

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF  
EDUCATION - OFFICE OF  
PORTFOLIO PLANNING  
Alfred E. Smith Campus  
March 19, 2010**

1 [START 159\_280\_a.MP3]

2 MS. ELENA PAPALIBERIOS: Good evening,  
3 everybody, and welcome. We're going to start  
4 the proceedings. Welcome and thank you for  
5 coming tonight to the public--joint public  
6 hearing regarding the proposed phase down  
7 decision of Bronx Haven High School. I am Elena  
8 Papaliberios, Superintendent of Bronx High  
9 Schools.

10 We have asked members of the--the  
11 representatives of the SLT from both schools to  
12 be present tonight and join us on the dais.  
13 Eserala Inason [phonetic] SLT member, Bronx  
14 Haven and Mr. Ari Brondle [phonetic] SLT, uh,  
15 Alfred E. Smith High School. There are  
16 translation services tonight if anybody [foreign  
17 language].

18 This proceeding will be recorded. The  
19 purpose of this hearing is to provide comments  
20 about the proposal. But before I read the  
21 proposal, I want to make sure that everybody has  
22 had an opportunity to sign up if you're  
23 interested in speaking tonight.

24 All those who want to speak must sign  
25 outside of the auditorium, um, in order to, uh,

1 present their comments tonight. Speaker,  
2 speakers will be given the floor in the order  
3 that they signed up. All comments will be  
4 limited to two minutes. There will be a  
5 timekeeper that will just give a warning for 30  
6 seconds and when your time is up.

7 In addition, we welcome any comments and  
8 feedback you may have at any time before the  
9 educational, uh, panel meets. There will be  
10 meeting on March 23rd, 2010. The email and the  
11 phone number where comments may be made can be  
12 found on the DOE's website under the section for  
13 the Panel for Educational Policy.

14 I will read the proposal. In December 2009,  
15 the Department of Education announced a proposal  
16 to phase out and eventually close Alfred E.  
17 Smith on December 11th, 2009; issued an  
18 educational impact on the proposal.

19 Subsequently, based on feedback from the  
20 community, the DOE revised its proposal to phase  
21 out and close Alfred E. Smith, announcing  
22 instead the phase in, um, instead of phasing  
23 out, the DOE will phase down and leave the  
24 Construction Trades, um, as programs remain in--  
25 that will, uh--I'm sorry, that the programs that

1 will be phased out and retain the Automotive  
2 Technology CTE program.

3 For the year 2010-2011, the--and subsequent  
4 school year, and the school year, students will  
5 only be accepted to the automotive technology  
6 program. All students currently enrolled in  
7 non-automotive CTE Alfred E. Smith programs will  
8 have the opportunity to continue with their CTE  
9 pathway and graduate from the school. However,  
10 beginning the 2010-11 school year no incoming  
11 students will enroll in these programs.

12 The proposal to phase down Alfred E. Smith  
13 to just its Automotive Technology program is  
14 based on the community's, uh, feedback and the  
15 DOE's determination that Alfred E.--that Alfred  
16 E. Smith students are best served by  
17 concentrating on the school's automotive  
18 technology program.

19 The revised impact statement published on  
20 January 27th, 2010 indicated that the space made  
21 avail--available by the phase down of Alfred E.  
22 Smith in the building X600 would be used to  
23 house two schools, Bronx Haven High School, an  
24 existing transfer school servings students in  
25 grades 9 through 12 and the New York City

1 Charter High School for Architectural  
2 Engineering and Construction Industries.

3 In response to public comments since those  
4 proposals were announced, the DOE has decided  
5 not to site AECI in X600. The DOE is now  
6 proposing to site only Bronx Haven with Alfred  
7 E. Smith in X600 for the 2010-2011 school year.  
8 Accordingly, the DOE has issued this revised  
9 educational impact statement for the Alfred E.  
10 Smith proposal and revised the educational  
11 impact for the AECI Bronx Haven co-location  
12 proposal.

13 Before the start of the 2010-2011 school  
14 year, Bronx Haven will move its current location  
15 in school building X140 located at 90016 Eagle  
16 Avenue in the Bronx in Community School District  
17 8 to X600 located at 333 East 151st Street in  
18 Bronx in Community District 7. Bronx Haven and  
19 Alfred E. Smith will be co-located in that  
20 location.

21 Bronx Haven is a high school performing as a  
22 transfer school that currently serves  
23 approximately 100 students in grade 9 through  
24 12. Transfer schools are small academically  
25 rigorous, diploma-granting high schools designed

1 to reengage students who are over aged and  
2 under credited or who have dropped out of high  
3 school. Interested students apply directly to  
4 the transfer school through a school, a school-  
5 based process.

6 The move of Bronx Haven to X600 will allow  
7 this school to grow to its intended size of 175  
8 to 225 students. The 2008-2009 target  
9 utilization rate of X600 was 75% and its target  
10 capacity was 1,562. There is sufficient space  
11 in X600 for Bronx Haven and Alfred E. Smith's  
12 Automotive Technology program to operate at  
13 fully organizational capacity after Alfred E.  
14 Smith's phase down is complete. After the joint  
15 public hearings, the Panel for Educational  
16 Policy will vote on the revised proposal at its  
17 March 23, 2010 meeting.

18 Bronx Haven enrolled 110 students in grades  
19 9 through 12 according to the October 31st, 2009  
20 audited register. At scale, Bronx Haven will  
21 serve approximately 175 to 225 students in  
22 grades 9 through 12.

23 Alfred E. Smith served 1,049 students in  
24 grades 9 through 12. At scale, the phase down,  
25 after the phase down, Smith will serve 400 to

1 500 students in grades 9 through 12. The phase  
2 down of Alfred E. Smith will result in a  
3 temporary load of approximately 120 high school  
4 students who are new ninth grade students in  
5 constructional trades and architectural  
6 engineering programs in the Bronx.

7 The DOE will work with the community to  
8 develop a school proposal for 2011-2012 that  
9 would offer architecture, construction and  
10 engineering technology pathways in X600. Any  
11 such proposal will be the subject of a separate  
12 educational impact statement. Architecture,  
13 construction and engineering technology pathways  
14 will also continue to be available at other high  
15 schools throughout the city.

16 The automotive technology CTE program  
17 pathway will continue to be available to  
18 students at Alfred E. Smith. In addition, the  
19 siting and expansion of Bronx Haven in X600  
20 will address the needs of over age and under  
21 credit students in the Bronx by providing a high  
22 quality transfer option. Thank you. We look  
23 forward to hearing your comments and questions.  
24 If there are any elected officials that would  
25 like to present tonight, please let us know.

1 I just want to introduce again joining me  
2 at the panel tonight, SLT representative from  
3 Bronx Haven Eserala Inason, SLT representative  
4 from Alfred E. Smith High School, Mr. Ari  
5 Brondle. And joining us?

6 MS. ALMI TRAMEL: Almi Tramel [phonetic] CEC  
7 representative for District 7.

8 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you. If the SLTs  
9 from in the schools would like to present at  
10 this point, could we have the presenter come up  
11 please? Eserala? Ms. Eserala Inason will speak  
12 on behalf of the SLT from Bronx Haven.

13 MS. ESERALA INASON: Good evening. My name  
14 is Eserala Inason and I'm the SLT representative  
15 from Bronx Haven High School. Bronx Haven High  
16 School is a transfer school which gives a risk--  
17 at-risk students aged 15 to 20-years-old who are  
18 over age and under credited a second chance at  
19 earning their high school diploma.

20 Bronx Haven gave my daughter Clarissa a  
21 second chance. I am thankful that they - - not  
22 only for Clarissa but - - but also the social  
23 economic means of the student. In fact, each  
24 student at Bronx Haven High School has an  
25 advisor who assists them with college and career

1 preparation and also that student's achievement  
2 development. Bronx Haven is transferred  
3 [phonetic] by the partnership with East Side  
4 House and as a result is able to provide a wide  
5 variety of social services to students and their  
6 families.

7 In addition, students are in learn to work  
8 program where they are given the opportunity to  
9 have paid internships. To sum it up, Bronx  
10 Haven students are supported by a caring staff  
11 and are given a second chance to get their high  
12 school diplomas.

13 Students are encouraged academically,  
14 socially and emotionally and work on skills that  
15 will not only prepare them for college but  
16 various careers and other options after high  
17 school. We are looking forward to moving to the  
18 Smith campus so that students like my daughter  
19 will be exposed to provided technical learning  
20 opportunities, have more space, improved  
21 facility and be more accessible to public  
22 transportation. Thank you.

23 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you very much.  
24 From the SLT of Alfred Smith, Mr. Ari Brondle  
25 will present.

1 MR. ARI BRONDLE: Good evening. I must  
2 have missed something. I'll try again. Good  
3 evening.

4 GROUP: Good evening.

5 MR. BRONDLE: That's better. I was told  
6 today an opportunity--you know, being - - was  
7 actually bothering me. I guess you guys are  
8 used to every time I come up to there's  
9 something bothering me, right? So also today is  
10 that this hearing is not about Alfred E. Smith  
11 High School. And I think that nothing could be  
12 further from the truth.

13 And I think there are two reasons. Reason  
14 number one is until March 23rd rolls around and  
15 the Mayor's representatives raise their hand and  
16 say yes, we approve this proposal, let's close  
17 down Alfred E. Smith, I am putting up a fight.  
18 I am not accepting that the - - or construction  
19 skills program in this building is closing. I  
20 am not accepting that other programs are coming  
21 into the building until then; number one.

22 Number two, what this proposal really is  
23 about is capacity building--uh, capacity, right?  
24 Um, and there's a lot of discussion about the  
25 underutilization of this building. But there

1 hasn't been a discussion about the  
2 misutilization of this building and what this,  
3 this proposal represents is the misutilization  
4 of this building. You take one quick tour of  
5 this building and it is obvious to you what this  
6 building was designed for. Structurally and in  
7 every sense, this is a trade school.

8 A few minutes before I came in here, I had  
9 someone assist me in doing an unofficial count  
10 of--or a somewhat official count of the rooms in  
11 this building. It turns out that in this  
12 building there are 28 rooms which are dedicated  
13 solely and exclusively to the construction of  
14 trades. The utilization of that space for  
15 anything else is a misutilization of this  
16 building.

17 Now the Department of Education has gotten a  
18 few things right over the last few months and we  
19 applaud them for that. They got it right when  
20 they pulled the proposal off the table to close  
21 the entire school. They got it right when they  
22 pulled back from bringing in AECI. And what  
23 we're hoping we're able to do today or what they  
24 will do over the next few weeks is to once again  
25 because three is the charm, right? Right?

1           GROUP: Right.

2           MR. BRONDLE: Right?

3           GROUP: Right.

4           GROUP: Yeah.

5           MR. BRONDLE: Because three is the charm,  
6 and what we are hoping that they will do is for  
7 a third time, do the right thing and withdraw  
8 this proposal to bring Bronx Haven here. Now,  
9 when I suggest this, it's not a criticism of the  
10 good work that people are doing at Bronx Haven.

11           So we have a single event [phonetic]. Bronx  
12 Haven needs more space to accommodate their  
13 students. We understand that and we appreciate  
14 that. The Department of Education has closed 19  
15 schools. The state has its eyes upon the  
16 numerous other schools they're about to close.  
17 What they need are classrooms. What we need in  
18 this building is shop classes, programs which  
19 are designed to do and fit well with what this  
20 building was intended to do, which is to teach  
21 the trades.

22           The current discussions which are going on  
23 at the Department of Education about what should  
24 happen after March the 23rd, after this vote,  
25 whichever way it goes, these are all positive

1 ideas. And we applaud the commitments that  
2 representatives of the Department of Education  
3 have made to ensuring that trades are kept in  
4 this school.

5 But taking away or bringing in a  
6 distraction--no offense to, again, to my  
7 representatives from Bronx Haven--but bringing a  
8 distraction into this building, taking away  
9 space that could be utilized to help build  
10 dynamic trade schools which will prepare  
11 students for the workforce of the future is a  
12 misutilization of this space.

13 There are numerous other options, numerous  
14 other places that Bronx Haven could be taken.  
15 Smith should only be used for trade instruction.  
16 We are a trade school. We've always been a  
17 trade school. We will always be a trade school.  
18 Thank you.

19 [Applause]

20 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you Mr. Brondle.  
21 We will now open the floor for public comments.  
22 Just as a reminder, whoever is speaking will  
23 have two minutes to speak. There will be a  
24 timekeeper that will indicate when you have 30  
25 seconds left and then when your time is up. We

1 will be using the microphone in the, in the  
2 front and we will be calling speakers by the  
3 numbers that they have received.

4 So if I could ask the first three speakers  
5 to come up and just line up in the middle, just  
6 turn the mike the other way.

7 [Background noise]

8 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Speaker number one, Miss  
9 Corona Orr [phonetic], welcome.

10 MS. CORONA ORR: Thank you. Okay, this,  
11 turn it this way?

12 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: That's okay.

13 MS. ORR: I just face this way.

14 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: That's fine.

15 [Crosstalk]

16 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: That's okay.

17 MS. ORR: Okay. Good evening, everybody.

18 Many thanks to all who have come here to support  
19 us. My name is Corona Orr and I'm an  
20 International Science Teacher from Canada. Well  
21 informed people all over the world are talking  
22 green. They are taking their kids out to learn  
23 from the nature and they are giving their kids  
24 the space to expand their mind and intelligence  
25 in a national setting. I'm sure they will

1 create a green generation for the future. But  
2 unfortunately, our kids live in a place  
3 surrounded by concrete, study in a place  
4 surrounded by concrete because of limited space.

5 And now, on top of that, if we coexist one,  
6 two or three schools in the same building, we  
7 will be limiting the already limited space and  
8 facilities to our kids. And this is absolutely  
9 unfair. Coexistence can cause significant  
10 pressure on the system and can cause conflicts  
11 regarding lab facilities, library facilities,  
12 cafeteria and parking facilities. And most  
13 important of all, the morning scanning  
14 procedures.

15 Another important point to note is that we  
16 as a school, Smith, are working on effective  
17 steps to improve the overall standard. But  
18 unfortunately, realistic educational results  
19 cannot be achieved and displayed overnight or in  
20 one day or a week. These results grow gradually  
21 with time. So we request your kind patience and  
22 cooperation, and above all, we request you to  
23 have faith in us as a school and as a community.  
24 Please keep Smith open with all its trades.  
25 Coexisting two or three schools in a limited

1 facility can cause great problems now and for  
2 the future. Thank you.

3 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you.

4 [Applause]

5 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Next speaker, Miguel  
6 Orta.

7 MR. MIGUEL ORTA: Miguel Orta from East Side  
8 House. I'm Deputy Director of Social Services.  
9 I'm a professionally licensed social worker. I  
10 have been with East Side House for 11 years.  
11 East Side House is a community-based  
12 organization. We have been here for 49 years,  
13 since 1961. And I have witnessed the amount of  
14 youth whose life have been transformed by our  
15 commitment to the community and to education.

16 I have seen them. I have two names I want  
17 to say. They came and they joined us when they  
18 were 2-years-old. They went through the system.  
19 I met them when they were already in high school  
20 and they told me early childhood with East Side  
21 House, grade school and going to East Side House  
22 after school programs. And then when they were  
23 in high school and they joined our youth  
24 religions program, all that helped them to be  
25 committed to education. - - in 1998 was the one

1 who started the first attendance to a  
2 comprehension program and health opportunities  
3 in high school.

4 And I have seen East Side House commitment  
5 to education when we got together with the  
6 community Mott Haven and we helped create Mott  
7 Haven Village Prep High School and then Bronx  
8 Haven--Mott Haven Village Prep High School and  
9 then Bronx Haven High School. East Side House  
10 commitment to education has produced results.

11 And now for the last six years we have  
12 concentrated in going to the disconnected youth  
13 and bringing them back into the system.  
14 Bringing them back to choose whether job force  
15 or other ways to foster their education and  
16 become productive individuals. We are excited  
17 with the possibility of coming here and being  
18 able to expand services because our commitment  
19 is to make of education the key to a better  
20 future to this youth who are yearning, yelling  
21 for a chance to do better in life. Thank you.

22 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you, sir.

23 [Applause]

24 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Joe Santana.

25 DET. JOE SANTANA: Hi, good afternoon,

1 everybody. My name is, uh, Detective Joe  
2 Santana. I'm with the New York City Police  
3 Department. I'm currently assigned to the - -  
4 squad. I'm calling because I graduated from  
5 Smith High School in the class of '97 and I'm  
6 here because I was told that they, they might be  
7 closing down the school.

8 I'm here to say that I took four years of  
9 electrical wiring and I had great teachers.  
10 Some of the teachers are still there in front of  
11 me and they're great for students. They always  
12 had time for me whenever I needed them. Um,  
13 when I got out of Smith, I quickly went into - -  
14 and I took whatever I learned from the  
15 electrical theory and I applied it to - - . Um,  
16 three years into the private sectors, I got into  
17 Housing Authority and I spent a year and a half  
18 working in housing, for housing.

19 I left the field, um, I left the trade of  
20 September 11th to enlist with the Marine Corps  
21 and I served two tours in Iraq as an infantryman  
22 with the 2nd division. Out there I received a  
23 Purple Heart for wounds sustained in Afghanistan  
24 in '05. And when I came back home, my intention  
25 was to return back to the field, to the trade

1 that I had acquired here with, with teachers  
2 such as - - and everybody else who was great  
3 from here. Um, instead I ended up in a, in a  
4 law enforcement career and ended up, um, into  
5 the department.

6 About a year into being a patrolman, just  
7 out of the academy, I was involved in a - - that  
8 promoted me to detective. Now, I came back here  
9 and from time to time I ran into my old teachers  
10 when I'm work and they told me about the  
11 situation here. And I told them that I would do  
12 whatever it takes, that I could come in and  
13 talk.

14 I came by a couple of weeks ago to speak to  
15 the seniors and told them about the options that  
16 they have if they continue their education at  
17 Smith. Smith is not a waste of time. Smith is  
18 a great school and everybody's that here, when  
19 they get out of school they have the opportunity  
20 to make a lot of money and to be something good  
21 with themselves. And that's pretty much what I  
22 really have to say. I do want to thank  
23 everybody here. And my teachers who were there  
24 for me, or I wouldn't have graduated. Thank you  
25 so much.

1 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you very much.

2 [Applause]

3 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Jeffery Smalls.

4 MR. JEFFREY SMALLS: Got to raise this up--

5 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: [interposing] - - .

6 MR. SMALLS: Good evening. My name is  
7 Jeffery Smalls. I'm the president of Smalls  
8 Electrical Construction. Also, I'm chair of the  
9 Alfred E. Smith Advisory Board. Um, I'm here  
10 tonight to discuss and, and quickly give a  
11 brief, um, stance on where I stand as far as  
12 Smith. Um, we feel that the endorsement diploma  
13 program at Smith are very valuable and whatever  
14 the DOE decides to do going forward, the NCCER  
15 programs that allow students to be licensed at a  
16 very young age with the New York City Department  
17 of Buildings, it must be maintained.

18 So I look forward to working with the  
19 Department of Education towards developing any  
20 new model that they may propose if Smith is, uh,  
21 truly phased out, um, on the 23rd. But I think,  
22 uh, the future opportunities is what we have to  
23 look forward to. We have to look forward to  
24 partnership going forward. And I think, uh, the  
25 Department of Education, the way they're moving

1 forward considering the opinion of public,  
2 considering the opinion of industry and  
3 considering the opinion of community because  
4 really community is people. Those are the  
5 people that in the community that actually  
6 advocate for, uh, for their, for their students.

7 And I think that, um, right now it's, it's,  
8 it's an arduous task to get from December 8th to  
9 where we are now. I've been involved for the  
10 last couple of months and it's been many nights.  
11 Right, right now you'll see that people are very  
12 tired and it's something that is still coming  
13 back and letting you know, working with the  
14 Department of Education as much as possible. I  
15 volunteer myself going forward to offer anything  
16 I can offer towards the new schools, whether it  
17 be mentoring, any, any job site visits, anything  
18 I can do to make sure that the students are  
19 stimulated.

20 But I think that basically we need to do  
21 whatever we can to make sure that the  
22 opportunities are not lost at Smith. If there's  
23 anything that could be done to save the ninth  
24 grade class at any way possible, we can think  
25 outside the box, I can definitely discuss

1 anything that you, that you, that you would  
2 like, um, to somehow sustain the ability for  
3 students to come back to Smith and learn a trade  
4 in September. I think that should be  
5 entertained. And I do have some ideas that  
6 maybe we can discuss with the, with the  
7 Chancellor's office and move those forward.

8 But other than that, uh, I want to say  
9 again, a strong commitment through the industry,  
10 throughout the community towards supporting  
11 Smith going forward. Uh, Dewayne Sampson  
12 [phonetic] can't be here tonight, the President  
13 of Comto [phonetic] New York. He also says that  
14 he supports going forward and working with the  
15 Department of Education in any way possible to  
16 develop a new school if that opportunity  
17 prevents itself--presents itself. Thank you.

18 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you very much.

19 [Applause]

20 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Mr. Robert Sutter  
21 [phonetic].

22 MR. SMALLS: I'm sorry, just one last thing.  
23 I do have a packet that I've been giving out at  
24 every hearing. Right here, the 6,000 signatures  
25 that do support the trades at Smith and I think

1 that, again the last time we were going to  
2 offer this to the panel and, uh, hopefully they  
3 can take this into consideration. Thank you.

4 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Absolutely. Thank you,  
5 sir. Robert Sutter. That's number five.  
6 Number six, seven, and eight, start just getting  
7 close to the microphone that will help.

8 MR. ROBERT SUTTER: Good afternoon, ladies  
9 and gentleman. My name is Robert Sutter. I  
10 graduated in, uh, 2008 from the CTE Electrical  
11 program. Uh, basically when I left high school  
12 things were very rough. I was living on the  
13 street. I had to drive a cab for a little  
14 while. Things as this, I was just trying to  
15 make ends meet. Thanks, to, uh, my teachers  
16 Bocani [phonetic] and Mr. Pickney [phonetic] I  
17 was, uh, able to be employed with, um, MTA, New  
18 York City Transit as a single maintainer. And,  
19 um, if you was to phase out Smith CTE program  
20 there would be a lot more people like myself  
21 without getting a good job. Thank you.

22 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you very much.

23 [Applause]

24 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Maryann Asavelo  
25 [phonetic].

1 MS. MARYANN ASAVELO: Hello, my name is  
2 Maryann Asavelo. I'm - - up here today. I  
3 graduated from the electrical program in 2008  
4 and when I was here at Alfred E. Smith, I  
5 received an excellent education. One thing I  
6 remember is that the conflict with each other  
7 because they tried to identify us with many  
8 different uniforms to identify the various  
9 different trades. We asked them - - we will  
10 lose ourself and it will happen again - - .

11 As well, after--uh, upon graduation, I was  
12 hired by MTA as single maintainer - - and I have  
13 to say because of Alfred E. Smith, I can remind  
14 my little sister of the future. And to close a  
15 school like this, it's devastating. It should  
16 not be closed down. The misutilization of this  
17 building should not be allowed. This, because  
18 of schools like this that have provided such a  
19 great future for students like me that have help  
20 with my job and now I can pay for me to go to  
21 college, can help my family.

22 Again, this school should not be closed  
23 down. Everything that I've gotten from this  
24 school not only has it helped me but helped my  
25 community as well and everyone else in here.

1 The teachers here because of students like me  
2 look forward to going to the school every day  
3 just to see the outcome and see students like me  
4 involved every single year. And that's why I'm  
5 protesting. I do not believe Alfred E. Smith  
6 should be closed down.

7 Building trades should be held up, as well  
8 as with automotive and building trades to  
9 provide students now with a great future and  
10 decrease the unemployment rates that are going  
11 to be coming up, to keep students more devoted  
12 to life. This I can't, I can't put it into so  
13 much notice. This was such a short note from  
14 me, but I cannot, I cannot put it in so much  
15 words and emphasize that closing Alfred E. Smith  
16 will be wrong, but it will be a mistake to South  
17 Bronx.

18 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you.

19 [Applause]

20 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Number seven, Steve Jared  
21 [phonetic].

22 MR. STEVE JARED: Good evening everyone. My  
23 name is, uh, Steve Jared. I'm a guidance  
24 counselor at Bronx Haven High School. We  
25 support at-risk youth. And as we grow we would

1 like to add some more students to our - - .  
2 So if anyone here knows any over age under  
3 credit youth, please see me afterwards. I do  
4 have some referral forms. And I have my  
5 business card. Thank you.

6 [Applause]

7 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you. Number eight.  
8 Scott Hem, sorry, Hadam [phonetic]. My  
9 apologies Mr. Hadam.

10 MR. SCOTT HADAM: Good evening. We've been  
11 through this several times and, uh, we can't  
12 overemphasize the importance of the CTE  
13 programs. We employ the services at Bronx Haven  
14 High School give to the community and children  
15 for all the overall age and under credited  
16 children who haven't graduated from high school.  
17 And we think that that's, that's, that's a good  
18 thing. It's a positive.

19 What we are concerned about is, uh--one  
20 gentleman said that they would like to expand  
21 their services. Another gentleman said they  
22 would like to take in more. And we feel that if  
23 that is available in this school it will lead to  
24 diluting and watering down services that we  
25 offer with our CTE programs. So whatever

1 proposal goes forward and we ask the DOE that  
2 we're concerned with our programs, our  
3 vocational programs becoming diluted and watered  
4 down. If anything, we would like help to  
5 improve, uh, becoming more innovative and  
6 helping our programs become more stronger, uh,  
7 even with technology. And that's, that's what I  
8 would like to, uh, ask of DOE. Thank you.

9 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you very much.

10 [Applause]

11 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Louis Castile.

12 MR. LOIS CASTILE: Good evening. My name  
13 is, uh, Louis Castile. I am also alumni of  
14 Alfred E. Smith. I, uh, came to Alfred E. Smith  
15 in 1989, graduated in 1992, became a teacher  
16 here in 1999. I teach architectural drafting  
17 and I'm very familiar with the structure of this  
18 building.

19 As Mr. Brondle said, the building is built  
20 for one purpose only and that is to teach the  
21 trades. Okay? The only place that Bronx Haven  
22 can go in this building is in the fourth floor.  
23 And my, my only, uh, concern with Bronx Haven  
24 is--well I have two concerns. If Bronx Haven is  
25 doing so great then they should be rewarded with

1 their own building, not take up space in  
2 somebody else's building.

3 MALE VOICE: I agree.

4 MR. CASTILE: Um, another thing is, uh,  
5 Bronx Haven people agree with me. Another thing  
6 is the age of some of Bronx Haven students.  
7 I've heard 20. I heard the number 20. A 20-  
8 year-old should not be mingling around with 13  
9 and 14-year-old kids coming from junior high  
10 school. Unless you build walls around the  
11 fourth floor above the gym in our building, then  
12 Bronx Haven kids will be mingling with our  
13 students. And that's unavoidable outside of the  
14 building.

15 And I don't think there's anybody in this  
16 auditorium right now that would appreciate their  
17 13, 14-year-old daughter speaking to a 20-year-  
18 old young man. If anybody has a difference of  
19 opinion with me, I would love to hear it.

20 FEMALE VOICE: We're not allowed to respond.

21 MR. CASTILE: Thank you very much.

22 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you.

23 [Applause]

24 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Mr. Sterling Roberson.

25 MR. STERLING ROBERSON: Good evening. Uh,

1 my name is Sterling Roberson, the Vice  
2 President of Career and Technical Education for  
3 the United Federation of Teachers. Now we've  
4 been down this road, we've been down this--the  
5 decisions, uh, being made as we speak.

6 In terms of, um, what we do is have a clear  
7 understanding and I'm going to ask the  
8 Department of Education to recognize that the  
9 building trades, like all of the other trades in  
10 this building provide students, as testified by  
11 many of you--provide students with opportunity  
12 and access that they would normally not have,  
13 access to higher education; access to some kind  
14 of post-secondary education, whether it's an  
15 internship, externship; direct entry into the  
16 workforce, the opportunity and the access for  
17 them to have a middle class lifestyle, which is  
18 so important these days.

19 In addition to that, the CTE graduates from  
20 Alfred E. Smith just like many other schools  
21 citywide, these individuals as successful  
22 students become taxpaying citizens. They help  
23 ultimately become the statewide economy. They  
24 become lifelong learners. I say that as a  
25 graduate from a CTE program. And get to stand

1 in front of you, um, to speak, not just as a  
2 student, a former teacher and as well as a  
3 representative for 200,000 members, for the  
4 educators in New York City.

5 So I say that to say that when we think  
6 about that as we move forward, we are committed  
7 to making sure that that opportunity access  
8 still exists for all students. So although we  
9 may agree to disagree, we believe that we can,  
10 we can actually achieve that with, with Alfred  
11 E. Smith staying intact. I do admonish the  
12 Department of Education, let's get this right.

13 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: Thank you.

14 [Applause]

15 MS. PAPALIBERIOS: The speaker list is now  
16 exhausted. I want to thank all of you for your  
17 participation. This portion of this joint  
18 public hearing is now closed. I wish everybody  
19 a healthy and beautiful weekend. Thank you.

20 [Background noise]

21 [END 159\_280\_a.MP3]

22

23

24

25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio files and have been transcribed to the best of my ability.

Signature Donna Hintze\_\_\_\_\_

Date March 23, 2010\_\_\_\_\_