



Public Comment Analysis

Date: February 2, 2011

Topic: The Proposed Co-location of 11X509 with Global Enterprise High School (11X541), Christopher Columbus High School (11X415), Collegiate Institute for Math and Science (11X288), Astor Collegiate Academy (11X299), Pelham Preparatory Academy (11X542), and a District 75 High School Inclusion Program (P010X@Columbus) in School Building X415

Date of Panel Vote: February 3, 2011

Summary of Proposal

The New York City Department of Education (“DOE”) proposes to co-locate 11X509, a new high school, in school building X415 (“X415”) located at 925 Astor Avenue, Bronx, NY 10469, within the geographical confines of Community School District 11. If this proposal is approved, 11X509 would be co-located with five existing high schools: Global Enterprise High School (11X541, “Global Enterprise”), Christopher Columbus High School (11X415, “Columbus”), Collegiate Institute for Math and Science (11X288, “Collegiate Institute”), Astor Collegiate Academy (11X299, “Astor Collegiate”), Pelham Preparatory Academy (11X542, “Pelham Prep”), and a District 75 High School Inclusion Program (P010X@Columbus). P010X students are enrolled in Columbus’ general education classes, and, depending on their individual needs, receive Special Education Teacher Support Services. Finally, there is a Young Adult Borough Center located in X415. A “co-location” means that two or more school organizations are located in the same building and may share common spaces like auditoriums, gymnasiums, and cafeterias.

In two separate Educational Impact Statements (“EIS”) published on December 20, 2010 and amended on January 27, 2011, the DOE also proposed to gradually phase out and eventually close Global Enterprise and Columbus due to their chronic low performance.

As part of the replacement strategy for Global Enterprise and Columbus, the DOE is proposing to phase in two new district high schools, 11X509 and 11X508, into the X415 building beginning in 2011-2012. The replacement option for Global Enterprise, 11X509, is delineated in the EIS available at the link below while the replacement option for Columbus, 11X508, is described in a separate EIS. In the event that the phase-out of Global Enterprise and/or Columbus is not approved, the DOE would re-examine the availability of space in the building, and may, as appropriate, revise its proposals to co-locate 11X509 and 11X508 in X415.

In 2009-2010, X415 had a target capacity to serve 3,055 students, and the building enrolled 3,264 students, yielding a target building utilization of 109%. In 2010-2011, the total enrollment for all schools in the building is projected to be 3,039, which would yield a utilization rate of 99%. This means that the building is fully utilized.

The proposed co-location of 11X509 is part of the DOE's central goal to create new school options that will better serve future students and the community at large. The new school would serve students in grade nine during the 2011-2012 school year and would continue growing to full-scale as Global Enterprise phases out, completing its expansion to serve students in grades 9-12 during the 2014-2015 school year. 11X509 would not have an academic screen, but would serve students who are learning English and have been in the country for less than four years. The EIS can be accessed here: <http://schools.nyc.gov/community/planning/changes/bronx/globalenterprise>
A copy of the EIS is also available in the main offices of Collegiate Institute, Astor Collegiate, Global Enterprise, Pelham Prep, P010X, and Columbus.

Summary of Comments Received at the Joint Public Hearing

A joint public hearing regarding this proposal was held at Christopher Columbus Educational Campus on January 28, 2011. At that hearing, interested parties had an opportunity to provide input on the proposal. Approximately 88 members of the public attended the hearing, 27 people offered comments on the proposal and 2 questions were submitted. Present at the meeting were CEC 11 member Patrick Gannon; Columbus Principal Lisa Fuentes; Collegiate Math and Science Principal Estelle Hans; Astor Collegiate Principal Sandra Burgos; Pelham Prep Principal Jane Aronoff; Deputy Chancellor Santi Taveras; Superintendent Geraldine Taylor-Brown; and Gregg Bethel, Executive Director of the Office of School Programs and Partnerships.

The following comments and remarks were made at the joint public hearings:

1. CEC Member Patrick Gannon stated that he was attending to hear feedback directly from the community, and will represent opinions from the hearing speakers in his future conversations with the CEC and other decision makers regarding the proposal.
2. Multiple commenters stated the Educational Impact Statement did not address options for students scoring a Level 1 or Level 2 on State ELA and math tests, and requested a support plan and the various options available to these students if the phase-out and co-location proposals are approved.
3. One commenter expressed dissatisfaction with the lack of quality and local schools available to students if Global Enterprise phased out and the co-location proposal is approved.
4. One commenter who has a child in Global Enterprise High School expressed concern that the child's younger sibling would not have the same options or opportunity if the phase-out and co-location proposals are approved.

5. One commenter who previously attended Global Enterprise High School stated the money needed to start up the proposed new high school should instead be used to support Global Enterprise.
6. One commenter questioned whether a new school designed for English Language Learners would be as successful with these students as Global Enterprise High School has been.

The DOE received a comment at the Joint Public Hearing which did not directly relate to the proposal.

1. One commenter noted the difficulty of attending the Joint Public Hearing because of weather conditions, and requested that the hearing be rescheduled.

Summary of Issues Raised in Written and/or Oral Comments Submitted to the DOE

No written or oral comments were received by the DOE in response to this proposal.

Analysis of Issues Raised, Significant Alternatives Proposed and Changes Made to the Proposal

Comment 1 expressed general support for Global Enterprise and the community without raising any specific issues warranting a response.

With regard to comment 2 concerning the DOE's plan to support low performing students if the phase out proposal is approved, in addition to the supports mentioned in the EIS concerning the phase out of Global Enterprise, the DOE will ensure that all students, regardless of their proficiency level, are supported during the school's phase out by:

- Providing teacher training around issues including curriculum planning, improving teaching practices, and tailoring instruction to individual student needs.
- Fostering opportunities for teachers and administrators to connect with colleagues in other more successful schools, allowing them to learn from one another, improve teaching, and better support students.
- Facilitating partnerships with community-based organizations to support youth development initiatives at the school.

Schools that are phasing out have demonstrated an increase in performance for remaining students in large part due to critical leadership and staff changes that may be implemented. The school will continue to receive critical support from their Children First network team. In addition, as phase-out schools shrink from losing one grade per year, they take on similar characteristics of small schools and realize the same benefits for students.

With regard to comment 3 concerning the options available to future students and the perceived lack of quality schools: if Global Enterprise is approved to phase out, beginning in September 2011 the school will no longer admit new ninth-grade students. Eighth grade students at all proficiency levels, with the exception of those applying to District 75 programs, can participate in the regular High School Admissions Process. In New York City, high school admissions are

based on a citywide choice process, with students ranking up to 12 high schools in order of preference during the Main Round of high school admissions.

In addition, the DOE is proposing to open seven new high schools in the Bronx in September 2011, including one new school as a replacement option for Global Enterprise that will provide additional seats to students in the borough. Some of these schools will open in campuses of the proposed phased-out schools while others will open in other campuses. If approved by the PEP, these seven new schools are expected to serve approximately 830 new 9th grade students in 2011-2012.

Information regarding the new schools that will be proposed to open in 2011 will be provided in the winter for students who may be interested in applying to the schools as part of the High Schools Admissions Process. Detailed information about all City high schools is published annually in the City's High School Directory, available in print at DOE middle schools and Borough Enrollment Offices or on the DOE website here:

<http://schools.nyc.gov/ChoicesEnrollment/High/Directory/default.htm>

Global Enterprise currently admits students through the Limited Unscreened admissions method. A full list of City high schools, including those with Limited Unscreened admissions methods, is available in the New York City High School Directory, which is available in print at middle schools and at Borough Enrollment Centers or on the DOE Website at:

<http://schools.nyc.gov/ChoicesEnrollment/High/Directory/default.htm>.

In response to comment 4, phasing out a school is the most difficult decision we make. We are proposing this action because we think it's the right thing for current and future students in this community. The DOE wants to ensure that every student has access to a quality education. In New York City, we are striving to create a system of great schools. To accomplish this goal, we've replaced 91 of our lowest-performing schools with better options and opened 474 new schools. Of the 474, 365 are traditional public schools and 109 are public charter schools. As a result, we've created more good choices for families.

The proposed co-location of 11X508 is intended to replace the seats lost at Global Enterprise and increase the number of high-quality educational options for all students across the city, and specifically in the Bronx.

Other Phase out and replacement examples include:

- Manhattan: The new schools located on the Seward Park Campus in lower Manhattan had a graduation rate of 82.5% in 2009, compared to Seward Park High School's graduation rate of 36.4% in 2002 (Seward Park HS phased out in 2006).
- Bronx: Evander Childs High School graduated only 30.7% of students in 2002, its final year before phasing out. The new schools on the Evander Childs campus are getting tremendous results with the same student population, graduating 80.3% of students in 2009.
- Brooklyn: Bushwick campus in Brooklyn. In 2009, the schools on the campus had a graduation rate of 71.7%—nearly 50 points higher than the former Bushwick High School's graduation rate of only 22.7% in 2002.

Comment 5 relates to the strategy of opening new schools and its related costs: The DOE believes that replacing failing schools with new small schools is the most effective way to quickly turn around student achievement. In June 2010 MDRC, an independent research group, issued a report on NYC's new small schools strategy. MDRC concluded that "it is possible, in a relatively short span of time to replace a large number of underperforming public high schools [and] in the process achieve significant gains in students' academic achievement and attainment. And these gains are seen among a large and diverse group of students, including students who entered the ninth grade far below grade level and students of color, for whom such gains have been stubbornly elusive." For additional information on MDRC's report, please refer to the following website <http://www.mdrc.org/publications/560/overview.html>.

Comment 6 questions whether the new school will be as successful with its students as Global Enterprise has been. Each year we develop a strong pipeline of school leaders by actively soliciting proposals from a variety of sources including people currently working in schools and external organizations with proven track records of success in new schools. In addition, we've already been talking to communities to get a sense of their needs and hopes, and in coming weeks and months, we will arrange to introduce the new school leader to the community in meetings with parents and families, CEC's and elected officials. Our hope is that by identifying the strongest leaders and school models, we will be able to provide more high-quality options to students and families across New York City.

The proposed new school would be dedicated to serving English Language Learners who have been living in this country for less than 4 years. Students would be able to apply to the school as part of the High Schools Admissions process with priority given to students and residents of the Bronx. High School students with IEPs are admitted to high schools in the same manner as general education students. Schools are expected to create programs that meet the needs of all students ensuring greater exposure to a general education curriculum.

Changes Made to the Proposal

No changes have been made to this proposal as a result of public comment.