ARTS EDUCATION
at the New York City Department of Education

ELEMENTARY ELEMENTARY

Music Reflection Tool
Elementary Level

NYC Department of Education

Table of Contents

Introduction and Overview of the Arts Education Reflection Tool. 3

Element I: Organizational Practice 6

Element II: Student Outcomes. 12

Element III: Instructional Practice 14

Element IV: Arts and Cultural Service Providers 20

New York State Arts Requirements 23

Acknowledgements. 25

Introduction

The goal of the Arts Education Reflection Tool is to provide a guide for principals, school teams, arts and cultural organizations, teachers, teaching artists, and researchers to assess the quality of the delivery of arts education to students, grades PreK-12.

This tool evaluates four essential elements of high quality arts education.

Organization of the Reflection Tool:

Organizational Practice:
- School Environment
- Physical Resources/Space
- Staff/Instructional Time
- Teacher Support
- Arts Data Use

Instructional Practice:
- Curriculum
- Teaching and Learning

Student Outcomes:
- Student Engagement
- Demonstrated Arts Skills, Knowledge and Understanding

Arts and Cultural Service Providers:
- In-School Residencies
- Exhibitions & Performances

How to Use This Reflection Tool:

If you are:	Purpose:	Use this part(s) of the tool:	When:
A principal	Overall assessment of School arts program	**Organizational Practice; Student Outcomes; Instructional Practice; Arts & Cultural Services Provider**	Periodically/over time
A principal & school team	Overall assessment of School arts program	**Organizational Practice; Student Outcomes; Instructional Practice; Arts & Cultural Services Provider**	Periodically/over time
A principal	Professional development	**Instructional Practice; Student Outcomes**	As areas of student need are identified; teachers collaborate in professional learning communities to address need
A principal	Feedback for Arts teacher	**Instructional Practice; Student Outcomes**	Periodically
A principal	Feedback for Arts partnership	**Instructional Practice; Student Outcomes; Arts & Cultural Services Provider**	During or after a residency/program
An arts & cultural services provider	Feedback for Teaching artist	**Instructional Practice; Student Outcomes; Arts & Cultural Services Provider**	Periodically during residency
An arts & cultural services provider	Assessment of Residency/Program/ Visit(s) to Exhibit(s) or Performance(s)	**Arts & Cultural Services Provider**	During or after a residency/program
A teacher	Self reflection on teaching practice	**Instructional Practice; Student Outcomes**	Periodically/overtime
A teacher & teaching artist	Reflection on collaborative classroom practice	**Instructional Practice; Student Outcomes**	Before/during/after a residency/program
A teaching artist from an arts & cultural provider	Self reflection on teaching practice	**Instructional Practice; Arts & Cultural Services Provider; Student Outcomes**	Periodically/overtime

Arts Education Reflection Tool: Criteria and Scale

The observer is asked to use the criteria with the associated scale (below) for each component as a guideline for assessing strengths and areas in need of improvement.

Reflection Scale:

Yes	Yes, But	No, But	No
(Strong Evidence)	(Some Evidence)	(Little Evidence)	(No Evidence)
(To a great degree)	(to a moderate degree)	(to some degree)	(to a slight degree)

Additionally, there are comment fields for specific notes and reflections as well as writing space to record evidence.

Element I:
Organizational Practice/School Wide

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

School Environment: The arts program is supported by the school's administration and contributes to a healthy school climate.	**Y**	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
There is a culture of mutual respect for the arts and arts teachers among all members of the school community.				
The arts and arts teachers are viewed as an integral part of the school community.				
Student work is current and displayed/performed appropriately and in various stages.				
The school has assigned an arts education liaison.				
An arts educator is part of school leadership team.				
School allocates the appropriate amount of personnel to provide sequential arts education instruction for all students.				
School allocates the appropriate amount of financial resources (OTPS) to provide sequential arts education instruction for all students.				
School schedule allows for instructional time for arts teachers, arts partnerships and/or classroom teachers to deliver high quality arts education and the State required instructional hours for students. (see page 23)				
The school encourages parents to be involved in school arts programs.				
Students, teachers, and other staff attend arts performances to support students.				
School offers after-school programs in the arts that are; (1) an extension of arts learning during the day (2) provided by in-school arts teachers alone or with the support of arts and cultural organizations				

Notes

What are the strengths in this area? What is the evidence?

What are the areas for improvement? What is the evidence?

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

Physical Resources/Space: There are dedicated arts studios/classrooms that are appropriately equipped and maintained for arts instruction and equipment and instruments are appropriate and in good condition.	**Y**	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
All arts rooms are arranged to facilitate learning, well-stocked with supplies, and outfitted with storage				
All arts rooms have libraries and technological resources				
Dedicated classrooms for each of the arts disciplines exist and are appropriately equipped				
Equipment, instruments, tools, and materials are neatly labeled and stored; and available to all students				
Accommodations are made for students with special needs				
Custodians are involved in maintaining rooms and supporting the arts				

Music	**Y**	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
Appropriate storage exists for all instruments				
Area accommodates students' ability to properly position instruments and maintain excellent playing/singing posture.				
Audio equipment is available				
Music stands are available				
There is a contract to maintain musical equipment				
Risers are available for performances				

Notes

What are the strengths in this area? What is the evidence?

What are the areas for improvement? What is the evidence?

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

Staffing and Instructional Time – Grades K-6: The arts program has an appropriate number of staff to ensure that all students are receiving the required instructional time as outlined by the NYSED. To see these requirements, please refer to page 23.

	Y	YB	NB	N
Teachers and arts & cultural service providers are assigned so that school is able to offer sequential arts instruction* in all four arts disciplines for all students. * Sequential arts instruction: instruction that builds upon prior learning such that students' skills, knowledge and understanding in an art form increase from year to year.				
All students receive arts instruction in all of the four arts disciplines.				
Instructional time for all students meets state mandates for arts education at the appropriate grade level.				

Teacher Support: Teachers are provided with adequate professional development opportunities and planning time.

	Y	YB	NB	N
All arts teachers attend Blueprint-based training throughout the year offered by the OASP, SSO, cultural partners or institutions of higher education.				
Non-arts teachers are provided with opportunities for planning time to work with arts teachers and cultural partners to create interdisciplinary connections.				
School schedule allows for sufficient planning time for arts teachers, classroom teachers, and arts partnerships.				
Whenever possible teachers, including arts teachers, are provided with common prep periods.				
Non-arts teachers are provided with opportunities to work with arts teachers and cultural organizations to create interdisciplinary connections.				
Professional development in the arts is made available to non-arts teachers.				

Arts Data Use: The school uses data to inform planning and setting goals for instruction, professional development, and progress.

	Y	YB	NB	N
School consistently uses Arts Education Survey and Annual Arts in Schools Report to evaluate current year and plan for the following year.				
School consistently reflects upon references to the school's arts programs in the Quality Review. Middle and high school level, responses to arts questions on the parent, teacher, and /or student Learning Environment Surveys.				
Teachers know where to find informational resources and how to use arts data to evaluate and identify needs.				

Notes

What are the strengths in this area? What is the evidence?

What are the areas for improvement? What is the evidence?

Element II: Student Outcomes

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

Student Outcomes: Students demonstrate progress toward meeting Blueprint benchmarks in Music				
	Y	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
Students				
■ Understand and can explain what they are learning and the criteria for success.				
■ Identify their next steps in meeting a learning goal.				
■ Demonstrate learning through accountable talk, music making, portfolios, written work, notebooks/journals, or other similar modes.				
■ Build their capacity in music making skills and techniques from unit to unit, and from year to year.				
■ Show evidence of progress through performances and/or portfolios with content for the age appropriate Blueprint benchmark level.				
■ Respond to and discuss professional compositions and the original musical compositions of their peers using age-appropriate music concepts and vocabulary.				
■ Actively explore (experiment/take risks) in all aspects of music				
■ Increase their critical thinking skills as reflected in their writing, class discussion, and the artistic choices made throughout ensemble and solo work.				
■ Increase their communications skills and ability to work cooperatively with others through their music.				
■ Reflect on their progress and can self-assess based on agreed-upon criteria and targets.				
■ Express their understanding of the historical and cultural context of the arts verbally, in writing, and in production/performances/exhibitions.				
■ Demonstrate commitment to time on task, active engagement, and focused attention when engaged in music learning				
■ Make connections between music and their own lives.				
■ Use music vocabulary in class discussions, rehearsals, self and peer assessment, program notes, and in other writing.				

Notes

What are the strengths in this area? What is the evidence?

What are the areas for improvement? What is the evidence?

Element III: Instructional Practice

Instructional Practice: Arts program employs instructional strategies to ensure that all students are actively engaged in arts learning. There are indicators of quality teaching unique to each art form, in addition to the general indicators of quality teaching and learning. *

- NOTE: This tool is most helpful in evaluating curriculum and teacher instructional practice when used in periodic observations over time. It can be used as the basis of professional conversation among arts educators as they seek to improve their practice and address student needs and/or with school leaders who wish to support the instructional practice of arts educators both through formal observations and informally.
- Some of the indicators below may be affected by the amount of instructional time provided. For instance, sequentially scaffolded lessons require consistent instruction over time. Please refer to the Arts Education Manual for School Leaders and the Arts Count pages on the arts education website for guidance on NY State requirements and NYC recommendations for instructional time in the arts.

***Quality teaching and learning are evident across arts disciplines when:**

- Productive routines are evident.
- Teacher or teaching artist creates and maintains an environment of mutual respect.
- Instructor makes effective use of instructional time.
- All students are engaged in learning.
- Teacher or teaching artist addresses individual learner needs.
- Teacher or teaching artist is designing tasks for individuals, small, and large groups.
- Teacher or teaching artist is responding to students in a meaningful and timely fashion.
- Students are attentive and participating in activities.
- Students are ready to learn.
- Students are familiar with classroom routines.
- Students are employing technology in production of art form.
- Students are presented with choices and creative problem-solving tasks.

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

Curriculum: Arts curriculum is sequential, developmentally appropriate, and includes all five strands of the Blueprint: Arts Making, Arts Literacy, Making Connections, Community and Cultural Resources, and Careers and Lifelong Learning.				
	Y	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
There are clearly articulated goals for student learning				
There are clearly articulated goals for teachers as well as teaching artists				
Units of study are scaffolded and built on prior learning.				
Ongoing opportunities for formative assessment include: Teacher descriptive feedback Peer assessment Student self-reflection				
Units are linked to the five strands of the Blueprint.				

Assessment Tools: Teachers use a variety of assessment tools and practices to evaluate student progress toward meeting Blueprint benchmarks.				
	Y	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
Teachers use formative assessments* which include teacher and student self/peer assessments to develop and implement units of study *Formative assessments: e.g., individual and collaborative performance tasks, rubrics, checklists, in-progress peer observation and response, peer coaching, group discussion, journals				
Teachers share and/or create the assessment rubric with students to define goals and expectations for the class.				
Teachers use appropriate summative assessments (e.g. arts production or performance, journal, portfolio, written examination or paper, oral presentation, peer jury, summary self-evaluation, etc.) to evaluate student progress.				

Notes

What are the strengths in this area? What is the evidence?

What are the areas for improvement? What is the evidence?

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

Music

Aims/Objectives of Lesson (please check one):

- Music as performing art ☐
- Music as an interdisciplinary component ☐

If aim/objective is music as performing arts:

	Y	YB	NB	N
Lesson builds sequentially to challenge the student creatively, analytically, orally, technically, and musically.				
Develops music literacy and deep contextual understandings.				

If aim/objective is music as an interdisciplinary component:

	Y	YB	NB	N
Lesson develops music skills and understanding; lesson relates meaningfully to additional subject area.				

Core Music Course/Class:

	Y	YB	NB	N
Class begins with a warm up activity or "do now."				
Class structure includes performance objectives which are related to student outcomes.				
Class structure includes direct listening, responding, singing and playing.				
Class structure includes assignment of individual and group projects, reports, and presentation; provides opportunities for students' self and peer assessment.				
Class structure includes students actively participating (responding, inquiring, presenting, demonstrating, performing, singing, executing rhythms, etc.); reading and writing as an outgrowth of the lessons content, composing and creating original music are undertaken.				

Instrumental Music Course/Class:

	Y	YB	NB	N
Performance lessons address one or all of the following objectives: Introduction of a new selection or skill Rehearsal of one or more selections or movements for problem-solving Fine-tuning for a performance				
Class begins with a warm up activity (scales, long tones, vocalizes, etc.). This activity is related to repertoire being prepared (shared key, rhythm, phrasing, etc).				

Notes

What are the strengths in this area? What is the evidence?

What are the areas for improvement? What is the evidence?

Element IV: Arts & Cultural Service Providers

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

In-school Arts Residencies: Connections are made to arts and cultural resources in the community.				
Support	**Y**	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
■ School has relationship with one or more arts and cultural organizations that collaborate to support and enhance the work being done in both arts and non-arts classrooms.				
■ School supports the program through space, scheduling, funds, arts education liaison, etc.				
■ Partnership is well-managed by both school and arts & cultural service provider(s).				
Planning:	**Y**	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
■ Arts & cultural service provider(s) is part of the school's overall arts education plan.				
■ School leadership, arts teachers, and other participating teachers are involved in the residency and/or partnership planning.				
■ Planning meetings were held prior to partnership(s) between school and arts & cultural service provider(s).				
■ School-based staff meets with arts & cultural service providers to do mid-residency evaluation, additional planning and reflection.				
■ Evaluation is part of the implementation process and the program has evolved in response to it.				
Student Learning:	**Y**	**YB**	**NB**	**N**
■ Goals for students are articulated by the service provider, aligned with the Blueprint, and address the particular needs of the students, teachers, and school community.				
■ Arts & cultural service provider(s) provides expertise in arts discipline(s) and community arts and cultural resources.				
■ Student learning is assessed by the teaching artist(s) in conjunction with school arts staff or classroom teacher(s).				

Notes

What are the strengths in this area? What is the evidence?

What are the areas for improvement? What is the evidence?

Legend:

- **Y**=Yes
- **YB**=Yes/But
- **NB**=No/But
- **N**=No

Exhibitions and Performances:	Y	YB	NB	N
■ Preparation for visit includes: establishing the purpose for the visit within context of classroom work; becoming familiar with exhibition or performance using websites; contacting the education department of cultural organization; teacher visiting for a preliminary walk-through if it is a museum or gallery.				
■ Teacher selects components of exhibit or performance that will be discussed ahead of time and prepare students appropriately.				
■ Students understand the purpose of the field trip and visit within the unit of study; images or videos of the performance or exhibition; and facts about the exhibition or performance space.				
■ Students receive support/resource materials prior to the trip, engage in preparatory activities, and reflect on their experiences upon its completion.				

Professional Development	Y	YB	NB	N
■ Arts & cultural service provider offers professional development opportunities for school-based staff and/or parents related to the residency.				
■ Arts and cultural service provider's practice includes ongoing professional development for their own teaching artists.				

NY State Arts Requirements

The New York State Education Department's (NYSED) Instructional Requirements for the Arts outline the continuum of educational experiences students need for their academic and social development. All New York City public schools are expected to meet the NYSED Instructional Requirements for the Arts as outlined below. These requirements included in each school's Annual Compliance Review and are an important component of principals' annual performance evaluations. The DOE uses the NYSED Instructional Requirements for the Arts as the foundation for sequential arts education instructional programs because they are developmentally appropriate, and because we know that teaching and learning in these subjects is extremely beneficial for our students.

In the early grades, the study of dance, music, theater, and visual arts enriches student learning across the entire curriculum while developing students' ability to express themselves and build skills and knowledge in a variety of forms. As students move from elementary to middle school, the arts become an important vehicle for self-expression and provides an opportunity for students to focus on a particular art form along with like-minded peers, giving them sense of belonging within the school community. Finally at the high school level, students can pursue the study of a particular art form in greater depth and consider the options available for advanced study, the possibility of a career in New York City's vibrant arts community, and the chance to earn a Regents Diploma with Advanced Designation through the Arts.

State & City Requirements and Guidelines

PREK-K: Each such school operating a pre-kindergarten or kindergarten program shall establish and provide an educational program based on and adapted to the ages, interests, and needs of the children. Learning activities in such programs shall include dramatic play, creative art, and music activities.

GRADES 1-3: In grades 1 through 3, all students shall receive instruction that is designed to facilitate their attainment of the State elementary learning standards in the arts, including dance, music, theater, and visual arts. Twenty percent of the weekly time spent in school should be allocated to dance, music, theatre, and visual arts. In New York City, this is the equivalent of approximately 186 hours throughout the entire school year equally allocated between dance, music, theater, and visual arts.

GRADES 4-6: In grades 4 through 6, all students shall receive instruction that is designed to facilitate their attainment of the State elementary learning standards in the arts, including dance, music, theater, and visual arts. Ten percent of the weekly time spent in school should be allocated to dance, music, theater, and visual arts. In New York City, this is the equivalent of approximately 93 hours throughout the entire school year equally allocated between dance, music, theater, and visual arts.

GRADES 7-8: All students shall be provided instruction designed to enable them to achieve, by the end of grade 8, State intermediate learning standards in the arts, including one-half unit of study in the visual arts, and one half unit of study in music. *In New York City, one-half unit is the equivalent of approximately 55 hours of instruction by a licensed arts teacher and may be offered in dance, music, theater or visual arts.

GRADES 9-12: New York State Graduation requirements for the arts include one unit (one year) in visual arts and/or music, dance, or theater. In New York City, one unit of credit is the equivalent of approximately 108 hours of instruction by a licensed arts teacher.

Availability of Arts Sequences NYSED Requirement: High schools have the option of fulfilling the graduation requirement through either 1/2 unit of credit (one semester each) in both visual arts and music, or one unit of credit (one year) in one of the four arts forms.
All public school districts shall offer students the opportunity to complete a three- or five-unit sequence in the arts (art, music, dance or theater).

Acknowledgements

The New York City Department of Education's Office of Arts and Special Projects would like to thank The Wallace Foundation for their generous support of this Quality Rubric.

The New York City Department of Education's Office of Arts and Special Projects would like to thank all of the individuals and organizations who contributed their ideas and experiences to the Arts Education Quality Rubric. This document was created based on the research and expertise of the New York City Department of Education's Arts Education Task Force comprised of NYCDOE partners and colleagues, along with input from pilot testing of the tool with school principals and arts and cultural organizations.

Arts Education Task Force

Andrew Ackerman (Children's Museum of Manhattan)
William Bassell (Long Island City High School)
Jamie Bennett (New York City Department of Cultural Affairs)
Mary M. Braebeck (New York University)
Karen Brooks Hopkins (Brooklyn Academy of Music)
John Buffa (PS 084 Steinway)
Thomas Cahill (Studio in a School)
Sarah Calderon (The New York City Department of Education)
Ana Maria Correra (American Ballroom Theatre Dancing Classrooms)
Paul Cothran (VH-1 Save the Music Foundation)
David Dik (The Metropolitan Opera Guild)
AmyDorfman (Shubert Foundation)
Marsha Drummond (The Metropolitan Opera)
Stephanie Dua (The Fund for Public Schools)
Jason Duchin (DreamYard)
Pierre Dulaine (American Ballroom Theatre)
Sharon Dunn
Deborah Effinger (Bronx Theater High School)
Brian Ellner (The New York City Department of Education)
Carol Fineberg (CF Associates)

Tom Finkelpearl (Queens Museum of Art)
Joan Finkelstein (The New York City Department of Education)
Peter Gelb (The Metropolitan Opera)
Clive Gillinson (Carnegie Hall)
Anna Giordano (JHS 045 Thomas C. Giordano)
Patricia Glunt (Long Island City HS)
Eileen Goldblatt (The New York City Department of Education)
Thelma Golden (The Studio Museum of Harlem)
Jody Gottfried Arnhold (Dance Education Laboratory (DEL), 92nd Street Y)
Barbara Gurr (The New York City Department of Education)
Mike Halverston (Center for Arts Education)
Radiah Harper (Brooklyn Museum)
Kashif Iqbal (Jamaica Center for Arts and Learning)
Ronald M Jabradally (Wadleigh Arts High School)
Sarah Johnson (Carnegie Hall)
Caroline Kennedy (The Fund for Public Schools)
Richard Kessler (Center for Arts Education)
Paul L. King (The New York City Department of Education)
Jennifer Kozel (Children's Museum of Manhattan)
Kate D. Levin (New York City Department of Cultural Affairs)
Julia C. Levy (Roundabout Theatre Company)
Tim Lord (DreamYard)
Sharon Luckman (Alvin Ailey American Dance Theater)
Yvonne Marceau (American Ballroom Theatre Dancing Classroom)
Heather McCartney (Alvin Ailey American Dance Theater)
Sean McGlynn (New York City Department of Cultural Affairs)
S. Zuri McKie (Jamaica Center for Arts and Learning)
David Miller (Roundabout Theatre Company)
Carol Moore (Mark Twain I.S. #239)
Barbara Murray (The New York City Department of Education)
Scott Noppe-Brandon (Lincoln Center Institute)
Maria Palma (The New York City Department of Education)

Elena Park (The Metropolitan Opera)
Bonnie Rosenberg (Office of the Mayor, NYC)
Karen Rosner (The New York City Department of Education)
Jerrold Ross (St. John's University)
Lauren Schloss (Queens Museum of Art)
Laurie Schopp (VH-1 Save the Music Foundation)
John G. Schultz (Young Audiences New York)
Martin E. Segal (Segal Company)
David Shookhoff (Manhattan Theatre Club)
Linda Singer (Barbara Reing School-P.S. #255)
Lorie A. Slutsky (New York Community Trust)
Sonnet Takahisa (National September 11 Memorial & Museum at the World Trade Center)
Shirley Taylor (Apollo Theater Foundation, Inc.)
Steve Tennen (Arts Connection)
Misty Tolle (Carnegie Hall)
Jama Toung (The Fund for Public Schools)
Carol Varikos (The New York City Department of Education)
Joseph P. Versace (Bernstein)
Meryle Weinstein (New York University)
Ellen Winn (The Fund for Public Schools)
George Young (PS 146)

Pilot Testing Schools

P.S. 84Q
P.S. 255K (Barbara Reing School)
J.H.S. 45X (Thomas C. Giordano)
Mark Twain Intermediate School for the Gifted and Talented
William McKinley IS 259K
Curtis High School
Edward R. Murrow High School
Wadleigh Secondary School for the Performing and Visual Arts
Long Island City High School