10 equitable to the public schools?

11 MR. BETHAL: I didn't say who asked the
12 question. I just said I'm trying to answer
13 them. I didn't say it was his question--he did.

14 MALE VOICE 3: How is this colocation
15 equitable to the public schools?

16 MR. BETHAL: I didn't get to your question.

17 MALE VOICE 3: But you tried to infer that
18 that was my question.

19 MR. BETHAL: I didn't try to infer anything
20 at all. I made a suggestion that you were
21 referring to the state law that required
22 equitable investments in the school, if one is
23 upgraded and not the other--

24 MALE VOICE 3: Yeah, that's not the
25 question.

1 MR. BETHAL: And that's what I was
2 answering to relative to what the moneys would
3 be to divide. They may very well be different
4 questions. This one was asked, and now
5 answered.

6 FEMALE VOICE 1: Is that money in a holding,
7 like, under capital funds, because where would
8 the money come from?

9 MR. BETHAL: I believe it comes from SA; I'm
10 not sure. We can follow up to get that answer
11 and post it online.

12 MALE VOICE 3: It's not necessarily a money
13 thing--it's the space. By creating a smaller
14 space and still having the amount of kids that
15 you have--

16 MR. BETHAL: And then let me do this: is
17 there a consideration of the two schools? And
18 the two schools will continue to exist as
19 separate schools with separate district borough
20 numbers, the DBNs that we use to code them but
21 will be served under one administration. That
22 was the question before about whether or not
23 they're being consolidated, they're still being-
24 -

25 MALE VOICE 3: So they're going to merge?

1 MR. BETHAL: The schools will continue to
2 exist as separate schools with separate DBNs,
3 but will be served under one administration for
4 that one year.

5 MALE VOICE 3: So it's not consolidated?

6 MR. BETHAL: The two schools will continue
7 to exist as separate schools with separate DBNs.

8 MALE VOICE 3: Okay.

9 MR. BETHAL: And then again, the question
10 was asked whether or not this threatens the
11 magnet grant and I hope I've been as clear as I
12 can about that.

13 MS. ANNECHINO: Greg, I was looking at
14 Julius when you answered the question. I'm
15 sorry.

16 MR. BETHAL: I'm sorry.

17 MS. ANNECHINO: - - But what was the - -
18 schools with the one answer?

19 MR. BETHAL: The answer is the schools will
20 continue to exist as separate schools with
21 separate district borough numbers but will be
22 served under one administration.

23 MS. ANNECHINO: How does that work?

24 MALE VOICE 3: Yeah, how does that work?
25 The question is where does that fit in the

1 charter school law?

2 MR. BETHAL: Sir, that's a question you're
3 welcome to submit and we'll be answering it
4 online. I don't want to pretend--

5 MALE VOICE 3: - -

6 MR. BETHAL: Let me be clear: I'm here
7 representing the Department of Education. I am
8 not - - with every aspect of the charter school
9 law. You have a right to have your question
10 answered. That's why we provide a phone number
11 and an email address and have a responsibility
12 to answer those questions. I would encourage
13 you tonight either going home or tomorrow to
14 either email the office at
15 d03proposals@schools.nyc.gov or call the phone
16 number that was at the bottom of the sheet. I'm
17 not trying to judge it--just not something I'm
18 individually comfortable answering. As a
19 department, we have a responsibility to respond
20 to. This is a set of questions that were
21 submitted to me--maybe there's a couple
22 questions about other buildings--

23 MR. GOTBAUM: The Catholic school.

24 MR. BETHAL: I don't know about the Catholic
25 school, particularly there was one that was

1 asked earlier. I don't remember the number
2 offhand.

3 MS. ANNECHINO: It was the building on 117th
4 street.

5 MR. BETHAL: It was a building on 117th
6 street; it may be the same building. - - It was
7 sold already and was not available to us in the
8 portfolio.

9 MR. GOTBAUM: - - Catholic schools

10 MR. BETHAL: I can't speak to the Catholic
11 schools. You'll have to speak to the arch
12 diocese.

13 [crosstalk]

14 MR. BETHAL: Hold on one second. I'm trying
15 to be fair to everybody here. I'm just going
16 back to the notes that I had earlier. - -

17 MALE VOICE 3: - -

18 MR. BETHAL: I'll get to equitable--how is
19 it equitable to the schools?

20 MALE VOICE 3: How is it equitable for the
21 public schools in this building?

22 MR. BETHAL: Let me be clear: Both district
23 schools and charter schools are both public
24 schools paid for with public dollars.

25 MALE VOICE 3: - -

1 MR. BETHAL: Sir, again, we can take the
2 conversation offline, you can submit it in. We
3 have an obligation to serve all students
4 equitably, that have rights as public school
5 students, which all of your children, students
6 of the teachers that are here at the charter
7 school, at the district school, they are all
8 considered public schools. Some are authorized
9 by the State University, some by the Board of
10 Regents, some were originally authorized by the
11 Department of Education. There were changes in
12 those rules. But we have an obligation to make
13 sure all kids are served, and I think the best
14 of the comments this evening, this is my own
15 personal opinion, suggested that it would be a
16 mistake to pit kids against kids or schools
17 against schools and make sure that we're all
18 advocating to make sure that every kid had an
19 opportunity to get the education they deserve
20 and that too often many have not gotten or had
21 access to. There is any definition of equity,
22 to me it is that every kid has access to a
23 quality choice that is going to meet their needs
24 and is supported and has the opportunity to
25 fulfill exactly the kind of ambitions that I

1 think our last two student speakers spoke to
2 so well.

3 MR. GOTBAUM: Greg, there was a question
4 about--this is a temporary colocation. Where
5 will those fifth grade classes go--

6 FEMALE VOICE 1: I'm next.

7 MALE VOICE 3: - -

8 MR. BETHAL: I'm sorry, I can only do one at
9 a time. I really--

10 MALE VOICE 3: It's space. You can't build
11 a plane in a private house, but in a hangar you
12 can. It's the issue of space.

13 MR. BETHAL: I've got a couple of prepared
14 things I'll go through them and let me know if -
15 - we'll have the question about one year and
16 what happens then.

17 MR. GOTBAUM: - - Those kids?

18 MR. BETHAL: It's a fair question. If it's
19 only one year proposal, why not put it in space
20 not yet occupied by the schools phasing in is a
21 dimension of it--because of the schools phasing
22 in, they amount of space available is less than
23 the baseline footprint for those two schools'
24 fifth grades and was not reflected in the blue
25 book. What happens to these grades next year--

1 the DOE is exploring all possible long-term
2 sites for these schools. Any future siting of
3 these grades whether in 185 and 208 or any other
4 building requires us to propose a new EIS and go
5 through the same process, so those plans have
6 not been finalized yet, they've not been
7 proposed, and that is work we have to do, and
8 obviously given the sentiment here this evening,
9 it's work we need to begin in earnest.

10 MR. GOTBAUM: So this is--

11 MR. BETHAL: This is, as you characterized
12 it, this is only proposed as a temporary
13 colocation for those two grades. Nothing's been
14 planned beyond that, and any work that happens
15 has to go through that same process.

16 MR. GOTBAUM: The short answer is you don't
17 know where you're going to put them after next
18 year?

19 MR. BETHAL: That would be a correct answer.

20 [crosstalk]

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: You guys go through a lot
22 of trouble producing the EIS and things like
23 that, and we have to show it to - - they don't
24 even really have to show up. So like...

25 MALE VOICE 3: - -

1 MR. BETHAL: So folks, I don't want this
2 to begin to - - I want to make sure - -
3 Christine, I want to give you a word. I know
4 you have a question and I haven't forgotten. I
5 remember you were up there and we've got the
6 microphones working now so we'll be okay.

7 MALE VOICE 3: Can SUNTY answer a question?

8 MR. BETHAL: Sir--

9 MALE VOICE 3: I'm just asking.

10 MR. BETHAL: Please. The application is
11 online. If you want my job, please apply.
12 Again, I understand there was a question that
13 was directed to SUNY. It's among the things
14 that I want to get to. They want the
15 opportunity to do it, it's an important question
16 about public notice and other things. I don't
17 want to put them on the spot, but if they want
18 the opportunity to ask--

19 MALE VOICE 3: - -

20 MR. BETHAL: Sir.

21 FEMALE VOICE 1: - -

22 MR. BETHAL: I'm not suggesting it's not.
23 I'm suggesting it's not - - harp at it while I'm
24 trying to get to a question that was posed
25 earlier. Your question?

1 MS. FRYE: It's just, I would like to
2 know how you got to the 981. Like, did someone
3 read the wrong numbers, because--

4 MR. BETHAL: All right, so what I'll
5 suggest, - - if there's a question about the
6 calculations, that's certainly something we can
7 answer. I'm not prepared to do it here tonight,
8 and I don't want to make this a math course for
9 anybody.

10 MS. FRYE: Okay.

11 MR. BETHAL: But before I leave tonight,
12 you're referring to page 7 of 19 in the
13 enrollment capacity and utilization report, and
14 specifically looking down the lines for M185 and
15 M208, you're questioning the target method
16 relative to 234 and 408--I'm doing this so it's
17 in the public record, and questioning, how does
18 that add up to the 981 that was projected,
19 right?

20 MS. FRYE: Right.

21 MR. BETHAL: Right, so we've got the
22 question, and I can make sure we can get an
23 answer to it. I'm not going to be able to do
24 that this evening.

25 MR. FRYE: - -

1 MR. BETHAL: I'm sure there is. I don't
2 have it right now, but the question's a clear
3 one and we'll make sure we get a response to
4 that. - - State University, there was a
5 question about the notice in the two different
6 hearings. I know you spoke to it earlier in
7 your introduction. I didn't know if you wanted
8 to speak to it now or not, or you can get that
9 answer out to folks in another form.

10 [background noise]

11 MR. BETHAL: Let me just get you a
12 microphone.

13 [background noise]

14 MS. MURPHY: You had asked about the
15 specific site and I do not know that number off
16 the top of my head, but you can send an email to
17 that address on there and ask the question.

18 MALE VOICE 3: You mean the specific law--

19 MS. MURPHY: Yes.

20 MALE VOICE 3: Okay. And what about--when
21 was the notice requirement of the SUNY hearing
22 sent to parents of the public schools here
23 regarding the SUNY part of this hearing?

24 MS. MURPHY: The notice was given to the DOE
25 and they gave it to the principals of the school

1 to backpack home.

2 FEMALE VOICE 1: Never got it.

3 MALE VOICE 3: A whole bunch of these
4 parents said--yeah.

5 FEMALE VOICE 10: We never got it.

6 [crosstalk]

7 MR. BETHAL: We will follow up with the
8 charter office and make sure that that in fact
9 was done. It's a reasonable question. And we
10 need to address it. I can make this more
11 complicated. Folks, we're at the point right
12 now where the building permit that was taken out
13 this evening, we've exhausted the main of the
14 questions that were answered. If there are
15 additional questions, again, I would encourage
16 folks to provide additional questions and
17 comments that you may have at any time before
18 the panel on educational policies votes on the
19 proposal at its March 21st meeting. Again, that
20 March 21st, 2012 meeting will be at the High
21 School for Fashion Industries in Manhattan. The
22 email address and phone number, again, where
23 comments may be made are
24 d03proposals@schools.nyc.gov and (212) 374-3466.
25 I thank you for your participation. This joint

1 public hearing is now closed.

2 [END 285_720.MP3]

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio files and have been transcribed to the best of my ability.

Signature 

Date March 20, 2012