

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**NEW YORK CITY
DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION -
DIVISION OF
PORTFOLIO PLANNING**

**The Re-Siting of UA High School
for Emergency Management
to M520 hearing at M520**

and

**The Re-Siting of
Mather High School to M625**

and

**Opening and Co-Location of
SA - Manhattan 3 K-4
at M520/Murry Bergtraum HS**

1 [START RECORDING]

2 MS. ELAINE GORMAN: We're ready to begin. I
3 am Elaine Gorman, I'll be facilitating the
4 hearing. Thank you very much for coming out.
5 This is a joint public hearing of the Department
6 of Education, the District Two Community
7 Education Counsel, and the school leadership
8 teams of Murry Bergtraum High School for
9 Business Careers, Stephen T. Mather Building
10 Arts and Craftsmanship High School, and the
11 Urban Assembly School for Emergency Management
12 to discuss the following proposals: The
13 proposed resiting and co-location of the Urban
14 Assembly School for Emergency Management to this
15 building, M5220, beginning in the 2014-2015
16 school year; the proposed resiting and co-
17 location of Stephen T. Mather Building Arts and
18 Craftsmanship High School out of this building
19 and into Building M625, beginning in the 2014-15
20 school year; and the proposed co-location of a
21 new public elementary charter school success
22 academy charter school, New York One, in
23 building M520, beginning in the 2014-2015 school
24 year. I want to remind you that tonight's
25 proceedings will be recorded and transcribed.

1 Before we begin the hearing, we ask that
2 anybody who wishes to speak during the public
3 comment portion of the evening sign up at the
4 table in the back. Sign-ups will end as soon as
5 the dayus [phonetic] finishes their comments.
6 And only people who have signed up to speak will
7 be able to participate in the public comment.
8 Our full panel is here. And at the time that we
9 finish the reading of the full proposals we will
10 pass the microphone down, and have those that
11 wish to speak make a comment. There may be
12 elected officials who arrive. I don't see
13 anyone here at this time. But if they arrive
14 and they wish to make a statement, we will
15 provide them that space at the first opportune
16 time. Tonight's format will include a
17 presentation of the proposals and presentations
18 by hearing participants, followed by public
19 comment. We have a separate current students'
20 list in order to allow students at the school to
21 speak early, so that they can go home and do
22 their homework, and have it turned in tomorrow
23 when they come back on time. Public comments
24 are limited to two minutes, which will be in
25 force so that everyone has an ample opportunity

1 to speak. You will be given notice when you
2 have 30 seconds left, so that you can finish
3 your thoughts, and you will be asked to finish
4 your sentence when the two minutes is up. If
5 you do not get the opportunity to finish what
6 you have intended to say, I am more than happy
7 to accept those comments in writing so they can
8 be part of the public record. I would now like
9 to introduce the panel which has been assembled
10 for this evening's joint public hearing. I will
11 start at the end of the dayus with our three
12 principals, Larry, Rudy, and Lottie. We decided
13 to go first names only. Our PA president for
14 Murry Bergtraum, Valerie; our two CEC members
15 Sonni and Shino; and the District Two High
16 School superintendent Marisol Bradbury. Oh, I'm
17 sorry, Marisol. At this time I turn the program
18 over to your superintendent and the chancellor's
19 designee who will present the proposals.

20 MS. MARISOL BRADBURY: Good evening. There
21 are three proposals which could affect the use
22 of this building next year. The first two
23 proposals are for the resitings of two distinct
24 high schools. Each proposal depends on the
25 panel's approval of the other proposal. This

1 spring the Panel for Educational Policy
2 approved the co-location of a new district
3 career and technical education high school
4 called Stephen T. Mather Building Arts and
5 Craftsmanship High School in this building.
6 Construction assessments after the panel vote
7 determined that the spaces in this building
8 cannot support the structures for Mather's
9 specialized lab equipment. The Department of
10 Education is therefore proposing to resite
11 Mather High School out of this building, and
12 into the High School Graphics Communication Arts
13 building, M625. The facilities at the graphics
14 building, M625, can house the specialized lab
15 equipment needed by Mather's curriculum. The
16 DOE is simultaneously proposing to resite the
17 Urban Assemblies School for Emergency Management
18 out of the graphics building, M625, and into
19 this building. Urban Assembly Emergency
20 Management will occupy the same spaces as
21 planned for Mather. The spaces at this building
22 are able to provide Urban Assembly Emergency
23 Management with appropriate instructional
24 spaces. There are two resiting proposals. One,
25 to resite Mather out of Murry Bergtraum High

1 School for Business Careers, M520; and the
2 other to resite Urban Assembly Emergency
3 Management into M520. If both proposals are
4 approved, the two CTE high schools would
5 effectively exchange places of their respective
6 buildings. This exchange will maintain the
7 number of CTE high school options in Manhattan.
8 In these proposals the DOE also described an
9 enrollment reduction at Murry Bergtraum over the
10 course of the next four years. The enrollment
11 reduction will proceed regardless of any future
12 proposals. Various existing excess space in the
13 building and the enrollment reduction will
14 create even more excess space. This third
15 proposal is not dependent on the first two
16 resiting proposals. The Department of Education
17 is proposing to co-locate a new charter
18 elementary school, Success Academy New York One
19 with Murry Bergtraum and Urban Assembly
20 Emergency Management. The two proposals to
21 resite the high schools are independent of this
22 proposal to co-locate Success New York One. If
23 the proposal for Success is approved by the
24 panel, Success would open in the fall of 2014
25 with students in kindergarten and first grade.

1 It would reach full scale in the 2017-2018
2 school year, when it would serve students in
3 kindergarten through fourth grade. At full
4 scale Success would serve 450 to 600 students.
5 And along with Murry Bergtraum and Urban
6 Assembly Emergency Management there would be
7 1,925 to 2,155 students in the building overall,
8 with a utilization rate of 90 to 101 percent.
9 The DOE strives to ensure that all students in
10 New York City have access to a high-quality
11 school at every stage of their education. The
12 opening and co-location of Success Academy New
13 York One in building M520 is intended to provide
14 an additional option to students and families in
15 District Two. Thank you.

16 MS. SHINO TANIKAWA: Okay, my name is Shino,
17 I'm the president of the Community Education
18 Counsel for District Two. There is so much to
19 say about these proposals. It's a little hard
20 to give you a cohesive take on it, but I'll
21 start with a message from my counterparts from
22 the Citywide Counsel on High Schools. Paula
23 DeKock [phonetic], who is the president, would
24 say to the Department of Education "I told you
25 so." Now the reason Paula's not here tonight is

1 because Paul is the present of the Citywide
2 Council on High Schools, and the council is
3 having its monthly meeting tonight. So she and
4 Stanley Ing [phonetic], who is the Manhattan rep
5 on the Citywide Council for High Schools, are
6 not able to be here to say "I told you so" in
7 person. Now I told you so because about a year
8 ago I sat here at the same spot with Paula
9 discussing the creation of Stephen Mather
10 School. And at that hearing Paul posed the
11 question, because we were told it's going to be
12 a landscape, architecture, and carpentry-type
13 schools, Paul said to the DOE, are you positive,
14 are you sure that such a school that requires
15 specialized instructional space can be
16 accommodated in this building? And she was
17 told, yeah, yeah, we did the walk-through, we
18 did the analysis of the space, it's going to be
19 fine. Now a year later this new school starts,
20 and we are told, woops, this school cannot be in
21 this building. So that's where the "I told you
22 so" comes from. Paula was skeptical from the
23 beginning about this specialized school,
24 specialized in the way that it caters to a very
25 particular field, can actually be accommodated

1 in this building. If somebody had listened to
2 her we wouldn't be in this place where two brand
3 new schools have to switch places after just one
4 year. I would like to know where the planning
5 is in the Office of Portfolio Planning. We
6 can't call this planning. So that was the
7 message from the high school council. And also
8 Paula asked me to share her concern that by
9 allowing Success Academy to start in this
10 building we're losing precious high school
11 seats. When there are high school seats, or
12 high school seat capacity, we believe, and I
13 share Paula's sentiment on this, we believe that
14 high school seats should become high school
15 seats. High school seats should not be turned
16 into elementary school seats. Elementary school
17 seats should not be turned into high school
18 seats. So those are some basic notions that we
19 have. So I would like to, rather than go on and
20 on, share with you a resolution that the
21 Community Education Council District Two passed
22 at its September meeting on all three proposals
23 together. And if you just bear with me, I'd
24 like to read it to you. Resolution number 72,
25 calling for the withdrawal of the proposal to

1 co-locate Success Academy Charter School New
2 York One with Murry Bergtraum High School.
3 Whereas, despite having opened these new zoned
4 elementary schools in the last four years--
5 three, I'm sorry--despite having opened three
6 new zoned elementary schools in the last four
7 years, lower Manhattan continues to experience
8 overcrowding resulting in wait lists. Whereas
9 Speaker Silver has continued to convene the Task
10 Force on School Overcrowding, where principals
11 and parents reported on the overcrowded
12 conditions in the schools in lower Manhattan.
13 Whereas parents and community members in lower
14 Manhattan have continued to make the case for
15 the need to build another elementary school
16 south of Canal Street. Whereas the Department
17 of Education has agreed to reevaluate the
18 population projection, and the need for school
19 seats in lower Manhattan. And the preliminary
20 analysis shows the planning subdistrict south of
21 14th Street will require 1,000 additional
22 elementary seats. Whereas parents in lower
23 Manhattan have expressed their desire for a
24 zoned neighborhood elementary school with a
25 certainty of admission, meaning no wait list.

1 And they have not asked for more choices in
2 the elementary schools, particular in the form
3 of a charter school. Whereas the Community
4 Education Council District Two has passed two
5 resolutions against co-location of charter
6 schools, one of them citing Success Academy
7 Charter School specifically, and those are
8 resolutions number 30 and 54. Whereas the CECD2
9 has passed a resolution calling for moratorium
10 on charter school applications in district two,
11 that's resolution number 58. Whereas the CECD2
12 questions the merit of co-locating an elementary
13 school with a high school, whose facility needs
14 are very different from those of the elementary
15 schools. And there's concern for the potential
16 impact of the co-location on the high school
17 students, potential loss of instructional space,
18 the disruption associated with relocating rooms,
19 et cetera. Whereas the CECD2 is also concerned
20 about the safety of elementary school students
21 sharing the building with high school students,
22 particularly when anecdotal evidence indicates.
23 Charter school administrations are often
24 unwilling to work with the host public school
25 administrations such as the Success Academy

1 Charter School, Hell's Kitchen, whose
2 administration has refused to attend advisory
3 committee meetings to develop a safety plan.
4 Whereas the co-location proposal has been
5 released before the charter application for
6 Success Academy Charter New York One is approved
7 or rejected. Whereas the Department of
8 Education has released multiple co-location
9 proposals all over the city, seemingly in the
10 rush to implement as many co-locations as
11 possible before the end of the current
12 administration. And the CECD2 is uncertain
13 about the thoroughness of the planning behind
14 these proposals. Rush planning last year led to
15 the creation of Stephen Mather Building Arts and
16 Craftsmanship High School in M550, whose
17 facilities cannot accommodate the new school's
18 curriculum needs, necessitating a building swap
19 with the Urban Assembly School for Emergency
20 Management. Whereas clearly creating and siting
21 new schools requires careful and thorough
22 planning, which the Department of Education has
23 not demonstrated on a consistent basis. And
24 relocation schools, particularly start-up
25 schools, is disrupting to the students and the

1 faculty creating unnecessary challenges.
2 Therefore be resolved that the Community
3 Education Council District Two urges the
4 Department of Education to withdraw the
5 proposal to co-locate Success Academy Charter
6 School New York One. Therefore be it further
7 resolved that the Community Education Council
8 District Two urges the Department of Education
9 to conduct a thorough review of all current co-
10 location proposals before releasing them
11 publicly, and moving to the joint public hearing
12 phase. I apologize for the long-winded
13 resolution, but I wanted to share that with you.
14 We do not oppose the swapping of the two high
15 schools, because I think that swap is a
16 necessity for the schools to thrive. What we
17 object to is the rushed planning process that
18 led to this result. So with that, I'll hand my
19 mic over to my colleague, Sonni Mun, our second
20 CEC member. Thank you.

21 MS. SONNI MUN: Hi. So I'm speaking as a
22 CEC member, but I'm also speaking as somebody
23 who lives about--I live about a seven-minute
24 walk from this building. And I have been
25 talking to everybody that I know that live

1 around here, because hearing about the charter
2 school, in particular, was something that we
3 were not aware of until very recently. And we
4 are actually--I have to say, I'm a little
5 offended to hear the phrase "giving the
6 community what they want." Nobody in this
7 community has asked for a charter school here.
8 It was never anything where the community was
9 asked in terms of asking if that's what they
10 wanted. I send my son to a public school in the
11 Gary building. There's another public
12 elementary school opening at Texslip [phonetic].
13 This is the third elementary school that they
14 will be opening right here in this neighborhood.
15 We have a looming crisis in middle schools. We
16 have 17 middle schools in District Two, 34
17 elementary schools. And we had a problem with
18 placing middle school students last year. And
19 these Success Academy students, they're not
20 going to be from this district, because this
21 area has not asked for this. I don't want to
22 deny anybody the best education. Everybody has
23 the right to the best education in their
24 neighborhood, and I don't want to deny that.
25 But this is not how this is accomplished. I

1 think it's also--I think it's unacceptable
2 that the educational impact statement clearly
3 says that when this building is at full
4 utilization it'll be over 100 percent. And the
5 only statement that they make about that is, we
6 will ensure that everybody will get their own
7 space. I don't trust them, why should I trust
8 them? Look what happened with Mathers. They're
9 clearly not thinking about the students. If
10 they had this wouldn't happen. And now the plan
11 is for a school that will be over 100 percent
12 utilization, that's unacceptable. There's
13 clearly some issues that have to be addressed at
14 Murry Bergtraum. It has a very--it's highly
15 regarded. It has a past history of being a
16 great school. The way to address any issues now
17 is not to shove a school that they don't want,
18 that the community doesn't want. Thank you.

19 MS. GORMAN RPA president from Murry
20 Bergtraum.

21 MS. VALERIE ROMAN: Hello, my name is
22 Valerie Roman, and I am representing the SLT. I
23 am also president of the Parents' Association.
24 I'm a mother. And I'm going to sit here for the
25 next couple of minutes and speak to you as a

1 mother. My son is a freshman here at Murry
2 Bergtraum. I base his decision to come here on
3 the programs that are offered at Murry Bergtraum
4 High School. I did not base it on the negative
5 factors that are here in all these little
6 pamphlets that say why you came to the decision
7 of wanting to push our children out. I based
8 the decision on the programs that the school
9 offers. You got to look past the negative in
10 order to develop the positive. These kids
11 deserve what they get, which is an education
12 here on Pearl Street. This is their building,
13 this belongs to them. Our decision makers made
14 this decision without thinking about the
15 children involved, without thinking about the
16 administrators who take the time to walk into
17 this building, punch in to educate our children.
18 The decisions were not made for them. Yes, you
19 know what, we may not be an A school. Work with
20 us to help us become what we once were, which
21 was at one time when the schools didn't have
22 letters, when they didn't carry all these
23 reports and all these statistics, this was a
24 really good school, and it still is. Not every
25 child that walks in through these doors walks in

1 because they want to chill out. They're not
2 walking in here because they want to hang out.
3 A good majority of them are looking for what?
4 They're looking for a chance to get a diploma.
5 But if we keep on pushing our children, then
6 what's happening? We're not thinking from the
7 heart anymore. We're not thinking on behalf of
8 these who are future citizens. And we keep on
9 pushing them out. Shame on everybody. Shame on
10 everybody behind the decision to say Murry
11 Bergtraum, sure, let's minimize the numbers
12 within the next couple of years. Where are
13 these kids going? Where are they going to go if
14 we keep on bringing in these chartered programs,
15 we're pushing our own out. Where did you go to
16 school? I went to Norman Thomas [phonetic]. Do
17 I need to tell you what Norman Thomas is now?
18 It is not what it used to be, because it got
19 broken into different schools. I'm a mother, I
20 look for what is best for my child. Murry
21 Bergtraum right now is what is best for my
22 child. The programs offered here is what is
23 best for my child. Then I walk in here, and I
24 find out what? Now you tell me, and you want to
25 feed me, that bringing in little children to

1 share space with big children is logical.
2 Please explain to me that logic, tell me where
3 it's coming from. I'm the mother of a five-year
4 old. When the kids are outside, I protect my
5 five-year old, because you know what, you're
6 among all these big kids, these teenagers. So
7 now I need to displace my Murry Bergtraum
8 students--which is 1700 in case you didn't know,
9 and I'm speaking on behalf of all my parents--
10 now I need to displace my big kids the way they
11 come in, the way they walk around, the way they
12 use their facility, the floors, the programs
13 that are available. Where are they going to be
14 able to do that? I walked in into one of the
15 classrooms when I was here talking to each and
16 every class that I can get to. And I walked
17 into the student government office--and it
18 brought back some really nice memories--when I
19 saw all of them working hand in hand doing a
20 massive mailing that just went out a few days
21 ago. Now for a school that supposedly is doing
22 so bad, according to your black and white paper
23 here, you needed to walk into that room where
24 there were 17 students, during their lunch hour,
25 helping administration and volunteering to make

1 this a better place, and to get the message
2 out. Where were our decision makers then? I
3 have kids that I have met--and I mind you,
4 September, I've only been here for a month and
5 change--I have met, 'cause I made it my
6 business--'cause now I represent the parents of
7 this school--I made it my business to meet a
8 couple of students. I know students who already
9 have scholarships line up, right here, Murry
10 Bergtraum D School. I met students who are
11 talking about their FAFSA, trying to reach out
12 to each other, talking about college. One
13 senior was talking to a freshman, you got to
14 join the program. Syracuse, the program is
15 amazing. Encouraging, peer mentoring, that's
16 important. And yes, I've also witnessed the
17 fights. You know what? Let's work on making
18 that better so that it doesn't happen. To every
19 good there is a bad, such is life. But our kids
20 deserve a chance, and we're taking it away from
21 them. Bringing in a charter school to the
22 community, from what I have seen and from what I
23 have gone out there these last couple of weeks
24 talking to people, you're bringing in a school
25 that's going to benefit not the local community.

1 It's not benefiting the local community, so
2 why bring it in here? If you're going to do
3 something with the intention of helping the
4 community, then help the community. The current
5 schools that are in here, the current students
6 that are in here, let's work with what we have.
7 Let's progress with what we have, instead of
8 disrupting and making more changes. Our
9 students, our young kids, are so disenchanting.
10 And it's because we adults don't think through.
11 You're saying that you're doing it in the
12 benefit of who? It better not be yourselves, it
13 should be for them. It always has to be for
14 them. And I'm always a mother first, will
15 always be a mother first. I am really truly,
16 truly ashamed of the fact that we as adults
17 claim to be doing right by them, and we're
18 selfishly not even considering them. In these
19 panels, did anybody reach out to them? Did
20 anyone hear them speak? Has anyone heard them
21 speak? That's what needs to happen. Mathers,
22 it's a good school. There was poor planning
23 there, now you have to fix that. I completely
24 understand. I can't fix yesterday, but I'm
25 going to give you a fight for tomorrow. You

1 want to bring in young children. I'm a mother
2 of a young child. If you bring in these little
3 children, you better triple that security.
4 These guys have a hard enough time as it is.
5 You want to bring in little ones, you're going
6 to have lots of problems. And you can't favor,
7 'cause all of our kids are young, they're all
8 underage. You cannot pick a five- and six-year
9 old over that 14-, 15-year old. You can't
10 harass them because they too are minors. They
11 have rights, they are citizens. They are your
12 future votes, they are your future, they can be
13 your future president. I've met some pretty
14 amazing voices in this building, and it's only
15 been five weeks. They're going places, don't
16 push them out anymore. Give them a fighting
17 chance. Thank you.

18 MS. GORMAN Thank you very much, and thank
19 the panel for their service. At this time the
20 speakers' list is now closed. We'd like to
21 allow our electives to have an opportunity to
22 say some words if they choose. City
23 Councilwoman Margaret Chin. She will be
24 followed by Community Board Tricia Joyce.

25 MS. MARGARET CHIN: Thank you, good evening.

1 I'm Councilwoman Margaret Chin. I'm here
2 tonight to speak in opposition to the co-
3 location being proposed in Murry Bergtraum. We
4 have heard from school leaders in opposition to
5 this co-location for a number of reason.
6 Everyone expressed concern that DOE is looking
7 to put an elementary school in a high school
8 building. And when I mentioned that to DOE, of
9 course they say, oh, we've done it in other
10 schools and it's okay. But it's not okay here.
11 I don't think it's ever okay to put young
12 children together with high school student. And
13 in this building it's a high school, and we need
14 high school seats, and we need to preserve that.
15 Also, DOE has their impact statement. Their
16 impact statement never say there's any negative
17 impact. But we know there is not enough space.
18 When you have Murry Bergtraum High School,
19 you're proposing a CTE high school in here,
20 there's no more room for another school,
21 especially an elementary school. And frankly
22 speaking, DOE does not have a good history of
23 doing through investigation of the suitability
24 of the space before co-locating schools in Murry
25 Bergtraum. Last year they put a CTE landscape

1 architectural school in this building. I
2 remember people raising issues about lab space.
3 Where are they going to do the landscaping?
4 It's not really appropriate. But DOE say, no
5 it's fine, it's appropriate. They put them in
6 here and they realized not enough ventilation,
7 problem with lab space. And now they got to
8 swap with another CTE school. So I think DOE
9 need to figure out how this co-location is going
10 to work between Murry Bergtraum and another CTE
11 school, before they even start thinking about
12 bringing in an elementary school that is a
13 charter school in our district. And you have
14 heard from the CEC, and then you will hear also
15 from our local community board that are here
16 tonight. We have overcrowding in our elementary
17 school in District One in lower Manhattan.
18 We're fighting to find new space. You never ask
19 us before you site a charter school down here,
20 an elementary charter school that nobody ask
21 for. We need local schools for our kids. Local
22 elementary school, local middle school that's
23 going to serve the kids in our neighborhood.
24 Charter school kids come from all over the city,
25 okay? That's not what we need here. So I am

1 asking DOE and the PEF [phonetic] to listen to
2 the school, to listen to the student, to listen
3 to the teacher and the parent, and change their
4 position, because this is really inappropriate.
5 And furthermore, I want to make sure that all
6 these location is not, nor intention DOE, to try
7 to phase out Murry Bergtraum, okay? 'Cause that
8 is unacceptable. Murry Bergtraum had a
9 wonderful reputation. And I think the
10 administration, the new principal, and the
11 faculty, and the parents are working to build
12 this school community, and we have to give our
13 kids a fighting chance. So you better not be
14 thinking about phasing them out by putting all
15 these school in here. So we're asking you just
16 to stop this idea, and we're against this co-
17 location. Thank you very much.

18 MS. TRICIA JOYCE: I am Tricia Joyce, the
19 chair of the Youth and Education Committee for
20 Community Board One. Good evening, thanks for
21 the opportunity to comment on this important
22 issue. At our full board meeting on September
23 24th, the Youth and Education Committee and the
24 Community Board won unanimously, passed a
25 resolution in support of the CEC resolution that

1 Shino so eloquently read earlier. So a lot of
2 our points are similar, but in some ways we have
3 some other things we wanted to add. CD1 is very
4 concerned about the proposed co-location of
5 Success Academy Charter School within building
6 M520. And the proposal for an additional
7 charter school within our community is at
8 complete and total odds with the current needs
9 of our community. Schools in CD1 have faced
10 chronic overcrowding and wait lists over the
11 past several years. And our schools have
12 resorted to enlarging class sizes, repurposing
13 classrooms to meet this rising demand at a time
14 of budget cuts. As a result, our schools are
15 overcrowded, our students lack the level of
16 education, attention, and resources they deserve
17 and need. The DOE has recently promised to
18 include 1,000 school seats in lower Manhattan in
19 the next five-year capital plan. This is great
20 news and we're very appreciative. But we're
21 years out of realizing this building. The
22 siting of an additional charter school within
23 our district is not responsive to local parents
24 who have repeatedly called for additional zoned
25 schools. CD1 is also concerned about the safety

1 of any elementary students who attends Success
2 Academy if this plan is approved. We are
3 unfortunately all too familiar with safety
4 issues at Murry Bergtraum, due to a series of
5 incidents that have taken place in recent years
6 in and around the schools. Such incidents have
7 been reported about in the local and citywide
8 media. These incidents have continued this
9 year, and in fact taken place in recent days.
10 The safety of all students is of the utmost
11 importance to us, and we find it an
12 inappropriate place for young students to be in
13 the same facility as high school--of a high
14 school student designed as an impact school.
15 I'm sorry, I'm reading this for the first time.
16 Additionally, CD1 is concerned that building
17 utilization plan under consideration has not
18 been fully vetted. This proposal has been
19 handled in a hurried manner, and we believe that
20 access to shared facilities--gyms, lunchrooms,
21 auditoriums, and staircases--would be inadequate
22 for these children and the students in building
23 M250. The DOE has also proposed to relocate
24 Stephen Mather Building Arts and Crafts in the
25 high school after one year in the building, due

1 to insufficient facilities for their
2 curriculum. In its place, DOE proposes to site
3 both the Urban Assembly School for Emergency
4 Management, and the Success Academy Charter
5 School, for 2014-15. Given the DOE's track
6 record of rushing co-locations, we are very
7 skeptical and concerned about the agency's
8 ability to site two schools in the same year,
9 and do not believe it would best serve the
10 educational needs of any of these students. It
11 is also noteworthy that the co-location proposal
12 was released prior to the charter application
13 for Success Academy Charter being approved,
14 which is inconsistent with due process.

15 Finally, CD1 passed a resolution on February
16 22nd, 2011 opposing the co-location of charter
17 schools in all public schools. In light of the
18 dramatic need from our locally-zoned schools,
19 and the concerns about security-shared
20 facilities, all of these yet to be addressed and
21 answered, CD1 recommends that the Panel of
22 Educational Policy vote against this proposed
23 siting. Thank you very much.

24 MS. GORMAN Thank you very much. We thank
25 the councilwoman and the community board for

1 their participation. At this time we have 11
2 students who have signed up to speak. We will
3 do the students and then the adults. We will do
4 the students who are also young adults, but then
5 the older adults, to state it correctly. I'd
6 like to call up numbers 1 through 4 to line up
7 at the mic. That's Cindy, Victor, looks like J-
8 -the last name is Austin--Leslie, and number 5,
9 N-S-A-M-A, I apologize.

10 MS. CINDY MOLENA: Thank you.

11 MS. GORMAN Cindy, before you begin, I want
12 to remind the students, you have two minutes.
13 The time people will tell you. I also want to
14 remind people that the applause may take away
15 from their time or their ability to be heard. I
16 will pause after every five speakers so you can
17 applause all at one time. Cindy, you may begin.

18 MS. MOLENA: My name is Cindy Molena
19 [phonetic], and I go to Murry Bergtraum, I am a
20 senior here. I am vice president of student
21 government, and I've been in student government
22 for the past three years. I am also a part of
23 the FWA, the moot court and mock trial team, and
24 HS, and part of a lot of extracurriculars here,
25 so I consider Murry Bergtraum like a second home

1 to me. And sometimes I'm here to like about 8
2 o'clock in the night helping the faculty, being
3 here, just helping with what I can do. And I
4 see a lot of students, when they come into the
5 government office, they come to us for guidance.
6 They ask us, where can I get a MetroCard, where
7 can I get this, or when can I get the other? We
8 help teachers with their bulletin boards. We
9 help a lot of the students here, and the
10 teachers, in general, as well. So when I hear
11 that we're going to have another school come in
12 on top of an elementary charter school that's
13 going to take up our space in the cafeteria, it
14 makes me think, where are these students going
15 to go when they look for guidance? Where are
16 these teachers going to go when they want a
17 favor from us? We don't hesitate to help any of
18 them. In fact, that's what we're here for. And
19 we know that when we signed up to be in student
20 government, this is what our job was going to
21 be. A lot of us are here because we want to
22 help, we want to be a part of our school
23 community. For me to be a part of the moot
24 court and mock trial team has been an amazing
25 experience. And this year I might even get to

1 go into international moot court. So for me
2 to come to this school, and know that the future
3 generations that come after us won't be able to
4 have what we have, it makes me think then, how
5 are they going to be encouraged to help the way
6 we helped? How will they want to help? So I
7 think that, before any decisions are made, there
8 should be a lot of careful thinking and planning
9 to be considered. And also to consider the way
10 this is going to affect the students that are
11 already going here. We have a new freshmen
12 academy that just entered, so their next four
13 years are going to be highly affected by this.

14 MS. GORMAN Thank you, Cindy. Victor.
15 Victor, you may begin.

16 MR. VICTOR TAVAREZ: My name is Victor
17 Tavarez [phonetic], I'm a senior here at Murry
18 Bergtraum. So coming ninth grade I vied to
19 transfer out, so I can see the misconceptions
20 that a lot of people have affiliated at first
21 glance. But today I stand here president of the
22 National Honor Society, CEO of student
23 government, part of the mock trial moot court
24 team, and part of many of the organizations that
25 this school has to offer. So I understand

1 firsthand exactly what the school has. Last
2 year, with the decision to bring in Mather
3 School, we lost 52 teachers. We will continue
4 to bring in more school, losing more space,
5 we'll continue to lose more space for our
6 extracurriculars, more space for our teachers,
7 things that are so precious to us, that even our
8 basic rights will be given up. We would have
9 to--we would be truly second-class citizens in
10 our own school, because we would have to
11 accommodate the kindergartners that come into...
12 And, just for the sake of time, and I'm very
13 nervous, so I would like to remind those that
14 are running for office next year, or the
15 following years, to become represents of the
16 city, that we will be the future voters of this
17 school. So keep in mind the decisions made here
18 today will not be forgotten.

19 MS. GORMAN Thank you. Please, you may
20 begin.

21 MR. JADON AUSTIN: Hello, my name is Jadon
22 [phonetic] Austin, and I'm a freshman of
23 Syracuse University Project Advancement. That's
24 like part of Murry Bergtraum School. And we
25 just came in here, like we just started off, and

1 already they're putting restrictions on us.
2 We won't be able to walk in hallways as the same
3 as are we now. And how would you guys like if
4 we came from our high school and came to your
5 guys' kindergarten, and just stayed there?
6 That's all.

7 MS. GORMAN Thank you very much. Leslie.

8 MS. LESLIE VALOSE: Hello, my name is Leslie
9 Valose [phonetic], and I am a senior here at
10 Murry Bergtraum High School. Please bear with
11 us, we have nothing written, and we're all
12 speaking from the heart, because this is
13 something that really hits close to home. So
14 here at Murry Bergtraum I am the co-president of
15 student government, I am in the FWA, mock trial
16 moot court, National Honor Society, you name it,
17 I'm probably in it. But with here in Murry
18 Bergtraum High School, offices like student
19 government, senior office, all of the amazing
20 things we have here, provides the student with
21 the fundamental intellectual confidence that we
22 need to strive, not only in the school, but in
23 college. Because, yes, we are a D school, and
24 almost everyone here is going to college. We
25 all have dreams, we all strive for things. And

1 everything that we do, we try to help each
2 other. This really is a community. And even
3 though we do have these bad things going, we
4 have so much going on here at the school, and
5 we're trying, we are really trying to become a
6 better school, and have an example, and change
7 the status quo here. So please leave us with
8 what we have here, because we need the space to
9 grow.

10 MS. GORMAN Thank you very much. Lynn Sama
11 [phonetic]. As Lynn Sama speaks, could we also
12 have Heaven [phonetic], Edwin, B-E-G-U-M, I
13 apologize, last name Wood.

14 MS. LYNN SAMA: Hello everyone, my names
15 Lynn Sama. I am currently the senior class
16 president, and I am part of a whole bunch of
17 extracurricular activities here in Murry
18 Bergtraum. And when I first applied to this
19 school, I wanted to come here because they had
20 focuses in a career I was thinking of at that
21 age. And while in the school, I've been opened
22 to many new opportunities. I've been allowed to
23 try things my own way, and learn a whole bunch
24 of new things. And I was taught that there are
25 many other options. And regardless of

1 everything that does happen in this school, we
2 still have faculty that cares for us, and cares
3 for our betterment, and pushes us, and makes
4 sure we do what we have to do. And that's how
5 we have the kids like myself, and all the kids
6 here that are trying to go forward with their
7 lives. We stay here late at night, we work
8 hard. We make sure we do what we have to do.
9 And it's unfair for us to have to share with
10 little kids, and have everything that has been
11 open to us reduced because things aren't planned
12 properly. I'm originally from Africa, and I
13 have seen people suffer. And I see that there
14 are people that don't have the opportunities
15 that we have, and the fact that Murry Bergtraum
16 offers us things such as Syracuse Project
17 Advance. Students are allowed to take
18 leadership in the school. We're allowed to
19 communicate with staff, staff is here for us.
20 We're provided with tutoring and all kinds of
21 help. All these facilities use spaces like the
22 cafeteria, the auditorium, they had offices down
23 here. So when you bring in new schools to this
24 school, you spoil everything for us. We don't
25 have these facilities anymore, we're not able to

1 use them. And we're uncomfortable in a place
2 that we thought of as a home.

3 MS. GORMAN Thank you. Heaven. Heaven, you
4 may begin. Heaven will be followed by Edwin.

5 MS. HEAVEN WONG: Okay, my name is Heaven
6 Wong, and I'm a senior here at Murry Bergtraum
7 High School. Like a lot of the other kids that
8 spoke, I'm a part of numerous programs. Some of
9 them, like I'm the secretary of the senior
10 office, which is located in the lunchroom. I'm
11 also part of student government, the office is
12 also located in the lunchroom. And the YWCA,
13 that office is also in the lunchroom. If the
14 kids were to come in, we wouldn't be able to
15 have those offices, which means that those
16 programs would have to either be relocated,
17 which is unlikely because we're losing space, so
18 more than likely they'd have to close. Mainly,
19 we lose more opportunities, added on to what we
20 already lost this year with the Mathers coming
21 in. Another school coming in, having two extra
22 schools, is already taking more space that we
23 don't have. And of course we also mention that
24 we have this bad rep. But of course it's always
25 some bad apples in the pickings. We're not that

1 bad. As you've seen this evening, we've had
2 numerous students who are part of multiple
3 things that are doing good things for this
4 community. We're the future leaders of America.

5 MS. GORMAN Thank you. Edwin. Edwin will
6 be followed by--I believe the last name is B-E-
7 G-U-M, I apologize.

8 EDWIN: All right, my name's Edwin. There's
9 a quote Plato once said, "the measure of a man
10 is what he does with power." And I want to
11 become that man. I want to make the change so
12 Bergtraum could stay Bergtraum, and that one day
13 it could be the best it could be one day. Like
14 right now I'm standing nervous, and I'm
15 uncomfortable here speaking to you. You know
16 why? Because I want the freshmen to have the
17 best education they can. Not just for me,
18 because they're going to be - - and eventually
19 change society. I mean I get uncomfortable
20 speaking so... But I really want Bergtraum to
21 stay Bergtraum because, you know, if you guys
22 aren't doing it, I'm doing it.

23 MS. GORMAN Thank you. You may begin.

24 MS. ROMY BEGUM: Hello, my name is Romy
25 [phonetic] Begum, I'm co-president of student

1 government. And what I would like to say is,
2 like what everyone said, we're part of many
3 different organizations in the school. We have
4 a lot to offer. And this school, as big as it
5 is, but we have so much space and so much
6 potential to be better than what we are. And--
7 I'm sorry.

8 MS. GORMAN It's okay, go ahead.

9 MS. BEGUM: Okay, this--like I've been in
10 government since freshman year. And ever since
11 freshman year I've been staying late with the
12 school helping with mailings, with bulletin
13 boards, with everything. And I've seen what
14 this school went through since freshman year.
15 We've been through two different principals,
16 we've been through so much thing, violence,
17 everything. We got through all of that. And
18 this school could do so much more. And this
19 really hurts. Even though it's my last year in
20 this school, I want this school to be better. I
21 want it to go on even more for the next 100
22 years. Like I want it to be like... I'm sorry.

23 MS. GORMAN You have nothing to apologize
24 for.

25 MS. BEGUM: We really want this school to be

1 better, like I was saying. And all of us
2 here, we're here in front of you because we
3 don't want another school to come in and take up
4 our space. We don't want to--we want our kids
5 to feel safe. And bringing in little kids, how
6 do you know that they will feel safe in this
7 school?

8 MS. GORMAN Thank you. Last name is Wood, I
9 think that's the last name. Last name Wood?
10 Then we'll call our last two students, Justin
11 and David.

12 MR. JUSTIN WOOD: My name is Justin, I'm a
13 student here at Murry Bergtraum High School. My
14 heart's beating out of my chest, just to let you
15 know. I'm an 11th grader here. I'm the
16 president of the Caribbean Students'
17 Association, I'm a partisan government, the
18 green team here in Murry Bergtraum. And when I
19 first started out applying for high schools, I
20 took the special eds high school test. So I got
21 into Brooklyn Tech and other things. But I
22 didn't want to go there 'cause I lived in
23 Brooklyn, and I hate it there, it's so quiet.
24 So the first school that I applied for was Murry
25 Bergtraum. And the only reason why I applied

1 for this school and put it in my first choice,
2 was because of the programs it offered. Like,
3 for instance, the Summer Bridge Program, we
4 don't have that anymore because apparently we
5 were downsizing. And now we added Mathers, and
6 that's not only--it's really good for, you know,
7 some others, some other kids that go to Mathers,
8 but it's also somewhat of an inconvenience,
9 'cause we had to share part of the school. And
10 that totally takes apart from the schedules.
11 Like, for instance, it used to take me two
12 minutes to get to class, now it takes me 10.
13 And also adding this elementary school or
14 kindergarten, this also takes space from us.
15 And we've been here and, you know, we can't--we
16 already share space with one school, why with
17 another school? It would totally be a very
18 large inconvenience to all of us. But--thank
19 you.

20 MS. GORMAN Thank you, Justin. David, when
21 you're ready you can begin.

22 MR. DAVID RIVERA: Hello everybody, my name
23 is David Rivera. I am a freshman at Murry
24 Bergtraum High School for Business Careers. I
25 speak on behalf for all the freshmens. And the

1 first thing I want to get across is, I've seen
2 all the YouTube videos. I've seen the girls in
3 the bathroom fighting, I've seen all of that.
4 But you know what I didn't see until I got into
5 this school? I didn't see all the good. I
6 didn't see the people staying here until 9
7 o'clock at night working their gluteus maximuses
8 off, as you will. I didn't see that, I didn't
9 see all these kids spending extra time, spending
10 their lunch periods, for everything else,
11 they're mailing. As said before, they are
12 spending their free time. And me, myself, I've
13 seen a lot of good. I've seen also the bad.
14 I've seen the fights, I've seen all of that, as
15 I said just now. But on behalf of Murry
16 Bergtraum, I don't think bringing in an
17 elementary school will benefit this. Right now
18 I have troubles going to my mathematics class,
19 because that's a maneuver around Mathers.
20 That's a maneuver around that. That is a three-
21 minute maneuver, if you will. I lose--I am late
22 to my mathematics class because I have that
23 school there. And then if you bring in an
24 elementary school, what more are you going to
25 take from me? I am late to my mathematics

1 class. I'm not good at math, by the way. I
2 struggle with math, I am horrible with math.
3 And then I'm late to that period. I don't enjoy
4 being late. I wake up every morning at 4:40 in
5 the morning, 4:40 every single day, just to get
6 here. And then that train ride is two hours.
7 I'm on the train for two hours. And then I get
8 here, and I love this school. You don't know
9 how much I love this school. In the no more
10 than five weeks in this school, I've been
11 exposed to love, I've been exposed to caring,
12 I've been exposed to empathy towards those that
13 need the extra push. Murry Bergtraum was not my
14 first choice. I had all these big aspirations.
15 My mother, Valerie Roman, put it there as the
16 third choice. No other school wanted me. Only
17 Murry Bergtraum gave me the benefit of the
18 doubt. And then I promise you, I will make this
19 the best opportunity for me as I can. As a
20 freshman, I have four more years to go, I'm just
21 starting. Right now I'm president--sorry, I'm
22 sorry. Oh, I'm sorry, time is up. Right now I
23 am president of media. I'm making the video to
24 make this school look better. I'm trying to
25 make this school better. I'm trying to get rid

1 of all this bad images. I'm getting rid of
2 it. And then you want to come here and then
3 bring all these papers saying Murry Bergtraum is
4 a bad school, when you haven't come here
5 yourself.

6 MS. GORMAN I want to thank the students who
7 took their time to come and exercise their right
8 to speak. I know you said you were nervous.
9 You represented yourselves and your school very
10 well. Congratulations. We have eight speakers.
11 We will start with John L. Frank [phonetic],
12 followed by Alice O'Neil [phonetic], and
13 Brendan, whose last name I can't read, I
14 apologize. John, you may begin.

15 MR. JOHN L. FRANKTON: Okay, thank you very
16 much. My name is John L. Frankton [phonetic],
17 I'm the FT chapter leader here at Murry
18 Bergtraum. I've been here since 1986. And I
19 was here on September 11th, 2001 when we had to
20 do the duck and cover. We had to scramble out
21 of this building. And I had to send my students
22 either over the Brooklyn Bridge or uptown to get
23 home safely. So when I heard there was
24 discussion about putting an elementary school
25 here in the bunker, we are next to a high-value

1 target. That's why we have to walk through
2 all this police security to get into this
3 building. It makes absolutely no sense, just
4 from a security point of view. Just set aside
5 all the pedagogical and space utilization
6 issues. It just makes absolutely no sense, and
7 that's what I wanted to focus on here. In
8 addition, we still have egress issues in this
9 building. Sure, we have fire drills, and we go
10 out all three exits. But in a real emergency,
11 are we going to have all three exits? Most
12 probably not. Now when you leave this building,
13 I want you to take a look. When you walk out
14 the main building, look at all the police vans
15 lined up there. And imagine for a moment an
16 emergency situation where that's our only egress
17 out of the building, and there's 2,000 souls
18 trying to get out of this building. Take a look
19 at that, okay? These guys, my students, I can
20 send them on their way if necessary. But what
21 are we going to do with elementary school
22 children, four-, five-years old, in such a
23 situation? It makes absolutely no sense from a
24 safety perspective, okay? Thank you very much.

25 MS. GORMAN Thank you, John. Alice O'Neil,

1 followed by Brendan and Antonio.

2 MS. ALICE O'NEIL: So good evening, my name
3 is Alice O'Neil, I'm the UFT Manhattan high
4 school district representative. I also teach
5 ninth grade every single morning at Finance
6 [phonetic] High School. Our CEC councilwoman is
7 exactly correct when she states that we should
8 not trust Eva Moskowitz [phonetic]. Last year
9 her intention--initially when she entered the
10 Brandice [phonetic] Building was for the
11 kindergarten school. And then what does she do?
12 She tries to put a middle school in there. But
13 more egregious than that, than breaking a
14 promise, is she wanted Innovation Diploma Plus,
15 which is 100 percent African-American, Latino
16 student population, that the plan was for them
17 to move to District Six, not in the eighties on
18 the upper-west side, and for her to expand her
19 middle school. So there was a collective effort
20 with the students, the teachers, the principals,
21 and the community that that is unacceptable.
22 Now I don't know if everyone in here knows who
23 Eva Moskowitz is, who makes over \$450,000 a
24 year, quite frankly, off the backs of our
25 students. But what I see at the Washington

1 Irving campus, when we have a system where
2 white parents do not have to go through
3 scanning, but parents of colored do, because
4 it's assumed that those students are the high
5 school students, that is wrong. When you have a
6 meeting, and you are correct that they do not
7 participate on the graphics campus, when the
8 businesses for school is told, that there
9 students should stand back during a fire drill
10 for the kindergartners, that's what we're
11 teaching? Is that what we're supposed to teach
12 our students? And I am not against any student
13 in New York City. I am not against any teacher
14 in New York City. What we are against as a
15 union is having co-locations where there is no
16 input from the community, where there is no need
17 to reduce high school seats, when we need more
18 high school seats. We need more transfer
19 schools, we need more GED programs, we need
20 larger space. As the chapter leader said to me
21 privately, where are the children going to play?
22 Is the playground going to be on the roof? It's
23 always wrong. And it's always wrong to
24 segregate us. And yes, just like the chapter
25 leader within the Brandice campus said, it is

1 never appropriate to think that it's okay for
2 our students to work in the kitchen, but it's
3 not okay for them to go to school in the same
4 neighborhood. I understand time is up. I'm
5 taking it literally and figuratively. Time is
6 up for Eva Moskowitz. She canceled school, she
7 canceled school. I would like to know, which
8 New York City Department of Education principal
9 would not be under investigation for that.
10 There's no principal who wouldn't be under
11 investigation, or teacher, for canceling school
12 to, what, so she become a millionaire? I
13 understand, her best friend is a
14 multibillionaire. But we all need the same
15 access, and this access is not equal.

16 MS. GORMAN Thank you, Alice. So we're
17 actually going to leave the mic that way. You
18 can talk from the side, because the feedback
19 will get to you. This is Brendan, followed by
20 Antonio.

21 MR. BRENDAN MULLENS: Hi, my name is Brendan
22 Mullens [phonetic]. I student taught here in
23 Murry Bergtraum back in 2004. And I didn't get
24 the job right away because my certification
25 wasn't through yet, and I had to return back to

1 Albany to sub for a year and a half. And I
2 subbed in a lot of schools. Everything from the
3 really wealthy suburban to the urban, I've seen
4 the whole spectrum. And when I got the phone
5 call to return to Bergtraum I took it, because
6 Bergtraum meant something. When you hear that
7 name it still resonates. I hear a lot of names
8 of schools in the cities, and they do not invoke
9 the same emotion as Murry Bergtraum does, for
10 better or for worse. But I hear these words
11 phase out--co-location, resiting--and they're so
12 sterile. And I just hope whoever is making
13 these decisions, that your decisions have huge
14 impacts on the people, the lives involved. I
15 was the teacher leader of the ninth grade
16 academy, and because of the drop in enrollment,
17 all those teachers are gone. And when you make
18 these decisions, it's not a school, you are
19 impacting a family. Because a school is a
20 family, not just for the adults involved with
21 each other, but also between the students and
22 each other, and the students and the teachers.
23 And there are teachers that I hear from who are
24 at other schools, who are A schools, B schools,
25 who are contacting me on a regular basis asking,

1 how is so and so doing? Well if they're
2 having problems please send them to this
3 teacher, they can talk to him. Those teachers
4 are still concerned. I still have teachers who
5 come back to the building because they do not
6 feel supported at their own school, but they
7 feel supported here. So, again, whoever's
8 making these decisions, please leave us the
9 family that we have left. Thank you.

10 MS. GORMAN Thank you. Antonio. Antonio,
11 you may begin.

12 MR. ANTONIO ORAGE: Okay, good evening
13 ladies and gentlemen, my name is Antonio Orage
14 [phonetic], and I am Bergtraum. The simplest
15 thing that I can make this evening, I attended
16 Murry Bergtraum High School from fall 2002 to
17 spring of 2006. I now work at Murry Bergtraum
18 High School as a parent coordinator. I speak to
19 you this evening because I am strongly against
20 the idea of a charter school that caters to
21 elementary school kids in this building. Please
22 allow me to remind you, when you enter this
23 building, the name on this building is Murry
24 Bergtraum High School for Business Careers. I
25 stand before you on preserving the legacy of

1 Bergtraum. By allowing the school in
2 Bergtraum, our high school students will no
3 longer be the focus. It will now be about these
4 little kids. Our students will be deprived of
5 resources in our building. What Bergtraum needs
6 is your support to bring back what it was.
7 Instead, let's discuss how we can support and
8 ensure that our students meet academic success.
9 All that is being seen is space, space, space.
10 And with this--excuse me--you don't realize what
11 it's there for, and you just take students,
12 including this very person that's speaking to
13 you today, closer to their dreams. And with
14 this charter school for elementary schools it
15 cannot happen. So, again, let me remind you
16 that the name on this building is Murry
17 Bergtraum High School for Business Careers, and
18 I am Bergtraum. Thank you.

19 MS. GORMAN Next to speak is former
20 principal Barbara Ezmalia [phonetic].

21 MS. BARBARA EZMALIA: Good evening everyone.
22 I'd like to thank everyone on the panel. One of
23 the things that you mentioned at the very
24 beginning was what the community wanted. What I
25 want everyone to remember is I started here 1976

1 as a student teacher. So I came through this
2 school, and I left at the age of 55. So when I
3 speak about this school, I speak from my heart.
4 The students that you saw here today, they are
5 what Murry Bergtraum High School has always
6 stood for, and hopefully will continue to stand
7 for if the Department of Education does the
8 right thing for kids. This school--so I speak
9 to you, not only as a former principal of the
10 school, but I speak to you as someone who has
11 spent her entire career here. I speak, not only
12 on behalf of myself, I speak on behalf of my
13 former students, my former staff, and
14 administrators, and for the students today, the
15 teachers today, and the administration today.
16 Murry Bergtraum High School was not only
17 supported by the business community, but by the
18 different constituencies in this building that
19 always supported the school. It is the business
20 community in this neighborhood that wanted a
21 school. With the Board of Education and the
22 business community wanting a school for business
23 careers to service the business community in the
24 future so that our students would feed into the
25 business community. I think that has been lost

1 over the last 35 years. People forgot what
2 the original mission of this building was. I
3 have not because I grew up here. So I implore
4 all of you to remember what Murry Bergtraum High
5 School stands for. It is Murry Bergtraum High
6 School for Business Careers, and let us not
7 forget that. I am Murry Bergtraum High School.

8 MS. GORMAN Noreen Stallings [phonetic],
9 Noreen Stallings, is Noreen Stallings here? And
10 then our last speaker is number 9 on the list,
11 S., the first initial is S., last name starts
12 with Y. First we'll hear from Noreen Stallings.

13 MS. NOREEN STALLINGS: Good evening
14 everyone, thank you for giving me this
15 opportunity to speak. I am here as a mother of
16 a senior who has been here at Murry Bergtraum
17 High School for four years. My daughter is out
18 of the Little Red Schoolhouse for five years,
19 and she's out of a private school in Brooklyn
20 for three years. When it was time to select a
21 high school, we selected Murry Bergtraum High
22 School for the things that they had to offer
23 her. It is so unfortunate that the media
24 continues to always put the bad forth and never
25 look at the good. My daughter is graduating

1 here with several scholarships being offered
2 to her, not only because she's a student, but
3 she's been offered the opportunity to also play
4 on the wonderful Lady Blazers. What I want to
5 say to you is, why, why is it that us as adults
6 cannot see that, for the history of the
7 Department of Education, we have always
8 separated elementary schools from high schools?
9 Yes, we've had a few schools that have put
10 together elementary schools and middle schools,
11 but we've always separated them from the high
12 school students. Our children at the tender age
13 of five, to when they go off to junior high
14 school, come into the school system with a clean
15 slate. We know that that age group does not
16 need to experience the same things that the
17 adolescents do have a right to experience as
18 adolescents. They should not be stripped of the
19 fact that they are learning, they are finding
20 their identify, and they are searching for
21 themselves, because they have to, quote/unquote,
22 "grow up," because now they have to set the
23 example for younger children. Let us all as
24 adults really think of what's best for the
25 elementary school and the high school students,

1 and stop pretending that we're doing that.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. GORMAN Thank you. And our last
4 speaker.

5 FEMALE VOICE: I've been a teacher at Murry
6 Bergtraum for the last 11 years.

7 MS. GORMAN Can you speak closer to the mic
8 please?

9 FEMALE VOICE: Okay, this is my 12th year
10 teaching at Murry Bergtraum High School, and
11 I've seen the school change. Rather than
12 putting all the money into a charter school, why
13 don't they give us the money to the school and
14 include the school, because we get a lot of
15 students who have social behavior problems and
16 other issues that we can use the fund for. And
17 second thing is, I would advise that before you
18 make a decision putting an elementary school in
19 here, that you'll visit the school during school
20 hours and see the halls, and see if the
21 elementary school students will be safe. And
22 the second thing is that already there are no-
23 walk zones for teachers in the school, that we
24 are asked not to go to certain areas. And
25 imagine if the elementary school came in, what

1 would our students be doing? They will not be
2 able to walk certain areas, okay? And that's
3 the issue here. And second thing, I'm more
4 worried about the elementary school students who
5 will be in this building. And like what the
6 former speaker said, we've brought in a high
7 school into this building, and now we're
8 relocating them. And that should have been
9 thought before you brought them in here. And I
10 would appreciate that the DOE would seriously
11 analyze what's going to happen in the future
12 when the new school is coming in. Thank you.

13 MS. GORMAN Thank you. We've heard many
14 significant comments this evening from students,
15 staff, and parents and community. We appreciate
16 your feedback and contributions to this hearing.
17 The information will be shared with the Panel
18 for Educational Policy before it has its meeting
19 on October 15th at 6 p.m. at Prospect Heights
20 Campus, located at 883 Klausen [phonetic] Avenue
21 in Brooklyn, when they will vote on this
22 proposal. If you did not get a chance to say
23 what you wanted to say, or if you think of other
24 things that you would like to add, or other
25 people who were not here tonight, I would like

1 to give you the email address and phone number
2 where comments can be made. The phone number is
3 212-374-3466, 212-374-3466. The email address
4 is d02proposals@schools.nyc.gov,
5 d02proposals@schools.nyc.gov. Thank you all for
6 coming. This joint public hearing is officially
7 adjourned.

8 [END RECORDING]

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

C E R T I F I C A T E

1
2 The prior proceedings were transcribed from
3 audio files and have been transcribed to the
4 best of my ability.

5
6 Walter Baker

7 Date: October 13, 2013
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25