



Date: June 21, 2010

Topic: Proposed Temporary Re-siting of Clinton School for Writers and Artists (02M260) to Saint Michael's Academy

Date of Panel Vote: June 22, 2010

Summary of Proposal

Prior to the 2010-2011 school year, Clinton School for Writers and Artists (02M260, "Clinton"), a District 2 middle school, will be moved temporarily to Saint Michael's Academy ("St. Michael's"), located at 425 West 33 Street, also in District 2. Clinton is currently co-located with P.S. 11 in school building M011 at 320 West 21 Street, Manhattan. St. Michael's will be a leased facility; the Department of Education ("DOE") has reached agreement on key business terms with the Roman Catholic Archdiocese of New York to lease St. Michael's for public middle school use.

This will be a temporary relocation for Clinton. The DOE and the School Construction Authority ("SCA") have contracted to acquire property at 10 East 15 Street, in District 2, on which a permanent facility will be constructed for Clinton. The SCA is in the process of obtaining the final public approvals required under its enabling legislation to acquire the property and construct the permanent facility. The Clinton community has been strongly supportive of acquiring this property for its permanent facility. This new facility will also house a 550-seat high school. The target completion date for this new building is September 2014. Clinton will be able to remain at St. Michael's until the new facility is ready for occupancy. The re-siting of Clinton to 10 East 15 Street will be addressed in a separate Educational Impact Statement ("EIS") at a later date.

In the original EIS for the re-siting of Clinton, published on January 8, 2010, the DOE proposed to re-site Clinton from school building M011 to school building M033. Also on that date, the DOE proposed to re-site the majority of the P138M program at M033 to M047, in order to create space for Clinton in M033. A further analysis of the M047 facility revealed that the elevator capacity of M047 could not adequately serve the number of wheelchair and mobility impaired students proposed to move into that building. Based on this information, the DOE issued a new proposal on March 5, 2010. The March 5th EIS proposed to keep the existing P138M program in M033 and to temporarily re-site Clinton to M047. With this new proposal, no District 75 students would have been relocated, and only one school would have had to move

rather than two. The March 5th EIS was amended on April 12, 2010 to include additional information about the proposed space allocation at M047.

While the DOE advanced the proposal to re-site Clinton and temporarily co-locate it with existing schools in M047, it continued to explore additional options. The DOE and SCA identified St. Michael's as an alternative to M047 to address concerns raised during the public comment period, in particular to provide Clinton with more classroom, physical education and administrative space than would have been available at M047.

The re-siting of Clinton from M011 and eventually to a new facility is necessary to provide additional capacity at the elementary school level in the West Village and Chelsea areas of District 2. Moving Clinton from the M011 building will allow P.S. 11, an elementary school that serves zoned students and is currently co-located with Clinton at M011, to expand. P.S. 11 is expected to need at least 3 additional classrooms in 2010-11 to address the articulation of currently enrolled students; these classrooms would have come from both Clinton and P.S. 11 relinquishing classrooms currently used as cluster rooms. P.S. 11 is expected to need 3-4 additional classrooms in 2011-2012 to address the anticipated increase in Kindergarten demand and articulation of existing students. P.S. 11 recently had to give up its library and a cluster room; both would be reclaimed in the event of Clinton's move.

Summary of Comments Received Regarding Previous Proposals

After the DOE's initial public notice on March 5, 2010, four joint public hearings were held regarding the proposal to re-site Clinton to M047. Comments made at the hearings are summarized as follows:

Critics opposed to the proposal stated that Clinton's co-location with 47, 347, and P138M@M047 would (a) lead to extreme overcrowding, particularly in the gymnasium and cafeteria; (b) create fire safety hazards; and (c) lead to overcrowding on neighborhood streets at dismissal time. Moreover, critics expressed concerns that (a) the DOE did not consult Clinton, 47, 347, or P138M@M047 prior to changing the original proposal to move Clinton to M033; (b) with this co-location, 47 would lose out on utilization of the space vacated by Quest to Learn and would not have access to the science laboratory; and (c) it would be detrimental to the deaf culture of the M047 building. Many critics also charged that the target capacity and utilization information in the DOE's Blue Book is inaccurate.

Critics advanced the alternative proposal that Clinton remain at P.S. 11 until Clinton's new permanent facility is complete - or at least for one additional year - and that the P.S. 11 G&T program and P.S. 11 pre-K and zoned K students be assigned to P.S. 33, the school north of P.S. 11, to make room for Clinton and the articulation of new students into P.S. 11.

Proponents of the proposal stated that Clinton's co-location with 47, 347, and P138M@M047 would (a) alleviate severe overcrowding at P.S. 11; (b) bolster the performance of at-risk students at P.S. 11; (c) create space for P.S. 11's collaborative team teaching and G&T classes; and (d) allow P.S. 11 to regain the library and cluster rooms.

The DOE also collected oral and written comments during the public review period. Comments submitted are summarized as follows:

Critics opposed to the proposal stated that Clinton's co-location with 47, 347, and P138M@M047 would (a) reduce the number of middle school seats available in the Greenwich Village and Chelsea neighborhoods; (b) create a fire safety hazard, as described by an April 26, 2010, UFT Life Safety Inspection Report on M047; and (c) according to the SCA's floor plan, result in insufficient space for Clinton students and staff members on M047's third floor, specifically a lack of sufficient sinks in the student bathrooms, teacher planning or student intervention space, and administrative space. Critics also emphasized that all of the libraries in M047 are needed by 47 and 347.

Proponents of the proposal stated that (a) P.S. 11's funding for the Library and Computer Program would be in jeopardy if Clinton remained at M011, and (b) P.S. 11's G&T program enrolls students from the zones for P.S. 41, P.S. 3, P.S. 116, P.S. 234, and P.S. 40, and re-siting P.S. 11's G&T students to another building would present a significant hardship to those students.

Summary of Comments Received on the Revised Proposal at the Joint Public Hearing

A joint public hearing regarding the revised proposal to temporarily re-site Clinton to St. Michael's was held at M011 on June 17, 2010, and all interested parties had an opportunity to provide input on the proposal. Thirty members of the public attended the hearing, and ten people spoke. All ten members of the public supported the revised proposal, stating that:

- The Clinton community approves of the facilities at St. Michael's;
- The Clinton School Leadership Team (SLT) should be able to decide where Clinton will hold its sex education classes.

Summary of Issues Raised in Written and Oral Comments Concerning the Revised Proposal and Significant Alternatives Suggested

One oral comment and eighteen written comments regarding the proposal have been received. The oral comment and eighteen written comments supported the revised proposal. They stated that:

- P.S. 11 is overcrowded and Clinton's re-siting is required in order to ease the overcrowding;
- P.S. 11 would regain needed library and cluster rooms if Clinton is re-sited;
- Achievement gains for at-risk students at P.S. 11 would be lost if Clinton stayed;
- The proposal to temporarily re-site Clinton to St. Michael's addressed many of the Clinton community's concerns about adequate facilities and the potential overcrowding that could have resulted from a re-siting to M047.

**Analysis of Issues Raised, Significant Alternatives Proposed
and Changes Made to the Proposal**

Regarding the comment that the Clinton SLT should be able to decide where to hold its sex education classes, the DOE identified M011 as the location at which Clinton's sex education curriculum will be provided in order to ensure no other school was impacted by the revised proposal.

No significant alternatives have been proposed. The revised proposal will be presented to the Panel for Educational Policy as it is currently posted. A copy of the revised educational impact statement for this proposal can be obtained at http://schools.nyc.gov/NR/ronlyres/72F24454-958D-4E5E-B0BF-236A70E66E09/0/M047_ClintonamendedEIS_Final_41210.pdf.