



Dennis M. Walcott
Chancellor

Public Comment Analysis¹

Date: March 8, 2013

Topic: The Proposed Opening and Co-location of New Secondary School Eagle Academy for Young Men of Harlem (05M148) with KAPPA IV (05M302), Mott Hall High School (05M304) and Bread & Roses Integrated Arts High School (05M685) in School Building M136, Beginning in 2013-2014

Date of Panel Vote: March 11, 2013

Summary of Proposal

On January 11, 2013, the New York City Department of Education (“DOE”) issued an Educational Impact Statement (“EIS”) describing a proposal to open and co-locate Eagle Academy for Young Men of Harlem (05M148, “Eagle Academy”), a new district secondary school, in school building M136 (“M136”) beginning in the 2013-2014 school year. M136 is located at 6 Edgecombe Avenue, New York, NY 10030, within the geographical confines of Community School District 5 (“District 5”). The proposed new secondary school, Eagle Academy, will serve male students and will offer a rigorous academic program that will prepare students for post-secondary education and work. If this proposal is approved, Eagle Academy will be co-located with the following district schools: KAPPA IV (05M302, “KAPPA IV”), an existing middle school serving students in grades six through eight; Mott Hall High School (05M304, “Mott Hall”), an existing high school serving students in grades nine through twelve; and Bread & Roses Integrated Arts High School (05M685, “Bread and Roses”), an existing high school serving students in grades nine through twelve. Eagle Academy will serve male students in grades six through twelve. If this proposal is approved, Eagle Academy will begin enrolling sixth-grade students in 2013-2014 and will add one grade per year until it has reached full scale and serves students in sixth through twelfth grade in 2019-2020.

The original EIS was revised to include updated descriptions of the admissions criteria and method at Eagle Academy indicating that the school will admit male students in Manhattan

¹ The DOE will continue to accept comments concerning this proposal up to 24 hours prior to the Panel for Educational Policy’s (“PEP”) vote on March 11, 2013. Any additional comments will be addressed in an amended Public Comment Analysis which will be made available to the PEP before it votes on this proposal.

through the Middle School Choice Process. It also includes updated enrollment figures, updated information regarding State Improvement Grants, and corrects typographical errors.

In a separate Educational Impact Statement (“EIS”) also initially posted on January 11, 2013 and subsequently amended on February 14, 2013, the DOE has proposed to phase out and eventually close Bread and Roses after an extensive review of data and community feedback indicating that the school is unable to turn around despite numerous efforts to improve instruction and school organization. This EIS can be accessed on the DOE’s Web site at <http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/leadership/PEP/publicnotice/2012-2013/Mar112013Proposals.htm>.

If the Panel for Educational Policy (“PEP”) approves the proposal to phase out Bread and Roses, the school will no longer admit new ninth-grade students after the end of this school year. However, Bread and Roses will continue to serve students currently enrolled in the school. Bread and Roses will phase-out one grade level per year over the next three years and will close in June 2016.

In the event that the phase-out of Bread and Roses is not approved, the DOE will re-examine the availability of space in the building and may, as appropriate, revise its proposal to co-locate Eagle Academy in M136. Such a revised proposal would be described in a revised EIS.

The proposed opening and co-location of Eagle Academy in M136 is part of the DOE’s central goal to create new school options that will better serve future students and the community at large. Eagle Academy will offer a rigorous academic program that will be open to male students in grades six through eight in Manhattan through the Middle School Choice Process as well as students in grades nine through twelve through the Citywide High School Admissions Process, once the school expands to serve those grades.

For its high school grades, Eagle Academy will admit students through a limited unscreened selection method giving priority to eighth-grade students already attending Eagle Academy’s middle school.

Copies of the EIS are also available in the main offices of Bread and Roses, KAPPA IV, and Mott Hall.

Summary of Comments Received at the Joint Public Hearing

A Joint Public Hearing regarding this proposal was held at school building M136 on March 5, 2013. Members of the School Leadership Team (“SLT”) from all schools in building M136 were invited to participate. At that hearing, interested parties had the opportunity to provide input on the proposal. Approximately 30 members of the public attended the hearing, and 13 people spoke. Also present at the meeting were: the principal of Bread and Roses, Rodney Lofton; Bread and Roses School Leadership Team (“SLT”) representatives Pooja Bhaskar and Andrea Wilson; KAPPA IV SLT Representative Nichole Bryant; Community Education Council 5 (“CEC 5”) Secretary Ayisha Irvin; Manhattan High School Superintendent, Anthony Lodico;

and Representatives from the DOE's Office of Portfolio Management, Yael Kalban and Ashley Davies.

Additionally, a Joint Public Hearing regarding the amended proposal to phase out Bread & Roses Integrated Arts High School (05M685, "Bread and Roses"), an existing high school located in school building M136 ("M136") beginning in the 2013-2014 school year was held on February 13, 2013. Comments from that hearing as well as the hearing held on March 5th pertaining to the proposed phase-out of Bread and Roses are contained within a separate document of Public Comment Analysis, available at: <http://schools.nyc.gov/AboutUs/leadership/PEP/publicnotice/2012-2013/Mar112013Proposals.htm>.

The following comments and remarks were made at the Joint Public Hearing:

1. Several commentators voiced general opposition to the proposal.
2. CEC 5 Secretary Ayisha Irvin stated that she is just here to listen to the community's thoughts on the proposal.
3. Andrea Wilson, a representative of the Bread and Roses SLT, asserted that:
 - a. She is opposed to the proposal to phase out and replace Bread and Roses.
 - b. Eagle Academy may do well with its students, but is able to select who attends the school, unlike Bread and Roses, which serves all students.
4. Nichole Bryant, a representative of the KAPPA IV SLT, voiced general opposition to the proposal and inquired about the purpose of phasing out a school to bring in another school.
5. One commenter expressed concern about the number of schools in the building stating that the school is already crowded.
6. One commentator stated that he knew of Eagle Academy, and that it is a good school.
7. One commentator questioned whether Eagle Academy will be more successful with the population that Bread and Roses serves.
8. At the previous hearing referenced in the summary on February 13, 2013, CEC 5 Vice President, Ernst Bryant Jr. acknowledged that Eagle Academy is a good school.

Summary of Issues Raised in Written and/or Oral Comments Submitted to the DOE

The DOE received one written comment via e-mail for this proposal.

9. One question asked where the new school will be located.

Analysis of Issues Raised, Significant Alternatives Proposed, and Changes Made to the Proposal

Comment 1, 3(a), and 4 express general opposition to the proposal.

While many members of the Bread and Roses community object to the possibility of phasing out and replacing Bread and Roses, the proposed opening and co-location of Eagle Academy in building M136 is part of the DOE's central goal to create new school options that will better

serve future students and the community at large. The DOE believes that Eagle Academy is a high quality school option that will benefit the District 5 community.

Comment 2 does not directly relate to the proposal and does not require a response.

Parts of comment 3(b) and comment 6 and 8 discuss strengths of the proposal and therefore do not require a response.

Comment 3(b) pertains to the admissions method at Eagle Academy.

As detailed in the EIS pertaining to the opening and co-location of Eagle Academy, the school will admit new sixth-grade students through the Middle School Choice Process, will have a limited unscreened admissions method, and will be open to male students in Manhattan. Beginning in the 2016-2017 school year Eagle Academy will have expanded to serve students in ninth grade. At this time, the school will admit male students through the High School Admissions Process. The school will have a limited unscreened admissions method, with priority given to eighth-grade students already attending the school's middle school grades. All eighth-grade students residing in New York City will have the opportunity to apply to any remaining Eagle Academy ninth-grade seats through the High School Admissions Process and through the over-the-counter admissions process.

Comment 4 inquires about the purpose of phasing out and replacing schools.

We count on each of our schools to provide a high-quality education to its students, and we hold all schools to the same high standard. If a school is not getting the job done for its students, we are compelled to take serious action to ensure its students do not fall even further behind.

To ensure that as many students as possible have access to the best possible education, under this Administration, New York City has replaced 142 of the lowest-performing schools with better options and opened 576 new schools: 427 district schools and 149 public charter schools. As a result, the DOE has created more high-quality choices for families, as evidenced by the data. Graduation rates at new schools are higher than at the high schools they replaced. In 2006, all phasing-out high schools had a graduation rate of 38.0%. In 2011, all new high schools had a graduation rate of 70.1%. The DOE believes that Eagle Academy will be a high-quality choice as well.

Comment 5 expresses concern about the crowding in the M136 building if another school is added.

The DOE believes that co-locations permit the DOE to maximize space in order to provide families with more high-performing educational options. There are many buildings Citywide where schools are functioning and co-existing successfully.

If this proposal is approved, Eagle Academy will open during the 2013-2014 school year, and be co-located with KAPPA IV, Mott Hall, and Bread and Roses (until, pending PEP approval, it completes its phase-out in June of 2016). Eagle Academy will serve approximately 75-85

students in the sixth grade in its first year. Eagle Academy will gradually phase in by adding one grade per year. The school is expected to reach full scale in 2019-2020 and will serve approximately 525-595 students in grades six through twelve. In 2019-2020, once Bread and Roses has completed its phase-out and Eagle Academy has reached full scale, it is projected that there will be approximately 1,145-1,285 students served in M136, thereby yielding a utilization rate of approximately 87%-97%. Thus, the DOE believes there is sufficient space in building M136 to accommodate all schools over the course of all proposals and that this co-location proposal will benefit the District 5 community.

Comment 7 questions whether Eagle Academy can produce better student outcomes with the same population that Bread and Roses serves.

Eagle Academy currently operates three schools across New York City serving a diverse and high needs population of young men and has produced positive outcomes for its students. For example, Eagle Academy for Young Men, located in the South Bronx, had graduation rates of 72% in 2010-2011 and 73% in 2011-2012 as compared to Bread and Roses which had graduation rates of 47% in 2010-2011 and 41% in 2011-2012. The DOE believes that Eagle Academy will serve as a high quality option for students in Manhattan. However, it is true the school will not serve precisely the same population of students, because Eagle Academy will enroll only male students.

Comment 9 asks where Eagle Academy will be located.

Eagle Academy will be located in the M136 building at 6 Edgecombe Avenue, New York, NY 10030. The new secondary school will be co-located with KAPPA IV, Mott Hall, and Bread and Roses (until, pending PEP approval, it completes its phase-out in June of 2016).

Final decisions regarding the location of Eagle Academy's within the M136 building will be made by the Building Council and Space Planning after the PEP vote.

Changes Made to this Proposal

No further changes have been made to the amended proposal.