

Public Comment Analysis

Date: May 21, 2013

Topic: The Proposed Temporary Co-location of a New Middle School (02MTBD) with Existing School P.S. 51 Elias Howe (02M051) and a New Site P094@M338 of an Existing District 75 Program (75M094) in New Building M338 Beginning in the 2014-2015 School Year and the Proposed Re-siting of New Middle School (02MTBD) to Building M933 Beginning in the 2015-2016 School Year

Date of Panel Vote: May 22, 2013

Summary of Proposal

The New York City Department of Education (“DOE”) is proposing to temporarily co-locate a new district middle school (02MTBD, “New Middle School”) in new building M338 (“M338”) for the 2014-2015 school year. New building M338 is located at 515-533 West 44th Street, New York, NY 10036 in Community School District 2 (“District 2”). M338 is expected to open by the beginning of the 2013-2014 school year. New Middle School will be co-located temporarily in M338 with P.S. 51 Elias Howe (02M051, “P.S. 51”), an existing elementary school serving students in grades kindergarten through five, and P094@M338 (“P094@M338”), one site of a multi-site District 75 (“D75”) school, 75M094. P094@M338 will open in the 2013-2014 school year and will serve students in kindergarten through second grade. At M338, New Middle School will serve students in grade six.

After the 2014-2015 school year, New Middle School will move out of M338 to building M933 (“M933”), located at 425 West 33rd Street, New York, NY 10001. Building M933 currently houses M.S. 260 Clinton School Writers & Artists (02M260, “Clinton”). Clinton is expected to move out of M933 prior to the 2015-2016 school year to new building M868, at 10 East 15th Street, New York, NY, 10003. The DOE anticipates the future posting of a proposal to re-site Clinton from M933 to M868. Building M933 is a leased site, and will be the long-term site of New Middle School. Beginning in 2015-2016, New Middle School is expected to be the only school organization in building M933, where it will serve students in grades six through eight at full scale.

P.S. 51 is a zoned elementary school currently serving students in kindergarten through fifth grade at its temporary location, building M816 (“M816”), at 323 East 91st Street, New York, NY 10128. P.S. 51 is expected to move from its temporary location, M816, to its permanent location, M338, by the beginning of the 2013-2014 school year.

Once it opens in the 2013-2014 school year, P094@M338 will serve approximately 30-42 students in kindergarten through second grade who are classified as intellectually disabled,

learning disabled, autism or mentally retarded under an Individualized Education Program (“IEP”). P094@M338 will serve students in Self-Contained (“SC”) sections in 12:1:1 (twelve students with one teacher and one paraprofessional) and 6:1:1 (six students with one teacher and one paraprofessional) classroom settings. Students are placed in D75 programs based on their individual needs and recommended special education services and are referred to D75 during a period that extends into summer.

If this proposal is approved, New Middle School will open in September 2014 in M338, where it will be -co-located with P.S. 51 and P094@M338. New Middle School will admit students through the District 2 Middle School Choice Process with a limited unscreened admissions method. In the 2014-2015 school year, New Middle School will enroll students in sixth grade. For the 2015-2016 school year, New Middle School will move from M338 to its long-term location in M933 and phase in to serve students in sixth and seventh grade. In 2016-2017, when New Middle School achieves full scale, it will serve approximately 225-255 students in sixth through eighth grades.

M338 is a new building currently under construction. It is expected to have a target capacity of 640 students when it opens for the 2013-2014 school year. No school organization currently uses space at M338, since the building is under construction. In the 2014-2015 school year, when New Middle School begins its co-location with P.S. 51 and P094@M338 in building M338, the building is expected to serve approximately 343-425 students, yielding a utilization rate of 54%-66%. If this proposal is approved, there will be sufficient space in M338 to accommodate New Middle School, P.S. 51 and P094@M338 during the 2014-2015 school year.

There will be excess space in M338 prior to and during the co-location of New Middle School. The DOE does not currently have plans for the use of this space. Any significant changes to school utilization would be proposed in a separate EIS in accordance with Chancellor’s Regulation A-190 and would be subject to approval by the Panel for Educational Policy (“PEP”).

M933 has been identified as an under-utilized building. M933 has a target capacity to serve 484 students. In the current 2012-2013 school year, the building serves only 249 students, yielding a utilization rate of 51%. When New Middle School reaches full-scale in M933 in 2016-2017, it is anticipated to serve approximately 225-255 students in grades six through eight, yielding a building utilization rate of 46%-53%. If this proposal is approved, there will be sufficient space in M933 to accommodate New Middle School during its phase-in and at full scale.

If re-siting New Middle School to M933 after the 2014-2015 school year is not feasible for any reason, the DOE will re-assess the space at M338 and, if appropriate, extend the co-location, or propose an alternative siting plan. The DOE would issue a separate Educational Impact Statement (“EIS”) describing any alternate plans for New Middle School, space in M338, or space in M933.

Summary of Comments Received

A joint public hearing regarding this proposal was held at building M933 on May 9, 2013. At that hearing, interested parties had an opportunity to provide input on the proposal.

Approximately 5 members of the public attended the hearing, and 4 people spoke. Present at the meeting were Superintendent Mariano Guzman, community superintendent of District 2; Shino Tanikawa and Sarah Chu of the Community Education Council for District 2 (“CEC 2”); Principal Nancy Sing-Bock of the School Leadership Team of P.S. 51; and Jennifer Peng of the Office of Portfolio Management.

Principal Ronnie Shuster of the School Leadership Team of 75M094 was not able to attend, but submitted comment on this proposal via email.

Below is a summary of the comments received:

1. Principal Nancy Sing-Bock of P.S. 51 asserted the following:
 - a. The P.S. 51 community is very excited to move into P.S. 51’s new building, building M338.
 - b. She is also excited to be co-located with the proposed new middle school for one year. She expects that all three schools will be able to benefit from their co-location.
 - c. It is wonderful that there will be a new middle school on the west side of Manhattan.
2. Shino Tanikawa, president of CEC 2, asserted the following:
 - a. She personally supports this proposal, although she is against all co-locations. Co-locations pose challenges but this is a temporary co-location, so the challenges are less for this proposal.
 - b. It is wonderful to start a middle school in District 2 and perhaps it can partner with the two other elementary schools in M338.
 - c. It is positive to have a school start in an established place.
3. One commenter asked what the movements would be for sixth graders who would enroll in the 2014-2015 school year at this proposed new middle school.
4. One public commenter asked what the admissions would be like at the proposed new middle school and if P.S. 51 and the new middle school be one school during the new middle school’s phase-in.

The DOE received no comments through its phone line.

The DOE received one comment through its feedback email address.

5. Principal Shuster of 75M094 asserted that the P94M school community has no objection to a middle school program being co-located for one year in building M338 and that they are looking forward to sharing new space with the P.S. 51 community. Furthermore, the P94M community knows that the one year co-location with a middle school group will not inhibit that in any way.

Analysis of Issues Raised, Significant Alternatives Proposed and Changes Made to the Proposal

Comments 1a-c, 2a-c, and 5 are in support of this proposal and do not require a response.

Comment 3 concerns the one year temporary co-location and subsequent re-siting of this proposed new middle school.

Sixth graders who enroll at this proposed new middle school in the 2014-2015 school year would enroll at the new middle school at building M338, located at 515-533 West 44th Street, New York, NY 10036. There, the new middle school will be co-located with P.S. 51 and a new site of the P094 District 75 program.

The new middle school would then move to building M933, located at 425 West 33rd Street, New York, NY 10001, once the current school housed at that site, Clinton Middle School for Artists and Writers, moves out by the beginning of the 2015-2016 school year. Building M933 is the proposed long-term site of the new middle school.

Comment 4 concerns the relationship between the proposed new middle school and P.S. 51.

The new middle school and P.S. 51 will be co-located schools for the 2014-2015 school year, but will be separate schools. There is no planned expansion of P.S. 51 into the middle school grades.

With respect to the new middle school's admissions method, the new middle school is proposed to have a limited unscreened admissions method. Limited unscreened schools give admissions priority to students who demonstrate interest in the school by attending an information session, attending an open house event, or visiting the school's exhibit at any one of the Middle School Fairs.

Changes Made to the Proposal

No changes have been made to this proposal.