



Dennis M. Walcott
Chancellor

Public Comment Analysis¹

Date: March 8, 2013

Topic: The Proposed Opening and Co-Location of a New Elementary School (09X274) with Existing Schools P.S. 230 Dr. Roland N. Patterson (09X230) and I.S. 229 Roland Patterson (09X229) in Building X229 Beginning in 2013-2014

Date of Panel Vote: March 11, 2013

Summary of Proposal

On January 22, 2013, the New York City Department of Education (“DOE”) issued an educational impact statement (“EIS”) describing a proposal to co-locate a new elementary school, 09X274 (“09X274”), in building X229 located at 275 Harlem River Park Bridge, Bronx, NY 10453, in Community School District 9 (“District 9”).

If this proposal is approved, 09X274 will be co-located in building X229 with P.S. 230 Dr. Roland N. Patterson (09X230, “P.S. 230”) and I.S. 229 Roland Patterson (09X229, “I.S. 229”). P.S. 230 is an existing elementary school that serves students in kindergarten through fifth grades. I.S. 229 is an existing middle school serving students in grades six through eight. The new school, 09X274, will begin to enroll kindergarten, first-grade, and second-grade students and offer pre-kindergarten in 2013-2014. 09X274 will then add one grade per year until it reaches full scale and serves students in pre-kindergarten and grades kindergarten through five in 2016-2017. Throughout the phase-in period and beyond, 09X274 will admit kindergarten students according to standard zoned admissions priorities as described in Chancellor’s Regulation A-101.

In a separate EIS, also published on January 22, 2013, the DOE has proposed to gradually phase out and eventually close P.S. 230 because of its low performance and inability to improve quickly to better support student needs. If the phase-out proposal is approved, P.S. 230 will no longer admit kindergarten, first-grade, or second-grade students after the conclusion of the 2012-2013 school year. One grade will then be phased out each subsequent year: during the 2013-2014 school year, P.S. 230 will serve students in third, fourth, and fifth grades; in 2014-2015, it will serve students in fourth and fifth grades; in 2015-2016, it will serve students in fifth grade. P.S. 230 will then close after June 2016.

¹ The DOE will continue to accept comments concerning this proposal up to 24 hours prior to the Panel for Educational Policy’s (“PEP”) vote on March 11, 2013. Those additional comments will be addressed in an amended Public Comment Analysis which will be provided to the PEP before it votes on this proposal.

Current P.S. 230 kindergarten and first-grade students, as well as second grade students who do not meet promotional standards, will be served in 09X274 beginning in September 2013. Current P.S. 230 third-, fourth-, and fifth-grade students who do not meet promotional standards will continue to be served in P.S. 230. In the future, P.S. 230 students who are held over in grades which are no longer offered at P.S. 230 will be served in 09X274.

Taken together, these proposals are part of the DOE's effort to ensure that all students in New York City have access to a high quality school at every stage of their education. The co-location of 09X274 in building X229 is intended to provide an additional option to students and families in District 9 and the Bronx.

The EIS containing additional details of this proposal, along with the EIS describing the proposed phase-out of P.S. 230, can be accessed here:

<http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/leadership/PEP/publicnotice/2012-2013/Mar112013Proposals.htm>.

Copies of both EISs are also available in the main offices of P.S. 230 and I.S. 229.

Summary of Comments Received at the Joint Public Hearing

A joint public hearing regarding the proposals to phase-out P.S. 230 and co-locate 09X274 was held at the X229 building on February 25, 2013. Members of the School Leadership Team ("SLT") from P.S. 230 and I.S. 229 were invited to participate. At that hearing, interested parties had an opportunity to provide input on the proposal. Approximately 220 members of the public attended the hearing, and 32 people spoke. Present at the meeting were P.S. 230 SLT members, including Teresa Gill, Wendel Deloatch, Leona Williams, and Yvette Jenkins; P.S. 230 Principal Rowena Penn; I.S. 229 Principal Ezra Matias; District 9 Superintendent Dolores Esposito; Community Education Council 9 ("CEC 9") President Marilyn Espada; and several DOE officials, including Deputy Chancellor Shael Polakow-Suransky who served as the Chancellor's Designee, Gregg Bethel who facilitated the hearing, Brendan Lowe, Sara Kaufman, and Henry Bluestone Smith.

The following questions, comments, and remarks were made at the joint public hearing:

1. One commenter, who identified herself as a parent, asked whether there was any guarantee that the replacement school would do better than P.S. 230.
2. Several commenters raised the issue of charter schools in relation to the replacement proposal

Summary of Issues Raised in Written and/or Oral Comments Submitted to the DOE

There were no written or oral comments submitted to the DOE regarding this proposal.

The DOE received a number of Written and/or Oral Comments along with comments at the Joint Public Hearing which did not directly relate to the Proposal

Comment 2 involved questions and comments that were submitted at the joint public hearing regarding charter schools.

As described in the EIS accompanying this proposal, the proposals to phase-out and replace P.S. 230 involve two public, District 9 elementary schools (P.S. 230, and the proposed replacement for P.S. 230, 09X274). There are no charter schools involved in this proposal.

The Analysis of Public Comments regarding the related proposal to phase-out P.S. 230 is available at: <http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/leadership/PEP/publicnotice/2012-2013/Mar112013Proposals.htm>.

**Analysis of Issues Raised, Significant Alternatives Proposed
and Changes Made to the Proposal**

Comment 1 asked if there was any guarantee that the replacement school would do better than P.S. 230 in terms of promoting student achievement.

To ensure that as many students as possible have access to the best possible education, under this Administration, New York City has replaced 142 of our lowest-performing schools with better options and opened 576 new schools: 427 district schools and 149 public charter schools.

As indicated in the table below, in each of the past three years the percentage of students in grades three, four, and five who meet or exceed the New York State Education Department (“NYSED”) achievement standards on the English Language Arts (“ELA”) and Math exams (defined as scoring a 3 or 4) at new schools has significantly exceeded the percentage of students meeting or exceeding achievement standards at schools that have been approved for phase-out.

ELA:

Percentage of third-grade students at Levels 3 or 4 on NYSED ELA exam			
	2010	2011	2012
New Schools	34.5	36.1	45.3
Phase-out Schools	27	23.7	25.1

Percentage of fourth-grade students at Levels 3 or 4 NYSED on ELA exam			
	2010	2011	2012
New Schools	35.2	42.2	39.9
Phase-out Schools	22.4	29.2	26.4

Percentage of fifth-grade students at Levels 3 or 4 on NYSED ELA exam			
	2010	2011	2012
New Schools	38.2	45.8	44.1
Phase-out Schools	23.2	24	27.6

Math:

Percentage of third-grade students at Levels 3 or 4 on NYSED Math exam			
	2010	2011	2012
New Schools	39.9	41.2	52.3
Phase-out Schools	28.9	27.1	24

Percentage of fourth-grade students at Levels 3 or 4 on NYSED Math exam			
	2010	2011	2012
New Schools	43.6	46.2	52.8
Phase-out Schools	29.7	34.6	35

Percentage of fifth-grade students at Levels 3 or 4 on NYSED Math exam			
	2010	2011	2012
New Schools	48.6	59	54.4
Phase-out Schools	29.8	33.8	36.3

While there is no guarantee that the replacement school will attain a given level of student achievement, there is ample data to suggest that phasing-out and replacing P.S. 230 will lead to gains in student achievement for elementary school children enrolled at the X229 building.

Changes Made to the Proposal

No changes have been made to the proposal.