

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

**NEW YORK DEPARTMENT OF
EDUCATION - DIVISION OF
PORTFOLIO PLANNING
SCN Brooklyn 6 @ K138 - 12/13/12**

1 [START RECORDING]

2 MS. ELIZABETH ROSE: My name is Elizabeth
3 Rose and I will be moderating this joint public
4 hearing this evening. Thank you all for coming.
5 This is a joint public hearing of the Department
6 of Education, Community Education Council 17,
7 sometimes will be referred to as CEC17, and the
8 School Leadership Team of PS138 to discuss the
9 following proposal. It's for the proposed co-
10 location of a new public charter school, Success
11 Academy Charter School Brooklyn 6, with existing
12 school PS138 in Brooklyn, also known as 17A-138,
13 in the building K138 beginning in the 2013-2014
14 school year. Tonight's hearing is not being
15 held in building K138 due to the construction in
16 the building's auditorium. This construction
17 will be completed before the start of the 2013-
18 2014 school year. Tonight's proceedings will be
19 recorded and transcribed. The purpose of this
20 hearing is for you to provide comments about the
21 proposal. Before the chancellor's designee,
22 Miriam Sondheimer, describes the proposal, I
23 want to make sure you are all aware of the
24 opportunity to provide your input. We ask that
25 anyone who wishes to speak during the public

1 comment portion of the evening will sign up at
2 the table in the front lobby where you arrived
3 at the building. The sign-up will end at 6:15,
4 which is about 12 minutes from now. Only people
5 who have signed up to speak will be able to
6 participate in the public comment portion. All
7 of the panel participants were asked to be here
8 no later than 5:30 P.M. this evening, and now
9 that we have started, if someone arrives late,
10 he or she will be given time to speak at the
11 first opportune moment. We want to be
12 respectful of everyone's time this evening.
13 There may also be elected officials who arrive
14 at different times throughout the evening, and
15 if they wish to speak, we will do our best to
16 accommodate them at the first opportune moment.
17 Those who were here at the start of the public
18 comment section will be asked to speak first.
19 Tonight's format will include a presentation of
20 the proposal and presentations by hearing
21 participants, the SLT, and so forth, followed by
22 public comment. Speakers should already be
23 signed up at the table in the lobby, and again,
24 if you have not signed up, please do so. There
25 are about 10, 12 minutes remaining. Public

1 comments can be no longer than two minutes each
2 and this time will be strictly followed and
3 speakers will be informed when their designated
4 time has ended. There will be a timekeeper who
5 will let the speaker know when there are 30
6 seconds remaining and when time is up--again,
7 two minutes. All comments made this evening
8 will be mentioned in the analysis of public
9 comment that will be published and provided to
10 the Panel for Educational Policy the evening
11 before the panel votes. Public comments may
12 also be made the evening of the Panel's hearing.
13 That vote is scheduled for Thursday, December
14 20th, 2012, at 6 o'clock P.M. at the High School
15 of Fashion Industries located at 225 West 24th
16 Street in Manhattan. In addition, we welcome
17 any comments and feedback you may have at any
18 time before the Panel votes on this proposal.
19 The email address where you can send comments is
20 d17proposals@schools.nyc.gov. That's D-1-7-
21 proposals@schools.nyc.gov. There's also a phone
22 number where you can leave comments, and that
23 phone number is (212) 374-0208. Before we go
24 any further, is there anyone in need of
25 interpretation services this evening? The

1 Department of Education originally posted this
2 proposal on September 20th, 2012, and this
3 proposal would have been voted on at the
4 November 8th, 2012 Panel for Educational Policy
5 meeting. The DOE withdrew the proposal due to
6 disruptions caused by Hurricane Sandy, and we
7 hope you are all safe and your family members
8 are all safe. As a result, the DOE reposted the
9 same proposal which will now be voted on at the
10 December 20th, 2012 PEP meeting. I would now
11 like to introduce the panel for this evening's
12 joint public hearing, and so I'm going to start
13 at the far end of the dais and ask each panel
14 member to introduce themselves and their role in
15 the hearing this evening.

16 MS. JULIA ALEXANDER DEFOE: Thank you. My
17 name is Julia Alexander Defoe. I am the PTA
18 President, SLT member/past president.

19 [applause]

20 MS. MIRIAM SONDHEIMER: Good evening.
21 Miriam Sondheimer and I'm chancellor's designee
22 from the New York City Department of Education.

23 [applause]

24 MS. MAUREEN MURPHY: I'm Maureen Murphy, and
25 I'm the Director of Charter Accountability at

1 the SUNY Charter Schools Institute.

2 [applause]

3 MS. ROSE: We also have Council Member
4 Albert Vann here with us this evening.

5 [applause]

6 MS. ROSE: I would now like to turn the
7 program over to our chancellor's designee,
8 Miriam Sondheimer, who will present the
9 proposal.

10 MS. SONDHEIMER: The New York City
11 Department of Education is proposing to site
12 Success Academy Brooklyn 6, a new public charter
13 school that will serve students in kindergarten
14 through fifth grade in building K138. If this
15 proposal is approved, Success Academy Brooklyn 6
16 would open in September 2013 and will serve 164
17 to 210 students from kindergarten and first
18 grade and would add one grade each year until it
19 reaches full scale in 2017-2018. At that time,
20 Success Academy Brooklyn 6 would serve
21 approximately 434 to 556 students in
22 kindergarten through fifth grade. The school
23 would admit students via the charter lottery
24 application process with preference given to
25 District 17 residents with a set aside for

1 English language learners. Success Academy
2 Brooklyn 6 would be co-located in building K138
3 with PS138, its own school that serves students
4 in kindergarten through eighth grade and offers
5 three sections of full day pre-kindergarten.
6 The DOE anticipates that pre-kindergarten will
7 continue to be offered at PS138, subject to
8 continuing funding and demand. K138 also houses
9 one community-based organization, Medgar Evers
10 College Beacon Program, which provides
11 afterschool youth development activities for the
12 PS138 community. As the educational impact
13 statement states, the Department of Education
14 does not anticipate that this proposal will have
15 an effect on this partnership or school
16 programming. K138 also houses the District 17
17 Community Education Council office. The CEC
18 does not expect to lose its administrative
19 office as a result of this proposal and will
20 continue to operate in the K138 building. A co-
21 location means that two or more school
22 organizations are located in the same building
23 and may share common spaces like auditoriums,
24 gymnasiums, libraries and cafeterias. Success
25 Academy Brooklyn 6 is a new public charter

1 school that is authorized by the charter
2 authorizer, the State University of New York
3 Charter School Institute to serve K-5. Success
4 Academy Charter Schools is a charter management
5 organization that currently operates 12 public
6 elementary charter schools in New York City.
7 Success Academy Charter Schools has been
8 authorized by SUNY to operate six new public
9 elementary charter schools starting in 2013-
10 2014, including this one, Success Academy
11 Brooklyn 6. K138 has been identified as an
12 underutilized building. K138 has the capacity
13 to serve 1,468 students, but in 2012-2013, PS138
14 is only projected to serve 811 students. This
15 yields a building utilization rate of
16 approximately 55% which demonstrates the
17 building is underutilized and has space to
18 accommodate additional students. In 2017-2018,
19 Success Academy Brooklyn 6 and PS138 would
20 collectively serve 1,158 to 1,370 students in
21 the building, which yields a projected
22 utilization rate of 79% to 93%. The building
23 utilization plan describes how space would be
24 allocated between the schools for each year that
25 Success Academy Brooklyn 6 phases in, if the

1 proposal is approved. Space is allocated
2 between the schools based on the citywide
3 Instructional Footprint, which is a tool used to
4 allocate space based on the number of sections
5 and school programs and the grade levels of the
6 schools. Each school will receive its baseline
7 Instructional Footprint for each year of phase-
8 in, and any excess space will be split up
9 between the schools proportionally based on the
10 schools' enrollment. If the proposal is
11 approved, then the Office of Space Planning
12 would design actual room placement in
13 consultation with the Building Council. The DOE
14 supports the placement of Success Academy
15 Brooklyn 6 in District 17. If this proposal is
16 approved, it will add approximately 434 to 556
17 kindergarten through fifth grade seats in
18 District 17. The four operating Success Academy
19 Schools that received a progress report for the
20 2010-2011 and 2011-2012 school year received an
21 overall grade of A. Further, students at
22 Success Academy Charter Schools have performed
23 well in statewide standardized tests. The DOE
24 acknowledges the positive performance of PS138,
25 which received an overall grade of A in the

1 2011-2012 progress report.

2 [applause]

3 MS. SONDHEIMER: As the Educational Impact
4 Statement states, the Department of Education
5 does not anticipate that this proposal will have
6 an effect on school programming.

7 [background noise]

8 MS. ROSE: Thank you. I'd like to note that
9 it is now a little after 6:15, so the
10 opportunity to sign up for public comment is now
11 closed. Success Academy Charter School Brooklyn
12 6 has been approved by its charter authorizer,
13 the State University of New York's Charter
14 School Institute or SUNY, to open a new public
15 charter school in this district. - - Although
16 this proposal has not yet been approved by the
17 Panel for Educational Policy, SUNY is required
18 to hold a facilities hearing to receive feedback
19 on the proposed co-location of Success Academy
20 Charter School Brooklyn 6 with PS138, New York
21 City 17. As such, this joint public hearing
22 will also serve as a facilities hearing. We
23 have a representative from SUNY in attendance,
24 and if you have any questions or comments on the
25 charter itself, Maureen Murphy of SUNY will now

1 tell you how to submit those questions and
2 comments.

3 MS. MURPHY: Good evening. My name is
4 Maureen Murphy; I'm the Director of Charter
5 Accountability at the SUNY Charter Schools
6 Institute. I'm here tonight to hold a public
7 hearing on behalf of the Board of Trustees of
8 the State University of New York, or SUNY. SUNY
9 is the authorizer of the charter school we're
10 discussing today. That meaning SUNY trustees
11 approved the application to create the school,
12 my organization, the SUNY Charter Schools
13 Institute, will visit the school and report on
14 its progress to parents. As the school gets
15 older, we will also make a recommendation to the
16 SUNY trustees about whether or not the school
17 deserves the right to stay open. Today, our
18 focus is on where the school will be located.
19 Education law requires SUNY to hold a public
20 hearing anytime the schools it authorizes might
21 open in an existing public school building. I'm
22 here tonight to listen to your comments about
23 the proposal that creates K-5 Success Academy
24 Charter School Brooklyn 6 in Department building
25 K138 beginning in the fall of 2013. As I

1 believe many of you know, we are not holding
2 the hearing in K138 tonight because of
3 construction. However, I did have the
4 opportunity to tour that building at 760
5 Prospect Place earlier this afternoon. SUNY is
6 holding its hearing now at the same time as the
7 DOE is holding its hearing so that we don't have
8 to ask parents and community members to attend
9 two different hearings on the same subject. We
10 want to be sure that we have the opportunity to
11 hear from as many parents, teachers, school
12 leaders and members of the community as we can.
13 I do want to note that SUNY has to make its own
14 decision regarding the school using the proposed
15 space. I will be taking notes on comments made
16 tonight. In addition, you can give me any
17 written comments that you may have. You can
18 email the comments to charters@suny.edu. You
19 can mail comments to 41 State Street, Albany,
20 New York, 12207, or fax comments to (518) 427-
21 6510. I have extra copies of our notices with
22 me that include all of that contact information.
23 SUNY will accept the comments through December
24 28th, 2012. We set the - - for five days after
25 the meeting of the Panel for Educational Policy,

1 where this co-location will be discussed.
2 That way, if there's any information that you
3 get as part of this conversation at the PEP
4 meeting, you can share that with us--you have
5 time to do so afterwards. SUNY will make a
6 decision on this co-location after the close of
7 the comment period. In advance, I want to thank
8 you for your comments tonight. We appreciate
9 your taking the time to be here.

10 MS. ROSE: Thank you. The Community
11 Education Council has elected not to make a
12 statement this evening. Our next statement will
13 be Julia Alexander Defoe of the School
14 Leadership Team of PS138.

15 [applause]

16 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: My name is Julia
17 Alexander Defoe. I have the PTA president of
18 PS/MS138. I am also one of the core members of
19 the SLT. My two sons attended this school. I
20 am certain that they are doing very well
21 academically because of this school and those
22 3's and 4's in state assessments. Most
23 important of all, I represent the parents and
24 the students of PS138. We are proud of our
25 school. We work hard with our children and the

1 school staff to insure that all of our
2 children are properly educated. They are being
3 prepared for college and beyond. PS138--

4 [applause]

5 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: PS138 is the true
6 representation of diversity that exists in this
7 city. The student population, made of students
8 who belong to general education, special
9 education, gifted education, and English
10 language learners--there are 23 languages spoken
11 in the school. 99.2% of the students populating
12 are entitled for free and reduced lunch. We all
13 know that PS138 educates all of our children.
14 The school does not turn away any of the
15 children.

16 [applause]

17 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: Our motto is to
18 provide a high quality of education to every
19 student.

20 [applause]

21 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: Coming together is the
22 beginning. Working together is the process and
23 keeping together is success.

24 [applause]

25 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: I strongly believe

1 that education is happening at PS138. I speak
2 to parents--I know how--as I was saying, how
3 parents love PS138, want a co-location with
4 administration staff and the teachers--that is
5 why I oppose co-location of a charter. PS138
6 has a population of 881 students. At this time,
7 that is what we are fighting to keep.

8 [applause]

9 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: The school is an
10 institution that has populations which reflects
11 100 students with special needs, 87 English
12 language learners, 300 gifted students--

13 [applause]

14 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: --And the rest of the
15 students - - general ed population. General
16 word is that the school has the capacity of
17 1,481 students. Four years ago, this office
18 indicated that the school footprint was at 1,250
19 students.

20 [applause]

21 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: - - Suggest they
22 increase the building capacity.

23 [applause]

24 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: Back in 2009, the
25 school population was 1,250 students. There

1 were so many students that it was dangerous
2 for a - - in the hallway with all - - in the
3 hallway.

4 [applause]

5 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: During fire drills and
6 in the cafeteria, where students were literally
7 on top of each other--at that time, the DOE
8 indicated that the school's capacity was at
9 1,250 students. There was a previous charter
10 school, Explorer Charter School, which co-
11 locates at PS138 four years ago in 2008. It
12 occupied seven rooms. Explorer Charter had to
13 be relocated to another school because it could
14 not grow.

15 [applause]

16 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: PS138 was overcrowded
17 with Explorer Charter School co-locating here.
18 It was a challenge. Conditions in the cafeteria
19 and the gymnasium, the auditorium and all the
20 libraries - -.

21 [applause]

22 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: There were too many
23 students in the school, which made it possible
24 to function adequately. It took 10 to 15
25 minutes to evacuate the school during a fire

1 drill. It was a dangerous situation for all
2 the students. PS138 populated at 950 students
3 and Explorer, population 150 students. It was
4 there when this dangerous situation commenced at
5 the school, it was considered about safety for
6 the students.

7 [applause]

8 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: The combined
9 population of PS138 and Explorer was 1,100
10 students. This situation was a dangerous
11 situation. Now the office of the DOE, four
12 years later, wants to relocate again another
13 charter school in the same PS138. - -

14 [applause]

15 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: - - I'm not talking to
16 the DOE. This cannot happen. As you say that
17 our school has room, show us. Show us - - .

18 [applause]

19 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: Show us the room - - .
20 Show us. As I said, - - 2013, the office
21 reports plans to give Success Charter Academy 20
22 rooms to house 600 students. This will give...
23 This will give to Success Academy 15 rooms the
24 first year and 3 additional rooms every year - -
25 . PS138 students are being squeezed out of

1 their classrooms, squeezed out of their
2 school.

3 [applause]

4 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: Students will be
5 packed on top of each other like sardines. The
6 last time - - Explorer Charter co-located here,
7 we had to give up special ed rooms. This
8 includes the science labs, reading labs,
9 computer labs, - - school space. This type of
10 situation is worse--there are - - 15 rooms the
11 first year - - 15 rooms. Where are we going to
12 put the existing population? They have to
13 recruit our children to come to their school.
14 The officials of PS138 cannot register next year
15 kindergarten students until April 2013. Success
16 Academy can recruit students before the public
17 hearing occurs.

18 [applause]

19 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: The law stated that a
20 charter school cannot recruit unless--they
21 cannot recruit until they have voted at a public
22 forum. The voting will not take place until
23 December 20th, 2012--yet the Success Charter is
24 actually recruiting for students. PS138 cannot
25 register our startup, our future kindergarten

1 until April 2013. How do they expect us to
2 grow if they're doing this?

3 [applause]

4 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: - - Charter School is
5 not improving our level A students. There are -
6 - schools failed - -. PS138 is a level A
7 school. They have been a level A school for
8 four times.

9 [applause]

10 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: We outperformed - -
11 from a charter school, and let me repeat: We
12 outperformed - - charter school.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: Two - - schools and
15 other - - school in our - - group. PS138,
16 because we are a failing school, they say--I
17 don't see how they can say we are a failing
18 school. We need to go into schools that are
19 failing. PS138 is not failing.

20 [applause]

21 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: We need our room to
22 continue to operate as a community at large. We
23 need our room in order for us to continue to
24 operate as a successful school. PS138 will not
25 be able to operate as we did in the past if we

1 are giving up so many rooms - - for a charter
2 in the building. So imagine, if Success Academy
3 comes in, the first year, they're looking for K
4 through 5, and every year they're going to grow.
5 While they're growing, PS138 is phasing out.

6 [applause]

7 MS. ALEXANDER DEFOE: Thank you.

8 [applause]

9 MS. ROSE: - - Thank you.

10 [background noise]

11 MS. ROSE: Miss Alexander Defoe now has a
12 Power Point to share.

13 [background noise]

14 MS. DYNISHAL GROSS: I'm going to assist
15 Miss Alexander Defoe in covering the Power
16 Point. You've done an excellent job.

17 [applause]

18 MS. GROSS: Okay. The position of the
19 School Leadership Team is that this proposed co-
20 location will rob this excellent public school
21 of the space it needs, space that's essential to
22 its academic program, and will therefore harm
23 the students, the current and future students at
24 PS138 - -.

25 [applause]

1 MS. GROSS: It was good here that the DOE
2 acknowledged PS/MS138's excellent record here
3 tonight. That did not happen in the Educational
4 Impact Statement in the proposal where they
5 refer to Success Charter Schools, Success
6 Academy's A grades at 4 of its 12 schools last
7 year while just describing PS138 as an existing
8 zone school. It's more than that to this school
9 community. It is an excellent school, an A
10 school.

11 [applause]

12 MS. GROSS: PS/MS138 has received an A in
13 five of the last progress reports. That's an A
14 for student progress. That's an A for student
15 performance on the state English and math exams.
16 Congratulations to the students - - you guys.

17 [applause]

18 MS. GROSS: And celebrate it - - the DOE.
19 PS/MS138 puts every space in that school to good
20 use, and the DOE has acknowledged that all of
21 the space in the building is used by this
22 school. The quality review reports for this
23 school note the excellent uses of this space,
24 the uses of the classroom space and the hallway
25 space for the curriculum, for student learning

1 and staff learning. There's a broad
2 curriculum that supports excellence at this
3 school and it's because they use the space
4 effectively. The DOE has stated that the co-
5 location is not expected to impact current or
6 future student enrollment or instructional
7 programming at our school while they present a
8 building utilization plan that ignores how these
9 students are actually taught. It doesn't make
10 sense and we're going to detail - - .

11 [applause]

12 MS. GROSS: The building utilization plan
13 addresses elementary and middle school standards
14 generally. Is PS/MS138 an elementary school
15 only, or a middle school only?

16 AUDIENCE: No.

17 MS. GROSS: It's a pre-K through 8 school--

18 AUDIENCE: Yes.

19 MS. GROSS: And it has a seamless program
20 that addresses all of those students, but the
21 DOE just says K through 5--you have this many K
22 through 5 students, you can do with four cluster
23 rooms, and with the 6th to 12th grade students,
24 6 to 8 at this school, they don't need their own
25 dedicated classroom. They can move from class

1 to class. Isn't that how it works? No.
2 That's not how it works at PS/MS138. PS/MS138
3 has science labs for every grade to allow hands-
4 on learning.

5 [applause]

6 MS. GROSS: Two of the science labs are
7 equipped with gas or Bunsen burners that work in
8 synch, and those are used by the oldest students
9 in the school. A third room has been approved
10 for sixth graders as a general science lab, and
11 even the pre-K to 5 students have access to
12 science labs, and the principal and the teachers
13 have invested greatly financially and in their
14 efforts to set up these classrooms, including -
15 -. You can't move the students from room to
16 room. If you take away these rooms, science
17 instruction will be lost.

18 [applause]

19 MS. GROSS: The school also has three
20 computer labs that they've invested in. The
21 pre-K to 2 lab has 30 desktop computers. The
22 6th to 8th grade lab has 20 desktops and 100
23 laptops, and the 3rd to 5th grade lab has 30
24 desktop computers. They're all hardwired for
25 Internet access. The building utilization plan

1 doesn't even acknowledge the existence of
2 these labs. Already we're at more than four
3 cluster rooms--these are essential spaces for
4 the school's instructional programs.

5 [applause]

6 MS. GROSS: Sixth graders at PS/MS138 do not
7 move from class to class every period. They are
8 taught in self-contained classrooms and this
9 part of the K to 8 instructional program at this
10 school. Seventh and eighth grade students move
11 minimally, okay? And this programming for older
12 students is an integral part of their success.
13 You can't just tell them sixth grade students
14 are expected to move and have the same result--
15 A's, A's, A's.

16 [applause]

17 MS. GROSS: The building utilization plan is
18 flawed and to take away space that is essential
19 to the school's instructional program. It's
20 also full of inaccuracies and omissions. The
21 last space that I described, the science labs,
22 the computer labs--there are also ESL labs as
23 you heard before--they're not being recognized;
24 they mention only the two hardwired science
25 labs. A permanent music room that's set up as a

1 mini-auditorium is never described in the
2 plan. It's just counted as a regular classroom.
3 They can't put desk and chairs in there--the
4 room is only appropriate for music instruction.
5 The building utilization plan states that the
6 cafeteria capacity is 570. Have you ever seen
7 570 students in a cafeteria at PS138? Posted
8 signs in the cafeteria indicate that the
9 capacity is 300 and the plan for the shared use
10 of the space if this charter moves in says you
11 can just shave 20 minutes off your lunch period.
12 You can finish lunch by 1:10. This ignores - -
13 it takes time to serve food to each child. It
14 takes time for them to eat, and PS/MS138 uses
15 their lunchtime to also give the kids playtime.
16 They need sufficient - - space. Additionally,
17 cutting the lunch period to 40 minutes is
18 unrealistic because UFT contracts mandate that
19 teachers and parents have 50-minute lunches.

20 [applause]

21 MS. GROSS: So who's going to supervise the
22 children during that 10 minute gap? It doesn't
23 make sense. It's administratively unworkable,
24 absolutely. The schoolyards of PS/MS138 are
25 referred to in the plan, but then they don't

1 address their distribution at all. PS/MS138
2 uses these yards to relieve overcrowding in the
3 cafeteria--some kids eat first and play
4 afterwards; others play, then eat, and - - .

5 [applause]

6 MS. GROSS: --And to the management of the
7 capacity of the cafeteria. The cafeteria plan
8 that does not address the schoolyards is fatally
9 flawed, and this plan does not address them at
10 all.

11 [applause]

12 MS. GROSS: The building utilization plan
13 also inaccurately describes the Beacon Program.
14 It actually says on page 2 that--excuse me, on
15 page 16 that the shared spaces in the school--
16 the gym, the cafeteria, the auditorium, the
17 library--are not currently allocated for
18 afterschool programs. Is that true?

19 AUDIENCE: No.

20 MS. GROSS: Absolutely not. The Beacon
21 Program is in constant operation during the
22 afterschool hours and they acknowledge this at
23 another point in the plan, in another document
24 in their proposal, but deny it in the building
25 utilization plan. The Beacon uses the gym, the

1 cafeteria, the auditorium - - when the
2 auditorium is not under construction--every day
3 to deliver services to 400 to 500 members of the
4 school community, and they use two offices, not
5 one within the school, for adult education and
6 for administration. In addition to pretending
7 that the Beacon's afterschool school programming
8 doesn't exist, the plan says that Success
9 Academy will use the building until 4:45 P.M.
10 This is well into the Beacon's time. Any plan
11 that begins by ignoring the Beacon which is
12 vital to this school community and would
13 undermine the Beacon's continuance in the school
14 is fatally flawed.

15 [applause]

16 MS. GROSS: This proposal will recreate
17 overcrowding that already existed at this school
18 during the prior charter school co-location.
19 DOE always forced one co-location on this
20 school. In 2009, Explore Empower Charter School
21 moved into the building, and besides showing
22 disrespect for the public school students and
23 staff--this, I found unbelievable, that they
24 actually chanted in the auditorium, "We are
25 charter; we are better"--that was audible to the

1 students. Besides that, it became clear that
2 there was not enough room for both schools. The
3 lunchroom was crowded. The halls were crowded.
4 They interfered with PS/MS138's ability to
5 accommodate students with disabilities. There
6 was a problem evacuating those little children
7 from the upper floors during fire drills, and
8 the response time for those drills went from 5
9 to nearly 15 minutes. This is a serious safety
10 hazard and SUNY should concern itself with that.
11 And there was additionally overcrowding in the
12 school nurse's office which occupies only a
13 quarter-sized space in the school and had to
14 serve children from both institutions. By early
15 2010--that's four months after the charter
16 school got there--DOE had decided the building
17 was overcrowded.

18 [applause]

19 MS. GROSS: And this is where it's wonderful
20 to have the internet, because we can go back to
21 DOE's words at that time. They said they had to
22 move that school to relieve overcrowding and
23 that - - their own building. They said they had
24 to move it because there was not room for that
25 school to grow there, and that school was only

1 supposed to grow to an additional 244
2 students. When Explore Empower Charter School
3 was there, the total population of the school
4 building was less than 1,100. Even at PEP--next
5 week, there's a PEP hearing, they voted on the
6 removal of Explore Empower Charter School:
7 Whereas the co-location of Explore Empower
8 Charter School is necessary to relieve
9 overcrowding in the K138 building where it's
10 currently located--and they moved it out because
11 of overcrowding. The combined population of the
12 building at that time was 1,098. In 2010, 1,098
13 equaled overcrowding. In 2010, 1,098 equaled no
14 room for the charter to grow, but the current
15 co-location would return the building to its
16 overcrowded state. Why replicate chaos and
17 failure?

18 [applause]

19 MS. GROSS: We can't answer the question of
20 why for the DOE. We still hope to convince them
21 not to do this, but we figured that they forgot
22 how. It's this issue of the building's target
23 capacity--in 2010, the DOE acknowledged that
24 this overcrowding with 1,098 students and today
25 it presented a new co-location plan that argues

1 that the building can accommodate 1,468
2 students, and if the plan goes forward, the
3 population of this school will grow to 1,370 by
4 the 2017-2018 school year. Target capacity is a
5 DOE fiction. It is used as needed to justify
6 its co-location proposals. Target capacity is
7 manipulated based on the DOE's willingness to
8 program the space--less pre-K, more target
9 capacity. Change the office space to a
10 classroom space--more target capacity. We
11 understand the building's actual capacity
12 because you--parents, teachers, and students--
13 you live in that building every day.

14 [applause]

15 MS. GROSS: The members of this school
16 community do not believe that students should be
17 squeezed into every available space in the
18 building regardless of what that space was
19 designed to do. There are real limits on this
20 school building, and they've been seen in the
21 recent past. The unstated aim here is to sap
22 resources from this excellent public school so
23 that it shrinks as this charter school grows.
24 The school community rejects this plan.

25 [applause]

1 MS. GROSS: The building utilization
2 report clearly lays out that PS/MS138's
3 population is expected to shrink from 811 to as
4 little as 724 during the five years of co-
5 location while the charter school grows from 0
6 to as much as 556. And it will - - numbers of
7 students, it's also space--they're going to
8 squeeze PS/MS138 into less and less space, 15
9 and a quarter classrooms and office the first
10 year, 2.5 more classrooms the second year, 3.25
11 in the third year--it keeps going until you've
12 lost a third of your school building. Is this
13 fair?

14 AUDIENCE: No.

15 MS. GROSS: Is this equitable?

16 AUDIENCE: No.

17 MS. GROSS: - - In 2010, the DOE itself said
18 that the space made available by removing that
19 other charter school would be made available,
20 would be used to serve additional pre-K to
21 eighth grade students at PS138. The building
22 cannot accommodate another entire school. That
23 has been tried and it has failed, but the school
24 can accommodate additional students and the DOE
25 should invest in maximizing the reach and impact

1 of PS/MS138. Use this success; don't destroy
2 it.

3 [applause]

4 MS. GROSS: The district needs additional
5 pre-K slots, and the school previously had four
6 pre-K classes. It was cut to three and capped
7 at that level. Rather than forcing another
8 school into the building, allow the school to
9 meet this demonstrated community need.

10 [applause]

11 MS. GROSS: In conclusion, the statistics
12 don't tell the story--the people in this room
13 tell the story. The people in this community
14 tell the story. This school is a shining star
15 and the DOE should respect this community's
16 input and withdraw the proposal.

17 [applause]

18 MS. ROSE: Thank you. We have been joined--
19 you'll have your chance. We have been joined by
20 Joan Eastmond from State Senator Velmanette
21 Montgomery's office, as well as Barbara Sherman
22 from Council Member Letitia James's office. I'd
23 now like to invite Principal Chauvet-Monchik to
24 - - .

25 [applause]

1 AUDIENCE: Miss Chauvet, Miss Chauvet...

2 MS. MARIE CHAUVET-MONCHIK: Thank you. Good
3 evening, everyone.

4 AUDIENCE: Good evening.

5 MS. CHAUVET-MONCHIK: I have the SLT
6 president for PS138 and the impact of what
7 happened previously when a charter school was
8 co-located with 138. It's very hard for me to
9 accept what's going on right now. This is not
10 the first time going through this experience. -
11 - Rated school six years ago, we had A's, B's,
12 C's, D's, E's--not E, F. But you know what, the
13 first time we were rated, we were at the - - of
14 a B, and I promised the school we will never go
15 back to that grade and from that point on, year
16 after year after year, we've repeated the same
17 grade.

18 [applause]

19 MS. CHAUVET-MONCHIK: - - That grade A, and
20 we will always be - - an A. But this meeting is
21 not about our grades. It's about a different
22 school and forcing our school who will, who will
23 eventually shrink the school and we will lose
24 all of our A's to go to the new school because
25 of publicity hikes. It hurts me for the parents

1 bringing me applications saying look, Miss
2 Chauvet, look what I received in the mail, and
3 it says Success Academy is open at PS138. We
4 don't have Success Academy in this school yet.
5 Today is the hearing, but yet in the minds of
6 the parents, it's there. Think about what
7 really makes me--what consoles me is that the
8 parents tell me - - you can have it.

9 [applause]

10 MS. CHAUVET-MONCHIK: When we had Explorer
11 Academy in the school, there were 150 students.
12 148 of them came from other communities. I lost
13 two students. One is Gabriella [phonetic],
14 who's back with me.

15 [applause]

16 MS. CHAUVET-MONCHIK: And the other one is -
17 - who went to Africa. So I didn't lose anyone
18 to Explore Charter School, because the community
19 around the school believes in 138.

20 [applause]

21 MS. CHAUVET-MONCHIK: So the fear that we
22 face is not really us losing population. It's
23 the other school who's bringing 150 or more
24 students into the school and that will go and
25 squeeze us out of our rooms. The question is

1 not about performance, 'cause we are
2 performing. The issue at hand is the space. If
3 you remember correctly, in 2009, we didn't have
4 a science lab. What science teachers were
5 doing, they were - - on the floor in the middle
6 of the hallway. The ESL teachers were pulling
7 their kids - - around the staircases. This is
8 not a dignified and educational experience for
9 the children, because--

10 [applause]

11 MS. CHAUVET-MONCHIK: - - The footprint that
12 is telling us we could occupy 1,468--that's the
13 newest number. At one point we were at 1,480
14 and three or four years ago, we were 1,000 to
15 1,050, so I don't really know what's the
16 footprint for 138. It changes as the need
17 changes, okay? Because when we were at 1,050,
18 the kids were in the hallway learning. It
19 wasn't fair to 138, and on the other hand, it
20 wasn't fair for Explorer either, 'cause they
21 didn't have rooms. I didn't blame them 'cause
22 they gave them the space, but both communities
23 had suffered from what had taken place in the
24 course of this year. So I can't see us going
25 back to the same old thing, 'cause when a school

1 has too many students, we cannot function. So
2 we really need to think it through, because when
3 we had so many students, it was dangerous, of
4 course, in the hallway. It was more dangerous
5 in the playground. It was especially dangerous
6 during fire drills; that, I was afraid of. I
7 used to pray for not having any real emergency
8 at 138, because 138 - - area, 'cause we
9 experience fires at 138--when the building
10 across the street was caught on fire, and we
11 were choking from smoke. We had to evacuate the
12 building instantly, but if we had so many
13 students, it wouldn't be instant evacuation. It
14 would be a panicking situation because we have
15 little ones that we have to accompany outside
16 quickly, and all of them would be in danger. It
17 won't be 138--it will be 138. It will be
18 Success. It will be everyone in danger, so we
19 have to think it through. What is reality, and
20 what is theory? We could make all the theories
21 we want on paper, but the realization that 138
22 is - - the room that we have is sufficient for
23 our children, and Success, I know you have - -
24 school in Harlem--try to find - - and leave 138
25 - -. Thank you.

1 [applause]

2 MS. ROSE: Thank you. We have now concluded
3 the formal presentations this evening, and are
4 about to begin the public comment section. We
5 are joined by Senator Eric Adams.

6 [applause]

7 MS. ROSE: And before I invite our elected
8 officials to speak, I'd like to call up the
9 first five speakers for public comment. We have
10 seats here in the front row for you so that when
11 it's your turn to speak, we will be able to
12 accommodate you as quickly as possible this
13 evening, so would the five speakers I'm about to
14 call, please come forward--Mr. McCain--

15 [applause]

16 MS. ROSE: - - Pieber, Jeremy Siderman--

17 [applause]

18 MS. ROSE: --Massay, and Steve Kusman.

19 [applause]

20 MS. ROSE: Okay, can we please keep it down?
21 Thank you. Council Member Vann?

22 [applause]

23 COUNCIL MEMBER ALBERT VANN: Good evening.

24 AUDIENCE: Good evening.

25 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: I thought that the

1 presentation by the Community Leadership Team
2 was outstanding. - -

3 [applause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: And after listening to
5 your principal, I had comments that I was going
6 to make but I don't need to make them. She did
7 great.

8 [applause]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Before I make my very
10 brief comments, I have a couple questions for
11 clarification. I noticed the - - from SUNY
12 indicated that you were co-chairing the hearing,
13 and that comments could be made and that they
14 could consider those comments, so I want to know
15 on what basis could SUNY decide that this co-
16 location should not go forward? Are there any
17 grounds, anything that we would say that you
18 have the authority to revoke, if you will, or to
19 withdraw the co-location application?

20 [background noise]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Okay. She says - -
22 with the comments, so when they take that back
23 and they hear, we--is there any basis by which
24 they can make a decision, 'cause there are two
25 parties--the DOE's here, and SUNY's here, so I'm

1 trying to see what the authority for SUNY is
2 in this situation.

3 MS. MURPHY: As I stated, - - make a
4 determination.

5 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Okay, - - they make a
6 determination whether this should not, this co-
7 location should not occur?

8 MS. MURPHY: - -

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: They could? They
10 could make that decision? Yes, okay--on the
11 record, good to know. And just one question for
12 the presentation of the DOE--I noticed you refer
13 to 138 as PS, and yet you also say it is pre-K
14 through 8. I'm unclear--why is that? Why is it
15 not a public school and a middle school? It
16 just caught my attention. I'm wondering why.
17 Do you--

18 MS. SONDEHEIMER: No, it's a K to 8. Pre-K
19 to 8--there's no question.

20 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: It's a K to 8--but
21 it's only referred to as PS. Is that
22 significant?

23 MS. SONDEHEIMER: The formal name is--in some
24 we have PS138, but it can be referred to
25 multiple names.

1 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Okay.

2 MS. SONDHEIMER: It is what it is.

3 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: - - Okay, and one
4 that's for--the last part of your presentation,
5 you said that DOE assumes that we're - - the co-
6 location will not affect in any way the academic
7 effectiveness of 138. Do you still feel that
8 way after the presentation?

9 MS. SONDHEIMER: Yes. The educational
10 impact does not believe--the DOE does not
11 believe in our judgment it will impact the
12 performance of 138. Yes, as stated, we do not
13 believe that this co-location will have an
14 impact on the performance of PS138.

15 [background noise]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: - - I think, I think,
17 I think that--no, seriously, I think that she's
18 representing the DOE - - their position, but
19 clearly they haven't heard this testimony. They
20 haven't heard this testimony, so obviously you
21 can't speak for them--and I'm not trying to put
22 you on the spot, but you should understand, you
23 just spoke, what you should have said is that
24 they will make a decision after they've analyzed
25 and heard and then make a decision but I

1 understand, you know, what your role is
2 currently, but that's not DOE's position. Let
3 me - - elected officials, Senator Adams and
4 myself, all the - - we did not come to embarrass
5 the chancellor so we gave him an opportunity to
6 withdraw this application so it wouldn't get to
7 this point because it's obvious on its face that
8 this is a ridiculous proposal, right, and so--

9 [applause]

10 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: We didn't want you to
11 have to go through this because it's an
12 excellent school. It's been acknowledged. We
13 know that. Five years, five years getting an A
14 on the chancellor's progress report. How many
15 schools in District 17 have that record? How
16 many? - - And so we know that the chancellor -
17 - he responded but he didn't answer the
18 question, so we wrote him a second letter. He
19 hasn't responded in writing. I got a call from
20 him, we're meeting tomorrow - - okay? All
21 right. But I wanted to spare him this because
22 the Board of Education, the Department of
23 Education is responsible for educational
24 achievement in the City of New York, all the
25 public schools. If I was the chancellor, if I

1 was the chancellor, I would be celebrating
2 138. - -

3 [applause]

4 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: All of the City of New
5 York and say look what you can do. - - You can
6 be a star. If they can do it, you can do it.
7 Teachers, faculty, anybody at 138, they will be
8 known all over the world because they are doing
9 what they say they have been done.

10 [applause]

11 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: - - This is what you
12 understand, the Department of Education, - -
13 they should take responsibility for it. They
14 should take credit for it. They should - - it
15 is incredible to me. I cannot believe that they
16 have such a shining star and they are trying to
17 do anything to affect that. It's disrespectful
18 to our children. It's disrespectful to our
19 faculty. It's disrespectful to our community.

20 [applause]

21 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: - - Let me be brief,
22 because I understand, I don't think they
23 recognize the message that they will be sending
24 throughout the City of New York, that a school
25 that is struggling over the years to get to the

1 point where they are reaching academic
2 excellence and maintaining, you are sending a
3 signal to New York City that even though you get
4 there, we're not going to accept that, we're not
5 going to celebrate that, and as a matter of
6 fact, we're going to take that - - Department of
7 Education - - .

8 [applause]

9 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: And it's incredible.
10 It's unbelievable. It must not stand. It must
11 not stand. Principal Chauvet-Monchik, I want to
12 thank you, our teachers, our parents, our
13 students, we love you, we will protect you. We
14 support you. - -

15 [applause]

16 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: Respectfully, I
17 recommend the DOE respectfully withdraw this
18 application. Don't take it to the PEP. The PEP
19 has previously determined that a co-location of
20 138 does not work. - -

21 [applause]

22 COUNCIL MEMBER VANN: It said it did not
23 work. We had this, we've been there, we know
24 that--it don't work. DOE, chancellor, - -
25 respect for my people, do the right thing,

1 withdraw the application. Thank you.

2 [applause]

3 MS. ROSE: Thank you. Senator Adams?

4 STATE SENATOR ERIC ADAMS: - - I want to
5 thank our physical and intellectual giant in
6 this community, Councilman Al Vann. Thank you,
7 - -.

8 [applause]

9 STATE SENATOR ADAMS: You know, as the
10 councilman, he touched on very serious point,
11 and as I was standing to the side listening to
12 him, he said that to dismantle a school that is
13 successful, you're going against your objective.
14 My question is what actually is the objective?
15 What's the objective? Because we fought hard to
16 close prisons upstate and the only common
17 denominator about those who are incarcerated is
18 not ethnicity--it's academic stand. So I'm
19 wondering, I'm wondering, if we create an
20 environment where our children would not only
21 compete in Brownsville and Bedford-Stuyvesant
22 but in Budapest and - - then why are we
23 dismantling it? Why? And what's the - - safety
24 part? You cannot reverse an emergency. If you
25 have a school that's overcrowded and there is a

1 fire on - - you get the children out of the
2 building, you can have as many fire drills as
3 you want--if you have too many children in that
4 space, you're not going to get them out safely.

5 [applause]

6 STATE SENATOR ADAMS: So I believe that SUNY
7 needs to reexamine the safety aspect of this.
8 Secondly, the statement was made--'cause I
9 listen very closely--the statement was made, we
10 don't think the school would disrupt the
11 existing school. This is not Las Vegas--you
12 don't play craps with our community.

13 [applause]

14 STATE SENATOR ADAMS: You don't, you don't
15 go after one of the rare successes that we have--
16 -understand that. I crisscross this city and
17 see the failures in the educational system--we
18 have a rare success that is doing the right
19 thing, and you want to say we will disrupt that
20 because we don't think it would disrupt the
21 environment.

22 [applause]

23 STATE SENATOR ADAMS: Something is wrong
24 with that. Something's wrong with that claim.
25 And this, this magical chance that the DOE is

1 playing--one day the school is too crowded,
2 another year it's not, one day it's crowded,
3 another year it's not--where is the consistency
4 in the presentation that was given to show that
5 it was crowded seven years ago - - it's crowded
6 now? If there's - - people who can actually
7 occupy the building seven years ago, then - -
8 facilities, and let me conclude with this--this
9 is so important. You created a principle - -
10 you created an equation that part of developing
11 the full personhood of a child is more than
12 having them sit in a classroom doing - - . You
13 created this equation by saying that we need a
14 music room to develop their full personhood. We
15 need spaces in the library for them to sit down
16 and read. We need a space for parents to come
17 in and - -. We need a place where teachers can
18 learn. Each one of those rooms that the DOE
19 sees as just four walls, you see as part of the
20 agreement that develops the full personhood of a
21 child.

22 [applause]

23 STATE SENATOR ADAMS: So instead of looking
24 at this model and seeing just - - instead of
25 looking at this model and saying maybe - -

1 because they're trying to cram the children
2 into one atmosphere and treating our schools
3 like a chain store, or selling - - and selling
4 academic achievement, maybe - -.

5 [applause]

6 STATE SENATOR ADAMS: - - I learned a long
7 time ago, there are some people in society and
8 they would throw a rock and hide their name, and
9 then - - and you're so busy saying sorry to them
10 when they're the ones that threw the rock. They
11 didn't throw the rock; the rock was thrown at
12 the city wall and we've got to - - threw the
13 stone, and throw it outside. - - And this is - -
14 we pull this off the table, and this is not
15 about private schools or public schools--
16 children - - always had a choice. This is not -
17 - about - - a charter school or a public school.
18 This is about--do we dismantle a system that is
19 educating students in the capacity that they
20 should be educated? That's what it's about,
21 that's the fight, and that's - -. Thank you.

22 [applause]

23 MS. ROSE: Thank you. Joan Eastmond from
24 Senator Montgomery's Office--do we have the
25 representative from Senator Montgomery's Office?

1 [background noise]

2 MS. JOAN EASTMOND: Thank you very much.
3 Good evening. I thank our councilman and our
4 state senator saying it all. I don't think
5 there's too much more I can say. What I will
6 say is walking in here, I had a great feeling
7 because the energy in the spirit of the parents,
8 teachers, students, from K138 say it all. You
9 are--

10 [applause]

11 MS. EASTMOND: --An exciting group, and I
12 think we need to take that excitement if need be
13 to the Mayor's Office, to the Governor's Office,
14 to whoever it is to make sure they leave you
15 alone.

16 [applause]

17 MS. EASTMOND: And know that Senator
18 Montgomery, who you, as of January 1st, you are
19 now in the Senator's district of 25, so anything
20 you need in terms of the Senator, you can know
21 that she's behind you 100%.

22 [applause]

23 MS. ROSE: And our last speaker before the
24 public comment, Barbara Sherman from
25 Councilmember Letitia James's office.

1 [applause]

2 MS. BARBARA SHERMAN: Thank you very much.
3 It's great to see everybody come out for such an
4 important cause. I'm just here to say that
5 Council Member James wants to make sure that you
6 know that she is with you in solidarity. She is
7 not for a co-location in District 13 or in
8 school District 17. Success Academy, as you
9 know, is trying to get into also district 13,
10 K265, and we're urging the DOE to make sure that
11 the choices are based on need, not on space. We
12 do not need a Success Academy in your school, in
13 K265. This just undermines the wonderful work
14 of the parents, teachers, and the students. We
15 are for choice, but not when the playing field
16 is not a level one, so thank you and have a - - .

17 [applause]

18 MS. ROSE: Okay. We are now going to begin
19 the public comment. I would like to remind you
20 that the public comment is limited to two
21 minutes. We have a woman here who will be
22 keeping time. She will hold up a sign when you
23 have 30 seconds remaining and then we'll flip
24 the sign when it's up, when your two minutes is
25 up. We have a microphone and stand set up here,

1 and we would like to begin, please, with Mr.
2 McCain.

3 [applause]

4 MR. MCCAIN: Thank you. - - But I do want
5 to say between the very detailed Power Point
6 presentation, between the comments of our
7 elected politicians, these - - Miss Chauvet said
8 it all - - I wanted to say, and I almost feel
9 like, I almost feel like I owe our students an
10 apology, because the message we're sending them
11 is no matter how hard you work, year after year
12 after year of being developed and getting an A,
13 maintaining the highest standard of education,
14 no matter how hard you try, that some power
15 broker, some - - is going to come in and take
16 away your ability and close your school.
17 Evidence has been shown that we are going to be
18 forced out and this is just based on common
19 sense, all right, as soon as the school grows,
20 we still have a finite amount of space. Where
21 are we going? Where are we going? We're being
22 pushed out. That's what's going to happen, and
23 we are here to fight. Are we here to fight? We
24 are here to fight.

25 [applause]

1 MS. ROSE: Thank you. J. Pieber?

2 [background noise]

3 MR. J. PIEBER: Good evening, parents,
4 teachers, administrators, - - and most
5 importantly, welcome students of PS138.

6 [applause]

7 MR. PIEBER: Welcome to our fight. I would
8 like to start off by apologizing for my entire
9 fifth grade today--we went to the Metropolitan
10 Museum of Art to do a compare and contrast
11 lesson on Renaissance and - - times. No help
12 from the DOE on supplies - - our own at 138.

13 [applause]

14 MR. PIEBER: We've been hearing a lot
15 tonight about being - - school. Our - - A
16 level--for me, we are a D school--D because we
17 are devoted. We're devoted from our
18 administrators to the teachers to the teachers'
19 aides to the students. We will win out. Do not
20 get scared.

21 [applause]

22 MR. PIEBER: When I returned to the school
23 office instead of my classroom and I saw that
24 our auditorium was closed for renovations, I
25 said to myself, uh-oh, here we go again--they're

1 after us again. We have no auditorium at
2 PS138. We do not have assemblies at PS138. I
3 live in Bay Ridge. In Bay Ridge, what's going
4 on? New public schools. What's going on in the
5 inner cities? Charter schools. Is this fair?
6 No, it's not. I know my time is just about up,
7 but I just want to say thank you to PS185 in Bay
8 Ridge--for in August, I was walking my dog and
9 what did I find? Dozens upon dozens of English
10 and math textbooks thrown in the garbage. Does
11 PS138 get - -? No. We are going to fight and
12 we will win. Thank you.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ROSE: J. Siderman?

15 [background noise]

16 MS. J. SIDERMAN: Thank you. To all
17 concerned individuals who are here tonight,
18 thank you for coming. I've been a teacher at
19 PS138 for--this is my tenth year now, and two
20 years ago I went back for gifted studies. I'm a
21 certified gifted studies instructor, and it is
22 fantastic that our school serves all students--
23 special needs, English language learners,
24 general ed and gifted. We have a robust high
25 achievers segment of our population, and classes

1 along those lines, and as you can tell from
2 the slide presentation, PS138 is achieving A's
3 and doing well by all its students. Why not
4 expand and create a true gifted - - program at
5 PS138?

6 [applause]

7 MS. SIDERMAN: - - District 17? Why are
8 District 17 parents sent to other districts in
9 order to get gifted and talented programs - -?
10 Why can't we have the resources at PS138 to
11 expand a program that is already in place and is
12 active? That's all I have to say.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ROSE: I'd like to invite the next group
15 of speakers to begin coming down--Janena Smith--

16 [applause]

17 MS. ROSE: Chanelle Webster, Gracelynn
18 Molokow--

19 [applause]

20 MS. ROSE: John Bogart. Okay. Our next
21 speaker is Massay.

22 [applause]

23 MR. RICHARD MASSAY: Good evening, all. My
24 name is Richard Massay. I'm a member of the
25 faculty at PS138 and as - - speakers and

1 colleagues before me stated, there's not much
2 I can say, obviously - - Council Member Vann
3 spoke and you guys - - .

4 [applause]

5 MR. MASSAY: There was one aspect--that A
6 that's been at our school for the past six years
7 has come at great cost. For the past six years,
8 our school has constantly lost funds. Those
9 funding losses have meant a cut in support
10 staff, from the programs and teachers are being
11 constantly asked to do more with less.

12 [applause]

13 MR. MASSAY: We can do more with less--we're
14 still producing level A performance and growth.

15 [applause]

16 MR. MASSAY: Now, this level A education at
17 PS138 quite honestly has a professional - -
18 sorry, I've been a professional past 14, almost
19 15 years--I know that there's a human element.
20 You cannot--you cannot cram kids to the capacity
21 that we're asked to - - and expect positive
22 results. Kids in the stairway - - when they
23 come to school, they need to space to fit in, to
24 learn, and to have - - so in closing, I'd just
25 like to say that if you want PS138 to remain - -

1 level A, you have to take into consideration
2 that the size of the school population will
3 negatively impact the students. And my last
4 comment is, what price are you placing on the
5 education of 138 students? How much is their
6 education worth?

7 [applause]

8 MS. ROSE: Steve Kusman.

9 [applause]

10 MR. STEVE KUSMAN: Okay, I am one of those
11 science teachers that you were talking about as
12 far as we had to set up a lab. We had to set up
13 a lab and as a teacher I have to try to excite
14 the young ones in science and the older ones, I
15 have to guide and teach them and some children I
16 have to nurture and as an educator, we face many
17 challenges and public schools in particular, we
18 have to take the gifted. We have to take the
19 children who have disabilities, and we have to
20 take those that have emotional challenges, and I
21 don't understand how some of the charter schools
22 are allowed to use public funds and not take
23 everyone or release some of them back to the
24 public schools--

25 [applause]

1 MR. KUSMAN: - - Secondly, secondly, this
2 past June, I watched the expression - - with the
3 sadness and frustration of having us lose funds
4 and having to excess certain teachers--many of
5 them were young, charming, they were good
6 teachers, and it's a sad thing that we have to
7 sit here and fight for funds with a new charter
8 school coming into our system.

9 [applause]

10 MS. ROSE: Jenena Smith.

11 MS. JENENA SMITH: - -

12 [background noise]

13 MS. SMITH: My name is Jenena Smith. I have
14 attended public school 138 since the sixth
15 grade. My comment about this school is the
16 teachers in all grades - - they take their time
17 with all the students and work really hard on
18 that. My principal, Marie Chauvet-Monchik, is a
19 nice caring principal. PS138 is not only a
20 school, it is also a family. Also, I have the
21 best fifth grade teacher and if it was not for
22 her, I would be a - -.

23 [laughter]

24 MS. SMITH: The great thing for her, - -
25 this is a solid A school and we want, and we

1 want it to stay together, plus my mom's - -
2 very hard worker. My parents care and want the
3 best for me. There might be one or two charters
4 at MS138 and we don't tolerate that kind of
5 behavior. I hope and pray that PS138 wins.
6 Shout out to my sixth grade teachers, - - my
7 math teacher, - - my science, Mr. - - teacher,
8 Miss Diaz, my literature - - and Miss - - my art
9 teacher.

10 [applause]

11 MS. SMITH: We are all in this together.
12 Goodnight and have a good one.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ROSE: Thank you. Chanelle Webster?

15 MS. CHANELLE WEBSTER: Goodnight, everybody.
16 My name is Chanelle Webster. I am formerly a
17 senior at MS/PS138.

18 [applause]

19 MS. WEBSTER: And I recently heard about the
20 charter school's co-locating with my school, and
21 I strongly oppose this decision for multiple
22 reasons. I have been attending this school
23 since second grade and I've been a part of this
24 school and I've seen it grow from a B to an A
25 and it has not dropped but it remains the same

1 and I am glad to be a part of that. PS138 has
2 become a part of me. We are a family at this
3 school. The teachers take the time to mold us,
4 make us. They're like, they're like potters who
5 work with clay, like, they just mold--

6 [applause]

7 MS. WEBSTER: Our teachers' model is not to
8 break us or bash us, but to make us perfect.
9 That is why we are perfect, 'cause - - we are
10 proud of our A. We want to remain an A and we
11 will stop this. We will not make the charter
12 schools come in and stop our grades, our
13 success, because we are the best, we are number
14 one, and we will make the grade.

15 [applause]

16 MS. WEBSTER: - - Person as well as the
17 Beacon program that is in this school. Having
18 too much students in this school will stop our
19 success. It will bring failure. It will hinder
20 us from being better people in our community.
21 It will not help us to grow, but it will keep us
22 low, at a very low level, and the great
23 community that supports us as they are always
24 behind us and I'd like to thank my principal for
25 being such a great principal. I thank my math

1 teacher, Mr. McCain. I thank my - - Robinson
2 - - teacher, and I thank all of you that came
3 out to support PS138. God bless you.

4 [applause]

5 MS. ROSE: Gracelynn Molokow.

6 MS. GRACELYNN MOLOKOW: Hello. My name is
7 Gracelynn. Today we are gathered to discuss
8 about the charter school. I am in fifth grade
9 at PS138. I can say that having another school
10 will cause a lot of problems for me as well as
11 my classmates. The spaces we have in our school
12 lets us have more areas to learn and be
13 ourselves. I love my classroom, science lab and
14 other resources in my school. By taking away
15 our space, you are giving us an earlier
16 lunchtime, less time to play in our yard, and
17 overall, it would be a very bad experience. My
18 sisters have all went to PS138, and always say
19 very good things about it. I want to be there
20 and be able to say that PS138 helped me for high
21 school, helped me for college and beyond. I
22 love my school and don't--and I don't want it to
23 be taken over. Would you like it if someone
24 came and took over your space?

25 [applause]

1 MS. MOLOKOW: And neither would I. I hope
2 that you guys can look at yourselves and see
3 what you're doing is wrong for us, wrong for our
4 school, and wrong for our community.

5 [applause]

6 MS. ROSE: I'd like to call the next five
7 speakers, please--John Bogart, Kiersten John
8 Foy, Michael Bennet, - - Robinson, and Reverend
9 Doctor Robert Townsey.

10 [applause]

11 MS. ROSE: Mr. Bogart?

12 MR. JOHN BOGART: Good evening. I think
13 these young people - - really know how to, you
14 know, go about this talk. Anyway, I'd like to
15 say this... PS138 is an excellent school, and
16 it's a successful school. As I watch Success
17 Academy doing its business throughout the city,
18 I want to know why Success Academy always
19 chooses the successful schools to invade, and
20 co-locate with. Success Academy is a cancer,
21 like all of the charter schools. They are
22 cancers--

23 [applause]

24 MR. BOGART: And how best, how best to treat
25 ourselves from cancers? Not letting them come

1 in.

2 [background noise]

3 MR. BOGART: This is the plan that the DOE
4 has for our city, to undermine all public
5 schools--undermining public schools is the
6 number one priority. Defund those schools, cut
7 their budgets, excess the teachers, so that,
8 that way, they can drop in their grades--we - -
9 those grades. PS138 is an A school, not because
10 of the - - of the DOE. They are an A school
11 because they are committed--teachers, the
12 community, the parents, the students are
13 committed to education. That's why they are A
14 schools, so therefore, I think that it's very
15 important that the community, the parents, care
16 about the school. You've got to stand up and
17 fight, fight, fight, because the DOE, they do
18 what - - they want to do what they want to do,
19 but you have to fight - - and fight, fight,
20 fight.

21 [applause]

22 MS. ROSE: Kiersten John Foy?

23 REVEREND KIERSTEN JOHN FOY: Good evening.
24 My name is Reverend Kiersten John Foy. I'm
25 president of the Brooklyn Chapter of the

1 National Action Network. That's Reverend Al
2 Sharpton's organization. - - From Al Sharpton.

3 [applause]

4 REVEREND FOY: Education is the civil right
5 of the 21st century, and when we have a school
6 like PS138, you have a national model for where
7 the civil rights movement is going. When you
8 have a student body that will stand up to City
9 Hall and articulate in a way that their parents
10 may not be able to why this policy not only will
11 affect their ability to be educated in optimal
12 conditions, but are also limited if this co-
13 location goes through, the ability of not just
14 the students of PS138 public school, but of the
15 charter school as well. Co-location is a very
16 dangerous formula, and when you take public
17 school resources and you use them to subsidize
18 private education, you are robbing from the
19 hundreds of thousands of public school children
20 who will not have that same opportunity.

21 [applause]

22 REVEREND FOY: It undermines their ability
23 to be properly educated and prepared. It is
24 violating their civil rights and we are not
25 going to stand by and let another generation of

1 our children have their civil rights stripped
2 of them because there is an administration that
3 refuses to acknowledge that separate but equal
4 is unequal in the end. We have two tiers of
5 education in this city. We have a public
6 education system and we now have a quasi-private
7 public education system. And what we're saying
8 to the students in the public education system
9 is oh well, we're sorry. You didn't have the -
10 - so you can't make it out of your condition.
11 What we're saying to the charter school kids is
12 by law, you're better than they are. That's not
13 acceptable - - that's not acceptable for the
14 City of New York. That's not acceptable for the
15 United States of America, and this co-location,
16 I've got to tell you, you will not succeed and
17 if we have to go to City Hall, if we have to go
18 to Albany, if we have to take this right to
19 Washington, D.C., to the President of the United
20 States, and say Mr. President, the civil rights
21 of the children of PS138 are - - and any other
22 charter school child, we are not going away. We
23 are not going away. And guess what? I feel
24 sorry for the charter school. How can they
25 compete with PS138?

1 [applause]

2 MS. ROSE: Michael Bennet?

3 [applause]

4 MS. ROSE: Please, Mr. Bennet's turn to
5 speak--please give - - your attention, thank
6 you.

7 MR. MICHAEL BENNET: Hello, my name is
8 Michael Bennet--

9 MS. ROSE: I'm sorry, Mr. Bennet, can you
10 hold on a minute? Can we please have quiet so
11 we can hear the student speak? Thank you.
12 Begin.

13 MR. BENNET: Hello. My name is Michael
14 Bennet. I am a senior in the eighth grade
15 attending PS138. I was recently informed that a
16 charter school was coming to PS138. I strongly
17 disagree with this. This is my last year at
18 PS138. I want it to be the best year I have at
19 this school. It won't be if a charter school
20 comes. If a charter school comes, - - rules and
21 regulations. Ever hear of the saying first
22 come, first served?

23 [laughter]

24 MR. BENNET: Think about it: A public school
25 and a charter school in one school--basically,

1 they want things to go their way. They will
2 try utilize the things we have. But we can't do
3 the same. It's not fair and that's plain
4 selfish. To me, they are trying to invade the
5 whole school. First of all, charter school--
6 with a charter school you have to pay about \$300
7 a month. If you multiply that by how many
8 months, school months, that would be about
9 approximately \$3000. \$3000 for a child a year--
10 some parents send their children to a public
11 school because it's free. Think about it:
12 Parents paying \$3000 for a child when you can
13 get it for free. Unlike some schools, this
14 school has a lot at the school that a person
15 would like the SAT prep, Regents prep, Beacon
16 and more. The specialized high school prep
17 will--the specialized high school prep, you
18 don't have to pay for tutoring but it's free in
19 our school, and the Regents. This school is
20 providing three or four Regents courses--some
21 schools don't do that. By the time I get to
22 high school, I will have six or eight credits
23 that - - for a freshman.

24 [applause]

25 MR. BENNET: During the school year of 2011-

1 2012, two seniors graduated MS138 going to a
2 specialized--going to one of the top specialized
3 high schools of Brooklyn Tech and Stuyvesant.

4 [applause]

5 MR. BENNET: At least 80%--at least 80% of
6 seniors in the school of the year 2011 to 2012
7 aced the test. To conclude this statement, the
8 charter school is asking for way too much.
9 These people need to get out of here and let our
10 school be. That's all I am asking, basically:
11 Save our school.

12 [applause]

13 MS. ROSE: Carla Robinson [phonetic]?

14 MS. CARLA ROBINSON: - - Tough act to
15 follow. Okay, I am a person who lives in this
16 neighborhood. I am also a guidance counselor in
17 PS138. My question to the charter school is
18 when you have a student misbehave, you don't
19 want to keep your student--you send your student
20 back to the public school--that's something that
21 I think, for us, you only want the good students
22 but the kids who misbehave, you don't want them.
23 What are you going to do when - - misbehave?
24 You gave them a ticket and say that they're
25 wonderful, you come to my school--the students

1 misbehave, I'm not - - go back to where you
2 belong, so I want to say--

3 [applause]

4 MS. ROSE: - - The next five speakers to
5 come down and prepare to speak--Gail Wright,
6 Jack Henry, Lashanta Henry [phonetic], Natalia
7 Wills and Abigail Williams.

8 [applause]

9 MS. ROSE: Our next speaker is the Reverend
10 Doctor Robert Townsey.

11 [applause]

12 REVEREND DOCTOR ROBERT TOWNSEY: My name is
13 Reverend Townsey. - -

14 [background noise]

15 REVEREND TOWNSEY: I know why it's
16 necessary--I think for PS1S38, teachers, for
17 instructors, for students, for parents to come
18 and we feel like somebody is - - while we're
19 making our presentations. I think that is very
20 disrespectful. I don't think that that's - -
21 and saving us the time for us to speak and you
22 to hear what we have to say, but in actuality we
23 know that you don't want to hear what we have to
24 say. That's why the CEC is not here. My name
25 is Reverend Townsey. I'm the pastor of Saint

1 Matthew Missionary Baptist Church, a former
2 member of the NWO. - - I work with a lot of
3 people in the community, and when we get a lot--
4 you've heard testimony from the principal on
5 down, where there's science projects that are
6 being done in the hallway. The DOE had to come
7 in and hook up everything for their science lab.
8 They worked hard to put together science labs
9 and everything else, to put together computer
10 labs, to put them online. They make it work.
11 But people already told you about the financial
12 thing, of what's happening with the finances in
13 DOE but you're not listening to that. They told
14 you that they had a B and they pushed to have an
15 A - - five years, they did not have an A, pushed
16 - - . You acknowledge--30 seconds--well, I
17 think it would be nice to hear what the reverend
18 has to say.

19 [applause]

20 REVEREND TOWNSEY: If I was a rabbi, if I
21 was a rabbi, I wouldn't be so disrespected,
22 okay? If I was one of the priests from the
23 Catholic Church--well, I'm a pastor from the
24 Baptist Church - - and I'm from this community,
25 and if I have something to say, I think the DOE

1 and SUNY should hear it, because this is my
2 window of opportunity to do that. My rights - -
3 CEC District 17. They're not here - - they're
4 not listening to our councilman. He's an icon
5 in our community. He made a lot of things
6 happen in this community.

7 [applause]

8 REVEREND TOWNSEY: And you didn't want to
9 listen to him--somewhere you have to listen. My
10 time is not up, because the funds that keep this
11 school open and that pay the salaries of the DOE
12 comes from our taxes, and it's our children that
13 you are teaching that - - for a short period of
14 time. This is the time you need to hear what we
15 have to say. Now, if you don't listen to
16 anything else, our children go to these schools
17 and when the school was built, the capacity for
18 the school was 1,200. Where does it say - -
19 problem, the capacity was 1,200? That was a
20 fairly experiment that you had. Now you want to
21 do it again and all of the sudden the capacity
22 goes to 1,400. Legally, who gave you the right
23 to change those numbers? And if a fire breaks
24 out, what's going to happen to our children?
25 There has to be a process--nobody can just put

1 down 1,400. The fire department has a system
2 of why it's 1,200, so we need to look at that,
3 and I want that on record, because if anybody
4 gets hurt, then that's something that's very,
5 very important and needs to be heard.

6 MS. ROSE: Your time - -.

7 REVEREND TOWNSEY: Okay, thank you very
8 much.

9 MS. ROSE: Thank you.

10 [applause]

11 MS. ROSE: Gail Wright?

12 MS. GAIL WRIGHT: I have one thing that's
13 very important that you need to know--the
14 chancellor's not here because - - number one,
15 all right? It's sad to say but technically the
16 decision has already been made. They will send,
17 what is it, Success Academy to 138, all right?
18 They're probably putting it on the stationary
19 right now, but they will not stay. I will not
20 want my child to - - okay, what they failed to
21 realize about 138 is that they are the - -
22 everything they put in front of you, the
23 challenges, you overcome. We will overcome
24 this. I went to 138 before mostly everybody in
25 this room was born. My daughter is a product of

1 138. When she went to high school they
2 thought she went to a private school. Her
3 teacher said to me, does she have Brooklyn
4 friends? I said, do I look like - - no, she
5 went to PS/MS138 and honestly, if you want to
6 find a school to put them in, 138 takes all of
7 the children from schools that only want levels
8 3's and 4's. They turn those level 1's into 2's
9 and 3's, and the level 2's into 3's and 4's.
10 Send them to 161 because they don't want the
11 children that are not super-smart because
12 evidently their teachers are not qualified
13 enough to turn these children into level 3's and
14 4's. They do not have - - and all of the
15 teachers that I have mentioned their name--they
16 challenge the students every year. I work with
17 the DOE - - hey, why not? Okay, every year, I
18 send students from my school to 138 because the
19 parents, they want--and I want them - - they say
20 Miss Wright, I want my child to go to the
21 school--where, number one, they can be safe and
22 not afraid, because a child that does not feel
23 safe and not afraid cannot learn, and then when
24 they want to get that good education and I send
25 them to 138. In fact, in the auditorium this

1 year, I sent them there, guess what? She was
2 the first one that Stuyvesant took, okay?

3 [applause]

4 MS. WRIGHT: Do not send the charter school
5 to 138. If we, if--

6 MS. ROSE: - -

7 MS. WRIGHT: Okay. And all--by the way, all
8 of the schools, be it the population in all the
9 elementary schools have - - .

10 [applause]

11 MS. ROSE: - -

12 [background noise]

13 MR. JACK HENRY: Good afternoon, members of
14 DOE, CEC, SLT, - - teachers, parents, - - are
15 here today. My name is Jack Henry and I am a
16 student here at PS138. I have been - - at PS138
17 since September. I wanted to share with you all
18 the main reasons I'm proud to be a student here.
19 The teachers are here and very knowledgeable.
20 They also show an interest in me and my academic
21 performance. At PS138, I look forward to many
22 events and experiencing new things. Miss
23 Chauvet, staff and students have welcomed me and
24 I am disappointed to learn that the Board of
25 Education is trying to have a charter school in

1 our school. I am afraid PS138 will be
2 overcrowded with too many students due to lack
3 of space. Our resources will be limited and we
4 will be forced out of our school. We cannot
5 allow this to happen. I ask that you all please
6 show your passion for the existing school which
7 is PS138 and think of the negative, and think of
8 the negative impact a charter school would have
9 on the current students' education. There are
10 so many students at PS138. There is no room for
11 a charter school when we need our space for
12 education. Thank you.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ROSE: Lashanta Henry [phonetic]?

15 MS. LASHANTA HENRY: Good night everyone.

16 My name is Lashanta Henry and I am in the fifth
17 grade, and I look forward to attending school at
18 PS138. I love my school. PS138 provides a high
19 quality education for every child. I have been
20 attending PS138 since pre-K and I couldn't ask
21 for a better place - - in education. Each year
22 our teachers care for not only our education but
23 our wellbeing so I say to them - - idea. We are
24 PS138 and you can't take us away. - - Also
25 charter school - - and help all of our

1 activities - - and we can't have it. This is
2 our school.

3 [applause]

4 MS. ROSE: Natalia Wills.

5 MS. NATALIA WILLS: Starting off with, my
6 school provides a high quality of education to -
7 - students here. PS138 needs these classrooms
8 in order to - - teach a diverse population of
9 students. If this charter school comes into the
10 school it will be overcrowded. I have recently
11 heard about the charter school on the first day
12 of school, and that's to say it's not fair.
13 Instead of using the money for this charter
14 school, the DOE should use the money for art and
15 music programs.

16 [applause]

17 MS. WILLS: - - Because if we don't, we will
18 have to go to the school and grounds - - we are
19 an A level school and we want to stay that way.

20 [applause]

21 MS. ROSE: Before calling the next speaker,
22 I'd like the next five speakers to come down to
23 prepare--Ashley Chambers, Naomi Rasano, Lashanda
24 Maynard, James Moultre--I'm sorry if I
25 mispronounced that--and Mohammed Barry. The

1 next speaker is Adyel Williams.

2 MS. ADYEL WILLIAMS: Good afternoon. My
3 name is Adyel Williams. I came here to - - my
4 school - - for its standard. We are a level A
5 school - - charter school to co-locate with our
6 school PS/MS138. If a charter school comes into
7 138 it will be total chaos. It would be chaotic
8 and - - in the classrooms, gymnasiums, play
9 yards, and so forth. We have been a level A
10 school and will stay so. We are trying - - to
11 reach that goal in education that the teachers
12 portray and teach with compassion. We are
13 trying to - - perfection--my question for the
14 charter school is - - education, how would you
15 feel if we come, if another school came in - -
16 it's simple common sense. The DOE could,
17 instead of using the money for the charter
18 schools, they could use it for putting it back
19 in 138, for school supplies and books--

20 [applause]

21 MS. WILLIAMS: - - That we could use the
22 space that we have, the unused space that we
23 have for more after-schools and more things that
24 would benefit our students. That's my question
25 and...

1 [applause]

2 MS. ROSE: Ashley Chambers?

3 MS. ASHLEY CHAMBERS: Today, today in
4 science we learned about the cells. The charter
5 school is like a virus which will kill our
6 cells, which is PS138. I'm not saying that - -
7 charter school; I'm saying it's a bunch of
8 nonsense. - - Say that we should speak our
9 right, and I'm speaking now--I never want to be
10 in a classroom with kids that might be - - all
11 kids - - we are - - and we will stay there, not
12 by - - but by faith.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ROSE: Naomi Rasano?

15 [background noise]

16 MS. NAOMI ROSANO: Good night. I'm a
17 seventh grader at PS138 and I'm here to talk
18 about my reasons why that we shouldn't let a
19 charter school come to our school. I remember
20 in the year 2009 when charter--when a charter
21 school came to our school. They actually, like,
22 overtook the classes, the lunchroom, and I don't
23 like it. I don't know about you, but I don't
24 like it. I want to say that I love my school
25 and we're all like the piece of puzzle. You

1 can't put pieces that don't fit.

2 [applause]

3 MS. ROSANO: I know that I have the greatest
4 school, and I want to pass and I want to be
5 known as a girl from PS138. I am a smart girl
6 and I know it. I know it.

7 [applause]

8 MS. ROSANO: Thank you so much.

9 [applause]

10 MS. ROSE: Lashanda Maynard?

11 [background noise]

12 MS. LASHANDA MAYNARD: Good evening - - .
13 My name is Lashanda--

14 MS. ROSE: I'm sorry, - - just wait while
15 the auditorium gets quiet so they can hear what
16 you have to say. Thank you.

17 MS. MAYNARD: Good evening, - - teachers,
18 staff, and students. My name is Lashanda
19 Maynard - - why the charter school and - -
20 because we are a family, and family matters.
21 This year has been quite challenging for us.
22 Mayor Bloomberg is conducting other students'
23 education by overcrowding classes, classes like
24 the gym, math lab, science room and more will be
25 overcrowded. If they are overcrowded, they will

1 get - - education. I'm sure that - - wants us
2 to achieve an A level school on our own. Thank
3 you for listening - -.

4 [applause]

5 MS. ROSE: Thank you. James Moultre?

6 MR. JAMES MOULTRE: Good evening. I'm very
7 - - and you know why, because - - because
8 there's only one ruler, and that is God. We're
9 not trying to bring Brown versus the Board of
10 Education again of civil rights, our Dr. King,
11 Rosa Parks, Malcolm X, listen, you do not get -
12 -.

13 [applause]

14 MS. ROSE: I'd like to call the last three
15 speakers to come and prepare, Cedeance Hyde,
16 Mariana Barry, and Leah Felder. Mohammed Barry,
17 your turn to speak.

18 MR. MOHAMMED BARRY: Good evening, ladies
19 and gentlemen of MS390 and PS138. I just want
20 to start by saying that PS138 is a great school.
21 It has loving staff, caring teachers and humble
22 students. PS138 has the best teachers that a
23 sixth grade can offer such as our principal,
24 Miss Chauvet, our math teacher - - our PA
25 teacher, - - our science teacher, - - and our PE

1 teacher, Mr. - -. This school should not
2 change and should remain the same for many
3 years. Thank you for listening.

4 [applause]

5 MS. ROSE: Cedeance Hyde?

6 [applause]

7 MS. CEDEANCE HYDE: Good night everyone.

8 Hi, everyone. So after yesterday, I was
9 informed that a charter school is trying to come
10 to PS138, and I highly disagree with that. I
11 really don't appreciate it. Speakers, my
12 principal, Miss Chauvet--okay, - - I want to
13 say, but I'm speechless at the moment. - - I
14 can say, I just have to say that for the past
15 four years, PS138 has been an A school, and I
16 just - - I can't - - but I know that...

17 [background noise]

18 MS. HYDE: I know that if we succeed, a
19 charter school not coming to our school, we
20 fight for what we believe in--education leads to
21 success and to believe that teachers like Miss
22 Julia, Miss Barr, Miss - - Mr. Vasquez - -
23 everybody, Mr. McQueen, - - everybody, they
24 fight, they fight, they help us to succeed for
25 what we have to be - - and to believe anything

1 that we have and - - we will succeed. Thank
2 you.

3 [applause]

4 MS. ROSE: Thank you. Mariana Barry?
5 Mariana Barry? Leah Felder?

6 [applause]

7 MS. LEAH FELDER: Hi. So I live across the
8 street from PS138, and I came here tonight to
9 support PS138 because I've met members of the
10 community and it's such a great community, but
11 they didn't come in here so, so strong. But my
12 experience here tonight has done the most in my
13 life to discredit the charter school movement.
14 I have never seen something that is so
15 offensive. Nobody that has the best interests
16 of our children and the children of this country
17 at heart could support the co-location of a
18 charter school in PS138.

19 [applause]

20 MS. ROSE: That is our last speaker of the
21 evening. I particularly want to acknowledge and
22 commend all of the students who spoke this
23 evening so eloquently.

24 [applause]

25 MS. ROSE: We have heard many significant

1 comments this evening and I appreciate all of
2 the feedback that we've heard and your
3 contributions at this hearing. All of the
4 comments made tonight as well as comments
5 received by email or telephone will be included
6 in the analysis of public comment that will be
7 published and provided to the Panel for
8 Educational Policy the evening before the Panel
9 votes on this proposal. Public comments may
10 also be made the evening of the Panel's hearing.
11 That panel will have its hearing on December
12 20th, 2012 at the High School for Fashion
13 Industries located at 225 West 24th Street in
14 Manhattan to vote on this proposal. Again, the
15 email address where you may send additional
16 comments is d17proposals@schools.nyc.gov and the
17 phone number where you can leave comments is
18 (212) 374-0208. Thank you all for coming this
19 evening. This joint public hearing is
20 officially adjourned.

21 [END RECORDING]

22
23
24
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

The prior proceedings were transcribed from audio files and have been transcribed to the best of my ability.

Signature Date December 18, 2012

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25